

Samuel John Penderbayne

Cross-genre composition:
encoding characters in the chamber
opera *I.th.Ak.A.* with semiotic
elements derived from commercial
music genres

**Cross-genre composition: encoding characters in the chamber
opera *I.th.Ak.A.* with semiotic elements derived from commercial
music genres.¹**

Dissertation Project

for the award of the title Doctor scientiae musicae

Submitted by

Samuel John Penderbayne

Hamburg 2018

Staatsoper
Hamburg




CLAUSSEN SIMON | STIFTUNG

INSTITUT FÜR KULTURELLE
INNOVATIONSFORSCHUNG

¹ The title of the thesis does not capitalise its major words so as to avoid confusion between the terms 'classical' (referring to a tradition) and 'Classical' (referring to a specific period within the larger tradition).

This dissertation project was made possible by the generous support of the Claussen-Simon Foundation, as supported through their program *Dissertation Plus*, 2015-2018.

The submission consists of two equally-weighted components:

- the creation of an original, purpose-written chamber opera *I.th.Ak.A.*, to be assessed via live performance thereof by the Hamburg State Opera (directed by Paul-Georg Dittrich, conducted by Barbara Kler, dramaturgy by Johannes Blum) and the submitted score;
- a written supplement for the dissertation.

1. Supervisor (artistic): Prof. Fredrik Schwenk
2. Supervisor (academic): Prof. Reinhard Flender
3. Supervisor (supervision): Prof. Georg Hajdu

Thesis defence: 14th of December, 2018, in the Fanny Mendelssohn Saal of the University for Music and Theatre, Hamburg.

Forward

I would like to express my immense gratitude to all those who made the completion of this work possible. Four significant institutions came together to take four significant risks in creating the Opernstipendium program.

Although the field of human endeavour is practically endless, the Claussen-Simon Foundation has chosen to support the risky, nebulous and young field of artistic research through their visionary and bold *Opernstipendium*. I have been constantly inspired by the reverberant work of Dr. Regina Back, Georg Joachim Claussen, Dr. Imke Franzmeier and their colleagues on the Elbe. The time and space afforded by the scholarship is for me of immeasurable value. This time and space was expertly supervised by Prof. Reinhard Flender (from the KMM, another of the four institutions) and Prof. Fredrik Schwenk from the University of Music and Theatre, Hamburg, who stuck their professional necks out for the bold, perhaps even reckless musical and academic ideas I brought to our sessions. Without their warm, competent and critical feedback, I would have been stuck in a vortex of insecurity and circular thinking. The university itself should be applauded for allowing such a program of artistic research in music to take place - the only of its kind in Germany - and the famous visionary Prof. Georg Hajdu is to thank for this awe-inspiring singularity. Finally, I can hardly believe that Georges Delnon and Johannes Blum from the Hamburg State Opera decided to let me through their doors. But since the first step past the Pfortner, I've come to see how extraordinary the vision and love for authentic art is in the building, the tune of which is set from the top. I've learnt that it's hard to stay idealistic when dealing with large ships (of which the State Opera is an ocean liner), but the driving forces of Delnon and Blum are so full of true passion for artistic ideology and bravery, that the State Opera is undeniably a home for new, risky ideas.

On a personal note, I always knew that I wanted to write a dissertation after seeing the pride and quality with which my parents completed and/or presented their respective research work. The concept of producing a tome of reflection on a subject dear to one's heart has been deeply embedded within, and it is clear to me that this dissertation has been a process of following in the footsteps of the elder ones. I am very grateful for their enthusiastic introduction to academia, it is a treasure afforded to a very select few.

Finally, this text and the opera has been made possible every step of the way by my immaculate fiancée Henriette Zahn. From listening to hours of MIDI files, to sacrificing the majority of all table tops to the score and thesis drafts, and converting autobahn trips into semiotics seminars, it has been an indescribable help to know that there is a guardian spirit and mind working to support the long process. It has been a humbling privilege to experience somebody investing so heavily in such an all-consuming project.

Samuel Penderbayne, Hamburg, 14.12.2018

Contents

1. Introduction to the Written Supplement to the Dissertation Project	...(11)
1.1. Context for the Dissertation Project and Expression of Gratitude	...(11)
1.2. The Research Question and its Realisation in the Thesis Structure	...(12)
1.3. Avenues for Research Results (<i>Erkenntnisse</i>)	...(14)
1.4. Comments on an Artistic Style of Artistic Research	...(17)
2. Artistic Research as a Framework for the Dissertation Project	...(19)
2.1. Artistic Research as a Paradigm Shift	...(19)
2.2. Practical and Intellectual Models for Artistic Research in Music	... (25)
2.2.1. Christopher Frayling and a Practical Model for Artistic Research in Music	...(25)
2.2.2. Henk Borgdorff and an Intellectual Model for Artistic Research in Music	... (29)
2.3. Summary and Methodology for this Thesis	...(45)
2.4. Chapter Bibliography	...(48)
3. Developing the Compositional Ideology of Cross-Genre	...(55)
3.1. Definitions	...(55)
3.1.1. A Focus on Developing the Ideology of Cross-Genre Theory for Musical Analysis	...(55)
3.1.2. Working Definitions of the Key Terms	...(58)
3.2. Developing the Cross-Genre Theory	...(67)
3.2.1. Exploring and Defining Genre	...(68)
3.2.2. Dichotomic Artistic Relationships and Potential for their ‘Crossing’	...(75)
3.2.2.1. Boris Groys and Conceiving of New Art as the Result of a Space	...(83)
3.2.2.2. Postcolonialism as a Source for Developing the Cross-Genre Approach...	(85)

3.2.2.3. Homi K. Bhabha and Constructive Terms for the Cross-Genre Approach	
Arising from Postcolonial Studies	...(89)
3.3. Chapter Bibliography	...(109)
4. An Original Method for Musical Narrative Analysis according to the Cross-Genre Ideology	
4.1. Narrative Analysis as a Basis for the Cross-Genre Analytical Method	...(117)
4.1.1. Two Key Influences: Almén (2004) and Karl (1997)	...(124)
4.1.2. Approaching Narrative Analysis through Assessing Layers	...(127)
4.2. Analysing the Bottom Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)	...(130)
4.2.1. Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation	...(130)
4.2.2. A Method for Analysing the Bottom Layer	...(133)
4.3. Analysing the Mid Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)	...(134)
4.3.1. Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation and Relation to One Another	...(134)
4.3.2. A Method for Analysing the Mid Layer	...(138)
4.4. Analysing the Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)	...(139)
4.4.1. The Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis: Archetype Identification and Analysis Within the Cross-Genre Dialog	...(139)
4.4.2. A Method for Analysing the Top Layer	...(145)
4.5. Chapter Bibliography	...(146)
5. A Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis of the original opera I.th.Ak.A.	...(150)
5.1. Introduction	...(151)
5.1.1. Goals of the Analysis	...(154)
5.1.2. Disclaimers	...(156)
5.2. Bottom Layer Analysis	...(157)

5.2.1. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Juli	...(157)
5.2.1.1. Step 2: Discussion of Juli's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(180)
5.2.2. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Cyclops	...(183)
5.2.2.1. Step 2: Discussion of Cyclops' Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(192)
5.2.3. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Circe	...(195)
5.2.3.1. Step 2: Discussion of Circe' Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(210)
5.2.4. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Dark	...(212)
5.2.4.1. Step 2: Discussion of Dark's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(223)
5.2.5. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Borgo	...(226)
5.2.5.1. Step 2: Discussion of Borgo's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(235)
5.2.6. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Der Kapitän	...(238)
5.2.6.1. Step 2: Discussion of Der Kapitän's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis	...(244)
5.2.7. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Die Sirenen	...(246)
5.2.7.1. Step 2: Discussion of The Sirens' Character Identity, as Arising from the Analysis	...(249)
5.3. Mid Layer Analysis	...(251)
5.3.1. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Libretto	...(252)
5.3.2. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Musical Material and Cross-Genre Associations	...(258)

5.3.3. Analysing Musical Plot Functions with Commentary on the Libretto	...(270)
5.4. Top Layer Analysis	...(291)
5.4.1. Identification of Elements of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict	...(291)
5.4.2. Discussion of the Elements and Identification of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict	...(294)
6. A Summary of Key Developments and Discoveries	...(299)
6.1. The Changing Form of the Guidelines Throughout the Dissertation Project	...(299)
6.2. Discovery of Methods for Artistic Research in Composition	...(302)
6.3. Discoveries as to the Nature of my Creative Process as a Composer	...(303)
6.4. A Recapitulation of the Original Research Contained in the Dissertation Project and Answers to the Research Question	...(304)
7. Complete Bibliography	...(307)

1.Introduction to the Written Supplement to the Dissertation Project

- 1.1. Context for the Dissertation Project and Expression of Gratitude
- 1.2. The Research Question and its Realisation in the Thesis Structure
- 1.3. Avenues for Research Results (*Erkenntnisse*)
- 1.4. Comments on an Artistic Style of Artistic Research

1.1. Context for the Dissertation Project and Expression of Gratitude

The dissertation *Cross-genre composition: enriching the classical composition tradition with elements of commercial music genres through the semiotic encoding of characters in a new opera*², consisting of the chamber opera *I.th.Ak.A.* and this written text, is the result of a unique collaboration between the Hamburg State Opera, University for Music and Theatre, Hamburg, and the Claussen-Simon Foundation. In 2015, these three institutions published an open call for proposals to compose an opera in combination with a substantial written text for submission as a doctoral thesis (Doctor scientiae musicae). Combined, this program forms the *Opernstipendium*, which was re-advertised in 2018. From the 60 candidates, I was awarded the honour to compose an opera based on a new, purpose-written re-telling of *The Odyssey* by Helmut Krausser and a substantial text on my approach to composition, which I call cross-genre. Between August 2015 and August 2018, I received a monthly stipend from the Claussen-Simon Foundation, which supported my living expenses for three years and allowed me to focus solely on the entire project. The opera was premiered on April 6 in the opera stabile and the thesis was submitted in August 2018 for consideration by the academic board for Doctor scientiae musicae at the University. The

² Again, the title of the thesis does not capitalise its major words so as to avoid confusion between the terms 'classical' (referring to a tradition) and 'Classical' (referring to a period within the larger tradition).

Opernstipendium is a visionary program offering a world-class pathway for young composer-researchers and I am truly indebted to all persons who played a part in helping this extraordinary opportunity come to fruition.

1.2. The Research Question and its Realisation in the Thesis Structure

Patrick Dunleavy, in his cross-disciplinary guide to developing a thesis, gave one simple and brave maxim for academic work of all kinds: ‘You define the question: you deliver the answer’³. This was my guiding principle whilst authoring this academic text. Moreover, I believe it to be the essence of third cycle academic work, as well as original thought and intellectual entrepreneurship: where (sometimes substantial) parts of first- and second-cycle academia may involve learning skills (*Handwerk*) as developed by others, I believe research to be that of developing new skills, testing them and bringing these results into a form suitable for dissemination. In this vein, my research question is simple: how did I compose the chamber opera *I.th.Ak.A.*?

In answering this key question, I firstly define the methodology for the thesis by way of surveying models of artistic research and proposing it as an intellectual framework for the project. This occurs in the next chapter, chapter 2. As will be shown in detail, I arrive at a ‘reflective methodology’, a process of analysing creative work that I composed intuitively, in order to derive cognitive results. These take three forms: research *about* (including aesthetic, hermeneutic and philosophical thoughts about the nature of my musical art), *for* (including creating, defining and demonstrating ‘tools’ for understanding and composing new music according to cross-genre concepts) and *through* (meaning research through the compositional experiment of composing *I.th.Ak.A.*) art. The research *about* art

³ Dunleavy, P. (2015). *Authoring a PhD: how to plan, draft, write and finish a doctoral thesis or dissertation*. Basingstoke : Palgrave Macmillan education: 23.

is explored in the commentary and debate I perform in chapter 3, which is a literature review of philosophies regarding musical analysis, and chapter 4, which develops the philosophical approach to cross-genre composition as I see it and as it is supported by various strands of intellectual debates. The research *for* art component is performed both in chapters 4 and 5, where I develop a perspective for appreciating, analysing and evaluating art along the lines of the cross-genre approach, and in chapter 6, where I perform the analytic ‘perspective’ (meaning the cross-genre analytic method) on my own composition, *I.th.Ak.A.*. Research *through* art is encapsulated in the other half of the thesis: the score for *I.th.Ak.A.*. As per my definition for artistic research, which will be derived in chapter 2 - making intuitive creative knowledge cognitive - *I.th.Ak.A.* was the experimental canvas on which I worked intuitively whilst reading and forming concepts freely and intuitively as preparatory work for the written, discursive and therefore cognitive written text. In other words, *I.th.Ak.A.* was composed alongside the genesis of ideas and research for the written supplement on the cross-genre approach, as research *through* (creating) art. This is similar to how a scientist (e.g. in the fields of experimental physics and mathematics) may freely and intuitively perform a range of experimental ‘sketches’ in order to find an effective final form of their theory, or like how some sculptors do not know the exact form of a stone sculpture before beginning, but rather find the details whilst sculpting. They, like I, follow an intuition whilst working. And, just as the sculptor ‘steps back’ at various stages of progress, I constantly read intellectual theories (those quoted, including by Groys, Lena/Petersen, Bhabha, Byron Almén and many others) in the breaks of composing *I.th.Ak.A.* in order to win fresh perspectives on the work. I also wrote sketches for chapters that are not included in the final text, such as a detailed consideration of postmodernism and analysis of works of my peers, such as Alexander Schubert (*Your Fox is a Dirty Gold*), Moritz Eggert (*Muzak* and *Wide Unclasp*) and Michael van der Aa (*The Book of Sand*). These chapter sketches and free musical analysis of works of my peers were important in gaining inspiration and

defining a pathway for the cognitive thoughts, although they don't contribute to the final form. This is a personal adaption of the Grounded Theory methodology, as will be detailed later.

Indeed, the term 'personal' in the last sentence of the previous paragraph is a key element to my academic work. Returning to Patrick Dunleavy, the aforementioned quote continues: 'You define the question: you deliver the answer. This proposition means that every effective PhD thesis should be genuinely *personalised* (my emphasis) in some way.' My dissertation is '*personalised*' in that I: define artistic research according to my personal interests and endeavours, analyse my own composition (rather than those of others), that I develop a new intellectual framework based on concepts that interest me, personally, and an original method for musical analysis that assesses the elements I consider most important to my own work, and then use this original and personal method on my own work (i.e. rather than analysing my work using an existing analytic method of a third party, such as Schenkerian analysis or another existing method). As such, I argue that my thesis is personal throughout.

1.3. Avenues for Research Results (*Erkenntnisse*)

The thesis has **five** key areas for research results (*Erkenntnisse*): an original perspective on artistic research as paradigm shift at time of writing (chapter 2), the development of a cognitive and discursively-articulated aesthetic philosophy of composition, namely, cross-genre composition (chapter 3), the development of a new style and method for analysing musical compositions based on the original aesthetic philosophy (chapter 4), the performance of a prototypical analysis using this original analytical style (chapter 5), and - not to be forgotten - a substantial new composition, which served as an experimental canvas for the intuitive sculpting of the original aesthetic philosophy (I'm referring here to the submitted opera, *I.th.Ak.A.*). In assessing the amount and

quality of original research content contained in this dissertation, I ask the examiners to consider the contributions that each of these five areas offer the academic community.

I suggest that members of the academic community who are composers may benefit from the results through finding a cross-genre perspective with which to inspire their works and/or learn from the works of others, or their previous works. This could be in the form of an adaption of the ‘tool’-like vocabulary I develop in chapter 3 to their own work: i.e. the thoughts on hybridity, stereotype, mimicry and other ‘vocabulary’ that I adapt from the work of Homi K. Bhabha in chapter 3, as well as those of compositional ‘newness’ as garnered from Boris Groys and commentary on musical narrative and genre⁴. Alternatively, composers may be able to adopt a method for artistic research in the compositional field using the research in chapter 2 as a model and follow a similar structural model of then developing an original analytic criteria and performing it on a substantial original composition, that forms the other half of the dissertation. I can imagine this methodology and structure applying to an infinite range of research in the compositional field. Indeed, musical analysis may well be more interesting to composers than performers or even musicologists. As the influential English musicologist Nicholas Cook says: ‘analysis has become the backbone of composition teaching’⁵. As such, composers interested in the possible interplay of cultural references between a given tradition and genres (or other bodies of music) outside of this tradition may find the cross-genre approach of use. In today’s increasingly connected and globalised society, I suggest that musical multi-culturality and (musico-symbolic) cultural exchange will become increasingly important as barriers are torn down and new generations attempt to make sense of old

⁴ Since composers work with individual and personal methods, I have deliberately avoided overly prescriptive methods of formulating the ‘tools’ that form the research *for* art, opting rather for a philosophical aesthetic perspective in describing cross-genre, which is later customised specifically for analysing the opera I.th.Ak.A.. Other composers may find benefit in reading the philosophical aesthetic perspective and customising it again on a technical level for their specific purposes. A comparison may be that of a software designer building a platform rather than a specific plug-in or feature.

⁵ Cook, Nicholas (1987). *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. New York: George Braziller: 2.

divides. As a final thought on this topic: cross-genre may suit those composers best who have a lot of diverse ideas and seek ways to bridge and hybridise them. In my personal experience, there are two broad categories of composers: those who tend towards having a tightly focussed set of ideas that develop more economically in a technically awe-inspiring manner to lead to a refined artistic experience, and those that tend towards a myriad of contrasting ideas that lead to a more spectacular (in the sense of 'spectacle') and startling artistic experience. For me, it represents a reality of deciding to 'focus down' or 'expand outwards' on the *essential* level of a creative process, although on other levels of the process, composers may alternate between the two. I consider myself to belong to the second camp, that which works with eclectic, diverse and contrasting ideas, and as such, the bridging and hybridising of such ideas is a primary pathway to an effective artistic experience. It is for this reason that I developed the cross-genre approach.

Nevertheless, aside from composers like me, musicologists may wish to observe the process of reflection that I as a composer underwent regarding a substantial artistic work of mine. Regardless of any significance or insignificance my work may ultimately have, I believe this reflective process to have the potential for musicological insight: deep reflections are rare in the compositional world, especially in comparison to the amount of artistic works which are presented 'as is'. For almost every musical work, musicologists must guess completely as to the motivations, reflections, doubts and philosophies of the composers. In many ways, this thesis could be an *ex-ante* document for assessing either my artistic work, or the development of artistic research as a field in the German-speaking area, since this thesis is one of a very few early examples of such in this academic area. This was made possible through the new 'künstlerisch-wissenschaftliche dissertation program at the University of Music and Theatre in Hamburg, a pioneering, visionary and innovative program. Also, the original thoughts on genre, analysis, newness and cross-genre may have musicological merit, as is may be assessed by a third party. Performers may also be able to adapt aspect of the

methodology for artistic research, and aspects of the original analysis method and aesthetic philosophy of cross-genre composition in order to inform their performance of works with this perspective.

1.4. Comments on an Artistic Style of Artistic Research

As an additional method to articulate the style of thinking I wish to signify with ‘cross-genre composition’, the academic construction of this aesthetic philosophy is in its own way ‘cross-genre’. For example, Homi K. Bhabha is a postcolonialist literary critic and Boris Groys a art critic, media theorist, and philosopher, yet I ‘cross’ their ideas at an essential juncture in chapter 4. Moreover, Bhabha himself is, in my opinion, a strong thinker due to his cross-genre-like style of reading postcolonialist perspectives and narratives hidden in a truly diverse range of literature. The range of references in this dissertation can also be considered cross-genre, coming as they do from canonic musicologists (e.g. Cook, Kramer), established non-canonic professional musicologists (e.g. Karl, Almén), artistic researcher peers in my local scene (e.g. Lazarevic), anthropologists (e.g. Lena/Petersen, Levi-Strauss), and non-academic authors (e.g. TS Eliot).

It could be the case that some perspectives into my personal creative process - the reflection upon which is the core of this dissertation - can be garnered from the style of research: an artistic style of (artistic) research, perhaps. In the next chapter, I will define art as effective when its originator convinces third parties of a personal vision; rocket fuel is effective when it achieves certain objective engineering goals, but art is effective in a subjective, communicative function. I then suggest that this written supplement to my dissertation could be evaluated in its effectiveness of the personal persuasiveness as to the depth, sophistication and originality of the reflections on my own creative process. Having said this, when I undertook tasks for which there is an established skill-set

(Handwerk), I have endeavoured to execute them to the highest standard. By this, I specifically refer to the elements of literature review and historic perspective in chapters 2, 3 and 4. Along with this style of research, of course, comes the risk that the ideas may not be convincing. This sort of risk also reflects my artistic personality, where I see myself as a similar sort of risk taker. In summary, my hope is that, even if the original ideas prove to be (subjectively) contentious, the method with which I employed to arrive at them provides a solid objective academic foundation.

2. Artistic Research as a Framework for the Dissertation Project

2.1. Artistic Research as a Paradigm Shift

2.2. Practical and Intellectual Models for Artistic Research in Music

2.2.1. Christopher Frayling and a Practical Model for Artistic Research in Music

2.2.2. Henk Borgdorff and an Intellectual Model for Artistic Research in Music

2.3. Summary and Methodology for this Thesis

2.4. Chapter Bibliography

There are many terms for what I will refer to as artistic research, including practice-based/-led research, research in the arts etc. I was convinced of the term ‘artistic research’ by Heather Nowonhy⁶ due to the fact it emphasises the analogy to scientific research and reflects its desired epistemology.

2.1. Artistic Research as a Paradigm Shift

Artistic research in music⁷ in Europe⁸ is a recent development in scientific inquiry⁹ that I posit to have a revolutionary potential on par with Thomas Kuhn’s concept of scientific paradigm shifts¹⁰.

⁶ Biggs, M. A. R., et al. (2012). *The Routledge companion to research in the arts*. London: Routledge.

⁷ Artistic research in the visual arts, film and theatre has a rich history in Europe and abroad that is not assessed with the scope of this thesis.

⁸ In the United States, artistic research has been a standard practice in the awarding of PhD (Doctor of Philosophy), DA (Doctor of Arts, a so-called ‘professional doctorate’) for many decades. For the purposes of my dissertation, I have excluded a direct transposition of the US system onto the European due to the fundamental differences between them, primarily because of the significant effects of a ‘free market’-based system in the US and a centralised public system in Europe. Other factors, such as broad tradition and culture, also make the direct, ‘1:1’ transposition of American ideas into the European sphere so problematic as to be ineffective for the scope of this thesis.

⁹ Artistic research in music may have existed in a quasi dormant, nebulous and unarticulated form for many centuries. For example, the awarding of PhD titles to composers and performing musicians can be traced back to the mid-to-late 18th century (Flender 2017). In the last few decades, triggered in a large part by the Bologna Process of 2005, tertiary music institutions have increasingly considered what a so-called ‘third cycle’ would look like (Gilsén, Y. 2006, Borgdorff 2007, Kershaw 2009, Lesage 2009, Kälvemärk, 2010, Schiesser 2015 et al.).

¹⁰ Kuhn, T. S. (2012). *The structure of scientific revolutions - fourth edition*. Chicago, Ill: The University of Chicago Press. Originally published in 1962.

Firstly, artistic research could be a paradigm shift for publicly-funded European music universities, who could use quality discursive research outcomes in all departmental disciplines (i.e. not just in musicology) to face down a potential challenge from critics who question the sociological value of tax-payer funded skill-based learning. This critical vulnerability is present regarding musical instructors who emphasise motoric skills in their teachings without a clear sensoric component. It is, of course, a fact apparent to those with experience, that very many higher-level instrumental and vocal teachers include significant sensoric and philosophical components in their courses and it is exactly these courses that can be highlighted through artistic research as examples of *motor-sensoric* knowledge of high academic value. Hermeneutic information can be linked directly to motor-sensoric skill. For example, practitioners experienced in honing and harnessing motor-sensoric skill in order to interpret written artistic musical knowledge (i.e. scores) could be paired with artistic researchers capable in expressing this within a framework of artistic research and thereby make it understandable to broader audiences, such as those that would be skeptical of motorically-skilled practitioners receiving public funding for academic purposes by way of universities.

Artistic research could then allow good music schools to demonstrate clearly with documented research artefact examples their academic worth to the outside. Such research artefacts can be used by others (people other than the research author) for innovative purposes (e.g. in a ‘tool’-like manner), and thereby being ‘not only a self-sufficient theoretical structure but also the driving force of innovation for art production and art reception’¹¹. Music universities might reveal ‘new ways of researching and provide insights and understandings beyond the arts themselves [...] in terms of its

¹¹ Schwarz, H.P. (2010). Forward to the Routledge Companion on Research in the Arts: xxix.

methods and outcomes rather than simply its interest in art'¹². Were this to be achieved, critics who currently claim that 'academic higher education [...] can only claim to be academic when supported by scientific research and insofar as the institutions that provide such education pursue their own research'¹³ and that 'education that consists mainly of learning skills is for this reason not academic: it is craftsmanship'¹⁴, would have to concede to the produced research outcomes and the musical innovation¹⁵ they have fostered. In conclusion, if artistic research were to reach maturity as an inter-departmental force within music universities, their sociological role would have been revolutionised.

Secondly, artistic research presents a revolutionary lack of distance between the observer and observed - these functions being unified in the hybrid artistic researcher, who both produces and reflects upon the artistic experience in a symbiotic way. This innovation would lead to new methodologies and degrees of verification/falsification (i.e. objectivity). Indeed, the innovative level of subjectivity involved in assessing the artistic experience by the actor that produced it in the first place is a source of the aforementioned skepticism regarding artistic research). However, if objectivity were an immutable component of research, then research would be highly restricted to a few choice areas such as pure mathematics and practically perfectly reproducible experiments in a

¹² Ibid.: 2.

¹³ Raes, G.W (2014). *Experimental Art as Research*. In Crispin D., Gilmore B (ed) (2014). *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology*. Leuven University Press.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ The practical-tactical body in Britain, the *Arts and Humanities Research Council (AHRC)*, has focussed on fostering innovation through artistic research for more than a decade. Its *Research Funding Guide* seeks to encompass artistic research broadly, before narrowing down on very specific conditions for awarding funding to projects. One such current (version 3.9) defines artistic research as an activity: 'to improve the breadth and depth of our knowledge of human culture both past and present', where this read 'building capacity and capability in the creative and performing arts' in 2009 (v. 1.2). In their 'Innovation Brochure', *Arts and Humanities Research and Innovation*, they connect artistic research to more concrete technical and commercial goals (as opposed to the epistemological ones of the *Research Funding Guide*), state the goal that artistic research 'nourishes the UK's cultural existence, and inspires creative behaviour, as well as innovative goods and services. The arts and humanities have a particularly strong affiliation with the creative industries. There is growing evidence that this research helps to fuel those industries, and that the creative industries in turn stimulate and support innovation in the UK'. Such a body has a long history of fitting in artistic research alongside more technical research proposals - Britain being one of the early European frontrunners in modern artistic research - and can be looked at for how goals may form in continental Europe in the future.

few elite laboratories¹⁶. This is simply not the case - scientific inquiry in universities ‘freely range[s] from the testing of formal mathematical models of learning through controlled laboratory experiments to the kind of studies done in the field of cultural anthropology by people like Robert Redfield¹⁷, and artistic research would be simply an innovative further spot on this spectrum of objectivity¹⁸. The paradigm shift creates new methodologies, epistemologies and ontologies¹⁹ for the academic community, following an ‘intellectual trend’ where ‘one can see the progressive adoption – over decades and even centuries – of different fields of study by the academy’²⁰.

The key revolution to science that artistic research poses is the use of artistic language itself in research as opposed to purely discursive and/or other scientific language (algorithms, data charts etc.). As with Eisner²¹, I do not claim that artistic language is per se a form of scientific language itself (therefore preventing the simplistic art *is* research declaration, see Frayling 1994, Borgdorff

¹⁶ Although even advanced mathematics and physics is ultimately also riddled with doubt as to the nature of objectivity, see: Michael Polanyi: *The Tacit Dimension*, New York 1967; and Paul Feyerabend: *Wissenschaft als Kunst*, Frankfurt/M. 1984.

¹⁷ Eisner, E. W. (2003). *On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research*. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

¹⁸ A successful, objective research object in the field of pure mathematics or physics or even one in a highly controlled laboratory environment may be the most ‘pure’ on such a spectrum of objectivity. Yet such research would involve slight impurities, since ‘wissenschaftliche Erkenntnisproduktion keineswegs allein das Ergebnis selbsttransparenter, objektiver Verfahrenswesen ist, sondern wie künstlerische Praxis auch wesentlich durch Intuition und Kreativität oder Praktiken des Experimentierens und des “impliziten Wissens” geprägt ist’ (Badura et al. 2015). These colourations would occur when the numerical or discursive knowledge has been influenced by both a personal interest and an intuitive ‘feeling’ or ‘intuitive knowledge’, the latter of which is particularly dangerous because it ventures towards the ‘unabgesicherten und häufig subjektiven Orientierungsweisen des Meinens und Glaubens’, from which ‘das begründete Wissen eines Sachverhaltes’ (i.e. discursive knowledge) attempts to distance itself. For this reason, ‘das klassische Konzept intuitiver Erkenntnis galt daher seit der Aufklärung als problematisch’ and ‘gilt nunmehr bestenfalls als Vorstufe zu einer wirklichen Erkenntnis’ until it ‘in rational-begrifflicher Rechtfertigung *trans-subjektiv* ausgewiesen [sein kann]’ and a sort of ‘übergeordneten Referenzpunkts, eines “tertium comparationis” could be found, ‘hinsichtlich dessen dieser Anspruch ausgewiesen werden kann’ (Badura 2009). Regarding specifically the ‘trans-subjectivity’ of this citation, a logical conclusion would be that research that is most removed from immediate pure objectivity (such as Robert Redfield’s cultural anthropology) is less self-sufficient, in that it requires (an) additional third-party(-ies) to evaluate its intuitive knowledge from a distance, but that this condition does not exclude it from the academy. The original research would be, to an extent, an *ex ante* document for other researchers.

¹⁹ I am aware of the problem of conceiving Ontology in the arts and will define this term - as well as methodology and epistemology - in a coming section.

²⁰ Biggs, M. & Karlsson, H. (2010). *Foundations*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge: 1.

²¹ Eisner, E. W. (2003). *On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research*. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

2007), but do see a potential symbiotic relationship between artistic and scientific languages as a paradigm shift for science. Therefore, I contend that a discursive written supplement is a necessary accompaniment to an artistic artefact in a research context. On a practical level, this would mean that scientific language should be used to the largest possible extent when discussing the artistic experience discursively, and where it is inevitably lacking, the artistic language (through the experience of the work itself) would ‘take over’. The inclusion of artistic language would thus be an ‘Ergänzung zur wissenschaftliche Forschung [...] weil die Wissenschaft erfolgreich, aber nicht vollständig die Welt zu erklären vermag’ where indeed the artistic language extends the scientific, and the ‘Nichtsprachlichkeit besonders interessant [ist]’²², creating a uniqueness and singularity in the sciences, bolstering its presence as a revolution.

Finally, artistic research could lead to a revolution in the life and professional function of an artist. Consummate artistic researchers would be innovators bringing artistic and scientific behaviours together. For artists becoming more involved in research, this would be a surface-level and/or behavioural ‘change in the role [...] of an] genius to dogged researcher’²³, or, even less romantic, an artist as a ‘worker aiming to become a researcher’²⁴. This may of course be a welcome change to artists not comfortable with the role of an eccentric, flamboyant genius, as is so often portrayed in mainstream culture²⁵. All things aside, combining the expressive with the critical must be a positive thing, and when this process can be skilfully documented, it must provide useful ex ante documents for future analysis: were high-quality art-works to be produced with a well-documented critical reflection from the artists themselves, a true revolution would take place in the appreciation and

²² Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

²³ Malterud, N. (2012). *Artistic research – necessary and challenging*. InFormation 1/2012 trans. Bergen Academy of Art and Design. The original publication could not be found.

²⁴ Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes: xx.

²⁵ Eisner, E. W. (2003). *On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research*. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

dissemination of art. Imagine for a second what knowledge could've been gained (i.e. which *Erkenntnisgewinne* could have been produced) if Beethoven had undergone a scientifically-informed critical self-reflection whilst writing all nine of his symphonies - the music world would have a bible-like document to analyse and re-analyse, creating a rich web of scientific intersubjectivity around his methods. The possibilities for developing (or even revolutionising) the role of the artist are truly exciting. What's more, an artistic researcher would be a highly sensitive sort of scientist, virtuosically touching the boundaries between discursive and intuitive knowledge. In the coming age of artificial intelligence, what other quality should humans bring if not this intuitive 'je ne sais quoi'? As formal mathematical modelling, statistical data gathering and even laboratory experiments become more the domain of the AI, an artistic approach to science may indeed become premium. But even before strands of this hypothetical were to become true, it would speak to researches in the arts field looking to bring their creative lives into the scientific, seeking to sculpt engaged, holistic, passionate research practices that bridge and not divide both the artist-self and researcher-self' and no longer 'hide our relationship to the work'²⁶. The artistic researcher could simultaneously analyse, appreciate (experience) and create the artistic experience, as well as articulate essential parts of its knowledge through discursive language, leading to multi-layered symbiotic results unseen in pre-paradigmatic research.

Artistic research has already been posited by Dombois as a 'paradigm shift in our world perception'²⁷, and indeed, there is a fervent debate surrounding the first years of the discipline in European music conservatories. It has been described, amongst other things, as a 'creative utopia'²⁸,

²⁶ Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford.

²⁷ Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

²⁸ Flender, R. (2017). *Über das Dr. Sc. Mus.* In *13. Jahre Multimedia in der HfMT Hamburg*. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

a ‘new academic modus operandi’²⁹ or even a ‘vague absurdity’³⁰, and the debate surrounding it a ‘ferocious’ and ‘urgent’ one³¹. It could even bring about ‘a change in the role of the artist, from genius to dogged researcher’³². My personal conviction is that artistic research could become the most sophisticated method we have for cultivating and stimulating the arts in our society, should a critical mass of excellent artistic researchers provide a canon of knowledge products that cement its academic standing and inspire the best young minds of the future generations to build upon it.

2.2. Practical and Intellectual Models for Artistic Research in Music

2.2.1. Christopher Frayling and a Practical Models for Artistic Research in Music

After positing such a paradigmatic revolution, a key question still remains: how should artistic research be conducted? The simple fact of the matter is, that despite significant activity³³, there is

²⁹ Hannula, M., Suoranta, J., & Vadén, T. (2005). *Artistic Research: Theories, methods and practices*. Helsinki: Academy of Fine Arts.

³⁰ Hornuff, D. (2015). *Praxis Dr. Kunst geschlossen*. Faz Feuilleton. Can be found under: <http://www.faz.net/-gsn-864ks> accessed 14:50, 21.11.17.

³¹ Borgdorff, H. (2007). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

³² Malterud, N. (2012). *Artistic research – necessary and challenging*. InFormation 1/2012 trans. Bergen Academy of Art and Design.

³³ Some active institutions of artistic research include: The Society for Artistic Research (SAR), which publishes the generally-praised Journal for Artistic Research (JAR); European Art Research Network (EARN), which published a ‘Handbook’ on artistic research called SHARE and an international journal called the Platform for Artistic Research Sweden (PARSE), associated with a biennial research conference of the same name; AEC European Platform for Artistic Research in Music (EPARM) – a conference; The European League of the Institutes of the Arts (ELIA), the board of which consists of active commentators on artistic research and which has published a ‘position paper on the doctorate in the arts... for policymakers, university leaders, curriculum designers and research funding agencies’ called The ‘Florentine Principles’ on the Doctorate in the Arts (EILA 2016) – a reaction to The Salzburg Principles published by the European University Association (EUA 2005); the Orpheus Institut in Genf, which is the largest producer of artistic research, including significant musical outputs, and the pioneering Universities of Malmö, Hamburg, Graz, Stockholm, Gothenburg and Bern, based on the output of musical artistic research that I have encountered in my readings.

no widely-accepted best practice, especially in continental Europe, and especially in music³⁴. Such a lack of best practice - and lack of true canonic masterworks - leads the field to be viewed often with broad skepticism as to its legitimacy as scientific research³⁵. For my part, I have taken this dearth as an opportunity to strive for innovation in creating a new intellectual and practical framework for research in the musical arts, and will base my approach on two other models posited by prominent researchers in the visual arts, Christopher Frayling and Henk Borgdorff³⁶.

Before doing so, I will mention the program within which this project has been conducted - the first and only one allowing for musical artistic research in Germany at the current time - the Doctor Musicae Scientiae program at the Hamburg University of Music and Theatre. The guidelines for completion of this program are stated as follows:

³⁴ Debate has been well and truly dominated by the visual arts and design, with music and dance as relative late-comers without strong champions. In fact, 'in music there was virtually no debate at all about practice-based research until recently' (Borgdorff 2006). Perhaps this is due to music's particular 'nichtrepräsentative Natur [... der] Flüchtigkeit, Zeitabhängigkeit', whereby 'die Musik [lässt sich] allerdings nicht [leicht] als Gegenstand für die künstlerische Forschung adaptieren', or perhaps it is due to the 'Historische Trennung in Musikwissenschaft und Praxis [... weil] man nur unter großen Mühen über verschiedene Wissenswege zu einem fundierten Forschungsansatz und umfassenden künstlerisch wie intellektuell brauchbaren Ergebnissen gelangt' (Crispin 2015). This is even more extreme with composition - the tiny article on composition in the Diaphanes Handbook for Artistic Research contains not a single citation and contains only some simple and general observations, that are nevertheless useful and welcome. This presents a dramatic dearth in research, since composition as a field has major potential for artistic research and unique strengths: the generation of a score creates a textually-based creative product that can endure in the same text-based form as much research does, it can involve direct creative innovation through new media (including software design, which contains elements of engineering-like research) and the ability to give creative, syntactic and expressive structures to exploratory sound 'research' with things such as extended playing techniques, to name just a few.

³⁵ Indeed, skepticism as to the legitimacy of artistic research would cease immediately should there exist a substantial masterwork of artistic research from which a de facto legitimacy could be developed. Skepticism is strong towards artistic research, since artistic research 'moves within a complex, overdetermined field [of pan-European universities], which is characterised by acute observation, stubborn skepticism, or fundamental rejection of artistic research' (Schiesser 2015). In face of this, there is a 'blatant need for some kind of "canon" of artistic research projects, a stock of commonly known examples of remarkable contributions' (Kjørup 2010). This does not appear to be the case, in fact, it could be the case that 'some of the earliest examples of doctoral work in the arts were simply not of an acceptable standard, a fact which has contributed to suspicion from the rest of the academic community.' (Kälvemark 2010) Instead, legitimacy arguments focus instead on philosophical placement of the singularity of artistic research: what can be gained from artistic research that cannot be replaced by other more established research methods? This question requires much definition and will be addressed gradually throughout this text. However, it may only be a question of time before artistic research can establish itself through quality production, as long as the field does not get discredited in the mean time. Indeed, considering 'the time it took the natural, technical and human sciences to break free of the primacy of religion', artistic research is in its early days, and at such a primordial stage, the argument can be made to 'pursue the strategy of many different approaches [...] rather than establishing a normative set of rules' (Schiesser 2015). As such, artistic researchers may have to suffer further under questions of legitimacy yet, since 'the burden of proof always rests with the "novices", whereas the legitimacy of mainstream academic research is seldom fundamentally challenged' (Borgdorff 2006).

³⁶ The work of these two authors - Borgdorff 2006 itself as building directly upon Frayling 1994 - has also been built upon directly in Dombois 2006, Lesage 2009, Schiesser 2015, Klein 2017, to name only a select few.

*Das spezifische Profil der wissenschaftlichen Professionalisierung besteht in einer Verknüpfung von Forschung und Musikpraxis [...] in der Reflexion künstlerischer Prozesse und ihrer Vermittlung.*³⁷

— Hochschule für Musik und Theater, Hamburg (2013/2015).

From this I can draw the fundamental criteria that this dissertation project must combine research and practice, whereby the research can include reflection on the artistic practice. Building upon this dichotomy is a trichotomy made famous by Christopher Frayling, a professor for cultural history in the Royal College of Art in London, and his 1994 *Research in Art and Design*³⁸, where he posits three ‘practical suggestions’ for how artistic research can be produced in the visual arts. The ideas are, however, so general as to allow a seamless transportation into the musical sphere.

His first practical suggestion is that of ‘research **into** art’³⁹, which he described as ‘the most straightforward [due to] countless models - and archives - from which it derives its rules and procedures’ as well as being ‘by far the most common [... including] historical [...] aesthetic or perceptual research [...] into a variety of theoretical perspectives on art [...] social, economic,

³⁷ Hochschule für Musik und Theater, Hamburg (2013/2015). *Ordnung für die Promotion zum Doktor der Musikwissenschaften der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*: https://www.hfmt-hamburg.de/fileadmin/u/ordnungen/SO_DrScMus.pdf. Accessed 16:06, 21.11.17.

³⁸ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. *Royal College of Art Research Papers*, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

³⁹ Strangely, it is a common occurrence for this verbiage to be changed freely when commented upon. I have put this down to art’s subversive and anarchic nature. For example, a charismatic development of it is Julian Klein’s description of Florian Dombois’ own variation, a set of ‘chiastic complements: “Research about/for/through Art | Art about/for through Research”’ (Klein 2017). This particular example is indeed a development, since reversing the order of ‘research’ and ‘art’ is a challenging and stimulating exercise. Other cases seem more ones of taste, where ‘through’ is changed to ‘in’ (Borgdorf 2006f) or ‘as’ (Kershaw 2014), and ‘into’ is changed to ‘on’ (Klein 2017). Here, the value may be one of creativity, pluralism and subversion. In itself, this has an artistic quality. The question could be posed, ‘isn’t one distinctive characteristic of the arts, and hence too of the research tied up with it, their very ability to elude strict classifications and demarcations, and to actually generate the criteria — in each individual art project and every time again and again – which the research is to satisfy, both in the methodological sense and in the ways the research is explained and documented?’ (Borgdorff 2006). The artist-side of an artistic researcher may want consistently to break free of this trichotomy (or any sort of categorisation) or add a personal flavour to it.

political, ethical, cultural, iconographic, technical, material, structural⁴⁰. It describes a hermeneutic approach already common in musicology and music theory, and is rooted heavily in existing methodologies of the humanities. The second suggestion is ‘research *for* art’, which is, in his words, the ‘gathering of reference materials’⁴¹ with the outlook of using them to create further art. I see this as an approach similar to artistic ‘tool-making’ - through the research outcomes, theories (or even more concrete ‘tool’-like artefacts such as software or instrumental innovations) can be formulated and applied by future artists to create the artistic experience. In the words of other academics commenting directly on Frayling, in research for art, ‘art is not so much the object of investigation, but its objective. The research provides insights and instruments that may find their way into concrete practices in some way or other’⁴², where ‘arts-based researchers are not ‘discovering’ new research tools [so much as] they are carving them’⁴³.

His third and final suggestion is ‘research *through* art’, which he fears could lead ultimately to a (from his perspective undesirable precedent of) ‘degree by project’⁴⁴. The theory of ‘research through art’ supposes that an artist works in their practice with artistic knowledge - concepts, theories, experiences, understandings - and the art object articulates this knowledge better any theoretic text. It is controversial because it is so highly detached from the basics of objective, declarative scientific inquiry that skeptics see its inclusion in academia to be a purely tactical one of seeking research money for artistic projects, ultimately helping neither the academy nor the artistic world, which can both exist happily in parallel to one another without such collision⁴⁵. Frayling

⁴⁰ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁴¹ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁴² Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

⁴³ Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford: 1.

⁴⁴ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁴⁵ Hornuff, D. (2015). *Praxis Dr. Kunst geschlossen*. Faz Feuilleton. Can be found under: <http://www.faz.net/-gsn-864ks> accessed 14:50, 21.11.17.

comments cynically yet poignantly that it would lead to ‘giving every single painter since the Renaissance an honorary Ph.D. in absentia’⁴⁶. As a discussion point, however, it remains popular: ‘many say [artistic knowledge] is embodied in the products of art (e.g. Langer 1957, McAllister 2004, Dombois 2006, Lesage 2009, Bippus 2010)⁴⁷, if not ‘the most controversial of the three ideal types’⁴⁸.

Frayling’s ‘practical suggestions’ can be applied to this thesis in order to structure the research content into three components: the construction of a theoretic framework and related compositional concepts for cross-genre composition (research for art via music theory and/or compositional technique, or even ‘tools’), an analysis of the submitted composition, *I.th.Ak.A.* (research into art via hermeneutic interpretation and a systematic analysis), and the creative production of this (compositional) artistic experience itself (research through art). As such, I contend that it is the fundamental **practical** model for artistic research in regards to my thesis.⁴⁹

2.2.2. Henk Borgdorff and an Intellectual Model for Artistic Research in Music

Henk Borgdorff builds directly on Frayling in an accumulative way, creating an **intellectual** model where Frayling sought to give ‘practical suggestions. He claims that legitimacy in artistic research

⁴⁶ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁴⁷ Klein, J. (2017). *What is Artistic Research?* Journal for Artistic Research Online. Originally published in German in: *Gegenworte 23*, Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften 2010.

⁴⁸ Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford.

⁴⁹ On a side note, one could even add ‘with’ to the trichotomy: using art as a catalyst to trigger thought and/or using discursive text as a trigger for the artistic creative process. A survey of using art for social science research is: Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford. An argument for research *with* art could start with how the artistic experience can trigger social research, for example. There is, however, no specifically developed theory for art *with* research or research *with* art, although I have experienced it clearly throughout my dissertation project, where the early and mid-stages of composing and sketching the written supplement were heavily influenced by the artistic experimentation of composing *I.th.Ak.A.*, and the written supplement was principally guided by the creative needs and ideas I experienced whilst composing. I believe this to have been a form of grounded theory in artistic research, whereby I performed an intuitively-lead hit-and-miss style free research in order to define the field of inquiry, rather than prescribing this field in advance of performing the research.

is reliant upon discussing ‘the nature of its research object (an ontological question), in terms of the knowledge it holds (an epistemological question) and in terms of the working methods that are appropriate to it (a methodological question)’⁵⁰. As deceptively simple as it sounds, establishing pathways for an intellectual approach to these three aspects of research form what I argue to be a necessary step in creating a model for artistic research.

In regards to **ontology**, Borgdorff’s definition of it as ‘the nature of its research object’⁵¹ may seem simplistic, since an artistic experience is inherently subjective and therefore difficult to define in an ontological sense. Nevertheless, the consideration of an object of research - an artefact - in artistic research has been fruitful to the development of this thesis and I will venture a personal definition for the purposes of this document: the knowledge as defined by the trichotomy is the ontology of this thesis. Where the artistic experience is subjective, I define the ontology to be that of my experience as the author of both the creative work (‘through’) and the hermeneutic interpretation thereof (‘into’). In other words, although every new observer or critic may experience *I.th.Ak.A.* differently - or indeed I may experience it differently in a future discursive hermeneutic interpretation thereof - for the ontology of this dissertation, the relevant experience is that which I reflected upon in the analysis contained within these pages.

As such, a three-in-one research object (i.e. research into+for+through arts) is the ontology I propose (presenting another variation on popular theme). Exactly how this is to be done is a methodological question. Working towards an understanding of cross-genre composition, it will draw theoretical conclusions about a set of existing repertoire, produce new compositional work

⁵⁰ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

⁵¹ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

attempting to create cross-genre-type music and synthetically carve new tools for the creation of such music. I submit this variation on a potential ontology for artistic research as an original value-added component of my thesis for evaluation. The three-in-one product, one of research into+for+through arts, may have been suggested somewhat cryptically by Giaco Schiesser in an attempt to find ‘other, different concepts, methods and procedures ... over and above [the methods and concepts of science and/or the humanities]’, that of an ‘artifact’, which he described as an ‘artifact’ (perhaps a fact about the arts, an ‘arty sort of fact’ i.e. knowledge of research *into* the arts), ‘art-affect’ (something that affects the arts, perhaps a tool carved by research *for* the arts) and ‘art-effect’ (a piece of art, creating the desired effect in an artistic experience, i.e. research *through* the arts) in one⁵². It is clever in its creative spin on the research artefact. Indeed, artistic research needs an equivalent but different knowledge object to the current scientific artefact, since ‘if [...] artefact-based outcomes [alone] are seen to ‘embody’ the research as the ‘serious’ output, we might suggest that that reproduces the systems of commodity exchange’⁵³. Artists may react especially strongly to the idea that their works - i.e. artistic knowledge products as artefacts - are part of a commodity exchange and not unique manifestations of their personal expression, and this is a legitimate standpoint - artistic output and commodity exchange appear at least to me to be incompatible in the long run. Perhaps the adoption of Schiesser’s ‘artifact’ (sic) as a three-part artistic research knowledge object is the best broad-view solution to an ontology for artistic research.

It is somewhat of a moderate position: ‘radical practitioners [... contest that art objects] may be research ‘in themselves’, while their moderate colleagues would expect some supplementary material - articles, journals, interpretive accounts of various kinds - for the ‘research’ to become

⁵² Schiesser G. (2015). *What Is at Stake: qu'est-ce que l'enjeu? Paradoxes: Problematics: Perspectives in Artistic Research Today*. In: Bast G. et al (2015). *Arts, Research, Innovation and Society. Arts, Research, Innovation and Society*. Springer, Cham.

⁵³ Piccini, A. and B. Kershaw (2003). *Practice as research in performance: from epistemology to evaluation*. *Journal of Media Practice*, 4 (2): 113-23.

manifest [...] the actor “researches” their role and the director the “background” of the work ... but the ‘as’ [meaning art *as* research, the same as research *through* art] makes a claim that the performance or theatre event itself may be a form of research⁵⁴. It seems apparent to me that the art itself must be included somehow in order to achieve a true singularity for artistic research, one which centralises its greatest strength - the artistic experience. If it were to be lost completely from the picture, the baby may have been thrown out with the bathwater. After all, ‘to know a rose by its Latin name and yet to miss its fragrance is to miss much of the rose’s meaning’⁵⁵. This does not seem to be a threat, since ‘despite all the differences of opinion that exist within the ascendant programme of artistic research, there seems to be general agreement about one thing: the practice of the arts is central to artistic research’⁵⁶. These art works should be only carefully, sensitively and incompletely translated into scientific language, since ‘eine sprachliche Beschreibung einer nichtsprachlichen Forschung... [ist] ein Aneignungsprozess’⁵⁷. The art product can talk for itself and provide pathways for a written supplement that illuminates as many aspects of it as possible, such as interior symbolic languages and syntax, the way it relates to other art works and any medium-specific terminology and jargon

The written supplement can also be a discursive product of critical reflection from the artist themselves which leads to the generation of possibilities for future artists, artistic researchers and other researchers *à la* research *for* art. The productive process of creating an artistic object, an ‘art-effect’, can be documented and then interpreted and, to a certain extent, even replicated by third-parties. In so far as this involves the creation of a personal artistic vocabulary, clear ‘art-

⁵⁴ Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*.

⁵⁵ Eisner, E. W. (2003). On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

⁵⁶ Borgdorff, H. (2010). *The Production of Knowledge in Artistic Research*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge 2010.

⁵⁷ Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

affects' (tools for creating art) and 'arti-facts' are created by the originator of them, who one could call the definitive first-source. Such written components are largely commonplace in the acceptance of an artistic research project, required for example by the Research Assessment Exercise in Britain - a 'succinct statement of research content' showing a process which 'interrogates itself' and is 'driven by a research imperative'⁵⁸ - and the Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg, to which I submit this dissertation project, as well as comparable European music institutions in Malmö, Genf and Graz, that are on the vanguard of musical artistic research. Specifically regarding doctoral theses - one of which this document is - it must be considered that the artistic work effectively *counts* towards the scope (or size) of the textual document: 'the size of the textual document is reduced in proportion to the scale of the artefact-based submission thereby implying that one substitutes the other'⁵⁹. The theory is that both works are different parts of the same endeavour, merely dealing with different languages that complement one another, in the same way data from laboratory experiments substitute written text in the natural sciences. If the connection between the two is convincing, then they can be added together to create the complete size of the product. When a symbiotic relationship between the artistic and textual works can be demonstrated, the result is indeed greater than the sum of the parts and a unique functional ontology for artistic research has been reached, according to my perspective, as built on the model from Borgdorff.

⁵⁸ Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) (2006). Dance, Drama and the Performing Arts (cited 15 June 2008), available from <http://www.rae.ac.uk/pubs/2006/01/docs/065.pdf> as quoted in Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts.

⁵⁹ Biggs, M. & Karlsson, H. (2010). *Foundations*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge: 3.

Aware of what sort of knowledge objects could be produced, including any combination of ‘Research about/for/through Art | Art about/for through Research’⁶⁰ or a three-part ‘artifact’⁶¹ combination of them all, epistemological questions can be asked as to what sort of knowledge this is and how it is to be understood and disseminated - as Borgdorff poses in his model. He poses an ‘epistemological question [...] in terms of the knowledge [an ontological object of artistic research] holds’ as being the following: ‘With what kind of knowledge and understanding does research in the arts concern itself? And how does that knowledge relate to more conventional forms of scholarly knowledge?’ In direct succession, he poses a ‘short answer to the first question’ as being ‘knowledge embodied in art practices (objects, processes)’, and through a two-page historical journey encompassing Aristotle, Baumgartner, Adorno and cognitive science of Maurice Merleau-Ponty, arrives at the conclusion that ‘the knowledge embodied in art, which has been variously analysed as tacit, practical knowledge, as ‘knowing-how’ and as sensory knowledge, is cognitive, though nonconceptual; and it is rational, though nondiscursive.’⁶²

As is intimately related to this definition, I posit that the epistemology of artistic research is singularly unique, in that artistic knowledge is that which extends beyond discursive logic into an aesthetic, sensoric one built in the artistic experience, which defies discursive explanation. From this perspective, I relate to Borgdorff’s excursion into historical aesthetics, since the tradition of aesthetics was ‘von der explizit erkenntnistheoretischen Frage motiviert, ob eine ausschließlich im Medium rationaler, logisch-begrifflich gefasster Argumentation operierende Erkenntnisaufassung nicht doch wesentliche Erkenntnismomente ausschließe und entsprechend erweitert werden

⁶⁰ Klein, J. (2017). *What is Artistic Research?* Journal for Artistic Research Online. Originally published in German in: *Gegenworte 23*, Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften 2010.

⁶¹ Schiesser G. (2015). *What Is at Stake: qu’est-ce que l’enjeu? Paradoxes: Problematics: Perspectives in Artistic Research Today*. In: Bast G. et al (2015). *Arts, Research, Innovation and Society. Arts, Research, Innovation and Society*. Springer, Cham.

⁶² All quotations from Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

müsste⁶³. It is a sort of sensual, *felt* knowledge is that which can compliment the scientific as experience in a research *through* art artefact: '[artistic research] has to be acquired through sensory and emotional perception, through the very artistic experience from which it cannot be separated [... it is] sensual and physical, "embodied knowledge"... a felt knowledge'⁶⁴. Where scientific knowledge is based on accurate representation or ability for perfect reconstruction, aesthetic knowledge is built on a 'Fülle der Merkmale' that lead to an artistic experience⁶⁵. The abundance of sensory features offered by a high-quality artwork is this felt, aesthetic, sensoric knoweldge; the know-how of how to best produce them, best appreciate, describe, and disseminate them. When artists know how to produce them only 'by doing' and not by way of rational discourse, which is an inevitable end in many cases, the artwork itself takes over and the felt knowledge is the only sort. Such felt knowledge does not stand in opposition to logical knowledge, even if included in the same three-part artifact form à la research *into* or *for* the arts, but is an extension of logical knowledge with an aesthetic one. It is complementary: 'Komplementarität [...] erlaubt es, die traditionellen Dichotomien intuitiv versus diskursiv, sinnlich versus rational oder objectiv versus subjektiv nicht als Entgegensetzung, sondern als Ergänzung zu denken'⁶⁶. Aesthetic language as a complement to scientific language points strongly to an epistemological singularity for artistic research.

... das Spannungsfeld zwischen sensibler Expertise und Begriff, zwischen Singularität und Allgemeinheit, zwischen Affektion und Reflexion immer neu in Widerstreit zu bringen [... der spezifischer Erkenntnisbegriff wäre] eine Erweiterung des Erkenntnisbegriffs [...] die Schaffung

⁶³ Badura, Jens (2009). *Erkenntnis (Sinnliche)*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes.

⁶⁴ Klein, J. (2017). *What is Artistic Research?* Journal for Artistic Research Online. Originally published in German in: *Gegenworte* 23, Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften 2010.

⁶⁵ Badura, Jens (2009). *Erkenntnis (Sinnliche)*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes. — referencing and paraphrasing Baumgarten, A. (1750). *Aesthetica*.

⁶⁶ Ibid., suggesting for further reading: Martin Seel, *Die Kunst der Entzweiung*. Zum Begriff der ästhetischen Rationalität, Frankfurt/M. S. 306f.

eines Verhandlungsraums unterschiedlicher Erkenntnisweisen [...] die Baumgartensche Tradition von sinnlicher Erkenntnis [...] zugleich auch kritisch entwickelnd [...] Künstlerische Forschung als eine Praxis der Erkenntnisgewinnung [...] als Zusammenspiel mit anderen, diskursiv operierenden Erkenntnisweisen ... [Künstlerische Forschung soll] sich bezüglich der Aushandlung von Konfigurationen der Wissensordnung nicht hinter Affirmationen einer 'ganz anderen' Erkenntnis [...] verstecken.

— Jens Badura, 2010

Furthermore, I contend that the key to making felt knowledge valid is to disseminate it and analyse its impact, since only through the aesthetic experience can one 'feel' the knowledge. It cannot be expressed through words on a page, unless words are its medium, as in poetry. Dissemination is of key interest to a range of parties interested in artistic research, it creates 'artistic research in a socially complex, responsible, and far-reaching sense'⁶⁷, turning away from 'abstract theorising and scientific rationality in favour of action-based investigations oriented toward practical engagement in the world'⁶⁸. This could be achieved through production of documentary media for presentation at professional conferences but perhaps most effectively through linkage to an active artistic career. There is a need for more research dealing with potential for the dissemination of artistic research. Harper notes that 'connections with the development of the creative industries has not been widely mapped or often closely considered [... and ideally] practice-led research in universities and the evolution of the creative industries will be closely linked'⁶⁹.

⁶⁷ Schiesser G. (2015). What Is at Stake: qu'est-ce que l'enjeu? Paradoxes: Problematics: Perspectives in Artistic Research Today. In: Bast G. et al (2015). Arts, Research, Innovation and Society. Arts, Research, Innovation and Society. Springer, Cham.

⁶⁸ Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts.

⁶⁹ Harper, G. (2011). *Practice-led research and the future of the creative industries*. Creative Industries Journal, 4:1, 5-17.

One such study is Alex Wilkie's *Creative Assemblages: Organisation and Outputs of Practice-Led Research*⁷⁰, assessing 100+ artistic research projects in the design field and sorting their impact and dissemination into three categories. Knowledge products ranged from domestic appliances and other consumer products to journal articles, workshops, Ph.D. theses, contemporary art and even policy intervention. The term 'assemblages' was 'drawn upon' out of sociology in order to understand the 'interweaving of practices, technologies, institutions, authors, knowledge and issues constituting the case studies'⁷¹. 'Creative assemblages' are a 'heuristic allowing us to consider 'logics' of inter-disciplinary beyond accountability and transfer and to avoid linear conceptualisations of innovation'. They can be split into the following categories (the first three of which are very convincingly referenced to concrete projects surveyed):

- compact and closed assemblages [...] efforts explicitly oriented to a single outcome [...] characterised by protection of intellectual property;
- compact and open assemblages [...] concentrated on a single outcome [...] disclose intellectual property;
- loose and open assemblages [...] endeavours supported by multiple agencies [...] occupying diverse contexts;
- and, no examples found of 'loose but closed assemblages'.

He notes that 'some of the most exciting assemblages we discovered [...] were loose and open [...] involving] a dynamically shifting cast [...] and producing] outcomes ranging from prototypes on the

⁷⁰ Wilkie, A., Gaver, W., Hemment, D., & Giannachi, G. (January 01, 2010). *Creative Assemblages: Organisation and Outputs of Practice-Led Research*. Leonardo, 43, 1, 98-99.

⁷¹ The following citation is provided by Wilkie (Ibid.): For the notion of the assemblage see, Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. Brian Massumi, trans (London, U.K.: Continuum, 1996). For examples of how the notion has been adopted in the sociology of science and technology see, Alan Irwin and Mike Michael. *Science, social theory and public knowledge* (Open University Press; Buckingham, 2003) p 119. For its utilization within anthropology see, Aihwa Ong and Stephen J. Collier. *Global assemblages: technology, politics, and ethics as anthropological problems* (Oxford, U.K. Blackwell, 2005).

one hand to community events, press coverage, post-graduate researchers and a research community on the other [...] rather than producing a clear transfer of intellectual property for commercial gain' — creating a culture of innovation, rather than any single innovative product. The culture is the innovation, in the loose and open scenario. A view such as this would resonate well with the argument of plurality, subversion and freedom of the nature of art. This research also comes with a warning that 'the danger of looking for commercial pay-offs from practice-based research is that it may construe the organisation and potential outcomes of such investigations too narrowly [...] it is tempting to assume a linear model [...] whereby basic research can reap commercial reward through application, development and diffusion'. What's more, 'it is certainly the case that creative, practice-led research can produce economic as well as cultural benefits [...] but it is equally certain that too narrow a conception of the appropriate organisation and outputs of such research will result in its unique benefits being lost'⁷².

How Wilkie's research could be applied in the field of music or other arts would be either the subject of a new research project or one of fantasy. A broad range of such studies could establish strong dissemination tactics for artistic research and strengthen its epistemology. On a more direct level, the Journal for Artistic Research has been gaining momentum as a flexible forum for posting a plurality of results, offering many pathways for including media, due to its online and not print-based form. JAR aims for 'displaying and documenting practice in a manner that respects artists' modes of presentation, JAR abandons the traditional journal article format and offers [...] a dynamic online canvas where text can be woven together with image, audio and video material'⁷³. Such a platform is one fulfilling the aim for 'a publishing culture based on non-verbal forms of

⁷² All quotes and paraphrases from: Wilkie, A., Gaver, W., Hemment, D., & Giannachi, G. (January 01, 2010). *Creative Assemblages: Organisation and Outputs of Practice-Led Research*. Leonardo, 43, 1, 98-99.

⁷³ Schwab, M. (2011). The Inaugural Issue of the Journal for Artistic Research (JAR). <http://v2.nl/lab/blog/the-inaugural-issue-of-jar>, accessed 17:28, 24.11.17.

discourse [that] should be developed or, rather, different discourses on art-based research should be released from their segregation and their results made comparable and made available to the necessary criticism by peer groups, thus providing them with a really animated research environment⁷⁴. Whatever the method for dissemination should be, at this early stage of artist research's development, it may be enough to carve one's own 'self-reflective, self-critical and outwardly-directed communication'⁷⁵. Viewing the epistemology of artistic research as that which includes the artistic experience itself removes the monopoly that scientific language has on research, whilst embracing the best aspects that scientific language has to offer. Since, were scientific language to be used exclusively to describe the kind of knowledge produced by art, it would render the the artistic experience in music '2D' and not *felt*. It is necessary that such a criteria has evolved, since 'die 'Träger des Wissens [in der Musik sind] nicht wissenschaftliche Artikel'⁷⁶.

Finally, Borgdorff explores potential **methodology** for artistic research, which are in simple terms 'the working methods that are appropriate [to artistic research]' thus completing an intellectual model. In more complete terms, he creates a criteria from the following modulars: '1) whether the research is exact or interpretive in nature, 2) whether it seeks to identify universal laws or to understand the specific, 3) how great a role experimentation plays'⁷⁷. In the cases of research into art, qualitative, hermeneutic methodologies common in the humanities (*Geisteswissenschaften*), which have already been established, will suffice, leading to an interpretive, singular, non-experimental methodology. In research for art, an interpretive, universal, non-experimental methodology could be proposed: it involves interpreting art in order to find descriptors which can

⁷⁴ Schwarz, H.P. (2010). Forward to the Routledge Companion on Research in the Arts: xxx.

⁷⁵ Hannula, M., Suoranta, J., & Vadén, T. (2005). *Artistic Research: Theories, methods and practices*. Helsinki: Academy of Fine Arts.

⁷⁶ Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

⁷⁷ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

work universally to a greater or lesser degree in another process of creating art but does undergo the process of experimentation. The degree to which they work could be slowly established through inter-subjectivity, strong to the extent that it has been established through a quantity and quality of follow-up cases, but never truly objective, i.e. the tools would have to be used and the effectiveness of this process analysed and evaluated, perhaps many times.

In the case of research through art, the artistic researcher is essentially researching the process they undergo when creating art. The methodology would be interpretive, singular and experimental, since ‘unlike other domains of knowledge, art research [here, research through art is meant] employs both experimental and hermeneutic methods in addressing itself to particular and singular products and processes’⁷⁸. As far as art is a personal expression, researching it is a sort of manifesto activity, an ‘extension of personal development: autobiography rather than understanding’⁷⁹. It completely blurs the distinction between subjects and objects of study, and in this way shares a ‘comparison to field research and participant observation in ethnography and social anthropology [...] this approach acknowledges the mutual interpenetration of the subject and object of field research, and might serve to an extent as a model for some types of research in the arts [...] more analytically than empirically oriented [...] and focussed] more on interpretation than on description or explanation’⁸⁰.

Taking one’s own work as the object of hermeneutic academic research is a controversial but undeniably unique methodological singularity of artistic research, where ‘it is the artist’s own experience and insight that are the point of departure for artistic research, unlike research on the

⁷⁸ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

⁷⁹ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁸⁰ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

arts, which is based on looking in from the outside'⁸¹. Such a methodology could be called a 'nachdenkliche Methodologie', which according to Anke Haarmann suits artistic research in that it is not 'Festlegend, Einengung und Disziplinierung' but rather '[macht] namhaft [... eine] Vielheit der Wissenspraktiken [und] deren mannigfaltige Besonderheiten' and would be 'eine Lehre von den Wegen des künstlerischen Wissens, die nicht vorschreibt, sondern nachvollzieht'⁸². The artistic researcher working through art would experience through reflection a symbiotic benefit whereby the artist self would benefit from the critical one and the critical one informed by the artistic: 'wissenschaftliche Elementen Verankerung der künstlerischen - künstlerischen eine Ergänzung (Bereicherung) der wissenschaftlichen'⁸³. It would be a sort of 'Metacognition [... a] heightened self-reflexivity about one's own artistic practice [... and the] ability to position this practice in relation to wider artistic and non-artistic discourses'⁸⁴, where 'the performing body bites back at the thinking mind in a prospective quintessential practice-as-research experiment'⁸⁵. Indeed, who else could perform such a reflection on the work? At best, a close friend, colleague or student, who in some way knows the artist's work 'better than they do' could perform this, although the idea of objective distance is questionable in this case, too. It's best to sacrifice the idea of distance, opting instead for (inter-)subjective models, leaving the door wide open for artists to take their own work as the object of study, 'because artistic creative processes are inextricably bound up with the creative personality and with the individual, sometimes idiosyncratic gaze of the artist, research like

⁸¹ Malterud, N. (2012). *Artistic research – necessary and challenging*. InFormation 1/2012 trans. Bergen Academy of Art and Design.

⁸² Haarmann, A. (2010). *Methodologie*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes: 85-88.

⁸³ Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

⁸⁴ Lazarevic (2017). *(Artistic) Research - current state of affairs in our little neck of the woods*. In 13. Jahre Masterstudiengang Multimediale Komposition an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

⁸⁵ Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*.

this can best be performed “from within”⁸⁶. In summary: a reflective methodology in research through art would involve a symbiotic thinking where the artistic work undergoes a well-structured critical reflection and the scientific work is informed by the researcher’s artistic sensibilities, intuition and experience. Such a methodology would not require detailed prescription of artistic working methods but rather a sort of grounded theory whereby the researcher discovers the knowledge (and the balanced written and artistic form of this knowledge) about the creative process through free experimentation, something inherent to the nature of the arts.

I see the big strength of a reflective methodology as a double possibility to firstly stimulate artists towards well-structured critical reflection and evaluation which surely would lead to better art (since high-quality art embodies more artistic knowledge than that of lower-quality) and secondly as a generator for first-source data regarding artistic methods - written supplements to accompany new artistic works, which methodically and critically detail the creative process and can become ex ante documents for later research. In the latter case, inter-subjective patterns can be gleamed both within and between artistic disciplines. Models for interdisciplinary cooperation can be generated through informed guesses as to working methods of particular artists based on such knowledge. The knowledge artefacts would be artworks and supplementary first-source data on those works, where the data is a unique form of research into art since it was generated by the first-source (the creator of the artwork in question) within the same timeframe, sort of like a diary to ‘generate novel, reflexive zones’⁸⁷. This may also lead to a symbiotic influence of the written supplement back onto the artwork, something which could not have been achieved by an external observer. Here, what is often seen in science as an imperfection - the influence of subject on object - is turned into a

⁸⁶ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

⁸⁷ Slager, H. (2009). *Art and method*, in Elkins, J., (ed.) *Artists with PhDs*, Washington, d.C.: new academia publishing, 49–56

positive, knowledge-generating methodology in itself. Such a paradigm shift is exactly the sort of innovative singularity which artistic research seeks.

Coming down again to a practical level from the heights of intellectual theory, the question remains as to what researchers through art could write at the outset, since a statement of intention seems completely necessary for institutions and individuals looking to fund or otherwise sponsor artistic research. It is complicated, nevertheless, since ‘even the most open and carefully expressed queries inevitably imply a more or less predictable range of responses, which flatly contradicts the qualities of radical openness and excess that the creativity of [the arts] at its best can produce’⁸⁸. A more open, quasi-grounded theory approach could allow art to ‘generate the criteria’, since ‘academic researchers often develop the appropriate research methods and techniques as they go [... and the] rules for the validity and reliability of the research results [...] are defined within the research domain itself’⁸⁹, relying heavily on trust that the artistic researcher will produce a convincing reflective methodology, which may only work in limited cases. This is what I meant by ‘research *with* art | art *with* research’. The Norwegian National Artistic Research Fellowship Programme requires the following methodological components at the outset: ‘His/her personal artistic position/work in relation to the chosen subject area nationally and internationally; How the project contributes to professional development of the subject area [...] Critical reflection on the process (artistic choices and turning points, theory applied, dialogue with various networks and professional environments etc.) [...] Critical reflection on the results (self-evaluation in relation to the revised project description)’ and allows ‘the candidate [to] choose the appropriate medium and form’⁹⁰. At

⁸⁸ Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts.

⁸⁹ Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

⁹⁰ Norwegian National Artistic Research Fellowship Programme (2010). *Regulations for the Research Fellowship Programme*. Available at <http://www.kunststipendiat.no/index.php/en/regulations>.

the very least, artists could describe ‘hunches — or, more conventionally, ‘intuitions’ — [which] problematise the well-worn modernist oppositions between mind and body, spirituality and materiality, creativity and rationality, arts and sciences, and so on’⁹¹.

A general methodology for musical artistic research would require decoding the ‘combination of genius and technical skills’⁹² required to compose the artistic experience, demonstrating ‘cognitive elements’ of the work in addition to the ‘expressive’⁹³. The potential exists to articulate intellectual, cognitive and/or technical elements as opposed to the more purely expressive, the latter of which cannot be discursively articulated, and at best assessed through trans-/inter-subjective⁹⁴ interpretation and reflection. This is a methodological basis for including art works in artistic research, which is in itself a (unique) singularity on the research spectrum. The artist-as-researcher/researcher-as-artist has a significant advantage when performing this dual-skilled exercise, since they have both skill-sets required and can rely on their personal experience in both fields. At best, they can act as translators between languages and think symbiotically, using the two at once or in quick succession. My ultimate argument is that artistic research coincides with both scientific and artistic concepts of form, validity and language when it attempts to find the ultimate degree to which one can be objective, controlled and distant but does not shy away from exceeding this point by using artistic language (i.e. creating art) in the pursuit of new knowledge, doing so with declared awareness and reflection. Where the scientific language becomes insufficient, the artistic language gradually takes over. How the artistic language could ‘take over’ is a key part of answering Borgdorff’s ‘methodological question’.

⁹¹ Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*. 115.

⁹² Lesage, Dieter (2009). *Who’s Afraid of Artistic Research? On measuring artistic research output*. *Art and Research* Spring 2/2 2009.

⁹³ Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

⁹⁴ See the footnote regarding trans-subjectivity in Part 1 of this chapter for an explanation, definition of and positioning to this terminology.

2.3. Summary and Methodology for this Thesis

In summary, I believe artistic research has the potential of a revolutionary paradigm shift. Universities can collect and foster bright artistic minds that otherwise may stay exclusively within the 'free scene' and fulfil part of their given mission to generate new knowledge of any and all sort for the benefit of every aspect of society. What's more, existing academic dissemination structures can offer new pathways for the sharing of this knowledge, and the pathways themselves can become more sensitive to felt, aesthetic knowledge; new pathways (such as JAR) would also develop. Artists themselves can structure their critical reflections in a methodical manner for the benefit of others. This offers possibilities for discovering patterns and proposing future developments that may have remained tacit had they not been discursively verbalised not to mention being a potentially great assistance to the artists themselves through increased meta-cognition. Establishing artistic research would create a unique singularity on the already richly sophisticated spectrum of artistic knowledge we enjoy today. This requires ontological, epistemological and methodological arguments, sophisticated versions of which already exist, as demonstrated by the ruminations of Henk Borgdorff and the additional commentaries that I provided in section 2, as relating to his work. It provides knowledge products into, for and (even) through art (perhaps also 'with'), which extend and enrich scientific artefacts through their hermeneutic and practice-based aesthetic knowledge. Methods for performing the research and the form of the products will be necessarily pluralistic due to the nature of experimental creative endeavour. Overall, the fusion of artistic and scientific thought may be one that benefits all involved.

On the basis of these thoughts on artistic research, I have formulated a methodology for my dissertation project. It will be a three-in-one knowledge product submitting a multifaceted argument

for the genesis of a philosophical aesthetic theory I name cross-genre composition. This includes: a new original composition that embodies this theory and served as a canvas for its manifestation as art, the development of this theory in a written discourse on the basis of my original thoughts and a range of other intellectuals from various fields, an original method for analysing compositions according to this theory, and a prototypical analysis of the submitted composition using the original analytic method.

The analytic method and theoretical discourse on the theory can be used to by third parties for musical analysis, musicological discussion and/or as a stimulus for the creative process of composition, acting as an ex ante document. It creates perspectives to cross-genre composition, which can be personalised by third parties, rather than a prescriptive method for it. I intentionally leave this door open and avoid a narrow definition here, in order to create a 'loose and open assemblage', as described by Wilke 2010 in section 3.2. of this chapter, although concrete terms are provided, defined, explored and employed, forming a vocabulary which is tool-like in nature and is research for art. This perspective on cross-genre composition also offers possibilities for these parties to create a relative subjectivity through intersubjectivity or trans-subjectivity, where other composers, analysis or musicologists themselves would try the creative process of cross-genre composition, the analytic method for it, or a discussion thereof.

Arising from this theoretical discourse are specific vocabularies and definitions that can be considered clear examples of tools - I consider this process of tool-making and making of discourse research for art. The analysis of the submitted score (*I.th.Ak.A.*) that highlights elements of this approach is research into art, and the substantial original composition that attempts to articulate the theory musically is research through art. All three components are intended to be complimentary, taking off where the others cease to be effective, forming a symbiotic relationship and influencing

one another in both conscious and unconscious ways. They were developed with a quasi grounded theory methodology whereby I discovered the knowledge (and the balanced written and artistic form of this knowledge) about the creative process through free experimentation, something inherent to the nature of the arts.

The research for the thesis has followed two main phases:

1. Free research into a 'hunch' as to the existence of a compositional approach which enriches the classical music tradition with elements of commercial music genres, following a grounded-theory-style 'reflective' methodology, including:
 - initial shallow analyses of scores by esteemed, established composer-peers of mine;
 - free composition;
 - reading and theoretic experimentation by way of sketching essays and exchange with the supervisors and doctoral seminars offered by the university;
 - drafting and re-drafting of the methodology for the dissertation project, as encapsulated by this chapter on artistic research.
2. Crystallisation of the core research materials:
 - completion of the original composition as completion of experimentation-through-doing;
 - finished articulation of artistic research as the framework and academic scheme for the thesis;
 - development of a philosophical aesthetic perspective on cross-genre composition, an approach to musical analysis, and the combination of these two elements into a method for analysis per the theory of cross-genre composition in order to analyse the score with scientific consistency under an original universal paradigm;
 - analysis of the score for the original submitted composition.

2.4. Bibliography

Art and Humanities Research Council (2017). *Research Funding Guide*. Version 3.9. <http://www.ahrc.ac.uk/documents/guides/research-funding-guide/> . Accessed on 21.11.17.

Art and Humanities Research Council (2017). *Arts and Humanities Research and Innovation*. https://www.nesta.org.uk/sites/default/files/arts_and_humanities_research_and_innovation.pdf . Accessed on 21.11.17

Association Européenne des Conservatoires, Académies de Musiques et Musikhochschulen (AEC) (2015). *Key Concepts for AEC Members Artistic Research An AEC Council 'White Paper', 2015*. <https://www.aec-music.eu/userfiles/File/Key%20Concepts/White%20Paper%20AR%20-%20Key%20Concepts%20for%20AEC%20Members%20-%20EN.pdf>. Accessed 16:12, 21.11.17.

Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. 1. Auflage. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes.

Badura, J. (2009). *Erkenntnis (Sinnliche)*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes

Biggs, M. & Karlsson, H. (2010). *Foundations*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge.

Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

Borgdorff, H. (2009), *Onderzoek in kunsten bloeit*, Science Guide 2009. online. <http://www.scienceguide.nl/200903/onderzoek-in-kunsten-bloeit.aspx>. Accessed on 1 march 2010, link now defunct. — as quoted by Kälvevemark in the Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts.

Borgdorff, H. (2010). *The Production of Knowledge in Artistic Research*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge.

Crispin, D. (2015). *Forschen in den Künsten: Musik*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A.,

Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. 1. Auflage. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes.

Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB

EILA (2016), *The 'Florentine Principles' on the Doctorate in the Arts* as presented in the 14th ELIA Biennial Conference *Turn Mirrors Into Windows*, 30 November - 3 December 2016 Florence, Italy.

Available u.a.: http://www.elia-artschools.org/userfiles/File/customfiles/elia-florenceprinciples2017-digital_20170406105153.pdf accessed 17:31, 20.11.17.

Eisner, E. W. (2003). On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

EUA (2005), *General Rapporteur's Report*. http://www.eua.be/eua/jsp/en/upload/Salzburg_Report_final.1129817011146.pdf, accessed 13:24, 21.11.18. but here quoting a summary provided by: EILA (2016), *The 'Florentine Principles' on the Doctorate in the Arts* as presented in the 14th ELIA Biennial Conference *Turn Mirrors Into Windows*, 30 November - 3 December 2016 Florence, Italy.

Feyerabend, P. (1984). *Wissenschaft als Kunst*. Frankfurt/M.

Flender, Reinhard (2017). *Der Doktor der musikalischen Wissenschaften Dr. scientiae musicae an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater*. In *13. Jahre Masterstudiengang Multimediale Komposition an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

Gilsén, Y. (2006), 'Research: notions and complications', in L. Elkjaer (ed.), *Re.Searching — Om Praksisbaseret Forskning i Scenekunst*, NordScen: Nordisk center for Scenekunst, pp. 125-40

Haarman, A. (2010). *Methodologie*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes: 85-88.

Hannula, M., Suoranta, J., & Vadén, T. (2005). *Artistic Research: Theories, methods and practices*. Helsinki: Academy of Fine Arts.

Harper, G. (2011). *Practice-led research and the future of the creative industries*. *Creative Industries Journal*, 4:1, 5-17.

Hochschule für Musik und Theater, Hamburg (2013/2015). *Ordnung für die Promotion zum Doktor der Musikwissenschaften der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. https://www.hfmt-hamburg.de/fileadmin/u/ordnungen/SO_DrScMus.pdf. Accessed 16:06, 21.11.17.

Hornuff, D. (2015). *Praxis Dr. Kunst geschlossen*. *Faz Feuilleton*. Can be found under: <http://www.faz.net/-gsn-864ks> accessed 14:50, 21.11.17.

Kälveemark, Torsten (2010). *University politics and practice-based research*. in *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge (2010): 3-23.

Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*.

Kjørup, S. (2010). *Pleading for Plurality: artistic and Other Kinds of research*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge (2010).

Klein, J. (2015). *Peer Review*. In *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin:

Diaphanes

Klein, J. (2017). *What is Artistic Research?* Journal for Artistic Research Online. Originally published in German in: *Gegenworte 23*, Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften 2010.

Lazarevic (2017). *(Artistic) Research - current state of affairs in our little neck of the woods*. In *13. Jahre Masterstudiengang Multimediale Komposition an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford.

Lesage, Dieter (2009). *Who's Afraid of Artistic Research? On measuring artistic research output*. Art and Research Spring 2/2 2009.

Malterud, N. (2012). *Artistic research – necessary and challenging*. InFormation 1/2012 trans. Bergen Academy of Art and Design.

Norwegian National Artistic Research Fellowship Programme (2010). *Regulations for the Research Fellowship Programme*. Available at <http://www.kunststipendiat.no/index.php/en/regulations>.

OECD Frascati Manual, Sixth edition, 2002, para. 64, page 30. Also available online through their website <https://stats.oecd.org/>.

Polanyi, M. (1967): *The Tacit Dimension*. New York

Piccini, A. and B. Kershaw (2003). *Practice as research in performance: from epistemology to evaluation*. Journal of Media Practice, 4 (2): 113-23.

RAE (2008). *RAE 2008: the outcome*. <http://www.rae.ac.uk/pubs/2008/01/>, accessed 14:15, 21.11.17.

Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) (2006). Dance, Drama and the Performing Arts (cited 15 June 2008), available from <http://www.rae.ac.uk/pubs/2006/01/docs/065.pdf> as quoted in Kershaw, B.

(2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T.

(2014). Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts.

Raes, G.W (2014). *Experimental Art as Research*. In Crispin D., Gilmore B (ed) (2014). *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology*. Leuven University Press.

Seel, M. (1997). *Die Kunst der Entzweiung: Zum Begriff der ästhetischen Rationalität*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.

Schiesser G. (2015). What Is at Stake: qu'est-ce que l'enjeu? Paradoxes: Problematics: Perspectives in Artistic Research Today. In: Bast G. et al (2015). *Arts, Research, Innovation and Society*. Arts, Research, Innovation and Society. Springer, Cham.

Schwarz, H.P. (2010). Forward to the Routledge Companion on Research in the Arts.

Slager, H. (2009). *Art and method*, in Elkins, J., (ed.) *Artists with PhDs*, Washington, d.C.: new academia publishing

Smith, Hazel, and R T. Dean (2014). *Practice-led Research, Research-Led Practice in the Creative Arts*. Edinburgh University Press.

Sullivan, G. (2010). *Artistic Cognition and Creativity*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge

Wilkie, A., Gaver, W., Hemment, D., & Giannachi, G. (January 01, 2010). Creative Assemblages: Organisation and Outputs of Practice-Led Research. *Leonardo*, 43, 1, 98-99.

Wilson, M., & Ruiten, S. (2013). *SHARE handbook of artistic research education*. Amsterdam:

ELIA

3. Developing the Compositional Ideology of Cross-Genre

3.1. Definitions

3.1.1. A Focus on Developing the Ideology of Cross-Genre Theory for Musical Analysis

3.1.2. Working Definitions of the Key Terms

3.2. Developing the Cross-Genre Theory

3.2.1. Exploring and Defining Genre

3.2.1.1. Introduction and Line of Questioning

3.2.1.2. The Nature of Commercial Music Genres

3.2.1.3. Approaches to the Assessment of Modern Music Genres

3.2.1.4. Exploring the Specific Cultural Information Contained in Modern Music Genres

3.2.2. Dichotomic Artistic Relationships and Potential for their ‘Crossing’

3.2.2.1. Boris Groys and Conceiving of New Art as the Result of a Space

3.2.2.2. Postcolonialism as a Source for Developing the Cross-Genre Approach

3.2.2.3. Homi K. Bhabha and Constructive Terms for the Cross-Genre Approach Arising from Postcolonial Studies

3.3. Chapter Bibliography

3.1. Definitions

3.1.1. A Focus on Developing the Ideology of Cross-Genre Theory for Musical Analysis

Within the intellectual framework of artistic research I will form an original compositional ideology called ‘cross-genre’ and a method of musical analysis that can establish the presence and functionality of this ideology in the opera *I.th.Ak.A.*, so as to produce insights into my creative

process as a composer. As such, I wish to position my theory of cross-genre composition as an ideology capable at serving as a basis for a new method of musical analysis, and, after this chapter on developing this ideology, I will focus on creating an analytic method for analysing how encoding operatic characters with elements of commercial music genres can form a narrative semiology thusly. The goal of this chapter is, therefore, to define and explore the terms and concepts that will make the creation of this method possible. These terms and concepts derive from sociology, in particular, assessing cultural exchange in postcolonial contexts, but will be ‘translated’ through original thought into the musical sphere, focussing on how they can describe exchange between musical cultures. This is a key area of original research outcomes and generates some essential ‘tools’ for third parties to use: either for musicologists and analysts to use in discursive debate or for composer to use in a research-for-art scenario.

The terms could also serve as a stimulus for composition through a process of ‘reverse engineering’ - when a composer wishes to work creatively with musical elements belonging to what they perceive or define as musical spheres ‘outside’ of theirs, the terms can be used as a compass for how the results could be achieved. Were the artistic results to be then analysed using the same terms (the tools for their creation), a compositional technique could be assessed⁹⁵ through the critical comparison of the composer’s: artistic intention, technical realisation and musical effect. Indeed, as with the creative process, the results must not necessarily be then clearly analysable using the same terms for them to be valid - they would have still served as a stimulus. These terms articulate many key aspects of my creative process, and I make specific note in chapter 6 as to how I was creatively inspired through the concept of ‘third space’ (which will be developed and defined in this chapter),

⁹⁵ For example, one could analyse Mozart’s music using the contrapuntal technique of Joseph Fux, since we know Mozart to have learnt from this book: we can assess what he learnt and how this was applied.

and it is possible for other composers to find a similar inspiration through employing these terms and concepts in their own way.

In this combined-product artistic research dissertation project (*künstlerisch-wissenschaftlich*), however, the compositional process was done *largely* intuitively. It is only through reading, thinking, discussing, sketching and writing about the theory that I could form an articulate theory of this process post factum and realise the extent to which these ideas were at play during the process. In other words, the compositional process was a sort of free, intuitive experimentation with a semi-cognitive goal (since I had a vague concept of cross-genre⁹⁶ in mind throughout the entire compositional process) but without a cognitive technique - that technique was created afterwards, using the score as a large experiment. Through the background research into artistic research and musical analysis, leading to the creation of new terms for musical analysis, I develop a technique for analysing the intuitive experimentation (*I.th.Ak.A.*) and evaluating the results. Future artistic research projects of mine regarding cross-genre composition will take off from the basis formed in this thesis.

This methodology was formed through the research into artistic research, for example the about/for/through(/with) categorisation and 'reflective ('*nachdenkliche*') methodology, which seeks to make intuitive decisions cognitive through post factum reflection on artistic experimentation. Similar methods have seemingly always been at play in the history of composition, since self-improvement is the goal of any ambitious composer. Yet the expression of this into words (and formula-like techniques) seems to have accelerated in the 20th century with works such as Schönberg's writing on dodecaphony⁹⁷ and Messiaen's *Technique de mon Langage Musical*, which could be considered

⁹⁶ Originally, I labelled this 'mixed-genre'.

⁹⁷ See: Schoenberg, A. (1975). *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*. Edited by Leonard Stein, translated by Leo Black. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

along side their compositions as early examples of artistic research, were one to attach a posthumous methodology to their work, and provide it with academic legitimisation of this work as artistic research through trans-subjectivity. I believe that my thesis is a personal equivalent to such writings, submitted along side a large work which demonstrate its application in the realm of artistic experience.

3.1.2. Working Definitions of Some Key Terms

The title of this thesis is: Cross-genre composition: encoding characters in the chamber opera I.th.Ak.A. with semiotic elements derived from commercial music genres. I will elucidate my perspective on key terms of this title in the following chapter, where ‘semiotic’ will be explored through a larger exploration into semiotics at a later point. The main need for working definitions is to establish positioning and context within the extravagantly diverse modern musical landscape. Specifically, this will involve defining my position as a composer ‘inside’ the classical music tradition and the position of other musical influences of mine as ‘outside’ commercial music genres⁹⁸. An emerging result of the digital revolution is the extraordinary speed and affordability of almost the complete intercultural musical repertoire since the beginning of audio recording. With this background, my theory searches for a combinatoric technique to combine differing categories in this landscape. The nature of a ‘differing category’ is one of definition: music XY is merely defined as being different to music Z, even if this is very real to many people and has a strong, palpable basis in musical society.

⁹⁸ This relationship of ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ will later be codified as a process of creating ‘newness’ through considering the ideas of Boris Groys.

Most prevalent to me and my work is the definition that I am writing music in the **classical music tradition**, specifically, **opera**. Where some colleagues of mine see themselves as an artist not necessarily located inside the classical music tradition, or would avoid thinking in these terms at all, I have sought a connection to classical music tradition strongly enough and over a long enough period of time to be confident that it is right for me. With this confidence, I can produce a manifesto-style reflective discursive text referencing my artistic work, such as those by Messiaen and Schoenberg - indeed, the relatedness of my text to those examples show a sort of tradition, referencing key works of influential masters. **Tradition** in this sense can be seen as a ‘continual paradigmatic transformation, inter- or intratextual, of given material, the repetition and varying of stock elements, the aesthetic of a “changing same”⁹⁹. The ‘given material’ and/or ‘stock elements’ are the combination of intuitive composition and cognitive reflection in an attempt to create new knowledge for further research, regarding the development of a creative process for an individual artist. Tradition here is related to the idea of a canon of important works of which one is not ignorant, even if the intention is to break from them, rather than build upon them, although this difference ultimately hard to see is. T.S. Eliot expressed this thought in his essay *Tradition and the Individual Talent*:

...the historical sense compels a man to write not merely with his own generation in his bones, but with a feeling that the whole of the literature of Europe from Homer and within it the whole of the literature of his own country has a simultaneous existence and composes a simultaneous order.¹⁰⁰

T.S. Eliot

⁹⁹ Middleton, R. (2000). *Work-in-(g) Practice: Configuration of the Popular Music Intertext*, in Talbot M. (ed.), *The Musical Work: Reality or Invention?*. Liverpool, Liverpool University Press.

¹⁰⁰ Eliot, T. S., and Washington, P. (1998). *Eliot: poems and prose*. New York: A.A. Knopf.

Commentators of the contemporary era, such as Joseph Kerman, have been highly critical of the process by which musical analysis is used to ascribe higher value to works that conform with the analytical technique in question over those that don't¹⁰¹. Perhaps the expression of my artistic ideas in discursive language will make them easier to understand and therefore easier to defend in with pre-Kerman positivistic tactic, and contemporary commentators may be critical of this and say that I have merely invented a theory and analytical technique in order to validate and legitimise my musical approach. Regardless of this contentious criticism, the main goal of the research in this project is to create new knowledge with the goal of bettering my creative process, and perhaps those of others.

A significantly imposing question is: what is classical music? This term, although not included in the title of the thesis, is important for the later analysis where I freely discuss 'contemporary classical music' ('CCM'). One could say that the entire field of musicology could be seen as incomplete, 'living' research into this question. As such, the categorical divides described in 1.2. narrow this question down and the previous chapters on musical analysis and artistic research serve to position my perspective on musicology with literature reviews. I suggest, therefore, that **classical music** can be seen as: the music addressed by the theories described in the previous chapter, the literature review on musical analysis - a definition with an intimate connection to this thesis. I do not wish to venture a general definition of classical music but leave it instead as relying upon the thoughts up to this point. As a further indication of what this may mean in a broader sense, one could look at the Oxford *Living* Dictionaries (the emphasis here is original and shows a connection to my reference to musicology as 'living' research, meaning, it is always needing to be updated): 'Serious music following long-established principles rather than a folk, jazz, or popular

¹⁰¹ see: Kerman, J. (1985). *Contemplating music: Challenges to musicology*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press: 12. and his other texts as referenced in the previous chapter.

tradition.¹⁰² ‘Long-established principles’ can be well understood with the aforementioned attention to the theoretical history of the discipline - musicology - and the dichotomic term ‘rather than’ will be crucial to the concepts of ‘cross(-ing)’, ‘enrichment’, inside/outside and hybridity that will come to be explored: ‘rather than’ indicates that there is a body that is Other to the tradition, and creates an ‘inside’ (i.e. inside the tradition) and an ‘outside’ (that music not contained within the symbolic walls of a canonic musical tradition such as classical music).

This is obviously a topic open to significant debate, and indeed some theories I addressed in the previous chapters may include music of a ‘folk, jazz, or popular tradition’, which themselves may follow long-established principles and in many ways ‘serious’ (regarding the previous OLD definition) in nature. This is a sort of ‘overlap’ between the two categories: classical music tradition and commercial music genres. The line between the two is blurry, and it is into exactly this border zone that I aim many moments of my music and the theory of cross-genre composition. Such a border zone is described by Homi K. Bhabha as a place to find insights into his concept of *third space*, and the term ‘border zone’ will appear throughout my analysis of *I.th.Ak.A.*. Through the act of delineation, a debate may be sparked as to the validity of this very delineation, which can in turn spark artists and musicologists to cross-over the borders, hybridise seemingly contradictory components and otherwise bring things on either side of a dividing line in contact with one another (i.e. the beginning motivations for the cross-genre theory). This can be referenced to the ‘anarchic’ nature of art, as detailed in the chapter on artistic research. Again, I prefer such commentary and reference to the previous literature review to a general definition of classical music, so as to leave it open for interpretation and a fluid ‘enrichment’, challenge and/or hybridity with commercial music genres.

¹⁰² "Classical Music | Definition of Classical Music in English by Oxford Dictionaries." Oxford Dictionaries | English. April 09, 2018. Accessed April 09, 2018. https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/classical_music.

On a personal note, it is the very fact that I am located inside the traditional ‘space’ that gives me the freedom to be anarchic, rebel and bring about change. I see the usage of ‘outside’ materials in a work in the ‘inside’ of a tradition to be a progressive act of breaking taboo, something I find artistically stimulating. The classical music scene has a certain tinge of tame domesticity; some colleagues want to exercise a wildness that they see as unfitting to the well-dressed, well-spoken and well-mannered regular classical music audience. Instead, they search for performance venues with a dingy, run-down vibe and make aesthetic decisions at every turn to avoid the ‘fineness’, elitism or blatant decadence that clearly do exist in many classical music events. By positioning myself in the primary spaces of classical music - the concert halls and opera houses - an even more insidious opportunity to rebel is presented in attempting to unlock the wildness and dinginess in the otherwise well-mannered classical music scene. What’s more, my experience has been that this act is very welcome. The fact of the matter to me is that poor-manners is much more wild in a relative sense at a classical music event than it is in a rock or techno club¹⁰³. It is this context-based relationship that forms the delineation in my thesis, and both sides of this delineation can be brought together through the cross-genre theory.

Within the concept of the classical music tradition is the sub-category (or perhaps even sub-genre) **opera**. Being a sub-category, one should apply the working definition of the ‘classical music tradition’ on top of any new constraints. Such constraints may be defined simply as such:

Most narrowly conceived, the word ‘opera’ signifies a drama in which the actors sing throughout. There are, however, so many exceptions among the operatic works of the West – so many works

¹⁰³ again, See: Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso for a broader discussion of this phenomenon.

popularly called operas in which some parts are spoken or mimed – that the word should be more generically defined as a drama in which the actors sing some or all of their parts.

Grove Dictionary Online¹⁰⁴.

Following, **opera** is a dramatic work in the classical music tradition in which the actors sing some or all of their parts, although I would add that singing and music should be significant and irreplaceable components, without which the work would be radically reduced in artistic information (here referring to the inseparable unity of form and artistic message - a theory of 'felt' artistic experience as exposed by Klein in the chapter on artistic research).

Genres are defined in simple form here as sets of musical constraints that are recognisable to the listener and/or analyst. Such constraints form a hierarchy from high to low, where 'high constraints ... operate on all music of a given tradition, as tonality does for western European music from the middle Baroque through the Classical period'¹⁰⁵ and 'low constraints' are freedoms being tweaked in order to achieve personal style in order to 'stand out whilst also fitting in'¹⁰⁶. The progression downwards from high to low constraints is one of more precise analysis of the genre. Taking again genres of Classical music: 'all pieces termed *rondo* must minimally consist of two similar sections separated by a contrasting section (ABA). Yet lower on the hierarchy of constraints would be the characteristics of all rondos of a particular composer. Still lower would be the description of a particular piece. As one moves down the hierarchy of constraints, formalisation becomes increasingly difficult.'

¹⁰⁴ Brown, H. M. et al (2018). *Opera(i)* (It., from Lat. *opera*, plural of *opus*: 'work'; Fr. *opéra*; Ger. *Oper*). Grove Dictionary Online: <https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40726>. Accessed 17:55 on 24.04.2018.

¹⁰⁵ Becker, J., & Becker, A. (1983). *A grammar of the musical genre "srepegan."*. In *Asian Music* 14/2 (1983).

¹⁰⁶ Paraphrased from: Bellaviti, S. (2015). *Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians*. *Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

Alternatively and more simply, Jennifer C. Lena and Richard A. Peterson ‘define music genres as systems of orientations, expectations, and conventions that bind together an industry, performers, critics, and fans in making what they identify as a distinctive sort of music’¹⁰⁷ - a perspective that invites a sociological approach essential to the more detailed exploration of genre that follows this introductory section. Furthermore, the nature of genre sometimes ‘organizes the production and consumption of cultural material, including organizational procedures¹⁰⁸ [...] and influences tastes and the larger structures of stratification in which they are embedded¹⁰⁹’.¹¹⁰

An exploration of the nature of genres and the potential they have to enrich music in the classical tradition will follow. Nevertheless, for the benefit of the working definitions, it is necessary to say that there is also broad consensus that genres are not static, but fluid and evolving by nature¹¹¹. Also, genres are grouped in hierarchical collections. Paramount are what Roy Shuker calls meta-genres—‘loose collections of related genres, such as dance, or world music, within which are any

¹⁰⁷ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹⁰⁸ See: Ahlqvist and Faulkner 2002; Ballard, Dodson, and Bazzini 1999; Becker 1982; Bielby and Bielby 1994; Griswold 1987; Hirsch 1972; Negus 1999 - according to Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). *Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹⁰⁹ See: Bourdieu 1993, 1995; Lizardo 2006 - according to Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). *Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹¹⁰ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹¹¹ See:

- Harris, T. (1995). *Genre. The Journal of American Folk-Lore*. 108 (430): 509.
- Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). *Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.
- Sparling, H. (2008). *Categorically speaking: towards a theory of (musical) genre in Cape Breton gaelic culture. Ethnomusicology : Journal of the Society for Ethnomusicology*. 2008/52/401
- Bellaviti, S. (2015). *Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians. Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

number of sub-genres (such as house and techno), which themselves may be further subdivided (hard house, classic house)¹¹².

The question of what constitutes a **commercial** musical genre is even more open to debate than the basic existence and nature of musical genres. On this subject, I have found no convincing research to the extent that a review of the debate is not possible. I submit my own ideas in its place. In defining **commercial**, I suggest the observation of commercial ‘charts’, where the sort of chart relevant to the time period in which the analysis is taking place should be observed. In the latter part of the 20th Century, these were the ‘billboards’, for example. In 2018, I suggest that the most representative charts of mainstream listening are those on Spotify, iTunes, YouTube or any similar platform that is currently the world leader in music distribution: the genres, sub-genres and sub-sub-genres available on these platforms, for which there are commercial charts, are the commercial genres, broadly-speaking. There are, of course, charts tracking the sales of music of the classical music tradition: this represents an overlap between the classical music tradition and commercial music genres, a second sort of ‘overlap’ (the first ‘overlap’ being theories addressing the classical music tradition that consider music related to commercial music genres - indeed, theories such as cross-genre music). This is testament to the reality that there is no black-and-white line between the classical music tradition and commercial genres, rather, there is an intuitive division (with associated indicators, such as the musical theories in the literature review and the commercial music ‘charts’) which serves to spur on debate and new, transgressive art on the borderlines.

The binary opposition in the structural natures of commercial music genres (through charts) and the classical music tradition (through institutions) is a core definition in the construction of the cross-

¹¹² Shuker, R. (1998). *Popular Music: The Key Concepts*, London and New York, Routledge. In Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts - second edition*. New York: Routledge.

genre approach. In assessing the work of Homi K. Bhabha regarding cultural exchange in the postcolonial space, the institution based classical tradition and chart-based commercial music genres will stand for the two opposing cultures - without concretely ascribing one as the 'colonial power' and the other as the 'colonised', since this would open too many doors regarding the politics of cultural appropriation in music, which I wish to explicitly avoid. The binary opposition will also be likened to the inside-vs-outside conception of artistic and non-artistic objects by Boris Groys in his text *On the New*, a text which explores the fluid boundaries of an institutionally-based artistic tradition (in his case, an art museum) and how they accept manifestations of 'new' art objects.¹¹³

I wish to expand this working definition of commercial music genres into a practical and creative realm for analysis and composers. A problematic may arise - the question: 'what is genre XY?' . It can be solved with an intuitive aesthetic, artistic experience, by which I mean listening to musical examples of a genre one guesses intuitively is XY and assessing the truth of this match intuitively and subjectively. So long this methodology is stated as such, it could well be valid. For a more sophisticated experience, I will mention Glenn McDonald's 'genre-map' *Every Noise at Once*¹¹⁴, with which one can explore the commercial music genre landscape-space. McDonald does not convincingly display his methodology, but claims to have based his algorithm on data regarding genres and listening habits of Spotify users collected and published by *Echo Nest*, a data company whose target-market is app-developers looking to integrate user-based music tastes into their products¹¹⁵. He accepts that 'as data science, this is pretty unruly', since 'there's no imposed taxonomy of genres'¹¹⁶. Nevertheless, he states to use '10 dimensions internally, and two

¹¹³ See: Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso. regarding the acceptance of 'outside' and 'foreign' objects into 'sacred' artistic spaces - a sort of boundary-crossing of taste or definition of art comparable to cross-genre.

¹¹⁴ McDonald, G (2018). *Every noise at once*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/engenremap.html>.

¹¹⁵ See: <http://the.echonest.com/> - accessed 19:14 on 24.08.2018.

¹¹⁶ McDonald, G. (2013). *How We Understand Music Genres*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/EverynoiseIntro.pdf>

completely independent measures of genre similarity’ as well as the basic distinctions that ‘up’ represents electronic sound-composition, ‘down’ it’s opposite, acoustic, ‘left is ‘more atmospheric’ and ‘right’ is more ‘spikier and bouncier’¹¹⁷.

The map cannot be accepted as scientific-data (even if its source-data, that of *Echo Nest*, is scientific) since its methodology is too obscure and its results too subjective through being tweaked with Mcdonald’s subjective listening experience. However, through interacting with the map, I’m satisfied that his listening experience significantly enough corresponds to mine in order to use it as a source of inspiration and I suggest it form a part of the cross-genre compositional approach insofar as composers wish to have their creative process stimulated. This is in line with his intentions:

The point of the map, as with the genres, is not to resolve disputes but to invite you to explore music. It is an attempt – however uneven, idiosyncratic, and incomplete – to embrace this new state of the world, in which nearly all of humanity’s recorded music is streamable or downloadable, and give you a way to find out what you don’t know you don’t know [...] Maps are, after all, as much machines for getting lost as they are for finding yourself.

— Mcdonald (2013)¹¹⁸

3.2. Developing the Cross-Genre Theory

¹¹⁷ Mcdonald, G (2018). *Every noise at once*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/engeneremap.html> - bottom right in the screen (requires scrolling).

¹¹⁸ Mcdonald, G. (2013). *How We Understand Music Genres*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/EverynoiseIntro.pdf>

3.2.1. Exploring and Defining Genre

3.2.1.1. Introduction and Line of Questioning

In the early stages of musical history, it was not necessary to group music into categories such as genres, since musical cultures were isolated enough from one another to just have one category: (their) music. It is through the saturation of competing musical styles, traditions approaches that musicology has required significant tools for differentiation. Out of this, ways of dealing with the plethora have become paramount. In a sense, the modern music listener is a musical ‘omnivore’, to be split roughly into two camps: ‘poly-purists’ and ‘poly-mixers’¹¹⁹. Composers are faced with a similar reality since they are a listeners themselves. However, with a composer, a third option becomes available through the creation of new music: ‘crossing’ genres, like the process ‘cross-fertilisation’ in plants or ‘cross-breeding’ in dog breeds. The listener cannot perform this, since they only consume, however the composer can produce a ‘cross-genre’ music through their creative process. Therefore, the cross-genre approach applies the idea of omnivorous cultural tastes to the creation of new artistic work and demonstrates a third path unique to the creative process: cross-genre.

Central to the cross-genre approach is an engagement with ‘commercial music genres’. What are genres and why are they of integral focus to this thesis? Why was the term ‘genre’ chosen over other categorical terms? Firstly, I will explore the nature of genre and how genre-elements can be applied to classical music compositions through a process of ‘enrichment’, before cycling back to the specific question as to why ‘genre’ has been the most stimulating choice of terminology to

¹¹⁹ See: Peterson, R. and Simkus A. (1992). *How musical tastes mark occupation status groups*: 152-186 in Lamont, M. and Fournier, M. (ed. 1995). *Cultivating differences. Symbolic boundaries and the making of inequality*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

represent the ‘blurry divide’ between the ‘inside’ of the classical music tradition and elements from the ‘outside’.

Through an exploration of the nature of genre, composers and analysts can learn about the potential in the cross-genre approach. As with other composers of my generation and those before, I have felt this potential intuitively: through using elements of commercial music genres in my work, I’ve ‘felt’¹²⁰ an enriched artistic information in the work that would have otherwise not been available. To understand this knowledge further, one must understand more of the nature of genre.

3.2.1.2. The Nature of Commercial Music Genres

According to Lena J. and Peterson R., genres can be seen to progress through a combination of four stages: Avant-Garde, Scene-based, Industry-based, and Traditionalist. The way in which they progress through these stages is their ‘trajectory’. It demonstrates the fact that ‘genres are numerous and boundary work is ongoing as genres emerge, evolve, and disappear’¹²¹. A graphic follows the prosaic discussion, providing quick and easy reference to the ideas.

Avant-garde genres are those appreciated by small ‘circles’ (borrowing a term from fine arts) that may be ‘leaderless’ and ‘fractious’, where ‘members play together informally in an effort to create a genre ideal for the group...[and] in crafting music that is “new”, avant-gardists may combine elements of genres that are usually treated as distinct [...] Bauck, for example, describes how avant-garde grunge melded different genres together: “Grunde contained the energy, volume and

¹²⁰ See: Klein on the ‘felt’ artistic knowledge in the chapter on Artistic Research.

¹²¹ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.
See also: Lamont, M. and Virag M. (2002). *Study of Boundaries in the Social Sciences*, in the Annual Review of Sociology 28: 167-95.

distortion of hardcore punk, but was generally played at a far slower tempo. While borrowing the melodic lines and hooks of heavy metal, grunge left behind the macho posturing and gratuitous guitar solos.^{122,123}

Scene-based genres are built on a ‘community of spatially-situated artists, fans, record companies, and supporting small business people’, where it is noted that ‘such communities cohere through the exchange of information and music [... and indeed] some scenes are essentially, if not entirely, virtual; fans, musicians, and critics find each other on the Internet through listeners and chat rooms.’¹²⁴ Non-musical associations become codified with consistency in the scene-based stage, including ‘social conventions, including styles of clothes and adornment, body-type, argot, and “attitude”... [including] psychedelic rock fans' beads and tie-dye clothes, punks' Mohawk hair cuts, goths' "corpse paint" makeup, and beboppers' berets.’ Such social conventions ‘help distinguish members from nonmembers... [and] can also symbolize whole constellations of beliefs and practices known to scene members. For example, straight-edge punk rockers draw a conspicuous "X" on the back of their hands to declare they have forsworn alcohol, drugs, tobacco, and promiscuous sex’.¹²⁵ What’s important is that there is a sustainable community of consumers and producers, containing enough wealth that a significant number of artists can devote a significant-enough amount of their time to it’s development, creating musical and cultural innovation that drives the scene-based genre forward into the next stage: an ‘industry-based genre’.

¹²² Bauck, A. (1997). Review. *Popular Music* 16(2): 231-34.

¹²³ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

¹²⁵ Ibid.

See in addition: Haenfler, R. (2006). *Straight Edge: Clean-Living Youth, Hardcore Punk, and Social Change*. Piscataway, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Industry-based genres are those driven (and therefore controlled) primarily by industrial companies, creating music within an industry Frith describes as the ‘market based popular music field.’¹²⁶ In order to create fan-communities that number ‘in the hundreds of thousands... simplified genre conventions are codified in the interests of making, measuring, and marketing Industry-based genres. Firms train new artists to work within highly-codified performance conventions, and record producers regularly coach songwriters and artists to make simple music, clearly within genre bounds, that will appeal to a mass audience.’¹²⁷ With the increase in popular and economic important, media coverage is intensified and the social aspects of the genre become more widely understood and critiqued, especially featuring coverage that is ‘usually ill informed about the music and often frames a genre in three contradictory ways [... portraying] genre lifestyle as innocent fun and feature its colorful surface aspects [... or] spin the lifestyle as a danger to its fans¹²⁸ [... or] claim its "lawless, anti-social, and hedonistic" fans pose a danger to society¹²⁹¹³⁰. The media attention often spurs on further sociological activity, where ‘genre spokespeople, police, political authorities, religious leaders, parent groups, teachers, and moral pundits provide a willing press with lurid quotes’ and ‘elements of dress, adornment and lifestyle are exaggerated and mass-marketed [... such as the] grunge aesthetic, which inspired fashion designer Marc Jacobs to incorporate flannel shirts, wool ski caps, and Doc Marten boots into Perry Ellis's 1992 spring

¹²⁶ Frith, S. (1996). *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press: 77. As quoted in Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹²⁷ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹²⁸ Thornton, S. (1996). *Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital*. Hanover, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

¹²⁹ Binder, A. (1993). Constructing Racial Rhetoric: Media Depictions of Harm in Heavy Metal and Rap Music. *American Sociological Review* 58: 753-67.

¹³⁰ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

collection¹³¹.¹³² In general, almost the entire public is aware of the sociological debate surround the music, encoding the musical tropes with rich and complex hermeneutic information - information that can be used in the cross-genre approach. Since this information tends on one hand to become more clearly codified and on the other hand part of a more significant public debate, a fracturing of ideals is often scene where some form a new, avant-garde genre, and others form a 'traditionalist' genre, the final category.

As the name suggestions, the traditionalist genre stage is concerned with conserving and defending core principles that are more or less immutable. They are based on key examples or 'masterworks' and much of the learning process is focussed on looking into the past: the goal of 'traditionalist genre participants' is to preserve a genre's musical heritage and inculcate the rising generation of devotees in the performance techniques, history, and rituals of the genre. Fans and organizations dedicated to perpetuating a genre put a great amount of effort into constructing its history and highlighting exemplary performers who they deem fit into the genre's emerging canon of exemplars¹³³ [...] committed Traditionalists expend a great deal of energy fighting with each other about the models they construct to represent a genre's music and the canon of its iconic performers [... and] Performers' race, class, educational attainment, and regional origins are often used as markers of authenticity [... for example] you must be young, White, and an underachiever to

¹³¹ See Moore, R. (2005). Alternative to What? Subcultural Capital and the Commercialization of a Music Scene. *Deviant Behavior* 26: 229-52.

¹³² Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹³³ See in addition:

- Lee, S. (2007). *Musical Stratification: Explaining the Aesthetic Mobility among Music Genres*. PhD of Dissertation, Department Sociology, Nashville, TN, Vanderbilt University.
- Regev, M. (1994). Producing Artistic Value: The Case of Rock Music. *The Sociological Quarterly* 35:85-102.
- Rosenberg, N. (1985). *Bluegrass: A History*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.

perform punk music in an exemplary fashion¹³⁴ [... and] to really play salsa, a musician must be Latin American.¹³⁵¹³⁶

Table 1. Genre Forms and Attributes

Attributes	Genre Forms			
	Avant-Garde	Scene-Based	Industry-Based	Traditionalist
Organizational Form	Creative circle	Local scene	Established field	Clubs, associations
Organizational Scale	Local, some Internet	Local, Internet linked	National, worldwide	Local to international
Organization Locus	Homes, coffee shops, bars, empty spaces	Local, translocal, and virtual scenes	Industrial firms	Festivals, tours, academic settings
Genre Ideal or Member Goals	Create new music	Create community	Produce revenue, intellectual property	Preserve heritage and pass it on
Codification of Performance Conventions	Low: highly experimental	Medium: much attention to codifying style	High: shaped by industry categories	Hyper: great concern about deviation
Technology	Experimentation	Codifying technical innovations	Production tools that standardize sound	Idealized orthodoxy
Boundary Work	Against established music	Against rival musics	Market driven	Against deviants within
Dress, Adornment, Drugs	Eccentric	Emblematic of genre	Mass marketed "style"	Stereotypic and muted
Argot	Sporadic	Signals membership	Used to sell products	Stylized
Sources of Income for Artists	Self-contributed, partners, unknowing employers	Scene activities, self-contributed	Sales, licensing, merchandise, endorsements	Self contributed, heritage grants, festivals
Press Coverage	Virtually none	Community press	National press	Genre-based advocacy and critique
Source of Genre Name	Site or group specific	Scene members, genre-based media	Mass media or industry	Academics, critics

"Genre Forms and Attributes": Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

By assessing the stage at which a genre finds itself, the composer or analyst can make preliminary assumptions about its nature. The above diagram, 'Genre Forms and Attributes', can give a rough guide to what sort of hermeneutic information is contained in any genre at a given stage. With this information, the composer or analyst can evaluate the potential impact of the genre elements. For example, were a genre to have reached the Traditionalist stage, such as is the case with 'Roots Blues', when a composer uses elements of the genre, they will either be seen as 'traditionally correct' or 'deviant' usages of these elements. Reactions here would probably be very intense: either the elements would 'do justice' to the traditional standard, 'revolutionise' them, or 'exploit' them cheaply. On the other hand, using elements from an avant-garde based genre would have almost no hermeneutic information, since very few elements, if any, have been codified into the genre, which may not even have a name. The composer or analyst can assess every case anew.

¹³⁴ Laing, D. (1985). *One Chord Wonders: Power and Meaning in Punk Rock*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

¹³⁵ Urquia, N. (2004). 'Doin' It Right': Contested Authenticity in London's Salsa Scene. in *Music Scenes*, edited by A. Bennett and R. A. Peterson. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press: 96-114

¹³⁶ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

The researchers were clear to point out that they had restricted their research to ‘music created in the commercial marketplace’ which would ‘thus eliminate the many “classical” and “art” musics’¹³⁷. Such a statement reenforces the obvious yet enduringly contentious claim that there is a significant divide between the ‘classical tradition’ and ‘commercial music genres’. As previously mentioned, this divide is felt intuitively by a great deal of theorists, composers and analysts, yet attempts to draw a clear line between the two falter - only a ‘grey’ sort of contested border zone is possible, one which fits in nicely with Homi K. Bhabha’s conception of intercultural mixing, as will be described later. By way of repetition, contemporary music theories tend toward including the ‘whole musical field’¹³⁸ rather than narrowing down the scope of repertoire and ‘validating a certain body of works of art’¹³⁹, whilst ‘one must also comment that pop must has changed a great deal since 1941’ - when Adorno commented that ‘popular music’ is ‘characterized by its difference from serious music’¹⁴⁰. By way of summary, perspectives in the early 21st Century are contradictory, in that there is a common belief that ‘there are no longer any agreed and inviolable criteria which can serve to differentiate art from popular culture’¹⁴¹, yet an intuitive general distinction between these two broad categories. Exactly this contradiction is the principle artistic stimulus behind both the artistic and musicological work in this thesis.

Returning to the work of Lena J. and Peterson R., I submit my own ‘genre stage’ in addition that would incorporate some core ideas of the academically-based art-music of the classical tradition,

¹³⁷ Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

¹³⁸ Middleton, R. (1990). *Studying Popular Music*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press: 7.

¹³⁹ Kerman, J. (1994). *How We Got into Analysis, and How to Get Out*: 15, in *Write all These Down*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press [originally published in *Critical Inquiry* (1980), 7, 311–31].

¹⁴⁰ Adorno, T. (1941). *Studies in Philosophy and Social Science*, New York: Institute of Social Research, 1941, IX, 17-48.

¹⁴¹ Strinati, D. (1995) *An Introduction to Theories of Popular Culture*, London and New York, Routledge: 225.

especially in relation to composition: a ‘theoretic’ genre stage. In this stage, a singular artist or collection of artists would conceive of the theoretic existence for a potential genre before promoting it through their own work or the curation of the work of others. Schoenberg can be said to have done this with his serialist technique, which arose out of his ideology to progress tonal chromaticism into a pitch-based musical structure that does not involve tonality. In assessing theoretic genres, one could evaluate the extent to which the original mind(s) had considered additional hermeneutic information. In the case of Schoenberg and his famous claim that the serialist technique would assure the prevalence of Germanic music for the next century, it is obvious that he attached additional hermeneutic importance to the theory above and beyond the aesthetic quality of the music he produced in presenting it: he wished it to contain hermeneutic information regarding philosophy of elitism, connections to the Germanic cultural world, etc.¹⁴²

3.2.1.3. Approaches to the Assessment of Modern Music Genres

Once the nature of the genre has been evaluated, the composer or analyst can look to how an element from it could be/has been applied to a composition in the classical music tradition.

A textual approach leads one to identify a distinctive musical language amongst key compositions (and/or texts) known to exemplify the genre. This involves the examination of higher and lower musical constraints and the extraction of these constraints into a relatively lower position in a composition in the classical music tradition. For example, extreme distortion of the electric guitar is a high constraint in hardcore punk, but when transported into a classical composition as an ‘effect’ (i.e. reference, quote or ‘element’), it would be a low constraint, acting as information in

¹⁴² The development of the cross-genre theory would also fall into this category, although I do not profess with this thesis to be adding additional hermeneutic information to the music of a cultural, political or social sort - that would be the task of essayistic writing. With this thesis, I wish to add musicological (scientific) information to the musical examples.

one phrase but on the entire piece. Although scientific, this approach may ignore or devalue other cultural aspects of genre, which are harder to convert into formulas and principles. Hsu G. & Hannan M.¹⁴³ paraphrase a theory from Paul DiMaggio¹⁴⁴ that ‘artistic classification cannot simply focus on formal similarities of shared conventions of form or content’ but must understand ‘the process by which the audiences come to perceive similarities between artwork and by which meaningful categories, or genres of art, develop’. In other words, Hsu & Hannan, as well as DiMaggio, plead for a hermeneutic approach to genres, looking at the bigger picture outside of the ‘text’ itself.

A cultural approach would be such a ‘hermeneutic approach’, one that amalgamates non-textual elements of genre. This is a complicated and subjective process, as has been common in hermeneutic-based research in the humanities for many years (see here: the ‘research spectrum’ in chapter on artistic research). The cross-genre approach hinges on the understanding that genres transport palpable amount of hermeneutic information: how this can be utilized by composers and analysts will be explored in the section on semiotic narrative analysis in music. Although this feature of musical genres may be self-evident, it has nevertheless interested many academics. Robert Hatten suggested that ‘our listening strategies tend to arise both from conventional and idiosyncratic musical behaviors’¹⁴⁵ and that ‘an awareness of musical style, genre, and syntax is the primary way that a listener orients him/herself within a piece’¹⁴⁶. In a more extensive conclusion from J. & A. Becker:

¹⁴³ Hsu, Greta, and Michael T. Hannan. 2005. "Identities, Genres, and Organizational Forms". *Organization Science*. 16 (5): 474-490.

¹⁴⁴ DiMaggio, P. (1987). Classification in Art. *American Sociological Review*. 52 (4): 440-55.

¹⁴⁵ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid. See: Hatten, R. (1994) *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press. 1994: 29-30, 44-455.

A performance of music from any culture exhibits a broad range of possible relationships from which the performers of and listeners to that music can derive meaning. Some of these possible relationships are (1) the relationship of the various elements of the musical sound to each other, i.e., the structural meaning of the music, (2) the relationship of a given performance to the history of its genre (musical performances derive meaning from previous performances within the same tradition), (3) the relationship of a performance to its performance situation (a mass performed in a concert hall and in a church evoke different assumptions and expectations in the listeners and performers), (4) the relationship of a musical performance to non-musical events, i.e., musical referencing, such as the association of moderate tempo with a person walking, the use of horns, trumpets and trombones to suggest the military, the use of stringed instruments to evoke feelings of mystery, suspense or love, or direct references such as the evocation of a parade in CharlesIves's Calcium Light Night. For any given listener or performer, the areas of musical meaning will not all be the same, nor will they all be equally important.

— J. and A. Becker (1983)¹⁴⁷

Another approach would be a *socio-economic* approach that considers those who profit or gain from using genre terminology, and what affects this may have on the music. Fabbri and Chambers (1982) claim that genre is ‘more of a problem for journalists and promoters .. (and) frontier guards’ than for musicians themselves¹⁴⁸. It does seem logical that businesspeople and non-creating industry professionals, whose jobs are made more effective through good organization, should profit the most from constraints brought about by genre - although one should note the well known adage that

¹⁴⁷ Becker, J., & Becker, A. (1983). *A grammar of the musical genre "srepegan."*. In *Asian Music* 14/2 (1983).

¹⁴⁸ Fabbri, F., and Iain C. (1982). "What kind of Music?" *Popular Music*. 2: 131-143.

some constraints help creativity. The influence of industry on the ‘trajectory’ of a genre’s development is well explored by Lena J. & Peterson R.; this field of inquiry is perhaps stimulating to composers who wish to create art protesting the direction in which a genre has been developed by an industry. For example, David Bowie’s ‘ironic’ approach to pop music could be considered to contain a socio-economic critique, ironic in the sense that it is in itself a commercially-driven pop song: ‘understanding a song like Bowie’s “Fashion” means understanding it as ironic, which is dependent upon understanding the genre conventions of uptempo dance music’.¹⁴⁹

3.2.1.4. Exploring the Specific Cultural Information Contained in Modern Music Genres

Of intimate relation to the question - ‘What are commercial music genres?’ - is the question: ‘Why are commercial music genres of specific interest to this thesis?’ A simple answer is that genres are musical categories that group extra-musical cultural information with expressive musical material. The cross-genre approach, as developed in this thesis, seeks to create a musico-cultural exchange between such genres and the classical music tradition, providing creative pathways for composers to undertake such an approach and analytic pathways for music theorists seeking to understand existing works which may exhibit it.

‘Genre’ is a widely-accepted and common term for such categories in current musicology. Often, ‘style’ is used in a similar way: I define ‘style’ as the differences in usage of lower constraints, as a marker of difference between leading practitioners of a genre, but not a genre in itself, a view shared by Simon Bellaviti, who surveyed genre and style in Panamanian *Conjuto* musicians:

¹⁴⁹ Moore, A. (2001). Categorizing Conventions in Music Discourse: Style and Genre, *Music and Letters* 82/3, 432–42.

'style forms the basis for critical differentiation between practitioners of the same genre; that is, it simultaneously establishes relationships of sonic and aesthetic similarity and difference between a host of—potentially similar-sounding—individual practitioners.'

— Bellaviti, S. (2015)¹⁵⁰

Returning to genre, Bellaviti claims genre is 'socially and historically produced, involving a degree of consensus among practitioners' and that 'musical genres derive strength and discursive traction through repetition, a course of development that resonates with Allan F. Moore's definition of generic conventions as "socially constrained"¹⁵¹¹⁵². This process of repetition, social influence and competition and consensus between leading practitioners (perhaps leading to a canon) can be reconciled with the aforementioned trajectories. A further working definition can then be synthesised - genre is a hierarchical set of musical constraints, developed through repetition and consensus between leading practitioners within a music-scene.

What's more, 'genre' has branched out into other artistic fields, including in literature and film: indeed, in film, discussion of genre has reached such a point of saturation that one talks often in the first instance of whether the film is a 'genre film' or not, when assessing it as an artistic object.

¹⁵⁰ Bellaviti, S. (2015). Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians. *Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

¹⁵¹ Moore, A. (2001). Categorizing Conventions in Music Discourse: Style and Genre, *Music and Letters* 82/3, 432-42.

¹⁵² Bellaviti, S. (2015). Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians. *Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

Indeed, film studies have been influential on recent musicology, including shedding light on the concept of genre as a social convention¹⁵³ - an idea central to the cross-genre ideology as explored in depth later in this chapter.

In my research I was open to finding the best available term for my intuitive ideas, and as the literature reviews in this thesis show, the term 'genre' is well-embedded in modern musicological debate. Another alternate term to 'commercial music genre' may be 'pop music', which is disqualified, since to a large extent it has become a specific meta-genre within the commercial genre landscape, as is evident by modern 'charts' and McDonald's aforementioned genre-map, *Every Noise at Once*. As previously discussed, building a cross-genre theory on the difference of structuring musical categories through chart-based success, as in the case of commercial chart music, or institution-based success, as in the case of classical music, is the key binary opposition upon which the different acts of 'crossing' can occur.

Of deepest relevance to the cross-genre approach is the potential commercial music genres have to transport hermeneutic cultural information in musical language. They are coded with a social discourse formed in the 'scene' stage, mass-marketed in the 'industrial' stage to be ultimately canonised and conserved in the 'traditional' stage (as demonstrated by Lena/Petersen). Throughout the course of these trajectories, they form a 'kind of generic contract' whereby 'the composer agrees to use some of the conventions, patterns, and gestures of a genre and the listener consents to interpret some aspects of the piece in a way conditioned by this genre'¹⁵⁴. Contracts such as this are consistent with the views of William Hanks, who saw genres as 'an interaction between social

¹⁵³ See: Neale 1980 in Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts* - second edition. New York: Routledge.

¹⁵⁴ Kallberg, J. (1987) in Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts* - second edition. New York: Routledge.

constructs and musical content' that offer '(1) a framework that a listener may use by which to orient themselves; (2) procedures to interpret the music; and (3) a set of expectations'¹⁵⁵. The triggering of the centre contract can orient listeners so strongly toward a certain interpretation of the music and expectations that it takes on a psychological component of 'priming', where 'a network of associations that are linked by shared mood connections is activated by music'.¹⁵⁶

Taking the example of heavy metal: 'the generic cohesion of heavy metal until the mid-1980s depended upon the desire of young white male performers and fans to hear and believe in certain stories about the nature of masculinity'¹⁵⁷.¹⁵⁸ As another example, as Adam Krims has noted, DJs in the various forms of electronic dance music are more noted for the genre and sub-genre of music that they employ than how they do so - a DJ is more noted as a champion of a certain sub-genre, rather a virtuosic performer or composer.¹⁵⁹

Such an approach is not new to the modern commercial music landscape which has spawned the charts that I define as providing a polar opposite to the classical music tradition. A very many works sanctioned on the highest level by leading institutions of the western classical tradition contain what

¹⁵⁵ Hanks, W. (1987) as paraphrased by Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts* - second edition. New York: Routledge.

¹⁵⁶ Crozier 1998, 79 in Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts* - second edition. New York: Routledge.

¹⁵⁷ Walser, R. (1993) *Running with the Devil: Power, Gender, and Madness in Heavy Metal Music*. Hanover, NH, University Press of New England: 109.

¹⁵⁸ On a side note, the composer undertakes a certain risk in assuming that there is enough common understanding of the intended information in any given sample of listeners. This may be negated through framing the semiotic elements in such a way that the eventuality of not being understood as intended. According to Simon Frith, dialog in what he calls 'popular music' takes place with the existence of a 'shared critical discourse' (Frith 1996, 10). If this discourse is not understood, the musical materials become autonomous and not hermeneutically-encoded for the listeners in question. For me, this is a necessary risk and truthful to my experience of the listening experience, which is heavily informed by personal encounters with music. Discourse is, however inseparable to the listening experience with 'popular music', as Frith adds the poignant idea that 'part of the pleasure of popular music is talking about it' (ibid. 4). As such, the cross-genre approach is defined by the risk of listeners being aware or not aware of the discourse surrounding the genre in question. It is, then, a post-modern theory, not assuming autonomy of musical material or wide acceptance of a singular meta-narrative, upon which the theory is build, basing itself rather on 'little narratives'.

¹⁵⁹ Krims, A. (2000). Introduction: Postmodern Musical Poetics and the Problem of 'Close Reading', in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, Canada, G & B International.

Leonard Ratner saw as ‘topics’ or classical expression, including Turkish, pastoral and hunt style.¹⁶⁰ Yet the industrial scale of the formation (the ‘trajectories’ a la Lena/Petersen) and digital distribution music-genres (a la services like Spotify that can be measured with *Echo Nest* or *Every Noise at Once*) has brought the possibilities of such an approach to a new scale. Some ‘topics’ of the Romantic era may even be comparable to those today: references to techno in a cross-genre work may invoke the thrill and intoxication of clubbing, not at all dissimilar to those invoking the hunt style of the Romantic era, which certainly involved thrill and intoxication. Both are references to the functionality of music in thrill-based past-time activities, which are invoked creatively in the context of a concert-music experience to re-create the extra-musical associations, by way of a musical semiotic. Nevertheless, the modern emphasis on how innovative digital music technologies and globalisation have dramatically increased the prevalence of genres in the modern musical landscape require a new-thinking of classical ‘topics’ through the ‘crossing’ of genres and the classical music tradition.

In other words, genres become vessels for the socio-cultural discourse in question, since they transport a hermeneutic meaning. The musical materials become a sort of socio-cultural metaphor¹⁶¹ and, in the creative process of composition, a stimulating pathway for including such discourse as a musical element of tension and meaning: the ‘conventions, patterns, and gestures of a genre’ (Kallberg/Beard) can be trans-mutated by a classical composer for usage in an opera or other work in the classical tradition and the ‘contract’ formed with classical-music listeners familiar with the external genre in question will be in turn trans-mutated. As such, the binary ways of listening - that of listening to a classical opera and to a mainstream genre - will be ‘crossed’. How this may

¹⁶⁰ See: Ratner, L.G. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York, Schirmer Books.

¹⁶¹ ‘Metaphor’ as a term invites the flexible interpretation of meaning and avoids the necessity to one that is establish complete and universally-valid. Even basic general music metaphors that are extremely common, such as a certain sort of music being ‘sad’ can eventually shown to be flawed. The ‘sadness’ of a work is a ‘quality that we may ascribe to it’ via musical metaphor (See: Neubauer 1986, 151) and ‘a projection onto sound of aspects of our own mentality’ (Cumming 1994, 28)

occur and what may result is the topic of this thesis, ultimately leading to the following segments on an original interpretation of terminology for cultural exchange as observed by Homi K. Bhabha and their musical counterparts and an original method for narrative semiotic analysis based on and developing existing models.

3.2.2. Dichotomic Artistic Relationships and Potential for their ‘Crossing’

3.2.2.1. Boris Groys and Conceiving of New Art as the Result of a Space

Boris Groys outlines in *On the New* his understanding of the progression of (visual¹⁶²) art as existing not in time, as a set of historical epochs that present ‘a promise of a hidden historical telos’, but rather in space, as the changing borders between the ‘inside’ of a museum collection and the ‘outside’ of a ‘profane’ space. He is therefore a proponent of the so-called ‘spatial turn’, which turns from conceiving of artistic progression as the continuation along a line to that between spaces¹⁶³. So Groys:

‘The postmodern criticism of the notion of progress or of the utopias of modernity becomes irrelevant when artistic innovation is no longer thought of in terms of temporal linearity, but as the spatial relationship between the museum space and its outside.’¹⁶⁴

- Boris Groys, *On the New* (2008)

¹⁶² In order to consider his ideas, we need to draw a simple analogy of the museum to an opera house: the ‘collected works’ of a museum are equivalent to the repertoire.

¹⁶³ The spatial turn also received commentary in the musical realm, as observed in Flender, R. (2013). *Die Entdeckung des Raumes in der Musik*. in ZWÖLF, Hamburg: Hochschule für Musik und Theater.

¹⁶⁴ Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso.

Groys draws on an idea from Levi-Strauss that ‘Cultures without museums are the “cold cultures” [...] constantly reproducing the past [...] because they feel the threat of oblivion, of a complete loss of historical memory.’ Conversely, when society has collected their ‘cultural identity’ in a museum, ‘the replication of old styles, forms, conventions and traditions becomes unnecessary’ and art producers focus instead on creating ‘new’ work, which he defines as a ‘difference beyond difference’. New art objects do not ‘re-present any already existing visual differences’ but differ in the way they differ from already collected works. Importantly, Groys sees such new differences as forming through a process of bringing objects from ‘outside’ in to the inside of the museum space through the act of collection:

‘The production of the new is merely a shifting of the boundaries between collected items and the profane objects outside the collection ... some objects are brought into the museum system, while others are thrown out ... Such shifting produces again and again the effect of newness, openness, infinity, using signifiers that look different in respect to the musealized past and identical with mere things, popular cultural images circulating in the outside space.’¹⁶⁵

This undercuts the modernist idea of a linear progression of difference and instead focuses on an eternal representation of difference, as seen from within the walls of a museum, looking outward, with a view to bringing those attractive things from outside into the sacred space: ‘the primary function of the museum [is] to let us imagine the outside of the museum as infinite. New artworks function in the museum as symbolic windows opening up a view on the infinite outside.’

¹⁶⁵ Ibid.

Exactly this binary conception of ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ and the process of enriching the space-collection through external objects can be applied to the creative process of the cross-genre approach, as I mean it. The creative artist becomes a museum-like space, with an education in the classical music tradition and a desire to enrich this through combinatorics with challenging ‘outside’ stimuli that also form their musical reality but seem incompatible with the classical education. As such, the reality of operatic space as the creative artist has personally experienced it (in this case, it is my experience and perspective on operatic repertoire which forms the ‘operatic space’), is that which is relevant to this theory. The details of what I perceive to be operatic space, and what are ‘external’ commercial music genres, will be evident in detail in the analysis of *I.th.Ak.A.*.

A triangulation is formed between the classical tradition, genre elements and cross-genre approach, forming what Homi K. Bhabha calls a ‘third space’ in his studies of postcolonial cultures. How new musical art can be produced through the triangulation of traditional classical music, mainstream genres and the creative personality (‘space’) of a composer is the focus of this thesis. The next step is to find a method and set of ‘tools’ which can be used to understand and decode this triangular or third-space process by way of formulating an ‘approach’ to music analysis, and even stimulate further creative work by way of ‘reverse engineering’ the analytic concepts for stimulating the creative process, a process demonstrated by the usage of analysis in music composition, as formerly noted by Nicholas Cook. The ideas of this paragraph are a summary of the cross-genre approach, as offered to analysts, composers and composer-analysts (artistic researchers who seek to both understand, produce and intertextually-articulate artistic knowledge) from both parts of this dissertation project.

3.2.2.2. Postcolonialism as a Source for Developing the Cross-Genre Approach

Enriching a specific cultural space through objects or elements of an ‘outside’ sphere provides a parallel to colonialism - colonialist powers sought to enrich their states through the acquisition of foreign land, including the natural resources and human labour that inhabited that space. This process has resulted in much human suffering and environmental destruction, and as such, many leading postcolonialist commentators, such as Edward Said and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, have focussed on a judgmental analysis of the destructive results of colonialism (*Gesellschaftskritik*).¹⁶⁶ These commentators have a powerful relevance and value in evaluating this process, but do not line up with the primary goal of my thesis, which is: to assess how musical cultures can ‘cross’ to create new differences, i.e. to create ‘new’ art for the musical space (meaning: repertoire).

Many prominent musicologists have, however, applied critical postcolonialist perspectives to music, addressing the loaded term *cultural appropriation*. Simon Frith¹⁶⁷ examines the umbrella-genre ‘world music’, critiquing key elements of its economic function within large, European or American companies, that may seem to be exploitive. John Hutnyk similarly criticises world music as ‘a scene where authenticity operates through incomprehension and fracture of context ... CNN’s reports on WOMAD 1994 stressed little of the grass-roots politics and made much of the most “exotic” of the musicians’¹⁶⁸. Indeed, a common theme of quasi-postcolonial critique in musicology is that folk-musics tend often to be appropriated into industrial music marketing at the expense of the original context, including the traditional well-being of the folk-peoples that are seen to have created it. This can be seen as an impact of globalisation, and George Lipsitz explores in *Dangerous*

¹⁶⁶ For a general reader on fundamental elements of Postcolonialism, see: Mishra, V. and Hodge, B. (1994). *What is Post(-)colonialism?*, in Williams, P. and Chrisman, L. (eds) (1994). *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, New York, Columbia University Press.

¹⁶⁷ Frith, S. (2000). *The Discourse of World Music*, in Born G. and Hesmondhalgh D. (eds), *Western Music and Its Others: Differences, Representation and Appropriation in Music*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press.

¹⁶⁸ Hutnyk, J. (1997). *Adorno at WOMAD: South Asian Crossovers and the Limits of Hybridity Talk*, in Werbner P. and Modood T. (eds) *Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism*, London and Atlantic Highlands, NJ, Zed Books: 112.

*Crossroads*¹⁶⁹ how certain ethnic groups can ‘hybridise’ their folk-music to fit in to the constraints of a hegemonic (globalist) power, such as how homosexual Hispanic dancers in New Orleans used Native-American war-paint to hide their ethnicity during Mardi Gras and ‘express indirectly aspects of their identity that might be dangerous to present by more direct means.’¹⁷⁰ He extends this to an extensive extended critique of Paul Simon’s *Graceland*, and its commercially-driven strategy to add a sense of progressiveness and ethnicity to Simon’s musical product, whilst retaining complete (quasi-colonial) control of the album’s conception and realisation. Theories of Orientalism in particular have spurred on critical ethnomusicology: Edward Said saw *Aida* as ‘an Orientalised Egypt’¹⁷¹ and Beard and Gloag comment on ‘trace of orientalist ideology ... [in] the *japanisme* of Debussy’s piano music or the use of the sitar in recordings by the Beatles’¹⁷². As a counterweight, Mark Everist describes a constantly changing history of Orientalism which is not faithfully reproduced by an ‘essentialised view [...] that takes no account of the diversities of text and culture’¹⁷³ and that in the case of Verdi, ‘the antithesis between exotic and non-exotic music in *Aida* comes to seem a code as much for gender difference as for ethnic difference’¹⁷⁴.

In relation to the cross-genre approach, such orientalist and critical postcolonial studies demonstrate a risk involved in crossing musical cultures from the vantage point of a dominant culture¹⁷⁵. Behind (musical) multiculturalism is a globalised and postcolonial world largely engineered by European

¹⁶⁹ Lipsitz, G. (1997). *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place*, London and New York, Verso.

¹⁷⁰ Lipsitz, G. (1997) *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place*, London and New York, Verso: 71.

¹⁷¹ Said, E. (1994). *Culture and Imperialism*. London, Vintage Books.

¹⁷² Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts* - second edition. New York: Routledge.

¹⁷³ Everist, M. (1996). *Meyerbeer’s Il crociato in Egitto: mélodrame, Opera, Orientalism*, *Cambridge Opera Journal* 8/3, 223.

¹⁷⁴ Everist, M. (1996). *Meyerbeer’s Il crociato in Egitto: mélodrame, Opera, Orientalism*, *Cambridge Opera Journal* 8/3, 225.

¹⁷⁵ Later, as according to Homi K. Bhabha, this practice will be referred to as one of striving for ‘cultural diversity’ instead of ‘cultural difference’, the latter of which Bhabha sees as avoiding practices like cultural appropriation.

and Anglo-Saxon powers, resulting in a significant economic and militaristic world imbalance - this is merely a fact that many listeners and almost all critics have in the backs of their heads. There is a risk involved with the cross-genre approach in seeming to 'colonise', 'appropriate' or culturally 'loot' external genres for strategic enrichment of a musical tradition tied to the elite of European and Anglo-Saxon cultures. The classical music tradition can easily be seen to represent a colonialist culture, since key classical works are the musical crowning jewels of the European colonial era. On one hand, large-scale cultural exchange between the classical tradition and external genres could be at the expense of aspects of the genre through a process similar to gentrification, were the classical tradition to retain control of the discourse. In addition, were the state to give classical institutions a financial or other sort of power that leads to a seemingly insurmountable imbalance of power in favour of the institution, a postcolonial-like relationship would be opened.

However, the cross-genre technique as proposed in this thesis does not relate to institutional strategy, as connected or not connected to a nation state, but to the creative process of an individual artist seeking to enrich their personal creative process with elements of external genres. In this way, it avoids the caveats outlined. The 'geography' in which this occurs is in the internal experiences of the composer, not in a musico-geo-political area - that is a key difference. It can no longer be said that the cultural exchange occurs on an institutional level comparable to nation states. It becomes less like colonialism and more like collecting impressions from a period of travel that contribute to the building of one's self and one's life experience. These '(musical) impressions' express the individual desires of the '(musical) traveller': he or she chose those particular impressions or musical objects (to refer to Groys) based on the way they resonated on a personal level, not for the nationalistic benefit of the home state, as may be the case with the Elgin Marbles in the British Museum, over which there rages a postcolonialist debate. And even if one were to see the purchase of souvenirs in travel as a micro-imperialism, this cannot be compared on the level of collecting

musical impressions, since such objects are sense-based memories that do not ‘take anything away’, so to speak¹⁷⁶, instead, they create a cultural discourse within the experiences of the artist. In summary: where colonialism focussed on strategically building and enriching nation states, cross-genre is about building and enriching the artistic expression of an individual.¹⁷⁷

3.2.2.3. Homi K. Bhabha and Constructive Terms for the Cross-Genre Approach Arising from Postcolonial Studies

A background in the critical nature of much postcolonial commentary informs the wise selection of ideas for relevance to the cross-genre approach. Where postcolonial studies are built on the analysis of results of a large-scale event in the historical past, the cross-genre approach seeks to somewhat control and/or analyse a creative process based on the interaction of musical cultures within a new work of music. Postcolonial commentators whose work focusses on a critique of historical events are of little relevance to the cross-genre approach, but those who seek to understand the ways in which the colonial and colonised cultures have ‘crossed’ and continue to do so through the present day, have relevance to this thesis. Homi K. Bhabha is such a theorist: many of his ideas relate to the analysis of how pre-colonial cultures formed a new postcolonial culture. Through considering these ideas, one can learn about the process of triangulation between the cross-genre composer, classical tradition and modern mainstream genres, generating lessons that can be used for constructing new ‘cross-genre’ music by being translated to musical terms in order shed light on

¹⁷⁶ There is a critical perspective here to suggest that the gathering of musical impressions creates a discourse that ‘takes away’ the exclusivity of a musical impression, if this perspective is shared by the original culture. For example, there are certain Aboriginal songs only intended to be heard by inundated members of the community. Were these to be heard outside the intended context, a spiritual-religious commodity would be violated that draws strong comparisons to postcolonialism. In such highly differentiated and special examples, a case-by-case approach is necessary, far beyond the scope of this thesis.

¹⁷⁷ The line blurs in regards to the aforementioned example of Paul Simon’s *Graceland*: even if musicians belonging to an ‘other’-like culture are fairly paid and given credit, cultural domination is assured by the absolute extent to which the quasi-colonial artist retains control. When such an observation is coupled with a cynical perspective regarding strategic commercial benefits, a door to postcolonial criticism opened.

how musical cultures can 'cross'. At the same time, the judgmental view of colonialism (*Gesellschaftskritik*) is avoided, since that of assessing cultural 'crossing' becomes the purpose of the inquisition, not the negative effects of colonialist behaviour.

As such, enrichment in the cross-genre approach can be likened to Homi K. Bhabha's analyses of postcolonial cultures, with Groys' definition of creating the new through the changing boundaries of an art-space acting as a convoy. In this section of postcolonial studies, Bhabha analyses the resulting new culture as a product of cultural exchange, driven by the imperative to enrich. In cross-genre composition, the creative artist seeks to enrich their understanding of their classical tradition through external elements of modern mainstream genres.¹⁷⁸ Where the postcolonial culture inhabits a socio-geographic territory (or territories), the cross-genre composer is their own museum-like space, the boundaries of which they progressively stretch in an outwards direction.

Bhabha's work discusses the processes and results of building identity within a postcolonial discourse. The documentary basis for his studies are literary texts - his academic position being that of a literary theorist - leading to a great diversity in the nature of sources he draws upon, including the non-academic writer V.S. Naipaul, post-structuralist and post-modern writers like Jameson, Foucault and Derrida, and even psychoanalysts such as Freud, amongst many others. Since these sources are of fundamentally different natures and styles, he has developed a highly flexible vocabulary with which to discuss them, and it is this vocabulary which can be of great use to understanding cultural exchange in the musical sphere, too. This vocabulary discusses a broad range styles and genres of texts, and is a sort of 'cross-genre' discourse method itself, lending itself to adaption for cross-genre musical application.

¹⁷⁸ Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso refers to such elements as 'profane' objects - profane in its relativity to the museum, which he considers a 'sacred space', not using profane in a derogatory and inherently negative way.

Although the flexibility of his language is a strength in redefining it for musical studies, it manifests itself in an extremely prose regarding Bhabha's original texts. The text-study of this thesis, Bhabha's *The Location of Culture* from 1994, was comically awarded 2nd place in the 'Bad Writing Contest' of the *Philosophy and Literature* journal (published by Johns Hopkins University Press) in 1998¹⁷⁹. In fact, one of the leading postcolonial writers, Edward Said, described his work as sounding 'unfinished' amongst other things. Marjorie Perloff (emeritus professor of English at Stanford University) commented on his appointment at Harvard with 'when I heard that, I was dismayed [...] For Harvard to be thrilled to be hiring Homi Bhabha -- he doesn't have anything to say'¹⁸⁰ and Mark Crispin Miller (professor of media studies at New York University), who remarks that 'one could finally argue that there is no meaning there, beyond the neologisms and Latinate buzzwords. Most of the time I don't know what he's talking about.'¹⁸¹

Himself, he admits that his language is less 'empirical' than those of traditional 'Anglo-American' philosophers, stating that his Indian roots orient him toward 'South Asian and Continental traditions [that] tend to be more metaphoric and symbolic in their use of language'. Indeed, he is 'interested in the process of language itself', and his complicated, often convoluted and sometimes downright vague or even mystic syntactic structures and floral vocabularies may even be quasi-poetic, quasi-academic forms of research in themselves. I venture to suggest that his use of language could even be a form of artistic research in the literary postcolonial realm. It may well be that there is no singular valid interpretation of his ideas and his vocabulary, and that the reader is very much

¹⁷⁹ The Guardian (1998). *Bad Writing Contest*. The Guardian: <https://www.theguardian.com/books/1999/dec/24/news>, accessed 26.08.18. at 19:12.

¹⁸⁰ Sy, C. L. (2011). *Mimicry and Its Discontents: Examining Bhabha's Multiculturalism*. Inquiries Journal: <http://www.inquiriesjournal.com/articles/583/mimicry-and-its-discontents-examining-bhabhas-multiculturalism-as-mimicry-and-hybridity>, accessed 26.08.18. at 19:12.

¹⁸¹ Eakin, E (2001). *Harvard's Prize Catch, a Delphic Postcolonialist*, The New York Times.

involved in the construction of their meaning. Evaluations as to whether he has much 'to say' or to what 'meaning' is in his texts may have to themselves deconstruct the Western perspective of postcolonial enquiry.

All of this is to say that, although the language may be controversial in literary studies and philosophy, its ambiguities provide an opportunity for transmutation into the musical sphere. For the purposes of this thesis, I will summarise selected terminologies of Bhabha (including some of the 'neologisms and Latinate buzzwords') to the best of my understanding and provide definitions thereof in the musical realm. These terms then become ontological 'tools' for this thesis and can be used by third parties in either the discussion of existing music (including musical analysis) or in order to stimulate new musical activity (including composition). Bhabha's background as a literary critic makes the terminology garnered for his work particularly suited for narrative musical analysis.

I propose a methodology for translating his ideas into the cross-genre approach by summarising my understanding of his work in regards to the term in question, proposing a method for its understanding in music and the production of a non-exhaustive list of suggestions for its employment in composition and/or as a standpoint for narrative musical analysis.

Discourse

Building identity in a postcolonial space occurs for Bhabha through a discourse between the colonialist and colonised cultures. This may take place either in the interpretation of historical narratives or in conversations in the present time, and such discourses influence both the perception and the experience of the subjects thereof: even if the attempt of a discourse is to reflect reality, it is

in itself a process of creating that reality, since the perception of events is influenced to the extent that it shapes further events. Of all the terms discussed, discourse is the most general, standing for the entire process of cultural exchange through the construction of identity with symbology, language and other constructive measures of culture in their most basic and complicated forms: ‘the priority (and play) of the signifier reveals the space of doubling (not depth) that is the very articulatory principle of discourse. It is through that space of enunciation that problems of meaning and being enter the discourses of poststructuralism, as the problematic of subjection and identification.’¹⁸²

For the cross-genre approach, discourse may be used to refer on the most general or ‘highest’ level - to the way that musical elements interact, in order to construct meaning, tension, genre, tradition or any sort of narrative archetype. Its usage focuses the commentary on the cultural exchange involved in bringing the classical tradition into contact with commercial genres - what cultural discourse this conflict brings - as opposed to autonomous approaches to analysis which focus on materials and their non-hermeneutic functions. It may be used to describe how the exchange - the discourse - between musical genres shapes the perception of them.

Third space

The ‘third space’ is a metaphor for the cultural space in which the discourse takes place. Although there are clear geographic areas in which these discourses are most intense and relevant, the third space does not fundamentally denote a physical area and can be understood in psychological and diasporic cultural ways. According to Bhabha, it is ‘opened’ through the act of colonisation, and

¹⁸² Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 50.

becomes a contact zone¹⁸³ for cultures, where cultural elements are continuously hybridising and conflicting. The idea of conflict is essential in undercutting the propaganda of colonialist forces who seek to present their influence as omnipotent and their colony as free of significant conflicts:

*The intervention of the Third Space, which makes the structure of meaning and reference an ambivalent process, destroys [the] mirror of representation in which cultural knowledge is continuously revealed as an integrated, open, expanding code ... [and] challenges our sense of the historical identity of culture as a homogenizing, unifying force, authenticated by the originary Past, kept alive in the national tradition of the People.*¹⁸⁴

Where a traditional militaristic conflict would see two clear sides, the third space sees a process of hybridisation where the colonist desires the colonised peoples to take on certain elements, perhaps as a form of civilisation but certainly as a form of control, which never perfectly succeeds and always results in something that is ‘almost the same, but not quite’¹⁸⁵. One can locate the third space on the borderlines of clear cultural attributes (including stereotypes), which, like war fronts or the borders of nation states, can be used to understand the greater tensions between and within those more clearly on either side of the line: ‘The non-synchronous temporality of global and national cultures opens up a cultural space - a third space - where the negotiation of incommensurable differences creates a tension peculiar to borderline existences.’¹⁸⁶ Of relevance to two preceding terms, third space is a ‘precondition for the articulation of cultural difference’¹⁸⁷.

¹⁸³ See: Schorch, Philipp. (2013). *Contact zones, third spaces, and the act of interpretation*. University of Leicester : Department of Museum Studies and Clifford for a discussion of museums as ‘contact zones’ and places of ‘contentious and collaborative relations and interactions’. Also: J. 1997. *Routes: Travel and translation in the late twentieth century*, Cambridge & London, Harvard University Press. and Pratt, M. (1991). *Arts of the Contact Zone*. *Profession*: 33–40.

¹⁸⁴ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 37.

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid.* 86

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid.* 218

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.* 38-39

The third space then is a metaphor for a space in which symbols of colonial cultures interact, conflict and hybridise. In music, a composer or analyst can identify or create symbols which can behave like those in a third space. It is a 'space' to be conceived when two or more musical cultures interact in the compositional process, opening up an area of new possibilities and the borderlines between the 'museum' and the 'profane' musical objects outside of it. It is a space of neither original culture, where neither is the same as before - it forces change. In this space, new musical ideas can emerge that seem more to be their 'own thing' than a pure representation of those from the classical tradition or external genres.

Additionally, musical third space is an 'integrated, open, expanding code' which challenges our conception of a musical tradition and/or genre as either homogenous or unified. A strategy for garnering the brightest and most innovations of third space should be to spend as much time as possible on the musical 'borderlines' between the tradition and the external genres. Innovation may not always be the focus of an artistic work, but when it is relevant, the composer or analyst can 'go to the border' between the two - this will not necessarily involve a literal mid-point, as 'the production of the new [entails] a shifting of the boundaries'¹⁸⁸ and will entail objects that are ambiguous in characteristic, which is perhaps frustrating to a scientifically-minded actor, whereas the ambiguity would possibly excite a creative, intuitive actor. In the context of a third space, there is no homogenous mixture of musical cultural traditions, nor any fusion between elements that leaves the other 'untouched' or able to express in the same way as it did before. The resulting 'mix' would be, by definition, flawed as a piece of compositional technique. For example, mixing a fugue (e.g. a la J.S. Bach) with blues harmonies and rhythms (e.g. a la Stevie Ray Vaughan) would

¹⁸⁸ Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso.

essentially disrupt both the musical elements from blues and the structural aims, objectives and results of a fugue.¹⁸⁹

Concretely, the third space can be used¹⁹⁰ in the cross-genre approach to: deliberately strive for conflict, shun stylistic organicism and homogeneity, embracing the ‘disorder’ at the borders of the ‘museum’ of the classical music tradition when confronted by (an) external genre(s); build an aesthetic or an approach that is not the same, yet similar to the tradition and genres.

Stereotype

In the third space, discourses about the nature and characteristics of certain cultures can produce a fear of cultural difference. The control mechanism that responds to this fear by categorising cultural identities is the process of stereotype. Creating stereotyped identity of the ‘Other’ - the colonist or the colonised - makes them appear more understandable and easier to control through predictability, at least from the ‘inner’ psychological perspective of being afraid of what’s unknown. One key flaw in the process of creating a stereotype of another culture through discourse is that the Other is presented in a way that overlooks the inner contradictions and differences of that culture. Differences are not possible within a stereotype, which stereotype ‘requires, for its successful signification, a continual and repetitive chain of other stereotypes.’¹⁹¹ It presents a 2D image of that culture against their own (as if one was ‘black’ and one was ‘white’ which is fictitious in the 3D (‘colourful’) third space.

¹⁸⁹ For an analysis of hybridising fugue and latin jazz, see: Penderbayne, S. (2011). *Operatic Elements in Leonard Bernstein’s score for West Side Story*. BMus Honours Thesis (Sydney Conservatorium).

¹⁹⁰ Throughout this section, ‘usage’ is defined to mean relevance to composers as stimuli for the creative process and to analysis as a tool for interpreting a composition.

¹⁹¹ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 77.

*...it is the force of ambivalence that gives the colonial stereotype its currency: ensures its repeatability in changing historical and discursive conjunctures; informs its strategies of individuation and marginalization; produces that effect of probabilistic truth and predictability which, for the stereotype, must always be in excess of what can be empirically proved or logically construed.*¹⁹²

Bhabha makes a point of discussing how stereotypes often involve sexual fetishes of the Other. Although this occurs obviously in the sexuality of exotic women by men, members of a colonalising 'inside' culture may view men of the 'Other' as overly sexual. Bhabha gives the example of a Turkish (male) *Gastarbeiter* in Germany - he claims that some such people live under a sexualised stereotype where 'to say the word "girl" is to be a randy dog' where 'The Turk as dog is neither simply hallucination or phobia; it is a more complex form of social fantasy. Its ambivalence cannot be read as some simple racist/sexist projection where the white man's guilt is projected on the black man; his anxiety contained in the body of the white woman whose body screens (in both senses of the word) the racist fantasy'¹⁹³ which fulfils the 'voyeuristic desire for the fixity of sexual difference'¹⁹⁴.

Musical stereotype is already a common term, one of many common musical terms that are granted new cultural light by Bhabha's work, thereby demonstrating the inherent ability for terminology to cross borders of disciplines. Looking more closely at the specific usage in postcolonialism, we can focus on how musical symbols of external genres could be presented in an overly simplified form within the context of a classical music tradition, thereby creating a discourse in which the external

¹⁹² Ibid. 66

¹⁹³ Ibid. 166

¹⁹⁴ Ibid. 53

genre is categorised in a way that makes it easier to understand. This may include 'fetishisation' and sexualisation of the hermeneutic information that the genre brings with it. Perhaps the most general definition of stereotype in the cross-genre approach would be: to present a musical object and/or system with a set of symbols not displaying inner conflicts but instead presenting a homogenous, simplified (chain) of symbols that are based on highly-repeated symbols of the past rather than the differences within that genre that exist in the present. A purpose of stereotyping may be to control the understanding of a musical object, make its behaviour seemingly predictable, and therefore give an advantage to the order of the 'inner' side of the musical boundary at which the third space opens up. This is an attempt to monopolise the discourse of the musical object, and may be used strategically to show the stereotypes limited compatibility with the dominant system. It may involve a musical object which is likely to be recognisable to the audience based on their memory of the symbols outside of the work or more absolutely and abstractly as a pattern of symbols which becomes a stereotype of itself. Of course, this may be done ironically, to critique the process of stereotyping, or dramatically, since the more predictable an object or pattern becomes, the more dramatic the break will be.

Composers and analysts can look to find or construct a relative lack of symbolic difference within musical objects that represent external genres, what I refer to as stereotypes. On the contrary, a great deal of difference may be a polar opposite, and can be made more understandable through a discursive musical use of stereotype in the third space - after all, stereotype is a common tool in the third space to increase understandability: it could well be that this can be done in a constructive way in combination with other tools of the third space. Composers and analysts can become aware of

how, from the context of the classical tradition, we can fetishise external genres, and indeed see a simplicity that belays the inner conflicts of that genre.¹⁹⁵

Cultural Difference

Bhabha prefers the term ‘cultural difference’ to that which may often be referred to as ‘cultural diversity’ - it denotes the inhabitation of multiple cultures in one space that differ from one another in notable ways. In cultural diversity, after Bhabha, a culture is an ‘object of empirical knowledge’ that is not intended to create a discourse of conflict but one of unification, where the colonial power has enriched their collection of culturally diverse objects whilst maintaining order, control and a preservation (or repetition) of their culture before entering the third space. Where diversity invokes connotes of harmony, difference invokes the conflict that Bhabha stresses is important in the third space, but more importantly, diversity assumes a hierarchical policed order above the points of difference, whereas difference itself confers its own sort of authority, as if the differing cultures have their own police and hierarchy:

This revision of the history of critical theory rests, I have said, on the notion of cultural difference, not cultural diversity. Cultural diversity is an epistemological object - culture as an object of empirical knowledge - whereas cultural difference is the process of the enunciation of culture as 'knowledgeable', authoritative, adequate to the construction of systems of cultural identification.¹⁹⁶

¹⁹⁵ In January 2018, I worked with a prog-rock and techno drummer called Ex-Champion (Benjamin Kövener) for a contemporary ballet production in Kampnagel in Hamburg. The project involved using ‘clubbing music’ in a semiotic way to represent the release of bodily tension. Many musical suggestions from myself and the rest of the creative team seemed to him much too stereotyped, of the past and simplistic, and the exchange over what is ‘club’ music and techno showed to me a great deal of cultural difference between the sub-genres that I was not aware of.

¹⁹⁶ Ibid. 34.

Through seeking to articulate cultural differences, rather than collect cultural objects and silence their conflicting desires under the banner of what Bhabha refers to as ‘liberal notions of multiculturalism’¹⁹⁷, the term cultural difference seeks to give conflict the most important voice.

Considering cultural difference as opposed to cultural diversity in regards to the cross-genre approach can help distinguish it from polystylism and bricolage, two postmodern musical terms that I see as distinctly different to cross-genre. Polystylism (and bricolage) represent to me that which Bhabha criticises about cultural diversity: the external styles and genre elements (or stereotypes) seem to operate as a glittering array of objects that are relatively inconsequential to the deep-level concept of polystylist works. The dominant order of the classical context of polystylistic works overshadows the uniqueness of each style - styles are treated merely as shining objects of wonder, that do not challenge the dominant order. The works often wish to demonstrate a sort of virtuosic command of a stereotyped level of diverse styles rather than the complex sets of conflicts present in the styles themselves. Importantly - in bricolage, the styles themselves and the hermeneutic information they contain aren’t the primary reason for their inclusion, rather, the number and diversity of the styles is the primary reason. They are, therefore, interchangeable. The conflict between styles and genre elements do not challenge, conflict with and disrupt the ‘original’ context and therefore present diversity rather than true difference.

As such, if a composition refers to external genres as a means of technical virtuosity, where the specificities of the genres in question are interchangeable, then the work demonstrates a process of cultural diversity rather than one of difference, where the unique individual differences themselves constitute the tension of the work. Musical cultural differences should be their own ‘knowledgable’ systems and not pay homage to the policing of another system, should they be truly part of a

¹⁹⁷ Ibid. 34.

discourse in a third space. As Groy's would say, the differences themselves must be different to those differences that are already collected and contained within the museum's walls. Without having performed extensive research on the topic, this is what I see as the problem behind musical bricolage and polystylism: the fragmented styles seem entirely interchangeable, since the purpose is to show a glittering array of stereotyped musical objects, unable to perform any sort of meaningful dialog or conflict with the hegemonic structure and context in classical language, since their purpose is one of being stereotypically different, but not of also being different from within¹⁹⁸.

As a more practical suggestion, cross-genre composers can seek to design cultural difference rather than cultural diversity (with musical objects in the form of stereotypes), through aiming to give the elements of external genres a set of internal differences that become part of the discourse. Genre elements should have 'flaws', and those in a different way to the 'flaws' of the classical language. Structures including cultural difference are technically flawed and imperfect - they cannot be virtuosic. The introduction of genre elements should forever change the approach to classical language and not be a self-contained momentary stereotype within an unchanged 'museum' of the classical tradition.

Ambivalence

The ambivalence of colonialist cultures arises from the inherent inability to fix a cultural identity (which they need to do, in order to define and impose it on another,) since the humanity of cultural

¹⁹⁸ For example, the third movement of Berio's *Sinfonia* would be an example of polystylism, in my opinion, to the extent that the repertoire Berio has either quoted directly or references is interchangeable to the effect of the work, which is to create a sublime infinity of musical culture, and let them clash through contrast alone in the space of the work. It does not feature hybridity as a core compositional device, rather direct quote. An example of hybridity would be the last movement of Bartok's *Concerto for Orchestra*, where language derived from an 'external music' - that of Hungarian folk music - is hybridised with Bartok's influences from contemporary classical music of the time.

identities lies in their inner conflicts. When a culture, such as a colonising power, is confronted with the idea of the impossibility of fixity in cultures, they are in an ambivalent situation:

In seeking to come across as unified, authoritative and free of internal conflict, a colonial power 'returns the eye of power to some prior, archaic image or identity' that 'paradoxically... can neither be 'original' - by virtue of the act of repetition that constructs it - nor 'identical' - by virtue of the difference that defines it. Consequently, the colonial presence is always ambivalent, split between its appearance as original and authoritative and its articulation as repetition and difference.¹⁹⁹

Imperfection is a key component of discourse in the third space and the cross-genre approach. Where positivistic modernist ideologies of Schenker, Reti, Schoenberg and Forte sought to show the perfection of individual notes working as details for a larger form, the cross-genre approach embraces a conflict that gives voice to unfamiliar and uncontrollable differences, seeing it as an essential component of a third space discourse at the border-limits of a tradition and those genres outside of it. The compositional or analytical process may produce an ambivalent situation where one is 'split' between wishing to bring order and scientific authority to the understanding of (and production of) fundamental differences and the requirements of unpredictable (un-stereotyped) artistic discourse. The point at which artistic language cannot be adequately described or conceived through scientific method is the area of ambivalence²⁰⁰. In addition, as a classical composer, one is ambivalent in the attempt to compose in a tradition, inferring a sort of repetition of shared principles, and simultaneously articulate the contemporary context, which is both similar and different to the traditional one.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid. 107.

²⁰⁰ This refers obliquely to the chapter on artistic research, where one discipline 'takes off' where the other becomes insufficient.

Hybridity

One of the key terms for discussing individuals or elements of the third space is hybridity. It describes the mutual influence of two opposing cultures and the creation of a new culture in the third space (or the border zone), containing elements of both pre-colonial cultures. Hybrid identities are ambivalent in nature and arise from ‘collisions and interchanges ... in the attempt to assert colonial power’²⁰¹ where the ‘trace of what is disavowed is not repressed but repeated as something different—a mutation, a hybrid’²⁰² and ultimately ‘contradicts both the attempt to fix and control indigenous cultures and the illusion of cultural isolation or purity’²⁰³. A hybrid identity is ‘in-between’ and evades the ‘the politics of polarities’²⁰⁴: ‘any given mixing of cultural materials, backgrounds, or identities [...] implies a markedly unbalanced relationship²⁰⁵’ and result in ‘in-betweenness, diasporas, mobility and cross-overs of ideas and identities [as] generated by colonialism’²⁰⁶.

Hybridity can be manufactured through an imperfect process of repetition, where an individual seeks to ‘replicate’ a characteristic or element of cultural identity but is not able to do so faithfully, thus creating a ‘slippage or gap wherein the colonial subject produces a hybridized version of the “original”’²⁰⁷. This process can involve an art of ‘rework, reform and reconfigure’, as seen in the ‘the process of cultural mixing where the diasporic arrivals adopt aspects of the host culture’²⁰⁸.

²⁰¹ Ellis, J. (1995). Book Review: *The Location of Culture*. *Philosophy and Literature*, 19, 1, 196-197.

²⁰² Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 111.

²⁰³ Ellis, J. (1995). Book Review: *The Location of Culture*. *Philosophy and Literature*, 19, 1, 196-197.

²⁰⁴ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 21, 39.

²⁰⁵ Joel K. and Jopi N. (Eds. 2007). *Reconstructing Hybridity: Postcolonial Studies in Transition*. New York: Rodopi B. V.

²⁰⁶ Loomba, A. (2001). *Colonialism/Postcolonialism*. London and New York: Routledge: 145.

²⁰⁷ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 21, 39.

²⁰⁸ Kalra, V. et al. (2005). *Diaspora and Hybridity*. London: SAGE publication Inc: 71.

An additional view of hybridity is provided by Russian theorist Mikhail Bakhtin, similarly a literary theorist. He discusses ‘intentional hybrids’ that consist of a ‘double-voicedness’ that is intentional, in order to embody the polar conflict and even to create irony. In any case, double-voicedness is designed to ‘push to the limit the mutual non-understanding represented by people who speak in different languages’²⁰⁹.

In the musical sphere, one can easily adopt the elements of imperfection of reproduction, where the composer seeks to reproduce a cultural reference not within the explicit scope of the context of the entire work. In composing an opera, one works in the context of the classical music tradition. Reproducing genres that lie outside of this tradition would be such a process and create hybrids where there are imperfections, ‘slippages’, the art of reworking, reforming and reconfiguring as a form of ‘cross-over of ideas and identities’, and that contain a double-voicedness. The effect of this should be examined as applied to the ‘original’ classical tradition - its hybridisation affects the understanding thereof by calling its hard-and-fast principles into question, through presentation of the new.

Mimicry

A central action²¹⁰ of hybridisation is mimicry. Mimicry is the process of cultural articulation that is ‘a subject of a difference that is almost the same, but not quite’²¹¹. Essential to understanding mimicry as a technique is to recognise that ‘the effect of mimicry is camouflage [...] It is not a

²⁰⁹ Bakhtin, M. M. (2000). *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Trans. Emerson, C. and Holquist, M., ed. Holquist, M., Austin, University of Texas Press: 356.

²¹⁰ In contrast to an ‘action’, an ‘object’ of hybridisation would be a hybrid identity.

²¹¹ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 86.

question of harmonizing with the background, but against a mottled background, of becoming mottled²¹². As such, hybrid identities (colonised subjects, for example) seek safety in the cultural conflict of the third space, since the conflict creates a sort of cloud of cultural confusion where it is difficult to differentiate which actions and elements belong to which cultures. The context of this conflict - the 'mottled background' - creates a space in which it is possible for identities to present themselves as belonging (at least partially) to both of the opposing cultures, a possibility created through the necessities of conflict.

The result of 'mimicry represents an ironic compromise... [between] the demand for identity, stasis [from the colonist] and the counterpressure [...of] change, difference.' This articulation, being an act of hybridisation, 'is constructed around an ambivalence; in order to be effective, mimicry must continually produce its slippage, its excess, its difference.'²¹³ The slippages and excesses mean that the pre-colonial cultures are only partially present in an act of mimicry. It also demonstrates that an aspect of a hybrid identity is the repetition of a slippage, excess or cultural part.

Musically, mimicry can stand for actions (i.e. themes, gestures etc.) of hybrid musical elements in a work, and the background of these actions. A musical mimic is a reproduction of musical elements from the opposite side of the cross-genre divide, which produce a slippage, excess, difference or partiality. Such imperfect reproductions are bound to appear in the musical third space, since the differences between the classical tradition and commercial genres are significant and arise due to their fundamental difference in approach: the classical tradition is supported, filtered and maintained through art institutions lead by experts who make qualitative executive decisions, where the commercial genres are ultimately filtered through quantitative charts (albeit fuelled by

²¹² From Lacan, J., In Miller, J.-A., & Sheridan, A. (1998). *The four fundamental concepts of psychoanalysis*. New York: W.W. Norton. as quoted in Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 85.

²¹³ Ibid. 86.

executively-decided, qualitatively-filtered promotion). The essential point with mimicry, as received from Bhabha, is to embrace the imperfections that occur when transporting musical elements from one side of this divide to the other²¹⁴. Dealing musically with moments of imperfection in the ‘transposition’ across the border-zone of the third space should be focussed rather on how the reproductions of these imperfections create a hybrid musical object that seems authentic due to the aesthetic of conflict that forms the musical background to the object. Were the background to be uniform, homogenous and free of significant musical conflict, the musico-cultural ‘transposition’ would seem *kitch*. As such, we find a compositional ‘tool’: If a composer is creating a musical third space, and some musical elements seem undesirably kitch, the effect can be lessened by creating further musical conflict in the musical ‘background’. Also, the object itself could be examined for its slippages (the ways in which the original musical quality of the commercial music genre is lost) and excesses (the ways the material is exaggerated) and these can be repeated, in order to establish the object as a hybrid with its own internal differences, instead of repeating those of the previous (pre-transposed) music.

Where mimicry in the third space is borne out of ‘the desire for a reformed, recognizable Other’²¹⁵, this represents a musical equivalent to colonialism and borders on cultural appropriation. Personally, I find this route simplistic, potentially belittling of the original non-classical music and, essentially, lacking in musical drama. A mimicry that does not seek to ‘reform’ musical elements of the other side of the third space, but rather seems to be rebellious and a generator of musical conflict, or as Bhabha put it, ‘the representation of a difference that is itself a process of disavowal’²¹⁶, is that which is the focus of my work. I argue, that through the appreciation of

²¹⁴ Although it is beyond the scope of this thesis, I see the terminology received from Bhabha as extending beyond the classical tradition/commercial genre divide. Folk music-inspired composers, such as Toshio Hosokawa et al. could also potentially benefit from the work.

²¹⁵ Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. London, Routledge: 86.

²¹⁶ *Ibid.*

Bhabha's ideas, composers such as myself can be more aware of the potential pathways for techniques such as mimicry, and make informed decisions as to the potential effects thereof on the pre-hybridised musical spheres.

Fixity

When cultures clash in the third space, the powers that determine the conflict seek to clarify and define the cultural identities of their subjects in order to know the points of difference between the clashing cultures. This, of course, leads the dominant powers to simplify internal differences in the individual cultures in search of a homogenised present condition, which can be defended, and from which influences of the other culture can be excluded. *Fixity* described the process by which cultures look to the past for indicators of the core identity of the culture before the conflict began. Bhabha warns against 'the dangers of the fixity and fetishism of identities within the calcification of colonial cultures to recommend that 'roots' be struck in the celebratory romance of the past or by homogenizing the history of the present'²¹⁷. As such, the 'celebratory romance' of the past is a manifestation of fixity in the building of cultural identity, which results in a calcification and homogenisation thereof. Furthermore, Bhabha notes that fixity is often presented as 'the last word on the subject'²¹⁸, and a 'problem of how, in signifying the present, something comes to be repeated, relocated and translated in the name of tradition, in the guise of a pastness that is not necessarily a faithful sign of historical memory but a strategy of representing authority.'²¹⁹

²¹⁷ Ibid. 19.

²¹⁸ Ibid. 53-54.

²¹⁹ Ibid. 35.

When musical traditions or commercial genres look into the past for definition of their identity, a fixity occurs. This can be seen in the ‘Traditionalist’ stage of the ‘genre trajectories’ by Lena and Petersen (see 2.1.1.) in regards to commercial genres and in the discussion of tradition in classical music in 1.3.. Where this leads to a celebration, romance, desire to establish ‘roots’, a calcification of the otherwise fluid process of identity and a homogenisation of the internal conflicts of a culture, fixity takes place at the cost of the diversity of cultural difference in the present. This process of fixity should also be seen, musically, as an untenable situation for musical tension: homogenised musical material has only one narrative result, that its homogeneity will break apart or otherwise change its state. Fixity in music could serve as a precursor to conflict and can function effectively as a compositional ‘tool’ for this purpose.

Enunciation

Enunciation is a descriptor for the act of utterance or expression of a culture that takes place in the third space. When a culture expresses their difference to the other culture, it is an enunciation. This can involve expressing the difference in terms that the opposing culture can understand and therefore involves an aspect of hybridity, through combining terminology or descriptive techniques of both cultures: ‘cultural enunciations in the act of hybridity [is a] process of translating and transvaluing cultural differences’²²⁰. The actors who enunciate cultural differences in the third space, from one side to another and also from hybrid identity to hybrid identity, speak in the ‘hybrid tongues of the colonial [third] space’²²¹.

²²⁰ Ibid. 252.

²²¹ Ibid. 101.

For musical analysts, the term ‘enunciation’ can function as a descriptor for the articulation of a musical culture in a work dealing with a musical third space. In addition or instead of discussing traditional descriptors such as ‘themes’, ‘gestures’ or ‘musical objects’, one can discuss an ‘enunciation’ - here, the hermeneutic information of the genre (see: 2.1.1. onwards), the elements of fixity, hybridity, mimicry and stereotype, as well as how they form with the autonomous musical material, combine to be the musical enunciation. Enunciations can be seen, therefore, as the building blocks of a musical discourse in the third space. They can be broken down further into their subsequent parts, but in doing so, the cross-genre effect of how the parts encapsulate and transport musical conflict, will be lost. As such, enunciations should be complete musical fragments - were they to be separated from the larger composition and analysed on their own, the cross-genre quality would not be lost. In comparison, separating only the autonomous musical materials would lose the cross-genre quality and would not qualify as an enunciation, according to my definition thereof, as inspired by Bhabha. Using Bhabha’s terminology, the enunciation must speak a ‘hybrid tongue’.

3.3. Chapter Bibliography

Adorno, T. (1941). *Studies in Philosophy and Social Science*, New York: Institute of Social Research, 1941, IX, 17-48.

Agawu, V. K. (2004). How we got out of analysis, and how to get back in again. *Music Analysis*, 23, 2-3.

Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

Bakhtin, M. M. (2000). *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Trans. Emerson, C. and Holquist, M., ed. Holquist, M., Austin, University of Texas Press.

Becker, J., & Becker, A. (1983). *A grammar of the musical genre "srepegan."*. In *Asian Music* 14/2 (1983).

Bellaviti, S. (2015). *Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians*. *Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

Bauck, A. (1997). Review. *Popular Music* 16(2): 231-34.

Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. Routledge.

Binder, A. (1993). Constructing Racial Rhetoric: Media Depictions of Harm in Heavy Metal and Rap Music. *American Sociological Review* 58: 753-67.

Brown, H. M. et al (2018). Opera(i) (It., from Lat. opera, plural of opus: 'work'; Fr. opéra; Ger. Oper). *Grove Dictionary Online*: <https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40726>. Accessed 17:55 on 24.04.2018.

DiMaggio, P. (1987). Classification in Art. *American Sociological Review*. 52 (4): 440-55.

Eakin, E (2001). *Harvard's Prize Catch, a Delphic Postcolonialist*, The New York Times.

Eliot, T. S., and Washington, P. (1998). *Eliot: poems and prose*. New York: A.A. Knopf.

Ellis, J. (1995). Book Review: The Location of Culture. *Philosophy and Literature*, 19, 1, 196-197

Everist, M. (1996). *Meyerbeer's Il crociato in Egitto: mélodrame, Opera, Orientalism*, Cambridge Opera Journal 8/3.

Fabbri, F., and Iain C. (1982). "What kind of Music?" *Popular Music*. 2: 131-143.

Flender, R. (2013). *Die Entdeckung des Raumes in der Musik*. in *ZWÖLF*, Hamburg: Hochschule für Musik und Theater.

Frith, S. (1996). *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

Frith, S. (2000). *The Discourse of World Music*, in Born G. and Hesmondhalgh D. (eds), *Western Music and Its Others: Differences, Representation and Appropriation in Music*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press.

Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso

Haenfler, R. (2006). *Straight Edge: Clean-Living Youth, Hardcore Punk, and Social Change*. Piscataway, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Harris, T. (1995). Genre. *The Journal of American Folk-Lore*. 108 (430).

Hatten, R. (1994) *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press. 1994: 29-30, 44-455.

Hsu, Greta, and Michael T. Hannan. 2005. "Identities, Genres, and Organizational Forms". *Organization Science*. 16 (5): 474-490.

Hutnyk, J. (1997). *Adorno at WOMAD: South Asian Crossovers and the Limits of Hybridity Talk*, in Werbner P. and Modood T. (eds) *Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism*, London and Atlantic Highlands, NJ, Zed Books: 112.

Joel K. and Jopi N. (Eds. 2007). *Reconstructing Hybridity: Postcolonial Studies in Transition*. New York: Rodopi B. V.

Kalra, V. et al. (2005). *Diaspora and Hybridity*. London: SAGE publication Inc

Kerman, J. (1985). *Contemplating music: Challenges to musicology*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Kerman, J. (1994). *How We Got into Analysis, and How to Get Out*: 15, in *Write all These Down*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press [originally published in *Critical Inquiry* (1980), 7, 311–31].

Krims, A. (2000). Introduction: Postmodern Musical Poetics and the Problem of 'Close Reading', in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, Canada, G & B International.

<http://the.echonest.com/> - accessed 19:14 on 24.08.2018.

Laing, D. (1985). *One Chord Wonders: Power and Meaning in Punk Rock*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Lee, S. (2007). *Musical Stratification: Explaining the Aesthetic Mobility among Music Genres*. PhD of Dissertation, Department Sociology, Nashville, TN, Vanderbilt University.

Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (October 01, 2008). Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

Lipsitz, G. (1997). *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place*, London and New York, Verso.

Loomba, A. (2001). *Colonialism/Postcolonialism*. London and New York: Routledge.

Mcdonald, G (2018). *Every noise at once*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/engenremap.html>.

Mcdonald, G. (2013). *How We Understand Music Genres*. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/EverynoiseIntro.pdf>

- Middleton, R. (1990). *Studying Popular Music*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- Middleton, R. (2000). *Work-in-(g) Practice: Configuration of the Popular Music Intertext*, in Talbot M. (ed.), *The Musical Work: Reality or Invention?*. Liverpool, Liverpool University Press.
- Mishra, V. and Hodge, B. (1994). *What is Post(-)colonialism?*, in Williams, P. and Chrisman, L. (eds) (1994). *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, New York, Columbia University Press.
- Moore, A. (2001). Categorizing Conventions in Music Discourse: Style and Genre, *Music and Letters* 82/3, 432–42.
- Moore, R. (2005). Alternative to What? Subcultural Capital and the Commercialization of a Music Scene. *Deviant Behavior* 26: 229-52.
- Penderbayne, S. (2011). *Operatic Elements in Leonard Bernstein's score for West Side Story*. BMus Honours Thesis (Sydney Conservatorium)
- Peterson, R. and Simkus A. (1992). *How musical tastes mark occupation status groups*: 152-186 in Lamont, M. and Fournier, M. (ed. 1995). *Cultivating differences. Symbolic boundaries and the making of inequality*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Ratner, L.G. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York, Schirmer Books.

Regev, M. (1994). Producing Artistic Value: The Case of Rock Music. *The Sociological Quarterly* 35:85-102.

Rosenberg, N. (1985). *Bluegrass: A History*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.

Said, E. (1994). *Culture and Imperialism*. London, Vintage Books.

Schoenberg, A. (1975). *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*. Edited by Leonard Stein, translated by Leo Black. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Schorch, Philipp. (2013). *Contact zones, third spaces, and the act of interpretation*. University of Leicester : Department of Museum Studies and Clifford

Shuker, R. (1998). *Popular Music: The Key Concepts*, London and New York, Routledge.

Sparling, H. (2008). Categorically speaking: towards a theory of (musical) genre in Cape Breton gaelic culture. *Ethnomusicology : Journal of the Society for Ethnomusicology*. 2008/52/401

Strinati, D. (1995) *An Introduction to Theories of Popular Culture* , London and New York, Routledge.

The Guardian (1998). *Bad Writing Contest*. The Guardian: <https://www.theguardian.com/books/1999/dec/24/news>, Accessed 26.08.18. at 19:12.

Thornton, S. (1996). *Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital*. Hanover, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

Urquia, N. (2004). 'Doin' It Right': Contested Authenticity in London's Salsa Scene. in *Music Scenes*, edited by A. Bennett and R. A. Peterson. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press: 96-114.

Walser, R. (1993) *Running with the Devil: Power, Gender, and Madness in Heavy Metal Music*. Hanover, NH, University Press of New England: 109.

4. An Original Method for Musical Narrative Analysis according to the Cross-Genre Ideology

4.1. Narrative Analysis as a Basis for the Cross-Genre Analytical Method

4.1.1. Two Key Influences: Almén (2004) and Karl (1997)

4.1.2. Approaching Narrative Analysis through Assessing Layers

4.2. Analysing the Bottom Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.2.1. Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation

4.2.2. A Method for Analysing the Bottom Layer

4.3. Analysing the Mid Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.3.1. Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation and Relation to One Another

4.3.2. A Method for Analysing the Mid Layer

4.4. Analysing the Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.4.1. The Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis: Archetype Identification and Analysis Within the Cross-Genre Dialog

4.4.2. A Method for Analysing the Top Layer

4.5. Chapter Bibliography

4.1. Narrative Analysis as a Basis for the Cross-Genre Analytical Method

As with the chapter on artistic research, this discussion deals with a topic still under significant debate: semiotic narrative analysis of music, hereon referred to simply as ‘narrative analysis’. It is through this method that the ‘semiotic elements’ of *I.th.Ak.A.* should be analysed, leading to revelations regarding the research question. Through building freely on two main models for

narrative analysis by Byron Almén and Gregory Karl, I support my work on that of a focussed set of commentators, developing a line of thought that is extended according to the specific requirements of the opera *I.th.Ak.A.*. In doing so, I do not claim to have built my approach on a comprehensive examination of narrative analysis but rather just that which is required to formulate the analytical method for cross-genre.

Although I believe it possible to argue that developing the cross-genre ideology has a general musicological value, I will, for the purposes of this thesis, narrow any musicological discussion to the specific field of musical analysis. As Nicholas Cook notes in the introduction to his *A Guide to Musical Analysis*, musical analysis has ‘a special value in compositional training’ and indeed ‘become the backbone of composition teaching’²²², and so it is due to the intimacy between the creative process of composing *I.th.Ak.A.* and my research question - how did I compose it? - that I have turned to the specific branch of musical analysis.

Without wishing to labour the point, delineation between musicology and music theory seems apparently necessary²²³, as shown, for example, with the formation of the the Society of Music Theory in America in 1978, where theorists and analysts there seemed to escape the ‘hegemonic rule of the American Musicological Society’²²⁴. The field boasts a plurality of approaches to musical analysis including those concerned with: rhythm, cognition, non-Western and non-canonical repertoires, hermeneutically inflected work, semiotics and Neo-Riemannian theory, a sort of hyper-aggressive neo-formalism, and many more²²⁵. I wish to add my approach to this field.

²²² Cook, N. (1987). *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. New York: George Braziller.

²²³ In German music studies, there is an inherent separation between *Musikwissenschaft* and *Musiktheorie*, but in the anglo-saxonian sphere, the separation is more regional.

²²⁴ Agawu, V. K. (2004). *How we got out of analysis, and how to get back in again*. *Music Analysis*, 23, 2-3: 267.

²²⁵ see: Agawu, V. K. (2004). *How we got out of analysis, and how to get back in again*. *Music Analysis*, 23, 2-3: 267.

Semiotics, one of those approaches, I define as: the study of musical signs (in the form of the lowest coherent building blocks of a given work²²⁶) and their use or interpretation in a written account of connected musical events. The written account need not necessarily be notation, any documentation of a performance would be legitimate, so long as it can be held to appropriate academic standards. In my case, I submit a notated musical score and analyse this in a tabular, written account. I declare the notated score to be the repository of the artistic knowledge that I encoded into the work, the production and musical interpretation is the artistic knowledge of others²²⁷.

Although established, controversiality²²⁸ surrounding semiotic (narrative) musical analysis remains largely unsettled at time of writing²²⁹. With roots in the 1970s and 1980s, when a range of

²²⁶ Which I will come to call 'enunciations' - see the previous chapter for the definition thereof in cross-genre composition.

²²⁷ Were I to submit a film of the premiere performance, for example, the lines between my artistic knowledge and that of others would be unnecessarily blurred, since I define my original information to be contained within the score.

²²⁸ See, for example, Nattiez, J.-J., (1994). *Can one speak of narrativity in music?*. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 115, 240-257.

²²⁹ A particularly debated point regarding narrative analysis is to what extent it can be used to identify authorial structure. Lawrence Kramer, generally a critic of narrative analysis, believes that 'narrative elements in music represent not forces of structure, but forces of meaning' (Kramer 1992), a remark directed at rebutting a 'grand theory' concept of narrative analysis and focussing instead on moments of meaning within a work (à la Abbate) that are structured in a way other than through a narrative. It could be, however, that some works contain such a high density of high-impact 'narrative moments' that one could not ignore their impact on the structure of the work. In literature studies, structural analysis aims to 'map systems of meaning underlying relations among semantically relevant units, whether phonemes, morphemes, totemic classifications, or abstract narrative roles and functions' (Karl 1997), where most 'structuralists have generally followed [Roman] Jakobson and taken the binary opposition as a fundamental operation of the human mind basic to the production of meaning' (Culler 1975). As such, there is an opening to discuss structure within a narrative analysis, even if it should not be considered truly universal and may be difficult as a 'grand theory'. In essence, as Fred Everett Maus comments, the notion of conceiving musical 'structure' as an aspect of music separate from 'meaning [is] vague and obscure' (Maus 1988). It is counterintuitive and largely distanced from common sense, since where there is meaning, there will be what Leo Treitler calls (still in reference to narrative analysis) 'questions of motivation' (Treitler 1982), i.e. 'those addressing why musical passages occur when and as they do' (Karl 1997). I share the view of Maus, Karl and Treitler, that moments of narrative meaning can function as structural elements. In at least some works, narrative may be a comprehensive structural device, where an analyst could show 'the integration of formal and semantic-expressive aspects of musical works from the level of motives and phrases to that of entire movements or works' (Karl 1997).

prominent musicologists transposed ideas from literature studies²³⁰ and ethnomusicology²³¹ into the musical sphere, narrative analysis experienced a ‘boom’ in the early 1990s, becoming a ‘burgeoning area of inquiry’²³² that may have experienced a climax in form of ‘a period of intense interest in musical narrative between about 1987 and 1994’²³³ and a subsequent decline of activity thereafter²³⁴, although the discourse continues internationally through to the time of writing²³⁵. As it stands, a conservative commentator would at least agree with the assertion that ‘musical narrative is a potentially legitimate, if largely unestablished field of music theory.’²³⁶ Some proponents of the discipline argue for analysing narrative as a ‘grand theory’ that applies to the entirety of a work²³⁷ and others argue that narrativity occurs in ‘moments’ that are not representative of the entire musical effect and certainly cannot be used as a universal theory for analysing music, including Lawrence Kramer’s assertion that ‘narrative effects in [instrumental] music constitute a critical or disruptive process rather than a normative one’²³⁸ and Carolyn Abbate’s view that narrative analysis

²³⁰ See et al.: Cone, E.T. (1977). Three Ways to Read a Detective Story or a Brahms Intermezzo. *Georgia Review* 31: 554-74; Kivy, P. (1980). *The Corded Shell*. Princeton: Princeton University Press; Ratner, L. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York: Schirmer Books; Newcomb, A. (1987). Schumann and Late Eighteenth-Century Narrative Strategies. *19th-Century Music* 11: 164-74.

²³¹ See, for example, the transposition of Vladimir Propp’s 1928 *Morphology of the Folktale* in the highly influential and early article: Maus, F. (1988). Music as Narrative. *Music Theory Spectrum* 10: 56-73; and for how musical signs can be considered ‘topics’: Agawu, V. K. (2016). *Playing with signs*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. For a modern example of transposing Levi-Strauss’ idea of constructing meaning through ‘initial asymmetry’ into musical narrative analysis, see: Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia.

²³² McDonald, M. (2004). Silent narration?: Elements of narrative in Ives's "The unanswered question". *19th Century Music*, 27, 3, 263-286.

²³³ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

²³⁴ Ibid.

²³⁵ See for a discussion of narrativity in recent German musicology: Unseld, M. (2008). *Der Komponist als Erzähler: Narrativität in Dmitri Schostakowitschs Instrumentalmusik*. Hildesheim: Olms.

²³⁶ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

²³⁷ Including: Tarasti, E. (1994). *A Theory of Musical Semiotics*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.; Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.; Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39..

²³⁸ Kramer, L., & California Digital Library. (2003). *Music as cultural practice, 1800-1900*. Berkeley: EScholarship, the California Digital Library.

should not ignore ‘non-narrative expanses as well as its moments of narration’²³⁹ and that ‘the narrating voice [...] is marked by multiple disjunctions with the music surrounding it [...] I propose that we understand musical narration not as an omnipresent phenomenon [...] but rather as a rare and peculiar act’²⁴⁰. There are many prominent commentators who completely dismiss narrative analysis, the best known criticism of which is Jean-Jacques Nattiez’s polemic assertion that ‘any description of [music’s] formal structures in terms of narrativity is nothing but superfluous metaphor.’²⁴¹ Such criticisms have arisen through typical ‘thorny issues’²⁴² that surround debate on new subjects (as is also the case with debate on artistic research), including the differing definitions of musical narrative and disagreements as to what it constitutes²⁴³.

My approach focuses on analysing musical characterisation (or scene-settings and narrative musical interludes) through the cross-genre approach in opera, and the combination of both autonomous musical material and hermeneutic information. These objects of analysis - characters etc. - can be likened to Abbate’s ‘moments’, since they are fragmentary elements of narrative that do not claim to organically explain every detail and/or the relationships between all elements (such as in Schenkerian analysis) but rather shine analytic light on elements that enrich a work which may include a range of other techniques that cannot be understood best with narrative analysis. I wish, therefore, to show semiotic elements without arguing for integral organic cohesion of the cross-genre approach in the entire work.

²³⁹ Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press: xi.

²⁴⁰ *Ibid.*: 19.

²⁴¹ Nattiez, J.-J., (1994). Can one speak of narrativity in music?. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 115, 240-257.

²⁴² McDonald, M. (2004). Silent narration?: Elements of narrative in Ives's "The unanswered question". *19th Century Music*, 27, 3, 263-286.

²⁴³ A superb review of the fundamental disagreements regarding the nature and definition of narrative analysis with a constructive view to continuing the debate is provided by: Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39. and additionally by Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

What's more, the process of 'characterisation', which is the focus of the cross-genre narrative analysis of this chapter, has necessary effects on the entirety of an opera, and as such, significant parts of the analytic methodology focus on effects on the whole. Again, I do not claim that this analysis of the whole will, however, be applicable to every detail, or indeed explain every factor influencing the whole. Rather, it will aim to show a significant amount of narrative elements that represent the cross-genre approach. Such an approach is similar to Almén's 'sibling model in which the two media share a common foundation but varying manifestations' rather than a 'descendant model in which musical narrative is a transposed reflection of literary narrative'²⁴⁴. In addition, unlike the vast majority of detailed narrative analyses, which provide prosaic accounts of musical narrative through reading the score from start to finish in the temporal order of its intended performance²⁴⁵, I wish to provide a tabular analysis²⁴⁶ of semiotic (genre) elements, demonstrating how the musical material for characters is encoded with hermeneutic genre information and how this creates a musical and dramatic tension through musical and dramatic narrative.

Of particular note and relevance to this thesis is the dearth in addressing narrative analysis in music-theatre or opera, and complete lack of this in regards to contemporary opera (at least on a prominent level). The only significant text dealing with opera is Carolyn Abbate's *Unsung Voices: Opera and Musical Narrative in the Nineteenth Century*, focussing on which 'voice' communicates to the audience, assessing various passages of Wagner's *Ring Cycle* (such as the unreliable human narrator

²⁴⁴ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

²⁴⁵ This refers specifically to the following works already cited: Maus 1980; Abbate 1996; Karl 1997; Almén 2003; McDonald 2004; Jeffress 2013.

²⁴⁶ Karl 1997 provides the only sighted example of a visual (non-prosaic) representation of semiotic narrative with his 'map' of 'plot functions', that have been of great help and influence to my ideas and are included in my analytic method.

in Wotan's monologue²⁴⁷). 'Voice' does not refer to the vocalisations themselves, 'but rather a sense of certain isolated and rare gestures in music, whether vocal or nonvocal, that may be perceived as modes of subjects' enunciations'²⁴⁸²⁴⁹, creating a 'monological authority' of 'the Composer'²⁵⁰. Her text takes the form of a discussion at a general level about what purpose narrative analysis can serve, seeing narrative analysis as offering abilities to explain musical effects that are inaccessible to other methods, perhaps here meaning those based on positivism: 'Music analysis is itself born of a narrative impulse, that we create fictions about music to explain where no other form of explanation is possible, and may look to literary categories to endorse them'²⁵¹, but does not offer an explicit method for analysis, whilst the discussion of 'voice' is illuminating.

The pathway for contribution to the current debate on musical analysis through the cross-genre approach is then clear, untrodden, singular and relevant to the general academic discourse: developing a method for assessing characterisation through the semiotic incorporation of non-classical genres into a contemporary opera. Therefore, this chapter addresses a dearth in discussing narrative analysis in contemporary opera, on one level. On another level, it brings narrative analysis in line with the cross-genre approach and offers it as a tool for understanding cross-genre repertoire, and, through a process of 'reverse engineering' of the ideas, can be used as a tool for composition²⁵²

²⁴⁷ Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press: 156 onwards.

²⁴⁸ *Ibid.*: ix.

²⁴⁹ It is a pleasant coincidence that Abbate uses the term 'enunciations', which is exactly the one I transposed from the work of Homi K. Bhabha. It may demonstrate the popular contemporary usage of 'enunciation' to express a way of articulating identity without referring to technical forms of expression such as 'singing'.

²⁵⁰ *Ibid.*: x.

²⁵¹ *Ibid.*: 46.

²⁵² As noted by Nicholas Cook and quoted in the literature review for musical analysis, analysis has served successfully for a long time as a pedagogical tool for composition. Many composers would concur with my common-sense belief that methods or musical analysis can be turned into stimuli for musical composition.

- compositional techniques will be explored further after the exposition of analytic techniques as ‘reciprocals’ thereof.

4.1.1. Two Key Influences: Almén (2004) and Karl (1997)

From this point on, I will freely build a method for narrative analysis, which has largely been inspired by Byron Almén’s *Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis* (2004 - his approach to a triple-layered semiotics has influenced the structure of my method, especially the ‘top layer’) and Gregory Karl’s *Structuralism and musical plot* (1997, which influenced the ‘mid layer’)²⁵³. Karl defines narrative analysis as ‘[a] teleology in the expressive or dramatic unfolding of musical works’ (and indeed potentially a ‘grand unified theory of musical process’)²⁵⁴ and Almén the ‘process through which the listener perceives and tracks a culturally significant transvaluation of hierarchical relationships within a temporal span’²⁵⁵. One of Almén’s own models, the work of Jacob Litzka, took narration in the literary sense (i.e. not in address to musical analysis) to be ‘a set of rules from a certain domain or domains of cultural life which define a certain cosmic, social, political, or economic hierarchy, and places them in a crisis’²⁵⁶.

The common thread is one of a dramatic sense of change through a temporal experience, a ‘dramatic unfolding, ‘transvaluation’ or ‘crisis’. Semiotic studies in ethnomusicology follow Levi-Strauss’ proposition that myth arises from ‘an inherent or biological tendency toward opposition’ which creates a dynamic ‘initial asymmetry’ or ‘inherent disparity of the world [that] sets mythic

²⁵³ The literature upon which they based their work, including Propp 1928, Frye 1957, Barthes 1981, Bordwell 1985, Genette 1983, has also formed the basis for the historical perspective that I have taken on semiotics.

²⁵⁴ Karl, G. (1997). *Structuralism and musical plot*. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

²⁵⁵ Almén, B. (2003). *Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis*. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

²⁵⁶ Litzka, J. J. (1989). *The semiotic of myth: A critical study of the symbol*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

thought in motion²⁵⁷. Liszka, Almén and then Jeffress²⁵⁸ build upon this thought in the realm of musical narrative analysis, creating the archetypes of binary conflict explored in the coming segment: binary ‘differentia’ is ‘a primary narrative level [...] on which the significant oppositions of order/transgression and victory/defeat are given the opportunity to interact.’²⁵⁹ As such, the analysis of narrative in this thesis will follow on a teleological level the principle of narratological (mythical) meaning through the conflict of dynamic binary opposition.

The analytical technique explored in this thesis builds upon these ideas, assessing specific elements for their individual narrative quality (in the form of ‘scene-settings’ and ‘characters’ that are perhaps elementally similar to Abbate’s concept of ‘moments’ in their non-comprehensive nature) and venturing into the effect of these elements on the whole, in a quasi-organic approach that analyses the meta-level but does not, however, claim an intimate, comprehensive relationship between form and detail.

The aim of my analysis is to assess how genre elements in the form of ‘enunciations’ (which are therefore the ‘signs’) were used to compose the chamber opera *I.th.Ak.A.*, as encoded in the characters of the textual and musical narrative. This incorporates positivistic ideas, through its identification of signs and hypothesis of their function, and post-modern (i.e. post-structuralist) ideas of the reader bringing their own meaning beyond the intentions of the author. It is a form of narrative analysis that does not assume complete and perfect organicism of form and detail, but does not restrict itself to fragments of the work, instead supposing the effect of the narrative elements on the whole.

²⁵⁷ Levi-Strauss, C. (1981). *The Naked Man*. trans. Doreen and John Weightman. New York: Harper and Row: 603.

²⁵⁸ Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia: 6.

²⁵⁹ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

Effective analyses then ‘uncover the abstract dramatic plan in which the movement’s expressive coherence consists’²⁶⁰ and ‘integrated formal and semantic content of a musical work’²⁶¹ in order to create ‘an account of the semantic-expressive determinants of the movement’s formal structure’²⁶². Byron Almén has the following comments on the purpose and nature of a narrative analysis, with which I largely agree:

The primary task of a narrative analysis is to correlate the details of musical activity with a [...] model that describes how the primary conflicting elements influence each other [... and, in addition] an analysis must articulate the semantic intuitions of the analyst [...] in order to function as a tool for understanding these intuitions [...] one can at best persuade the reader of their usefulness or appropriateness in effectively confirming or reevaluating intuitions about the relevant piece [...] There is no single, correct narrative reading of a piece, only a more-or-less convincing one [...] which does not intend to show] how musical events are causally related, but rather how they can be explained or characterized based on the a posteriori apprehension of signification.

— Byron Almén (2004)²⁶³

He then adds a comment of special significance to this thesis: ‘we might value a composer’s analysis for its compositional insight’. The goal of this thesis is, then: to create a model for correlating

²⁶⁰ Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

²⁶¹ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

²⁶² Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

²⁶³ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

formal and semantic content of a musical work from the perspective of an analyst-composer, one that measures its success through both the aforementioned identification of content and the persuasiveness of personal semantic intuitions, including, but not limited to accounts of semiotic-expressive determinants and/or an (abstract) dramatic plan.

4.1.2. Approaching Narrative Analysis through Assessing Layers

Common to narrative approaches from Roland Barthes, Gerald Genette, Bryon Almén and Ian MacDonald Jeffress is an assessment of semiotic construction and meaning on different layers²⁶⁴. Figure 1.1. demonstrates the different approaches to assessing narrative through layers. Barthes describes two layers of meaning through semiosis: a singular ‘interior’ relationship between the signifier and signified, focussing on how the relationship defines the sign (as opposed to an autonomous quality), and various ‘exterior’ relationships existing between signs²⁶⁵. Gerald Genette, a literary theorist, saw ‘analysis of narrative discourse [...as] essentially, a study of the relationships between narrative and story, between narrative and narrating, and [...] story and narrating.’²⁶⁶ For him, these are some of many demarcations relevant to narrative analysis, including also ‘tense’, ‘aspect’ and ‘mood’²⁶⁷. For the current focus on layers of narrative, I take the ‘narrating’ to be broadest aesthetic context or over-arching dramatic situation, ‘narrative’ to be the sequential structuring of elements and the ‘story’ to be the content of the narration. Specifically referring to musical narrative analysis, Bryon Almén refers to three ‘corollaries, which lay out a methodological direction [...] 1) an assessment of the semantic characteristics of musical elements, both in isolation

²⁶⁴ As a supplement to this approach, Karl 1997 provides a useful method for temporal relationships between individual ‘narrative moments’ (à la Abbate) or narrative semiotic elements.

²⁶⁵ See: Barthes, R (1982). *The Imagination of the Sign*. In *A Barthes Reader*, ed. Susan Sontag. New York: Hill and Wang: 211.

²⁶⁶ Genette, G., Lewin, J. E., Culler, J. (1983). *Narrative discourse: An essay in method*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press: 29.

²⁶⁷ Ibid: 29.

and in context; 2) an understanding of how these elements mutually influence and mutually define each other as they succeed one another in time; and 3) an awareness of the cumulative, global effect of these relationships in terms of the opposition "order vs. transgression" and the logically possible outcomes of such an opposition, or narrative archetypes'²⁶⁸. Also referring to musical narrative analysis, Ian MacDonald Jeffress mentions 'three basic levels of relation that are useful to analysis: the symbolic, paradigmatic, and syntagmatic' which each 'serve an essential analytical function'²⁶⁹. He continues: 'analysis at the paradigmatic level is concerned with how specific signs are chosen and with the connotations of those signs [... for example] the choice of a specific chord from a given functional family (e.g. predominant) at a given moment rather than the other available options', 'the syntagmatic relation [... focuses on] how signs attain signification through their temporal or spatial relationships to other signs, and are thus constructed into sign groups [...] the way that elements are combined as opposed to how they are selected' and leaves definition of the symbolic level open. I take it to stand for analysis of the individual elements.

For me, three levels of narration goes to explain the essential elements as I perceive them and have read about them in musical narrative: the individual signs, elements or 'moments'; the sequential teleology of such elements inherent in a narration; and the 'higher voice' of meaning which is constructed by the sub- or super-textual meaning of these lower levels. The comparison of the ideas of other commentators and my own are depicted in Fig. 1:

²⁶⁸ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 13.

²⁶⁹ Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia: 6.

Layers of Narrative					
According to:	Roland Barthes (1982)	Gerald Genette (1983)	Byron Almén (2003)	Ian McDonald Jeffress (2013)	Characterisation through cross-genre (original perspective)
Top-Layer	Exterior relationship between signs	Narrating	Cumulative, global effect	Paradigm	Super-textual meaning
Mid-Layer	(N.A.)	Narrative	Mutual influence	Syntax	Sequential Teleology
Bottom-Layer	Interior relationship between signifier and signified	Story	Semantic characteristics	Symbol	Individual elements

Fig. 1.: Approaches to narrative layers in literature studies and musicology.

In literature, this higher voice this can be constructed through the usage of a narrator speaking in past tense²⁷⁰. In opera, this can be incorporated²⁷¹ through assessing the libretto, which could be supported or contradicted through the music, the later of which creates a clash between the literary and musical ‘subject positions’ of the work. Eric Clarke details such a process in Frank Zappa’s ‘Magdalena’: ‘[...the] narrative voice is that of a father who has abused his daughter [... and] the separation of subject matter and subject position [is illustrated] at a moment when the father appeals to his daughter to trust him and feel sympathy for him, while the music, which shifts to a Broadway show style, indicates that what the father is singing is fake’²⁷², adding ‘It is Zappa’s use of ironised, exaggerated and ridiculed musical styles, and the cultural values that each style specifies, together with a number of aspects of the vocal delivery, that articulates the music’s subject-position’²⁷³.

²⁷⁰ See Nattiez, J.-J., (1994). Can one speak of narrativity in music?. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 115, 240-257 for a detailed description of this in form of a critique against narrative analysis.

²⁷¹ See: Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press

²⁷² In Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts - second edition*. New York: Routledge: 134.

²⁷³ Clarke, E.F. (1999). Subject-Position and the Specification of Invariants in Music by Frank Zappa and P.J.Harvey. *Music Analysis* 18/3, 347-74.

Subject position is a considerably valuable field of narrative study in film and has significant pathways for musical narrative analysis. Also, the use of narrative voice in opera is a similarly fruitful area of inquiry, as Cathryn Abbate has explored²⁷⁴. Yet both of these areas are not explored by this thesis, which focuses instead on the enrichment of characterisation and scene-setting in contemporary opera through semiotic elements and does not analyse narration in the libretto (although it does compare musical and literary characteristics of the scenes and characters).

I propose a ‘bottom-up’ method of analysis: first the ‘building blocks’ are considered (the individual elements or symbols) to the extent that they create the characters, scene-settings and musical interludes for the work, then the ‘sequential teleology’ thereof (syntax or ‘mutual influence’) and finally how these depict a binary conflict on the level of an archetypal narrative. As such, the analysis should show how narrative archetypes are ‘supported by innate, organizing structures ... coordinating more detailed and specific semantic data into a single paradigm’²⁷⁵

4.2. Analysing the Bottom Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.2.1. Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation

Analysing the bottom layer of a cross-genre opera involves assessing how characters, scene-settings and musical interludes are composed from ‘enunciations’, which are the ‘building blocks’ of the cross-genre approach. Such enunciations include both autonomous musical material (which can be analysed positivistically) and non-musical hermeneutic information, and can be further categorised

²⁷⁴ See: Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press

²⁷⁵ See: Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-35.

through third space descriptors arising from the transposition of Homi K. Bhabha's work, as explored in the previous chapter. Of specific relevance to the cross-genre approach is the condition of conflict between the classical tradition and commercial genres, and how this is either articulated or boosted through the enunciations.

I suggest that the culmination of these enunciations is a musical equivalent to David Bordwell's concept of a 'syuzhet', which he used to describe the 'diagnosis' in film (the concrete elements of a film - 'the sounds and images presented in a film'²⁷⁶). The sibling term to syuzhet is 'fabula', which is 'the abstracted narrative constructed by the spectator'²⁷⁷ - the listener abstracts it from the concrete materials. On a musical cross-genre level, fabula is the abstracted hermeneutic meanings that the listener would be likely to construct based on the genre elements and their interaction with the classical tradition in the third space - the abstracted effect of the enunciations within the narrative²⁷⁸.

As a method of analysis of the bottom layer, I propose analysing the enunciations that constitute the syuzhet for each character, scene-setting and musical interlude. Firstly, the analyst should assess how the enunciation is built from autonomous musical material and what sort of hermeneutic information this material brings with it. Then, the way they articulate or boost the narrative conflict can be commented upon with cross-genre terminology - the terms transposed from the work of Homi K. Bhabha, as follows in Fig. 2:

²⁷⁶ Winters, B. (2010). The Non-diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music, and Narrative Space. *Music and Letters*, 91, 2, 224-244. — see in addition: Bordwell, D. (1985). *Narration in the Fiction Film*. London: Routledge: 49-57.

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Here, the 'translation' of 'fabula' departs from the direct linguistic translation of the Russian term 'fabula' (that would be close to 'story'), to the extent that I am not using it to define the sequential narrative events in a conflict (a task for the 'mid layer' of my analytic process', but rather the subjective associative elements that are abstracted by the fantasy of the listener. As such, the clear benefit of assessing syuzhet in cross-genre opera is incorporated into the 'discussion' element of the bottom layer analysis, where fabula is merely included as an additional term for the tabular analysis next to the more specific term 'hermeneutic information' - see below.

Cross-Genre Terminology, as Transposed into the Musical Sphere from the Work of Homi K. Bhabha

- **Discourse:** the exchange of musical elements (symbols) and their hermeneutic meanings between sides of a conflict (the classical tradition and commercial genres) on the *fabula* level.
- **Third space:** a non-homogenous musical aesthetic opened through a conflict of (perceived) binary opposites, which does not belong to either of the pre-conflict contexts (i.e. the classical tradition or commercial genres, for the purposes of this thesis). Where musical tension arises from 'the negotiation of incommensurable differences', the third space is active. Composing in the third space is a strategy, not a formula - the composer seeks out the 'border zone', which may be a shifting goal or a moving target. Composition techniques that have been learnt on either side of the binary divide - in the classical tradition or commercial genres - will be necessarily flawed and imperfect in the third space. In general, the third space is a technique for shunning stylistic organicism and homogeneity and embracing the 'disorder' of the clashing.
- **Stereotype:** the presentation of a homogenous musical object that represents one of the opposing binary musical cultures but does not show the inner conflicts in that (or any) musical culture. A stereotype is often based on an ideologically-driven historical narrative of the musical culture and not on its present condition. Its purpose can be to control the discourse through monopolising understanding of a musical culture, perhaps suggesting a limited potential for compatibility of one culture with another. The stereotype has no impact on the greater discourse, but is a self-contained object that does not change the behaviour of the other elements.
- **Cultural Difference:** a tension created through elements of specific difference. As opposed to bricolage or polystylism, it is inconceivable that the different musical cultures be interchangeable, since the focus is not on a compositionally-virtuosic kaleidoscopic diversity but rather on the consequences of specific differences. These consequences are the focus of the cultural difference, and are the opposite of stereotypes, since they have an unavoidable impact on the discourse.
- **Ambivalence:** the post-modern result of unclarity, as caused by the third space. Since the elements that enrich the classical tradition are not stereotyped, but full of internal conflict and cultural difference, they are necessarily hard to identify and understand - this results in a desirable ambivalence and is in fact a goal of the cross-genre approach. Identifying ambivalence should be, therefore, an indicator for an effective third space. Cross-genre compositions should have an ambivalent aesthetic - it should be so hard to categorise into either pre-crossed styles, forms, genres or traditions, as to not be possible and thereby create an ambivalent way of listening. Non-ambivalent cross-genre music would be polystylistic.

Cross-Genre Terminology, as Transposed into the Musical Sphere from the Work of Homi K. Bhabha

- **Hybridity:** new musical objects that build their identity through a combination of incomplete reproductions from both sides of the conflict. The new object enunciates both cultures simultaneously in a partial manner.
- **Mimicry:** an action of convincingly reproducing an element from the other side of the conflict through producing a mottled background for the action. The element is not an ‘authentic’ reproduction nor a stereotype, rather a hybrid element with flaws and internal conflict. It may appear authentic, however, due to its relative order in comparison with the chaos of the third space. The imperfections should be embraced and used as an artistic tool, and analysts should look to them for key indicators of the discourse.
- **Fixity:** the strengthening of one side of the discourse through the celebration of the historic ‘roots’ of either musical culture. Usually, fixity functions as a precursor to greater difference and can therefore be an indicator of building tension.
- **Enunciation:** a musical building block in its entirety consisting of both autonomous musical materials (themes, cells, gestures, rhythms etc.) and hermeneutic information (genre attributes etc.). They are the basic cell of the cross-genre approach.

Fig. 2: Cross-Genre Terminology

4.2.2. A Method for Analysing the Bottom Layer

Bottom Layer Analysis Step 1

In analysing the bottom layer of a cross-genre narrative in any given work, I suggest decomposing the character identities into their composite enunciations using the tables and discussion points below:

Character Identity # - Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis			
Enunciation	Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet	Hermeneutic information / Fabula	Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space
#			
#			

#			
Table 1: Analysing Cross-Genre Character Identity			

Bottom Layer Analysis Step 2

Discussion of Character Identity #: _____

Points of discussion for the *Discussion of Character Identity #* could be as follows:

- On what autonomous musical materials is the Syuzhet built?
- How do these materials articulate a musical culture?
- What sort of conflict is shown by this culture in the broader context of the work [hermeneutic enrichment of the tradition through the genres]?
- Describe the compositional process of transposing genre materials into the CCM context of the opera and identify the extent of hybridity in the enunciations [compositional enrichment of the tradition through the genres].

4.3. Analysing the Mid Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.3.1. The Mid Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis: Identification and Description of Cross-Genre Characters and Scene-Settings in Isolation and Relation to One Another

Characterisation through the cross-genre approach is a key component of the analysis of *I.th.Ak.A.* - as relevant to this thesis²⁷⁹. After these characters (and scene-settings and musical interludes) have

²⁷⁹ As noted in the Introduction, there are four main bodies of original work that I submit to the panel as the theoretical text-based research for this doctorate. An analysis of *I.th.Ak.A.* is one of these four bodies, which focusses on characterisation through the cross-genre approach, as informed by theories of narrative analysis.

been analysed through decomposition in the bottom layer, the process by which they perform narrative action upon one other (i.e. ‘functions’) can be considered, leading to their categorisation into a ‘role’. The analysis of the development of their role is a ‘character plot’.

In Fig. 1, I described the middle layer as one of ‘sequential teleology’²⁸⁰. Gregory Karl describes a process whereby musical characters influence each other in a sequential teleology, resulting in what he calls narrative ‘roles’, which are ‘idealized character types’, not necessarily bound to one manifestation of the type: ‘villain, not specific of which being, could be a bandit, a witch, a step-mother etc. In music, this could be a principle theme.’²⁸¹²⁸² A villain is a role that attempts to directly contradict the goals of the protagonist or ‘hero’. Generally, it can be expected that a protagonist and antagonist can be identified, and these form the two basic roles. There are very many additional roles available, and the analyst should assess this on a case-by-case basis. These include the:

- protagonist, who elicits our sympathies and strives for certain goals
- antihero/antiheroine, who elicits our sympathies and strives for certain goals whilst lacking conventional heroic attributes.
- antagonist (or ‘villain’), who attempts to directly contradict the goals of the protagonist or ‘hero’
- Mentor, who articulates lessons that help the protagonist achieve their goals
- Tempter, who attempts to distract the protagonist
- Sidekick, who demonstrates faithfulness to the protagonist
- Skeptic, who does not believe in the goals of the protagonist

²⁸⁰ See: Section 1.3.

²⁸¹ Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

²⁸² It is important to note that Karl sought a technique to analyse absolute music - not opera or programmatic music. As such, he saw musical drama as ‘a drama of mental life unfolding in the experience of a unitary persona’ where roles ‘should be understood as abstract personifications of opposing forces, impressions, and structures within the psyche of the persona.’ Nevertheless, the vocabulary and analytical technique he developed can be well applied to analysis of opera, as I hope to demonstrate.

- Emotional character, who acts intuitively
- Logical one that follows a process
- ‘Stock characters’ (that have ‘occurred so often [...] so] that his nature is immediately known’ including ‘the strong silent sheriff, the brilliant detective of eccentric habits, the mad scientist who performs fiendish experiments on living human beings, the beautiful international spy of mysterious background, the cruel stepmother’)²⁸³.

Characters can be further analysed by the following categories and attributes:

- ‘major’ or ‘minor’
- ‘dynamic’, in that they ‘undergo a permanent change in some aspect of character, personality, or outlook ... large or a small one ... for better or for worse’ or ‘static’, in that they remain ‘the same sort ... at the end of the story as at the beginning’
- ‘flat’, in that they can be ‘characterised by one or two traits’ but nevertheless ‘may be made memorable in the hands of an expert author’, or ‘round’, in that they have a ‘complex and many-sided’ state consisting of internal contradictions²⁸⁴.

This provides four categories of character attributes, as shown in Fig. 3:

Four Categories of Character Attributes	
Major-Dynamic	Major-Flat
Minor-Dynamic	Minor-Flat
Fig. 3: Character Attributes	

²⁸³ See: Perrine, L. (1985). *Story and structure*. Calgary: Alberta Education: 67-69.

²⁸⁴ Ibid.

‘Roles’ or ‘idealised character types’ can be easily identified in the libretto. More difficult, however, is their identification in the music. The key to this identification in the context of the cross-genre approach is the way in which they articulate, boost or control²⁸⁵ conflict between the classical tradition and commercial music genres.

The first step of analysing the mid layer continues the analysis of the character in isolation but provides the bridge into considering the character in relation to the others: identifying role types, as well as their dynamic development throughout the work (including the possibility that the development is insignificant and tends to being ‘flat’).

The second step is to consider plot functions of the characters as they relate to one another. Literary functions are ‘central elements [...] that motivate the actions of the [roles and especially the] hero, who eventually [...] attempts to counteract it’²⁸⁶. Musical functions can be seen to behave similarly by assessing elements ‘at odds with the principle material’²⁸⁷ and how they mutually influence musical behaviour. Karl provides a list of plot functions for usage in narrative analysis, arising from his ‘system of musical plot functions ... [for the] theory of musical actions’²⁸⁸:

- ‘Enclosure’: a sequence in which an agent is directly preceded and followed by opposing material... the agent is ‘the first to speak [and] also has the final word’
- ‘Disruption’: ‘a failed enclosure’ ... the first agent still has the final word but its attempt at refutation rings hollow

²⁸⁵ The factor ‘control’ is added in the mid level, since it related to the mutual influence characters have on one another. On the bottom layer, due to the method of considering characters in isolation, control was not a factor.

²⁸⁶ Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

²⁸⁷ Ibid.

²⁸⁸ Ibid. - Karl’s theory referred to absolute music, although I argue that it is clearly applicable to opera. It could be confusing when, for some reason, the literary protagonist of a libretto is not the musical protagonist, i.e. main musical driver, although this would only apply in extreme cases.

- ‘Subversion’: undercutting of a character
- ‘Counteraction’: ‘a measure taken to counteract the effects of a prior [function]’
- ‘Realisation’: bringing about of a desired state or the fulfilment of a threat
- ‘Withdrawal’: introversive counteraction
- ‘Interruption’: ‘self-explanatory’²⁸⁹

The plot functions between characters within scenes can be listed in succession with bar numbers.

4.3.2. A Method for Analysing the Mid Layer

Mid Layer Analysis Step 1: Character role and development analysis as given by the libretto.

Character Identity #	Role type and attributes	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
#			
#			
#			

Table 2: Character role and development analysis as given by the libretto.

Mid Layer Analysis Step 2: Character role and development analysis as given by the cross-genre approach evident in the musical score.

Character Identity #	(Musical) Role type and attributes	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
#			

²⁸⁹ See: Ibid.

Character Identity #	(Musical) Role type and attributes	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
#			
#			

Table 2: Character role and development analysis as given by the cross-genre approach evident in the musical score.

Mid Layer Analysis Step 3: Analysing musical plot functions in each scene, with commentary on the libretto

Plot functions in Scene #			
Bar #	Enunciation	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
#			
#			
#			

4.4. Analysing the Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis (in Opera)

4.4.1. The Top Layer of Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis: Archetype Identification and Analysis Within the Cross-Genre Dialog

In order to assess the top level of a musical narrative in cross-genre terms, I suggest an inquiry into the fundamental tension created by the meeting of ‘external’ modern music genres with the ‘internal’ space of the classical tradition. Such a tension would span an entire work and be experienced through the sum of all individual elements and also the sum of their relationships with one another. As such, it is a sort of ‘higher-level’ of listening which requires experiencing the entirety of the musical cross-genre tension, and as such, works to create the ‘highest’ level of

meaning. This is why I refer to it as the ‘top’ level: it is the highest arc of tension, built on the support of lower elemental and inter-relational levels.

Broadest analysis of a musical narrative can be effectively performed through assessing ‘archetype’ as explored in the work of Northrop Frye (himself building on Vladimir Propp’s *Morphology of the Folktale* from 1928)²⁹⁰, James Jakob Liszka²⁹¹ and Byron Almén²⁹². An archetype, as meant by these scholars, maps out an overarching conflict between forces that illicit our sympathies and those that oppose them. Frye posits four ‘generic plots’ or ‘mythoi’ - romance, tragedy, irony and comedy - which represent the four logical pathways between two narrative spheres of innocence and experience:

*The top half of the natural cycle is the world of romance and the analogy of innocence; the lower half is the world of "realism" and the analogy of experience. There are thus four main types of mythical movement: within romance, within experience [as expressed by irony or satire], down, and up. The downward movement is the tragic movement, the wheel of fortune falling from innocence toward hamartia, and from hamartia to catastrophe. The upward movement is the comic movement, from threatening complications to a happy ending and a general assumption of post-dated innocence in which everyone lives happily ever after.*²⁹³

— Northrop Frye (1928)

²⁹⁰ See: Frye, N. (1957). *Anatomy of criticism: Four essays*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

²⁹¹ See: Liszka, J. J. (1989). *The Semiotic of Myth: A Critical Study of the Symbol*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

²⁹² See: Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-35.

²⁹³ Frye, N. (1957). *Anatomy of criticism: Four essays*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

This idea of moving between halves was expanded upon by Litzka, who created a ‘logical model’ of ‘the intersection of two fundamental oppositions’ that mapped ‘the tension between an order or hierarchy [...] and the possibility of its transgression.’²⁹⁴ As with Frye, the narration focusses on the potential to shift states. However, Litzka, instead of envisioning movement within or between narrative spheres, sees instead a conflict-driven narrative which emphasises either ‘victory’ or ‘defeat’, where comedy is a ‘victory of transgression over order’, romance a ‘victory of order over transgression’, irony/satire a ‘defeat of order by transgression’ and tragedy a ‘defeat of transgression by order’. In the victorious scenarios, the force eliciting our sympathies triumphs and in the defeat scenarios it does not. These two approaches are tabulated in Fig. 5:

Archetype or mythoi	According to Frye	According to Litzka
Comedy	Upward motion from experience to innocence	The victory of transgression over normative order
Romance	Movement within the sphere of innocence	The victory of a normative order over transgression
Tragedy	Downward motion from innocence to experience	The defeat of a transgression by the normative order
Irony	Movement within the sphere of experience	The defeat of a normative order by transgression

Fig. 5.: Narrative archetypes according to Frye and Litzka.

The question for this thesis is: how could these archetypes behave in a musical narrative in line with the cross-genre approach? One obvious answer would be to transpose the cross-genre binary opposition of the ‘inside’ classical tradition to a sense of ‘order’ and the challenging ‘outside’ modern music genres to ‘transgressive’ forces, that wish to either come ‘inside’ the metaphorical musical museum or fundamentally challenge the contents thereof - this answer is represented in the ‘cross-genre model 1’ for each archetype. This relationship could also be reversed. A second model

²⁹⁴ Litzka, J. J. (1989). *The Semiotic of Myth: A Critical Study of the Symbol*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press: 15.

would be to build the material for the work out of cross-genre elements (as detailed in the mid and bottom layers) that themselves encapsulate the cross-genre approach, without representing cross genre explicitly through the archetypical conflict itself, as in the ‘cross-genre model 2’ for each archetype. Alternatively, the dramatic musical tension of a work could be constructed independently of cross-genre approaches and then enhanced, enriched or otherwise embellished by cross-genre ideas.

I wish to provide a non-exhaustive list of how this may occur for each archetype, to function as a starting point for top-level analysis.

Romance archetype: ‘victory of a desired order over an undesired transgression or opposition’²⁹⁵

- a musical tension where the desired attractive musical force contains and then defeats an opposing transgressive force.
- cross-genre romantic archetype model 1: an order of music within the classical tradition could face and overcome challenges from outside.
- cross-genre romantic archetype model 2: an attractive cross-genre element²⁹⁶ could grow and reach completeness, for example in the face of ‘transgressive’ self doubt or other forces. Growth can be achieved by a range of means, including: dynamic, textural, thematic, rhythmic, harmonic, in the melodic-arc or otherwise. An example of this may be Ravel’s *Bolero*: the main melody being a hybrid (cross-genre) element of a Spanish popular dance genre and the classical orchestral tradition.

²⁹⁵ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-35.

²⁹⁶ For cross-genre elements, i.e. hybrid, stereotype etc, see the following passages on mid and lower levels.

- additionally, there could be a particular focus on ‘the use of nostalgic or patriotic musical topics to elicit the listener's sympathy’²⁹⁷
- Examples include Ravel’s *Bolero* and *Daphnis and Chloe Suite* and Wagner’s *Liebestod*. Growth can be achieved by a range of means, including: dynamic, textural, thematic, rhythmic, harmonic, in the melodic-arc or otherwise.

Tragedy Archetype: ‘failure of a desired transgression (or an exercise of freedom) against a restrictive or undesired order.’²⁹⁸

- amongst an antagonistic or depressing musical force, an attractive element represents hope of improvement but is defeated.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 1: the classical tradition or ‘scene’ of external genres represents a musical force, which is elicits unwelcome responses from the listener and is contrasted with an attractive secondary element of the other sort that cannot become the main force.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 2: an attractive cross-genre element is restricted from developing freely, pushed to an extreme manifestation of the third space (i.e. stereotype, mimic, fixity etc. - see mid and bottom levels) and not able to display the differentiation of cultural difference within, due to the constraints placed by an overbearing other force. Another manifestation of this model would be that an attractive cross-genre element is shown enduring aggression and violence, which cannot be overthrown, transgressed or pacified to any significant degree.
- ‘employing musical topics [or genres or aspects of genres] associated with sadness, fate, or tragedy to reinforce a Tragic temporal unfolding, both of a specific character, such as the

²⁹⁷ Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-35.

²⁹⁸ Ibid.

"hammer blow of fate" in the last movement of Mahler's Symphony No. 6, and of a general character, such as the minor mode.'²⁹⁹

Ironic Archetype: 'suppression or removal of a pre-existent order resulting in an undesirable condition, whether chaos or a differently-valued order'³⁰⁰

- a tension between a force of order and one of transgression is presented, where the 'transgressive' force elicits our sympathies and is victorious but emerges as an unclear preference to the previous force of order, creating a musically ambivalent ending.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 1: either the 'inside' or 'outside' force of a cross-genre approach has predominance and is overthrown by the other (a 'switch' of focus), which then creates a mirror-reflection, with the 'inside' now 'outside' and vice versa, without any progress in understanding the 'third space' in between.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 2: a dominant cross-genre element is presented with relative order and through a compositional process, the internal conflicts are exaggerated to the point that disorder ensues without the compositional process of conflict resolving to an order of the magnitude of that which came before, resulting in an ambivalent 'anarchic' order.
- 'topics that tend toward exaggeration or parody, or distortions of musical convention, used in support of structural elements [...] pieces like Bach's Brandenburg Concerto No. 5, which begin conventionally, but spin out of control through the excessive use of some parameter or process.'³⁰¹

Comic Archetype: 'emergence of a new desired order (through a transgressive act) out of an undesired one'.

²⁹⁹ Ibid.

³⁰⁰ Ibid.

³⁰¹ Ibid.

- an unattractive, repressive and/or negative musical force is overwhelmed by a transgressive musical force that grows to dominate and may incorporate elements of the previous order in a more attractive way, as if to ‘improve them’.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 1: the ‘inside’ of a tradition or ‘scene’ of external genres is presented as unattractive, perhaps through its limited ‘newness’ of material, making it seem ‘cold’ or ‘retrospective’. Through contact with the other side of the boundary, through the third space, the original material becomes more attractive through lively conflicts of aesthetic, a richness of musical material and apparent ‘newness’ and progressiveness.
- cross-genre tragic archetype model 2: within an unattractive dominant musical force, an attractive cross-genre element grows to influence elements of the general force and gradually overtake and change the aesthetic of the general force to one which is attractive. Alternatively, the cross-genre element could resolve elements of its internal conflict that lead to its ‘spreading’ through out the general musical force.
- ‘topics suggesting humour, heroism, or liveliness reinforce the euphoric character of the Comic resolution [...] a theme or motive with a problematic element sheds that element and achieves fuller musical development’³⁰²

4.4.2. A Method for Analysing the Top Layer

Top Layer Analysis, Step 1

Identify an archetypical conflict using the following table:

Musical elements representing “order” in relation to the Cross-Genre theory:	Literary/textual elements representing “order”:
-	-
-	-
-	-

³⁰² Ibid.

Musical elements representing “transgression” in relation to the Cross-Genre theory: - - -	Literary/textual elements representing “transgression”: - - -
Musical elements eliciting the listeners sympathies in relation to the Cross-Genre theory: - - -	Literary/textual elements eliciting the listeners sympathies: - - -
Table 4: Identification of Archetypical Conflicts	

Top Layer Analysis, Step 2

I then propose a discussion of archetypes as they play out over the course of the work, in the text and music. Such archetypes are described in Fig. 5. The account of textual features (i.e. libretto, lyrics, multimedial aspects, programatic titles etc.), should be minimal - as much as required but not more - in order to direct discussion to the music. If the archetype can be strongly established, the analysis will have a more positivistic flavour, and if the archetype is ambiguous, the analysis will be more contemplative and abstract in style. The account of archetypal tendencies in the musical structure should regard binary oppositions created by the conflict of the classical tradition with external music genres, and the third space (see the list in 2.1.1.) that arises at the boundaries thereof.

4.5. Chapter Bibliography

Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*.

Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press: xi.

Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

Agawu, V. K. (2016). *Playing with signs*. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press.

Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts - second edition*. New York: Routledge.

Barthes, R. (1982). *The Imagination of the Sign*. In *A Barthes Reader*, ed. Susan Sontag. New York: Hill and Wang.

Bordwell, D. (1985). *Narration in the Fiction Film*. London: Routledge: 49-57.

Clarke, E.F. (1999). Subject-Position and the Specification of Invariants in Music by Frank Zappa and P.J.Harvey. *Music Analysis* 18/3, 347–74.

Cone, E.T. (1977). Three Ways to Read a Detective Story or a Brahms Intermezzo. *Georgia Review* 31: 554-74.

Culler, J. (1975). *Structuralist Poetics*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Frye, N. (1957). *Anatomy of criticism: Four essays*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Genette, G., Lewin, J. E., Culler, J. (1983). *Narrative discourse: An essay in method*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia.

Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

Kivy, P. (1980). *The Corded Shell*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Kramer, L. (1992). Musical Narratology: A Theoretical Outline. *Indiana Theory Review* 12.

Kramer, L., & California Digital Library. (2003). *Music as cultural practice, 1800-1900*. Berkeley: EScholarship, the California Digital Library.

Levi-Strauss, C. (1981). *The Naked Man*. trans. Doreen and John Weightman. New York: Harper and Row.

Liszka, J. J. (1989). *The semiotic of myth: A critical study of the symbol*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Maus, F. (1988). Music as Narrative. *Music Theory Spectrum* 10: 56-73

McDonald, M. (2004). Silent narration?: Elements of narrative in Ives's "The unanswered question". *19th Century Music*, 27, 3, 263-286.

Nattiez, J.-J., (1994). Can one speak of narrativity in music?. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 115, 240-257.

Newcomb, A. (1987). Schumann and Late Eighteenth-Century Narrative Strategies. *19th-Century Music* 11: 164-74.

Perrine, L. (1985). *Story and structure*. Calgary: Alberta Education.

Ratner, L. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York: Schirmer Books

Tarasti, E. (1994). *A Theory of Musical Semiotics*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Treitler, L. (1982). To Worship that Celestial Sound: Motives for Analysis. *Journal of Musicology* 1.

Unsel, M. (2008). *Der Komponist als Erzähler: Narrativität in Dmitri Schostakowitschs Instrumentalmusik*. Hildesheim: Olms.

Winters, B. (2010). The Non-diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music, and Narrative Space. *Music and Letters*, 91, 2, 224-244.

5. A Cross-Genre Narrative Analysis of the original opera I.th.Ak.A.

5.1. Introduction

5.1.1. Goals of the Analysis

5.1.2. Disclaimers

5.2. Bottom Layer Analysis

5.2.1. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Juli

5.2.1.1. Step 2: Discussion of Juli's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.2. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Cyclops

5.2.2.1. Step 2: Discussion of Cyclops' Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.3. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Circe

5.2.3.1. Step 2: Discussion of Circe' Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.4. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Dark

5.2.4.1. Step 2: Discussion of Dark's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.5. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Borgo

5.2.5.1. Step 2: Discussion of Borgo's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.6. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Der Kapitän

5.2.6.1. Step 2: Discussion of Der Kapitän's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

5.2.7. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Die Sirenen

5.2.7.1. Step 2: Discussion of The Sirens' Character Identity, as Arising from the Analysis

5.3. Mid Layer Analysis

5.3.1. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Libretto

5.3.2. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Musical Material and Cross-Genre Associations

5.3.3. Analysing Musical Plot Functions with Commentary on the Libretto

5.4. Top Layer Analysis

5.4.1. Identification of Elements of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict

5.4.2. Discussion of the Elements and Identification of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict

5.1. Introduction

Essentially, this chapter is the culmination of the entire dissertation project. The submitted composition, *I.th.Ak.A.*, combined with the preceding literature reviews and free thinking about artistic goals and philosophies to form the artistic, aesthetic and philosophical ‘data’ for my research, which will now be analysed for perspectives into what I call cross-genre composition. Before proceeding, I feel the need to stress that I have developed a new style of analysis and that this style may seem unorthodox in many ways. By this, I mean that the parameters of the analysis differ significantly from those of other analytical techniques of which I am aware: rather than dealing with development of harmony (as Schenkerian analysis), pitch-sets (as with Forte), thematic development (R  ti), or an over-arching concept (as in the work of Johannes Kreidler), my work deals with the manipulation, arrangement (i.e. structuring or creating form) and interplay of associations and hermeneutic information that arises from composing with the cross-genre approach as the primary force. I am confident that *I.th.Ak.A.* was composed as such: by primarily using hermeneutic information and associations arising for hybrid references to genres and their contrast

with the classical tradition - this is the cross-genre approach, as developed and outlined in the previous chapter.

Even if such associations may not be apparent to many, they were the motor for the inspiration for the work. In a sense, it's not so important to me if listeners hear all or even any of them (although I think some are too clear to miss), it's most important to me that this style of composing keeps me inspired and avoids writer's block. When I work with associations from genres and traditions, I feel a connection between my studio and the outside world, I feel part of a community - I feel enriched as a composer and person; enriched through society.

As such, I have developed a method for analysing the construction, manipulation, interplay and arrangement of musical associations and hermeneutic information. This is the analytic method for cross-genre works of music-theatre/opera that I developed in the previous chapter and put into motion in this chapter. I'm sure that it is, as I mentioned, an unorthodox style of analysis. Therefore, I ask the examiners to please refrain from comparing the analytic method to existing models but rather contemplate it on its own merits, as much as possible, since I believe this is the best and most effective way to examine the ideas and research outcomes (*Erkenntnisse*). There are, however, similarities between my analytic style and other philosophies for analysis as outlined in the literature review for musical analysis. In essence, my approach breaks down a 'whole' artistic product into smaller pieces for individual consideration, what I call 'enunciations'³⁰³. Enunciations contain three bodies of information, a brief descriptions of the autonomous musical materials as they were useful to me during the process of composition, a suggestion of which musical associations I intended to encode into the enunciation through references to genres and/or traditions

³⁰³ Refer to the previous chapter for a discussion of enunciations as they were adopted from the work of Homi K. Bhabha.

(as expressed by the modular verb ‘should’, as in: ‘Enunciation X references genre(s) YZ and should provide associations AB’), and commentary on how this creates a cultural conflict in the cross-genre third space³⁰⁴. That these three strands form a mutually-influential relationship is expressed through their fusion into the singular term *enunciation*. Having analysed these smaller parts in isolation, these are then considered for their mutual influence according to theories of narrative teleology, which is then evaluated on a meta-level in order to extract an over-arching artistic essence of the work.

This is the process outlined by David Beard in the ‘General Definitions’ section of my literature review on philosophies for musical analysis: he said that ‘At the simplest level, analysis provides a set of [...] symbols for discussing and describing the basic elements of music [... (where the symbols are ‘enunciations’) ...] which are applied in order to divide a musical structure into smaller constituent elements [...] These elements are then considered in isolation, in relation to one another, in relation to the work as a whole’³⁰⁵. This process has elements of organicism, the deconstruction of which I examined in the literature review. I argue that it treads a middle line between complete organicism (as in Schenker) and complete post-modern deconstruction (as in, perhaps, Carolyn Abbate’s narrative analytic essayistic discussion of Wagner’s *Ring Cycle*³⁰⁶), in that it considers only the primary compositional approach of the work - the cross-genre approach - whilst not

³⁰⁴ As a reminder: ‘conflict in the cross-genre third space’ refers to the interplay (i.e. ‘conflict’, in German: *Auseinandersetzung*) of associations and/or hermeneutic information arising from a musical ‘internal’ space (the ‘tradition’ or ‘traditions’) and musical ‘external’ objects (the genres). That this a process of generating or regenerating artistic newness was explored on the basis of Boris Groys’ *On the New*, how this may work in musical cultural exchange was transposed from the post-colonialist literary criticism of Homi K. Bhabha, and how a style for narrative musical analysis could be developed on the back of this was explored in the last chapter, featuring above all the work of Byron Almén and Gregory Karl.

For an additional hint, ‘conflict’ may be used the way some analysts use the term musical ‘tension’ (*musikalische Spannung*). Also, ‘third space’ is a term mostly referring to hybridity in this analysis and the work of Bhabha, who wrote a book entirely on hybridity. The other terms, such as ‘stereotype’, ‘mimicry’, ‘fixity’, ‘cultural difference’, ‘enunciation’ and ‘articulation’ can be seen simply as descriptors for the process by which hybridity is successful or a failure in a given cultural exchange. These comments are provided for clarity by way of simplification and different wording.

³⁰⁵ Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts - second edition*. New York: Routledge.

³⁰⁶ Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press.

analysing other techniques such as textual, rhythmic, harmonic or thematic developmental approaches, which are still present in the work. In other words, my analysis takes *one* approach of many that I employed in the creative process, albeit in the primary one from my perspective as the composer. On the most simple level, my approach shares the general philosophical-analytical mission of ‘answering directly the question ‘How does it work?’³⁰⁷, where ‘it’ stands for my creative process of composing an opera. In this way, I hope to have explained that, although the analytic method is and may seem unorthodox, it is nevertheless grounded in an established intellectual and aesthetic debate surrounding musical analysis, and the unorthodox elements of it are constructed so as to express the essence of my creative process, for which the existing analytic styles are insufficient.

5.1.1. Goals of the Analysis

The analysis should provide a perspective on how characterisation was achieved in the original opera *I.th.Ak.A.* through the cross-genre approach. As such, non-character-based music is omitted: instrumental interludes and the prelude, above all. For example, the *Verwandlungsmusik* contains elements of Techno, and the Malware Glitches interlude contains references to the avant-garde-stage *Glitch* genre of experimental electronic music, both of which may be interesting to a cross-genre analysis, yet these are excluded for purposes of scope, since they do not add to characterisation, but are composed for other reasons not explored in this analysis. Also reducing or focussing the scope is the method that once the characterisation is established, I do not analyse variations on the primary material for the character identities beyond that which shows a significant development in the character (bottom layer) or that which provides a narrative progression of teleology (mid layer). Much material is omitted, then, that may be interesting to an examiner or

³⁰⁷ Bent, Ian (1987). *Analysis*. London: McMillan Press.

student wishing to learn about the technique I use to develop material, which lies however outside the scope of characterisation as defined by the analytic technique (in the previous chapter). The examiner should have an impression of how each character was composed on a technical musical level, and with which hermeneutic information and associations I found inspiration to the creative process, in order to create a style of narrative conflict between the characters in line with a cross-genre approach. The analysis should present *I.th.Ak.A.* as a tapestry of stylistic conflict between characters and within the characters themselves, insofar as they are complex in their cross-genre identity.

Aside from the specific compositional task of analysing characterisation through cross-genre, on the most basic level, the goal of the analysis is to reflect on my creative process for *this* opera, which is the largest, most ambitious and important work I've composed up to the current moment. I have attempted a substantial reflection based on original ideas (i.e. the chapter 'Developing Cross-Genre') that are nevertheless supported by an intellectual debate (the various literature reviews) under the guise of artistic research, as I researched its current state. This is an example of the 'reflective methodology' (*nachdenkliche Methodologie* à la Harmann 2010) in artistic research and a goal of the analysis. Arising from these reflections, as inspired by intellectual research into cross-genre-related debate (as in those by Lena/Peterson on genre, Groys on newness and Bhabha on cultural exchange, to name just a few), a range of vocabulary should develop as products of research for art (i.e. vocabulary as 'tools'), through research about (i.e. the intellectual debate) and through art (i.e. the composition of *I.th.Ak.A.*). This flexible vocabulary could act as results that can be used by third parties for discussing cross-genre music past, present and future. At best, it could

be a new way of discussing diverse cultural influences within a work of music, just as Homi K. Bhabha did so with literature³⁰⁸.

All in all, I am confident this is the sort of analysis I want to produce, and the sort which best represents my work. The conflict between the musical tradition (as represented by Juli) and genres external to this tradition (as represented by the characters other than Juli) is what I mean by cross-genre composition. Without wanting to exhaust the point: it is a non-conventional analytical style: I do not deal with the notes themselves on a level that one would expect from traditional counterpoint, harmonic or thematic analyses, since this is not the thing most important to my work. Rather, the approach most important to my work the interplay of associations presented by references to genres and/or traditions of music - I firmly believe that this analytic approach, and the following analysis, faithfully analyses this concept in the submitted original composition³⁰⁹.

5.1.2. Disclaimers

I have two short disclaimers to express before detailing the analysis. Firstly, I have tried to keep commentary on the libretto to a basic minimum. This is done freely in the bottom layer analysis and systematically in mid layer analysis, where the same methodology is performed on the libretto and then on the music. I believe that one cannot analyse an opera without considering the impact that the libretto had on the musical material - this is a reason why I researched and adapted theories of narrative analysis. Nevertheless, the primary goal is to analyse characterisation through the musical cross-genre approach. As such, commentary on the libretto is limited. Secondly, when making

³⁰⁸ This is another reason for inspiration from narrative musical analysis is presented: literary theory crosses with both Bhabha's approach and those of the chapter on narrative analysis.

³⁰⁹ Arriving at this understanding of my music is perhaps the largest result (*Erkenntnis*) of the artistic research project, or at least a significant one.

claims as to the hermeneutic information potentially contained in any given genre, I will not provide external references that support the claim. The reason being, that I wish to state my intention as a composer, which I thereby give as a declaration, rather than prove scientifically a general validity of a hermeneutic info in a genre. This further supports the reflective methodology of the analysis, as one that assesses my creative process - how associations are used as a motor to power the composition of the opera beyond blocks, through providing a socially-based source of inspiration, from which I personally benefit greatly.

A musical example of each enunciation will follow (not precede) the tabular analysis of it.

5.2. Bottom Layer Analysis

5.2.1. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Juli

The focus of enunciations for the analysis of the Juli character identity is on her three ‘Ariettas’. These demonstrate the key elements of her character in isolation, not in dialog with other characters, where the musical language may primarily conflict and hybridise. In other words, since Juli takes these three moments of reflection, free of time constraints or musico-dramatic impetus from external forces, one can be confident that they represent a significant amount of her isolated character identity. Although the work does not start with her first Arietta - Juli sings and presents her character material firstly in the Computerstimme Scene (1.2.) - ‘Juli's erste Arietta’ [Juli's first Arietta] (1.3.) is the first clear exposition of her musical and textual material and therefore the starting point for this analysis.

<u>Enun- ciatio- n</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>
S1.3. B62 J1	Ascending minor second (m2) interval with an accent on the upper neighbour-note, which also has a comparatively longer duration. This theme is preceded by a piano hand sweep of the strings in the lowest quarter of the piano body.	A strong tension is usually created through m2: an emblematically dissonant interval with strong dramatic connotations. I propose that the ascending m2 interval is an established cliché or ‘calling card’ for drama (above all in the form of unresolved tension) in the contemporary classical music (CCM) tradition, especially in the post-tonal era, where dissonance becomes a premium musical material. One such example is the final bars of R. Strauss’ <i>Also Sprach Zarathustra</i> , with a resolution to B-major and a deep pizzicato C in the basses indicating unresolved musical drama.	In the context of a CCM opera, the interval places Juli clearly as an actor enunciating with language of the contemporary classical tradition. There is an ambivalence to the dramatic conflict caused and suggested by the m2 and its clear place of belonging in CCM: on one hand, it is familiar material and places the listener firmly in the CCM space, without demonstrating elements of hybridisation with commercial genres (hereon simply ‘genres’); on the other, the dissonant nature of it intends an aesthetic of conflict. In other words, it is an authoritative depiction of CCM, undermined by the harmonically unstable nature of m2, leading to ambivalence between authority and instability. i will attempt to clarify this ambivalence throughout the character identity analysis.



<p>SI.3. B63 J2</p>	<p>Development of the vocal minor second in the accompaniment, enhanced through the microtonal capabilities of the strings (through glissandi), including the sul pont. extended technique. Rhythm is not perceivable in the strings, just in the ‘bells’ of the e-drums, which are masked through reverb.</p>	<p>The ensemble reacts to Juli's personality in a loyal way, as if being a manifestation of these thoughts. The instrumental music takes the motif further into territory typical of contemporary classical music or ‘Neue Musik’, in that it further dissolves harmony into a set of a-rhythmic microtones though the long and small glissandi. The preceding piano hand sweep adds an additional ‘typical’ extended technique of CCM and places Juli's musical language firmly in this tradition for listeners familiar with its conventions or ‘generic contract’ (Kallberg 1987–8). Rhythm is deliberately masked through the extensive reverb on the ‘bells’ of the e-drums.</p>	<p>The accompaniment, with its calling cards of microtones, lack of rhythm and typical ‘extended techniques’ (hand sweeps in the piano and sul pont.) brings the music of Juli so firmly into the CCM space (representing the ‘inside’ tradition) so as to be a stereotype. At this point, there is no material which conflicts the depiction of CCM, in my opinion. My compositional intention was one of fixity - to clearly define Juli's battle-lines as a representative of CCM in the third space by referring to what I saw as essential harmonic (m2) and sonic (ext. tech., microtones, weakened rhythm) materials of CCM.</p>
--	--	---	---

<p>S1.3. B66-6 8 J3</p>	<p>Melodic (vocal - Juli) intervallic combination of an accented ascending perfect fourth (P4) and descending major 7th (M7), followed by the established ascending m2. The accompaniment plays double-stopped M7s separated by two octaves and a m6 with a ffpp accent rhythmically proceedings Juli's.</p>	<p>The intervallic quality of this enunciation is similar to the first, in that it is built on instability and dissonance and therefore reinforces Juli's representation of my stereotyped depiction of CCM. The M7 is obviously in this camp and even the P4 has often been noted for its dissonant nature. Subtracting the P4 from the M7 results in a tritone (TT) which is therefore suggested. The ensemble becomes more integrated with the vocalist and together, they provide an anchoring in a traditional sort of CCM, the hermeneutic information of which includes: rebellion against romantic harmony, A hermeneutic idea that fascinated me as a composer whilst composing Juli's</p>	<p>Elements of stereotype, fixity and ambivalence, that have already been discussed, are reinforced through this enunciation. Juli establishes herself further as an actor for my stereotyped depiction of the CCM tradition (the 'inside') in the third space. Again, ambivalence is created: the fixity-based stereotype of CCM shows a simplified version of this musical tradition - as if all composers of the tradition share a main goal of creating dissonance and obscured rhythm - yet the aesthetic itself is supposed to be unstable, creating an ambivalence through 'stability' of repeating the main doctrine of the (stereotyped) tradition and the 'instability'</p>
---	--	---	---

<p>The percussion continues with 'bells'.</p>	<p>language is the paradox of how a-tonality and a-rhythmicism became standard in German <i>E-Musik</i> in the <i>Nachkriegszeit</i>. On one hand, prominent composers of this time that never wrote with tonal harmony - Stockhausen, Boulez, Nono et al. - wanted to reject the Romantic tradition and the related way of composing. On the other hand, this rejection of tradition became a tradition in itself, which I as a composer am using to semiotically encode Juli's character. Regardless of whether this is understood by the listener (although I assume many would), the hermeneutic information I attempted to communicate and reinforce in her character thus far is her penchant for dissonance, instability and rebellion, as I hear in much music of the classical <i>Nachkriegszeit</i>.</p>	<p>inherent in the material and hermeneutic information itself.</p> <p>The 'hermeneutic idea' of the previous column expresses again the hard-to-express ambivalence of Juli's 'unstable authority' as protagonist and representative of the stereotyped CCM, as created through fixity.</p>
---	--	--

The image shows a musical score with a vocal line and a percussion part. The vocal line is in 4/8 time and features dynamic markings such as *f*, *sub. p*, and *ffpp*. The percussion part includes a 'whip' sound effect and various dynamic markings like *<ff*, *ffpp*, and *pp*. The score is divided into measures with different time signatures (4/8, 3/8, 4/8). The lyrics 'Kann für nichts steh'n im Sit-zen' are written below the vocal line.

<p>S1.3. B74-7 6 J4</p>	<p>An A-minor triad is partially outlined, followed by angular melodic embellishments largely in A-harmonic-minor and eventually tonicising E-minor. The rhythm is suggested with a ‘molto rubato’ indication and is accompanied ‘colla voce’ by decorative piano chords, taking notes freely from the mode. The text of the enunciation is ‘sanitarium’, and unlike the previous enunciations, this employs a significant melisma, taking 19 quarter notes to express the term,</p>	<p>The clear diatonic material of this enunciation contrasts that of the previous (main) enunciation. Hermeneutically, I intended the vocal line to be reminiscent of Romantic classical music, in that it uses expressively angular intervals to create tonally-based melodies that dramatically jump between registers (here, inspired by Richard Strauss). An association between Juli and late-Romantic music would be an intended effect, showing two sides to her characterisation - a post-tonal, quasi-serialist avant-gardist and a late-tonal Romantic - both of which can be ordered into the classical tradition. The significantly long duration of the single term ‘sanitarium’ and free delivery style (rubato etc.) creates a sort of <i>Réverie</i>, and my intention was to show a process of dreamy reflection, new to the character, who has been otherwise focussed on fast goal-driven actions. This should hint at a bipolarity, or at least at complexity of character. The Romanticism of the tonality and intervallic angularity should create associations of high emotionality, as was a goal of late Romantic composers such as R. Strauss and Wagner. This is</p>	<p>This enunciation should show an inner conflict in Juli and an inner conflict in the CCM that she represents, since its autonomous material and hermeneutic information differs from the previous ones. Therefore, it should provide some resistance to tendencies to Stereotype (where her materials and information would be homogenous and without conflict). In other words, where Juli represents CCM, I wish to show that there is difference and internal conflict in the tradition, including those of: tonality, a-tonality, emotionality, detachment. The ‘erste Arietta’ in Scene 1.3. is a depiction of Juli's character in isolation, showing internal difference with a dramatic freedom, since no other characters react to or influence her actions in this <i>Réverie</i>. The third space created in this scene is firmly on the side of CCM but complex in its own internal logic and aesthetic. Both ‘poles’ of her personality - highly emotional Romantic</p>
---	--	---	---

<p>where as all previous terms in this aria had not taken more than two quarter notes, sometimes only one 16th notes. The note: ‘sensa misura, freely, introverted, molto rubato, slowly’ is given.</p>	<p>in contrast to the emotional detachment I intended with the quasi-serialist language, of the first enunciations, that I described as a language developed in rebellion to the late Romantic tonality (giving Boulez, Stockhausen and Nono as examples). In addition, one could have the association that Juli is reflecting on her feelings of being in the sanitarium, as opposed to actions that will help her escape. It therefore is a musical narration of the past (memories) rather than the present. Regardless, it is intended to show her ability to create moments of reflective freedom within the narrative flow, adding to her protagonistic role and suggestion her control over the events.</p>	<p>tonality and detached, aggressive quasi-serialism - are a form of fixity, creating her identity based on the historical compositional tradition of CCM and of classical music in general.</p>
---	--	--

sensa misura, freely, introverted, molto rubato slowly, c. ♩ = 60-80

74 *p* *mf* *mp* *m*

sie nen-es Sa - na - tor - ri um m

76 *m* *m*

<p>S1.3. B80-8 1 J5</p>	<p>The vocal line creates a descending sequence, tracing out G#-minor, G-minor and F#-minor triads with additional dissonant notes - becoming harmonically most apparents when coupled with the right hand of the piano. This clashes with C-major, B-major and B-flat major triads in the strings. The vocal rhythm is in regular triplets where the ensemble plays staggered, highly syncopated rhythms that create rhythmic instability.</p>	<p>This enunciation follows the ‘sanitarium’ Reverie and presents a return to a more aggressive, rhythmically-bound and quasi-serially-dissonant expressive force. It has two sides: the aforementioned highly chromatic polytonality (which is so chromatic as to be quasi-serialist) with accompanying stuttered rhythm and aggressive articulation, and a quasi-tonal sequence with Romantic characteristics, where large intervallic distance, high chromaticism and accentuation of articulation create a penchant for emotionality. These build the two sides of Juli’s personality into one enunciation.</p>	<p>The neatness of the sequence creates a tinge of stereotype, since the fourth on the top of the figure is faithfully repeated three times (G#-D#, G-D, C#-F#). There is a certain complexity in the lower notes, that have a natural, intuitively-composed variation, but my contention is that the consistency of the top intervals can be heard and creates a clearly sequential structure that makes the quasi-serialist music more accessible than that which is shy of such clear structures. As such, this may be a sort of ‘self stereotype’ that is used by Juli to create clarity of identity and expression.</p>
---	---	---	--

S1.3. 96-99 J5' Development of J5 through extension of the sequence and less dissonant pitches, making the material more transparent.

The Romanticism of J5 is expressed more clearly, since the tonal chromatic sequence is unobscured by neither polytonal stuttered string chords nor dissonant melodic notes. This pairs with the text 'ich liebte die Wildnis, frei von Gesetzen' [I love the wildness, free from laws], which is a classic expression of Romantic desire for freedom and adventure. Both of these languages, as well as this textual expression, clearly orient her to the classical and CCM operatic tradition.

Although both elements of the enunciation are those of the classical tradition, and not belonging to genres, there is a sort of hybridity of different cultures from within the classical tradition. The late Romantic chromaticism is articulated to such a chromatic extent that it includes 10/12 semitones of the scale, warranting a label of quasi-serialism. The former element is incomplete due to the fragmentary nature of tonal

function and the latter due to a similar reason, in that the serial technique is not a complete function over any substantial body of music. Juli is, therefore, an actor hybridising the inner conflicts of her tradition.

Meno mosso (rubato)

96 *ff*

Juli

her ich lieb-te die Wild nis, frei von Ge

E. Gtr.

Vln.

Vc.

Pno.

Dr. Smpl.

8^{va}
ff con pedale

The image shows a musical score for a piece titled "Meno mosso (rubato)". The score is for a vocal part (Juli) and piano accompaniment. The vocal line is in treble clef, 3/8 time, and starts with a tempo marking of 96 and a dynamic marking of *ff*. The lyrics are "her ich lieb-te die Wild nis, frei von Ge". The piano accompaniment includes staves for E. Gtr., Vln., Vc., Pno., and Dr. Smpl. The piano part has a dynamic marking of *ff con pedale* and an *8^{va}* marking. The score is divided into three measures with time signatures of 3/8, 7/8, and 5/8.

<p>S1.3. B116- 119 J6</p>	<p>Juli repeats 'auf der Suche' [searching for] and sings intervals based on m2, TT, P4, P5, augmented octave (A8) and M7. The ensemble play hectic individual motives based on these intervals and a general upwards curve.</p>	<p>The intervals form sorts of 'broken octaves' (M7/A8) with 'broken fifths' (TT). The chords are almost stable and harmonic, but crucially a semitone off and therefore highly dissonant - this represents to me Juli's tragic desire to reach stability and harmony (which would be represented through fifths and octaves) but reality of instability, restlessness and tension - effects that are created from these dissonant intervals. This is reinforced by the text 'auf der Suche' [searching for].</p>	<p>The unstable intervals show the CCM as one built on harmonic tension and conflict. This will be important for the latter parts of the work, where the genres are presented as 'alternatives' to this constant instability.</p>
---	--	---	---

The image shows a musical score for a vocal and instrumental piece. The vocal line is in the top staff, with lyrics: "auf der Suche, auf der Suche auf der Suche nach". The score includes dynamic markings such as *mp*, *f*, *mf*, and *ff*. There are also performance instructions like "Recit." and "Tempo". The score is divided into measures, with some measures containing triplets (indicated by a '3' over the notes). The bottom of the score shows a piano accompaniment with various rhythmic patterns and dynamics.

<p>S1.3 B120- 122 J7</p>	<p>The melody creates a Leitmotiv for I.th.Ak.A. - a descending M7 and rising P5. The accompaniment reinforces the harmony with additional modal tones.</p>	<p>Similar ‘Juli intervals’ (J3) are used but set in a harmonic way that creates a Romantic tonality of a Major chord with a M7 embellishment. The goal of her journey - I.th.Ak.A. - is given a Romantic utopian tinge. She idolises this goal state. This moment is the climax of the aria, representing the potential for I.th.Ak.A. to be the climax of the journey and the whole opera. It further demonstrates Juli’s ‘Romantic side’ and suggests that the ‘fighting side’ (or ‘avant-garde’) is a means to an end of reaching her real character, Romantic and softer in nature.</p>	<p>As with the previous sections, this enunciation reinforces the multilayered and non-stereotyped representation of CCM, as encapsulated in Juli’s character. It could and should be clear by now that Juli represents the classical and contemporary classical music traditions in a way that contains inner conflict and cultural difference. Her identity is built through a fixity of tradition, but one which does not follow a single system of ideology. The pathway to a conflict is therefore opened through the fixity of tradition, yet kept flexible through the internal cultural difference.</p>
--	---	--	---

120 **L** *f*

I - tha - ka I - tha - ka

mp *f* *p*

mp *f* *p*

f *mp*

<p>S4.1. 7-11 J1'</p>	<p>The phrase begins with Juli's signature m2, which then expands to trace out an AM+M7 chord and an octatonic scale. This is mirrored in the accompaniment, which contains the same material in</p>	<p>The sparse and fragile texture, built on dissonant intervals and octatonic modes, gives a feeling clearly belonging to CCM. Primarily, it should situate Juli's action in a post-tonal and post-rhythmic soundworld. In addition, the extremely soft instrumental playing and use of synthesized violin sounds in addition to the real ones brings a modernity of texture to the classical vocal and instrumental playing styles. If any outside genre is to be heard, it could be connotations of horror film music - this</p>	<p>The space of the CCM tradition is put in an uneasy, if not terrifying light - it comes here to stand for the space Juli 'hates' ('ich hasse die Finsternis' [I hate the darkness]), and involves the most fragile harmonies and playing textures of the whole piece. This 'Second Arietta', therefore, is an intensification of the language from the 'First Arietta' in the direction of horror and (psychological) torture. Such a</p>
--	--	--	---

<p>long, drawn out tones.</p>	<p>was a minor intention whilst composing.</p>	<p>development shows the need for Juli to go to the border zone of the third space to find new experiences, rather than to get stuck in the fixity of her current language. It is suggested musically that she would benefit from the enrichment and/or conflict with other languages, not from withdrawal.</p>
-------------------------------	--	---

7 **A**

p 3

Hier ist es noch noch noch noch noch noch Fin-ster-er.

sul A

dealys on Juli's voice

pp

noch noch noch noch noch

<p>S4.1. 22-32 J8</p>	<p>Introduced by the phrase ‘sehe ich Dinge’ [I see things], the violin and cello play an experimental duet, accompanied by synthesiser chords built from Juli’s intervals and harmonies. The violin plays a range of Juli’s intervals (including doublestopped m2s) and highly a highly virtuosic range of articulations in extreme registers and quick durations. The cello plays an octatonic melody in the highest register.</p>	<p>In combination with the text, which indicates that the following music represents hallucinations based on past trauma, the instrumental music is intended to give an aesthetic look into Juli’s psyche. Each gesture played by the violin and cello is supposed to represent a memory or feeling of a traumatic experience that Juli has endured, and that reemerge when she is in darkness (as with this scene). This should reinforce the idea that the core of Juli has been traumatised, the trauma of which is represented by highly dissonant and rhythmically non-decodable avant-garde music. Furthermore, for advanced listeners and/or analysts, this can be compared to the more harmonic and tonal language Juli sometimes uses. In a way, one could consider the extreme dissonance, non-decodable rhythm and extended playing techniques of the most avant-garde CCM to be a traumatically-extreme development of the ‘healthy amount of dissonance’ in tonal music. In other words, the little bit of fear, trauma and depression in all music (as represented by dissonance) is developed to such an extreme that it represents full-blown clinical depression (substantial loss of</p>	<p>The exposition of Juli’s traumatised inner core is an act of fixity, performed by reaching to the extremities of CCM, and away from tonalities or rhythms that could form hybrid enunciations with elements of genres. This enunciation is perhaps the furthest point away from commercial genres in the work (the only other contender being the instrumental etude ‘The Scream’) and represents a ‘withdrawal’ away from the conflict between CCM and genres. At other points of the work, where Juli is more proactive in the process of conflict or enrichment, her language strays from a ‘pure’ form of CCM, as is the case in this Arietta, towards one of hybridity (see the Mid Layer Analysis). Paradoxically, the connotations of music for horror films, which may be prevalent in some listeners, would present an interesting overlap of CCM and commercial genres, in that CCM</p>
--	--	--	---

The image displays a musical score for Violin (Vln.) and Synthesizer strings (Syn. Str.). The score is divided into five systems, each marked with a double bar line and a repeat sign. The first system shows the Violin part with dynamic markings *fpp*, *(pp)*, *mf*, *pp*, *3*, *mf*, *ff*, *pp*, *ff*, *pp*, and *f*. The Syn. Str. part is marked with *f*. The second system includes a *Meno mosso* tempo change with a metronome marking of $\text{♩} = 70$ and a section labeled **D**. Dynamics range from *fpp* to *p*. The third system features dynamics from *ppp* to *pp*. The fourth system is marked with a section labeled **E** and dynamics from *ppp* to *mp*. The fifth system includes a *rit.* (ritardando) marking and dynamics from *pp* to *ppp*. The score includes various musical notations such as slurs, accents, and articulation marks.

<p>S4.1. 47-49 J4'</p>	<p>As the closing bars of the Arietta, they are also the most simple, consisting of only four notes of the A-harmonic minor scale (G#, A, B, C) in syncopated but simple rhythm. Originally, I also included an E, to make the A-minor tonality more clear, but later felt it was clear enough as is.</p>	<p>Unlike the complex avant-garde aesthetic of J8, this enunciation is simple and tonal. It should be the most extreme(-ly simple) version of the 'other side' of Juli's personality, that described as J4. It should serve to intensify the range of expression Juli uses to portray her character - from inaccessibly complex to childishly simple. The simple oscillation between A and G#, coupled with the descending scallic motion of the voice, should indicate a tonic/dominant/tonic cadential movement. I intended this enunciation to be surprising in its contrast and to avoid a potential predictability of continuing with one aesthetic. Although the Arietta ends and climaxes on textures very solidly in the camp of CCM, the ending, which is more oriented on Romantic or even 'sacred minimalist' music, should cast a doubt over the true authority of the 'traumatised', complex and fragile music that came before it.</p>	<p>The contrast of the J4' enunciation to J8 shows an inner conflict in Juli's embodiment of the classical and CCM traditions. It presents an ambivalence that creates opportunities for cross-genre aesthetics that articulate both the differences from within Juli's encapsulation of tradition and elements that come from 'outside' this tradition through the genres. The differences will then be multi-faceted. Were J8 to be the last enunciation, the message would be one that: Juli finds strength in the fixity of becoming more extreme in her avant-garde colours within CCM. That the ending is in many ways the complete opposite of this creates productive ambivalence and internal cultural difference.</p>
---	---	--	---

The image shows a musical score for three parts: Juli (voice), Vln. (violin), and Syn. Str. (synthesizer strings). The score is for measures 47-49. The vocal part (Juli) is in treble clef, 3/4 time, and features a simple melodic phrase starting on G#4, moving to A4, B4, and C5. The lyrics are "Dann ha-ben sie mich ge - noss - en." The violin part (Vln.) is in treble clef, 3/4 time, and features a simple accompaniment. The synthesizer strings part (Syn. Str.) is in treble clef, 3/4 time, and features a simple accompaniment. The score includes dynamic markings such as *p* and *pp*, and a hairpin symbol. A rehearsal mark **H** is placed above measure 47.

<p>S8 8-10 J4'</p>	<p>An A-minor triad is outlined in full, with additional modal tones of B and D and the dissonant tone D#, which is used to trace out the M7 'Juli-interval'. For this enunciation, there is no text and simple, free and slow rhythm.</p>	<p>Juli begins this Arietta, her third, with the simple tonal material she reached at the end of her last Arietta, having then reached the climax of the 'avant-garde' side of her identity. Because the third Arietta is at the end of the work and completely a cappella, the vocal material takes on a new importance for the listener. This makes the simple, tonal beginning especially meaningful. One is to understand Juli as essential simple and accessible by nature. However, the rest of the third Arietta will show that she is irreparably corrupted by the traumatic dissonance that she carries within her. I wished to encode this characterisation through the oft mentioned and conflict-prone 'two sides' of her identity - the extreme avant-gardist and simple (tonal) Romantic.</p>	<p>This Arietta, coming as the last piece in the work, presents the 'results' of the conflict in the third space. In the coming enunciations, I wish to show the arrival point for Juli as a hybrid character. In this first enunciation, Juli presents a hybrid of her 'Romantic' and 'avant-garde' languages, articulating a clear A-minor harmony with the one dissonant tone, the D#, to show the permanent presence of dissonance in an otherwise harmonic enunciation. As will be shown in the Mid-Layer Analysis, the presence of tonality in the final Arietta is a result of accepting the path of the Sirens, which was offered through a simple Pop-Song-Like chord progression. The following enunciations explore final her hybrid identity further.</p>
---	--	---	---

A c. ♩ = 60

8 *mp* with a lot of space and time, very freely

ah ————— eh - ah - oh - oo

12 *p* with more sense of tempo

Hier — bin ich frei, und ster- be ich, sterb' — ich in

<p>S8 12-24 Hybrid</p>	<p>A long enunciation, containing: a phrase on the m2, the interval at the beginning opens all three Ariettas (although this Arietta has a wordless phrase before it), a set of m6, P5 and TT, a stepwise octatonic melody and a variation on J5, including the M7 at the end of it. The text describes her decision to die in freedom rather than live without it.</p>	<p>At this point, hermeneutic associations of more adventurous CCM and more traditional Romantic harmonies have been so thoroughly explored as to have created their own aesthetic. This long enunciation shows this process through the collection of materials that Juli has used throughout the work: the standard ‘calling cards’ of post-tonal harmonies (m2 and M7) that start and end the enunciation, the suggestion of harmony through the G3#-A-B-C tonal phrase (also an octatonic cell) in bars 17/18 (see: J1’) and the descending chromatic sequence (J5). An information that I intended with this hybrid enunciation is that Juli has reached the maximum point of development, where the inner conflicts have formed a hybrid identity that has dramatically made the decision for its own fate.</p>	<p>This enunciation develops the Juli’s character further as a hybrid identity. Where the previous enunciation (J4’) had one element of hybridity, this one contains multiple substantial elements that counterweigh each other so as not to create a clear dominance of one element over the other, enhanced by the fact that there is no accompaniment that contrasts her language - the listener can hear clearly the elements of her character identity, articulating smoothly the different points of conflict from earlier in the work. The result of the conflict with other genres in the third space has resulted in Juli becoming more cohesive in the internal conflicts of her character, but not in any substantial change of character in the direction of any of the other ‘challengers’ in the work.</p>
---	---	---	--

with more sense of tempo

12 **p** **pp** **p**

Hier bin ich frei, und sterbe ich, sterb' ich in

19 **mf** **pp**

Frei - - - heit. Es gibt kein zurück.

<p>S8 39-51 Hybrid</p>	<p>A quasi-tonal melody tracing either CM or Em develops into a clear Em, ending in a dissonant tail of m2, M7, m6 and P5 intervals that end on the Ithaka motiv and a m2 fall. Juli sings further about dying wilfully in freedom. It represents the climax of the Arietta and a climactic point of the work.</p>	<p>The transparent intervals and clear development into E-minor, which then completely dissolves into Juli's dissonant intervals, represents the typical balance and inner conflict between tonality and a-tonality in her character identity. As the climax of the final Arietta, the clarity of these two polar opposites shows that homogeneity of the conflicting sides of her character is impossible. The intended hermeneutic information is that the polars of tonality (Romantic/Classical music) and atonality (CCM) exist as conflicting cultural difference and not as a harmonic homogenous tradition, as encapsulated by Juli.</p>	<p>The permanence of Juli's Inner conflict and tension presents her as her own third space, reinforcing the concept that the journey of <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i> is of Juli's creation and occurs in her mind.</p>
---	--	--	---

<p>S8 53-73 J1”</p>	<p>The enunciation begins and ends with the ascending m2 interval. After the first m2 interval, two octatonic passages are sung on the passages with significant text (interrupted by another m2, this time descending), ending in a descending chromatic sequence of m2</p>	<p>A focus on dissonance and lack of harmony or mode leads the enunciation to release tension and provide a lack of meaningful associations or hermeneutic information.</p> <p>The ending of the final enunciation is a clear depiction of the text - the text repeats a wish for redemption, after a declaration of intention to suicide, and the voice gradually descends to its physical lower limits and becomes overtaken by breath noises. An intended piece hermeneutic information for this ending was that endless dissonance (a chain of ascending chromatic m2s, descending sequentially by a M2, the smallest possible sequential interval) is</p>	<p>This enunciation can be seen as a ‘result’ of the conflict in the third space, since it is the final one in the narrative. Juli has not undergone a fundamental change of character identity through the conflict and/or process of enrichment, and forms the final enunciation with her key interval, a m2. As will be shown in the Top Layer analysis, this presents a tragic archetype, where a negative force (Juli’s inner dissonance) triumphs over other positive forces (her harmonic language, those of the genres, or hybrids thereof). The development of her</p>
-----------------------------	--	--	---

<p>and M2 on ‘erlöse mich’ [redeem me], which ends in incrementally dominant breath noises.</p>	<p>a cul-de-sac, and can only end in complete dissonance.</p>	<p>character has found a ‘solution’ of ‘redemption’ through nihilistic suicide, and in a way, the resolution to the third space conflict (between her CCM languages and the external genres) has been one of permanent fixity - she sinks into endless dissonance, as with serialist and post-serialist strands of atonal CCM.</p>
---	---	--

53 **E** *p* Komm, Meer, sal-ze mein-e Lung-en. Komm in mich. *pp*

60 *p* oo Er-löse-se mich ch *pp* ss Er-löse-ö-se mich ch

67 **F** *ppp* half voice, off the breath breathe out, (as if the breath is dissolving)

71 *dissolving vocal tone*

- - - se mich...

<p>E.g. S2 30 (in the first instance)</p>	<p>Juli’s melodic line is built largely from J1 and J3 material, singing quickly with energy (strong dynamics and</p>	<p>JX is the only enunciation not contained within the solo <i>Ariettas</i>, which were otherwise the exclusive focus of this bottom layer analysis. The reason for including JX was to make the mid layer analysis more fluid, since JX recurs frequently. In essence, it is a</p>	<p>In the dialog between Juli and the other characters, as will be shown in the mid layer analysis, Juli serves the musical tradition against which the genres musically contrast and operate in a third space style conflict. Juli,</p>
---	---	---	--

<p>JX</p>	<p>articulation) and aggression (incl. many syllables in a short time). Her instrumental accompaniment is jagged and polytonal, combining E-major and C-minor, then those chords transposed a m2, like in J5 in a guitar line and staggered string chords. This enunciation occurs throughout dialog scenes.</p>	<p>combination of the intervallic language of J1 and J3, with the highly chromatic tonal elements of J5. As such, it is a hybrid enunciation occurring outside her moments of individual reflection (<i>Ariettas</i>) that nevertheless is characteristic of her, since they recur so frequently throughout the work.</p> <p>Above all, they should bring associations of serial and post-serial music, like that of Schönberg's 'free atonality' (i.e. <i>Pierrot Lunaire</i>) or Berg's 12-tone music that rings of tonal harmony. Freely composed post-serial and quasi-serial music that incorporates elements of tonality and Romantic gestures, like that of Rihm, should also be referenced. It is, as such, another enunciation based on CCM and hoping to evoke associations thereof (associations of CCM have been explored above and will be elaborated upon in the analysis of Borgo's character identity).</p>	<p>standing for CCM and late-Romantic traditions, represents the 'native turf' for a CCM opera, which <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i> (the opera, not the fictive destination - that's why it's italicised here and not italicised when I refer to the fictive destination) essentially is. As such, the JX enunciation serves in the third space as an articulation of cultural dominance by Juli and her tradition, a tradition that provides the context for the opera. When she sings aggressively with the JX enunciation, she reasserts CCM as the dominant language and herself as the dominant character, which she definitely is, since the entire scenario and journey is a product of her imagination.</p>
------------------	--	---	---

Tempo 2
 ♩ = 95
mf

7

Ich kom-me ganz gut al - lei - ne zu

mand.

pizz. *f*

arco *mf*

6

f

5.2.1.1. Step 2: Discussion of Juli's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

The Syuzhet of Juli's character identity is built on either dissonant, quasi-serialist intervals or harmonic, quasi-tonal chords. The dissonant intervals are almost consonant, where the m2 difference between consonance and dissonance (M7 instead of octave, TT instead of P5, m2 instead of repeating the same note) makes the largest possible harmonic difference. The harmonic chords are built primarily on the (typically minor) triad. As discussed, these two strands of her personality can represent hermeneutically two strands of the classical tradition - the Romantic (including pre-Romantic) tonal tradition, built on major or minor triads and tension and release from small amounts of dissonance that are resolved throughout a work, and the post-Romantic tradition of atonality or non-tonality, where dissonance becomes the primary musical material and goal of pitch-

based composition. As such, her musical language articulates a culture (the classical tradition) with cultural difference and internal conflict, avoiding stereotype and opening pathways for challenge from external genres along the conflict lines created by the two opposing strands of her internal third space.

The internal musical conflict represents a conflict in her personality, that between peaceful, reflective and almost childishly simple tonal harmonies and dissonant, aggressive, thickly chromatic and quasi-serialist pitch-sets. In the three Ariettas, the textual focus is on her attempts to process internally the trauma she experienced before arriving in the 'Sanitarium' and make sense of her uncertain future. Ultimately, this leads her to suicide, seeing it as the only pathway to control her future and reach peace. In a sense, she gives into the trauma. Musically, the three Ariettas display the contrasting two strands of her musical language - the conflict between simple harmony and total dissonance - and display a process of working through this conflict, leading to the hybridisation of these themes and eventual decision for total dissonance ('giving in to the trauma'). She becomes a sort of eternal avant-gardist who can never be happy with consonance and flourishes only through instability, and finds her future only through total dissonance.

The decision for total dissonance in the final Arietta is preceded in the same song, however, by two moments of transparent tonal harmony, once in A-minor and once in E-minor (closely related keys). This should demonstrate that she has not 'cured' or 'solved' the dissonance inside her, but come to accept it and live with it, or indeed, die with it, where the dissonance 'wins out' as the final enunciation. The moments of transparent harmony that precede it should represent the final outings of the childish and pre-traumatic side of her identity, like a swan-song or final celebration thereof, before they will never be heard again. This is a nihilistic and hopeless way to resolve the tension created by the conflict in her internal mind-space, but cynically realistic. One of the lessons I

received from Bhabha though reading between the lines, is that the naive colonial perspective, as somewhat developed by modern globalist multiculturalism, aimed for a homogenous, conflict-free integration and cohabitation of conflicting cultures - something Bhabha spends his career counteracting. Therefore, I found it in line with the approach to cross-genre composition that I have developed throughout this project, that Juli would not reach a harmonic hybrid of her internal conflicts that 'live happily ever after' but rather shows that *her* conflict cannot be resolved.³¹⁰

Juli is not cross-genre as a character in the sense that she encapsulates a conflict between genres and the classical tradition. Instead, she is cross-genre in the sense that she represents the classical tradition, including the internal conflicts thereof. Were I do present her compositionally with a musical language only representing one strand of the tradition (i.e. only using classical harmonies à la Joseph Haydn or only with extended vocal techniques à la Helmut Lachenmann), she would be a stereotype. Through the artistic research on the cross-genre approach, I came to an understanding of the terms stereotype, cultural difference (as opposed to cultural diversity) and fixity, which helped me understand and enhance the process of encoding an operatic character with a musical tradition.

³¹⁰ At this point, I should note that I cut the original ending Krausser intended for the work, arising from discussions with my supervisor for composition, Prof. Fredrik Schwenk, and the creative team for the work, above all with Paul-Georg Dittrich (director) and Johannes Blum (dramaturg). A brief plot description follows:

The plot focusses on a digitally-themed psychological journey to I.th.Ak.A., as experienced by Juli in the internet. A 'boat trip' in a late scene is supposed to lead to I.th.Ak.A. - which is described as an island - but instead leads only to a sandbank, upon which Juli starts to 'drown'. Here, in the original version as delivered by Krausser, a doctor from the 'madhouse' offers her salvation, should she only cooperate with him. Juli refuses and drowns. The doctor then explains to the audience that the journey was an induced hallucination (a 'trip', in psychedelic terms) to test her amicability for society, which she has just failed, having never cooperated with the any of previous characters, all of which could have helped her. It is this final explanation scene in the cell that we cut - instead ending with her 'drowning' on the 'sandbank' and leaving the precise meaning of this open.

Krausser's original ending had a glimpse of hope that she would one day succeed in his personality test. The doctor is then mastermind of the action. Ending the opera at the previous scene, however, where Juli decides to drown, puts her in control of her destiny (i.e. her own mastermind) and creates a narrative that the journey was always about herself and her own fears, radically changing the piece. Crucially for this thesis and the cross-genre theory: The whole opera becomes a third space inside Juli's head, instead of a third space inside the plan of the doctor. The conflicts in Juli's identity, and the challenges from outside of this through the genres and eternal characters, are all inside the complicated third space of Juli's mind, and not designed by the god-like doctor, whose character has an otherwise shallow presence.

This was achieved through a cyclic process compositional sketches, broad reading on cultural conflicts and mixing and analysis of the compositional experimentation.

5.2.2. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Cyclops

Cyclops has one long passage of dialog and lacks a suitable Arietta or song, in order to assess his personality in isolation. The lack of moment of isolation could suggest that his character identity lacks a distinctive personality, which should produce a hermeneutic association that he lacks the ‘humanity’ or even ‘soul’ of the other characters. Were he to reflect on his motives, feelings, situation or similar, he would achieve an importance like that of a human. In contrast, I wanted his character to come across as a software. This is one reason why I never requested a song for Cyclops, although I did this for almost all other characters (aside from *Computerstimme* and *Der Kunde*)³¹¹. Rather, Cyclops consists of a set of pre-programmed commands and ‘samples’ that are played at the various stages of interaction with Juli, e.g. the ‘welcome’ sample at the beginning. These samples form the closest thing he has to an isolated character identity and will be assessed as enunciations. As the scene progresses and Juli influences Cyclops’ behaviour - by pushing the commands and samples to the limit of their flexibility - the samples begin to distort: this will be shown, however, in the mid-layer analysis.

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis:

³¹¹ Krauser wrote few songs or Ariettas in his first drafts. At my request, he gradually added songs for Juli (a second Arietta), Dark, Kapitän and the Sirens.

<u>Enun- ciatio- n</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>
S2.2. 18-22 Cy1	<p>The accompaniment is limited to piano and E-Drums, the latter of which plays simplistic computer drums. In the first bar of the Cyclops scene, the piano plays a flourishing C-pentatonic arpeggio and the drums cymbal rolls. The next bars contain a pentatonic in the left hand (LH), an utmost simplistic kick-snare pattern in the drums and nervous embellishments in the right hand (RH). The voice sings almost</p>	<p>The musical material and level of complexity representing Cyclops is a polar opposite of Juli. Where Juli built her language on every dissonant interval available and a counter-language of tonal triads, Cyclops builds almost all of his material on P4, with one M2 in this enunciation for variation.</p> <p>There should be a strong contrast in the associations between those of Juli and of Cyclops - this was a primary compositional hermeneutic intention. Where Juli is complicated and full of difficulty and conflict, Cyclops should be simple to the point of being simplistic. The contrast between these two characters should be a trigger for conflict.</p> <p>Cyclops' music is based on Gameboy music of the 1990s, the genre of which is commonly referred to as 'chiptune'. There are no direct quotes or transpositions of materials from this genre, the music drew instead on my</p>	<p>The first enunciation of Cyclops, not insignificant in its length, should indicate a stereotyped identity through its highly reduced simplicity. This high level of simplicity leads to a high level of musical conflict between Cyclops' musical language and the (high level of) complexity of Juli's language. On the back of Juli's Arietta, where she sings with freedom, contrasting language and a range of 'inner conflict', Cyclops is a sort of 'slap in the face' in his simplicity and almost shamelessly stereotypical homogeneity of style, completely without inner conflict.</p> <p>Chiptune as a genre is depicted on one hand through the primacy of the musical materials and on the other hand through the simplistic drum samples. Of course, this is no 'faithful' depiction of</p>

<p>exclusively in P4, with one M2 and simplistic rhythms, totally avoiding melisma through singing one note per syllable. Generally, there is little variation in this enunciation.</p>	<p>significant experience with the genre. Such games generally use very basic musical materials: simple alternating kick and snare patterns, pentatonic scales and highly illustrative and simplistic (<i>plakativ</i>) depictions of the game-narrative. Chiptune music often features simple arpeggios such as the pentatonic arpeggio in the LH of the piano and basic computer drums such as the drum-samples I chose for the E-Drums in the electronics for this scene. These elements provide associations for what I sought for Cyclops: he should be more 1990s MS-Dos than 21st-Century OSX. As such, hermeneutic information as to Cyclops' nature, that of a simple computer program, is encoded in the musical material.</p>	<p>Chiptune - one would have to exclusively use synthesizers and drum machines such as SID and SNES to get the correct 'sound'. That a classical piano is being used instead of a SID is a form of hybridity: the LH of the piano plays the material of a SID-like bassline on an instrument that is the exact opposite. Where SID is boldly primitive and electronics, a classical piano (which would often be an expensive Steinway in most opera houses) is developed from hundreds of years of sophisticated acoustic technology. The bassline articulates both of these approaches at once, resulting in a sound that is neither one nor the other: both primitive and sophisticated. A similar comment can be made about the singer, who has a classical education but the dramatic task of portraying a primitive robot, who would obviously not sing with nuanced vocal colours, as only humans can. The original tenor, Peter Galliard, hybridised these tasks, merging his Bel Canto education with a restricted, satiric</p>
---	--	---

and not 'round' way of singing.

18 **D** ♩ = 80 *f* *mp*

Cy. *f* *mp*
Cy - clops hier. Will-

3. Gtr. *p*

Vln. *p*

Vc. *p*

Pno. *p* *f* *mf*
quasi-cadenza: freely, with extravagance *8va*

Dr. *pp* *mp* *pp* *pp* *mp* *pp* *mf*

20 *mf*

Cy. *mf*
kom - men, Nie - mand. Wo - hin willst du?

Vln. *pp*

Pno. *pp*

Dr. *pp*

<p>S2.2 36 Cy2</p>	<p>On the final, key word of the sentence, there is a long melismatic soloistic cadence, marking out C major with a dominant 7th. There is no accompaniment and the rhythm is free time with the indications 'Recit.' and 'quasi-Cadenza'.</p>	<p>The 'cadenza' should strongly remind of the Bel Canto operatic tradition, referring to works of composers such as Verdi, Puccini and Rossini. This should provide a humorous contrast to the rudimentary chiptune language of the previous enunciation.</p>	<p>The Bel Canto-like cadenza is so narrowly conceived as to be a stereotype. At no point in the (short) cadenza is an innovative or original approach utilised. This stereotyping of Bel Canto should add to the caricature quality of Cyclops: the rudimentary nature of his programming and potential weakness for 'hacking' through Juli's conflict with him in the third space. Juli does not need to process or decode any inner conflicts of Cyclops, he is easy to understand and thereby control.</p>
---	--	--	--

36 *fp* *port.*

Cy. *nie.* *Nie*

E. Gtr.

Vln.

Vc.

Pno.

Dr.

<p>S2.2 42-46 Cy3</p>	<p>A secondary main enunciation to complement Cy1, in the same style and banal C-pentatonic tonality. The strict rhythm of Cy1 is replaced with a practically rhythm-free set of floral instrumental gestures, none of which provide substantial thematic information but are rather decorative in nature.</p>	<p>This enunciation provides another ‘sample’-like theme which is repeated throughout the scene: ‘Ich bin hier, um zu helfen.’ Like Cy1, the enunciation is rudimentary, adding to the impression that Cyclops has a simple nature. The ungrounded, rhythmless accompaniment could remind one of ambient background music for computer software or computer games - this is what I had in mind when composing. An association may be Brian Eno’s <i>Music for Airports</i>. The atmosphere is meant to be one of ‘standing still’, as if the computer has reached a part of its code, where it repeats his one line of text and inconsequential music until the user gives a further command. The slight vocal variations are meant to make it musically more interesting and could represent an algorithm that intends to make him more ‘human’-like, but adds to his inauthenticity and artificiality.</p>	<p>As before, the characterisation of Cyclops focusses on the simplicity of his nature as a computer program, hermeneutically encoding references to video game music and repetitive background ambient music. This enunciation should show variation within his character, without showing true difference or internal conflict - it is a new enunciation articulating the same intentions. This presents him as a true stereotype, sitting clearly outside of CCM in terms of both genre references and musical simplicity.</p>
--	--	--	---

The image shows a musical score for two sections. The first section, labeled 'Cy4', starts at measure 42 and features a vocal line (Cy) with lyrics 'Ich bin hier um zu helfen, ich bin'. The instrumental parts include Electric Guitar (E. Gtr.) with techniques like 'bend trill' and 'hammer-on trill', Violoncello (Vc.), Piano (Pno.), and Drums (Dr.). The second section, labeled 'Juli', starts at measure 45 and features a vocal line (Juli) with lyrics 'Wie wird man dich hier, um zu helfen.' The instrumental parts include Electric Guitar (E. Gtr.), Violin (Vln.), and Violoncello (Vc.). The score includes dynamic markings (p, mf, pp, mp, f, ff), articulation (accents), and performance instructions like 'Tempo 2' and '♩ = 95'.

<p>S2.2 48 Cy4</p>	<p>The piano plays two low semitone clusters in rhythmic unison with a kick and a snare hit. The vocalist sings 'Bitte?' loudly and <i>marcato</i> in the lowest register with a semitone interval.</p>	<p>Cy4 should be a clear form of 'error message'-like sample, as if from a computer software - it refers to the general style of software sounds, rather than quoting a specific error message. The reference to computer software sound design should create a musical pathway to displaying the dramatic material that Juli has given a command that the computer rejects.</p>	<p>As opposed to the previous enunciations, this one shows a 'negative' response to Juli, instead of a 'positive' sort of gesture that offers her a pathway through the surface net or describes his 'positive' function as the 'cyber guide'. Generally, for this enunciation, which sets a simple conflict to music, and others similar to it, Cyclops stays in his 'genre' of computer game</p>
----------------------------	---	--	--

music. This is the most simple form of conflict in the cross-genre third space: each character stays firmly with their side of the conflict zone and does not enter the borderline, where hybridity is inevitable. I assume that most listeners will hear it this way, yet, the melodic interval he sings is a m2 - Juli's interval - which was a compositional intention of mine to suggest a slight hybridity in the conflict. It also suggests the meta-narrative that the whole scenario is in Juli's mind, and that she is every character herself.

Recit.

The musical score is for a recitative section in 3/4 time. It consists of several staves. The vocal line starts with a rest, followed by a measure containing a half note G4 (marked with a fermata) and a quarter note F4. The lyrics "Bit- te?" are written below the notes. The piano accompaniment includes chords in the right hand and single notes in the left hand, with dynamic markings like *f* and *8va*.

<p>S2.2 106-1 07 Cy4'</p>	<p>As a variation on Cy4, the pitch material for the accompaniment, which starts the enunciation with a one bar instrumental gesture, takes the semitone clusters of the Cy4 and instruments them across wide-ranging registers, either as a cluster (piano RH) or as M7 intervals (the rest). A cello glissandi motif adds another layer. The repetitive rhythms are a development of the repetitive two low clusters of Cy4. The vocalist sings 'Warnung' with a M7 instead of a m2 as a development; one can consider the</p>	<p>The 'error message' enunciation has reached a form of maturity in the form of a specific warning. Where the error message was brutishly simple, the warning has a sort of relative sophistication that could indicate an opinion, fear or other humanistic reaction to Juli's desires to contradict Cyclops' guidance. The repetitiveness and simplicity of the dissonance should, however, still be grounded in simple computer software or computer game music.</p>	<p>Through the conflict, Cyclops develops his simplistic enunciation Cy4 into something more closely resembling Juli's CCM language through its relatively creative orchestration and multi-layered themes. The enunciation shows that Cyclops was hiding a higher level of sophistication when he conflicted originally with Juli through Cy4. Cyclops' self-stereotyping was a strategy to present himself as a simplistic opposing genre, where Cy4' shows that his language is capable.</p>
---	--	--	---

	M7 to be the same as m2 where one interval is octavated.		
--	--	--	--

5.2.2.1. Step 2: Discussion of Cyclops’ Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

The Syuzhet for Cyclops is built on a small set of materials which differ slightly in composition but not in aesthetic nature, since they all show a simplified computer-character with simple objectives. The first set of materials is that of Cy1: sets of melodic P4s (prevalent to the extent that they become unnatural, compositionally inelegant or even annoying), a staccato bassline in the piano with straight 8th notes on pentatonic C and a simplistic kick-snare pattern in the computer drums. The second set is a Bel Canto-style tenor ‘quasi-Cadenza’ outlining a C-dominant scale, the chord of which is then played in full in the instruments. The third is an instrumental semitone cluster with a basic, repetitive rhythm that precedes a similarly m2-based tenor line. The fourth is a floral ‘background’, ‘ambient’ or ‘muzak’ texture in C-pentatonic with a mixture of the P4s and quasi-Cadenza style in the tenor.

As discussed, these simplistic materials are based on my impressions of early Gameboy and computer game music, as found in the 1980s and 1990s, before the industry began aiming for the production heights of film, as happened throughout the 21st century. The culture expressed by this genre could be one of the joy of simplicity - early video game music has become a cult genre since it is probably the most basic of any: 8-bit sounds (such as the drum samples used in *I.th.Ak.A.*) are the most simple synthesisers available, melodies are often rudimentary in both the scale (such as the pentatonic, here) and in rhythm (by avoiding syncopation, as here). In addition, the text is often very simple, also as here. Aside from the almost childish joy of early computer game music, the simplicity displays a weakness, in that the lack of inner conflict resulting from the largely stereotypical approach to depicting this style compositionally makes Cyclops a very easy character to understand. As the Sun Tzu axiom goes, 'know your enemy' - between Cyclops and Juli, Juli has here the upper hand through the unbalance of simplicity between Juli's CCM language and Cyclops 'Chiptune'. The hermeneutic information for Cyclops as garnered from Chiptune should be that of primitivity of nature and the general unnaturally of a computer software trying to emulate humanistic behaviour. For listeners that had strong Chiptune associations, additional hermeneutic information of the computer game experience would arise: that of finding one's way toward a goal through a designed set of obstacles, just like Juli does in *I.th.Ak.A.*.

The process of encoding Cyclops with influences from the Chiptune genre (standing for early stage video game music in general) involved a large change of sound from basic synthesiser sounds to those of classically-trained musicians and singers. A larger change of sound can hardly be imagined, since Chiptune or 8-bit synthesisers were made to be as small, simple and cheap as possible, so as to fit in an early Gameboy or SNES-like console - on the other hand, classical instruments and vocalists aim for sophistication at any cost. The drum samples are of a relatively authentic simplicity, nevertheless played through the same high-quality speakers used for the entire

performance. The piano (a Steinway D in the original production) produced a sound far from an 8bit synthesiser, yet the simplicity of the material goes far enough to represent the genre. The vocalist for the original production offered to sing somewhat ‘clenched’ or ‘cramped’ (*verkrampt*), in order to have an element of a robotic sound. Not every singer would offer this, but in this case, he achieved a mixture sound which was still very classical but somewhat straighter and less rounded than a typical Bel Canto. It was a hybrid style of singing - simultaneously articulating the unnatural nature of robotic vocoders and the aesthetic and technique of the Bel Canto tradition. Compositionally, I aimed to create basic materials (etc. the aforementioned C-pentatonic, P4-sets and straight 8th or snare-kick rhythms) with intuitively-led variations of metre (e.g. 3/4 to 3/8 to 4/4) and some flurries in the RH of the piano, which may represent little bits of ‘loose data’ that fly around, but musically keep the pattern fresh. Additionally, the vocal cadenzas and Cyl intervals that are not P4s were intuitive, free moments of transporting the otherwise brutally-straightforward Chiptune genre into a more through-composed opera.

As such, the compositional process of encoding the operatic character of Cyclops with the Chiptune genre revolved around discovering how the simplistic (imagined) source material would sound with classical instruments and a Bel Canto tenor in the context of a CCM opera. The original genre should not be so veiled as to give the listener no chance of association, but must undergo some degree of transformation so as to fit into the context of an opera. Were I to depict Cyclops exclusively depicted through original 8-bit synthesisers and vocoders (vocal synthesisers), it would make a dialog in the third space almost impossible, since Cyclops and Juli would be operating fundamentally different musical worlds. Dialog (or conflict) in the third space arises either through internal difference/conflict or slippages and incomplete or imperfect reproductions of original source material - this is the key idea behind Bhabha’s conception of hybridity and the action of mimicry. As such, Cyclops is not a complete stereotype, since a substantial amount of Chiptune

elements have been transposed to the operatic medium, yet he has significant stereotypical qualities due to the relative lack of inner conflict displayed in his material.

The dramatic plot eventually explains that Juli imagined the characters and the journey, and so it makes sense that Cyclops would be largely within the context of a CCM opera, since this is what Juli represents. Cyclops is, however, the furthest point of simplicity that Juli encounters, or indeed, *imagines*. He offers her an alternative, as do all characters in the opera, by showing her the potential pleasure and joy of simplicity: he gives her clear borders within which she can play a game with limited, simple, easy materials (textually but also musically). He stands for the part of Juli that wants a simple and easy life with the clear and achievable purpose of appreciating the ‘low hanging fruit’ in life. As with all the characters, Juli rejects this potential way of life through rejecting Cyclops and pressing onto I.th.Ak.A..

5.2.3. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Circe

Before Circe sings, a ‘Pop-Up’ interlude is played which provides strong hermeneutic information and extra-musical associations. Directly afterwards, Circe sings an ‘introductory song’ (as Krausser called it in the libretto) which flows similarly seamlessly into the long scene with Juli. The dialog scene has three different languages: that from before Circe knows who Juli is (a woman in need of help, rather than another masculine good-timer from the sanitarium), that from afterwards and that of the ‘customer’ (*Der Kunde*), whom she imitates in an attempt to manipulate Juli. I will choose enunciations from each of these sections in the following character analysis.

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Circe

<u>Enun- ciatio- n</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>
Pop- up/ Interl- ude	Multilayered samples of female soul and R&B singers, with additional samples from ASMR (autonomous sensory meridian response), smooth ‘pad’ synthesizers and additional decorative noises such as chime bells and white noise.	The sultry singing styles of the soul and R&B samples immediately bring associations of sensually-driven popular music, perhaps also of stripping or other forms of sexwork-like dancing and even prostitution. The ASMR sounds refer to a genre of spoken word audio where a speaker records their voice extremely close to the microphone, making mostly sensual sounds and saying calming, reassuring things. It is used for both relaxation and arousal, and mimics the effect of ‘pillow talk’ or intimate talk at an extremely close distance. Together, these elements should provide clear associations to sexual music and the hermeneutic information that Circe is active in the sex industry.	For the first time, a significant amount of original samples from an external genre are presented, instead of a transposition of the genre’s musical materials into the available instrumental and vocal soundworld of a CCM opera. The unorthodox layering of these samples is, however, much closer to how a contemporary composer layers material than how a Soul or R&B producer would layer them. Also, they are combined with additional sounds in an experimental fashion. As such, a clear external force is presented, yet not stereotyped to the extent that a real break with the CCM context is created. The genre elements certainly introduce a new force into the conflict but provide a pathway for dialog with the CCM tradition, rather than being completely incompatible, there. This should create potential for artistic tension in a musical third space.

<p>S3.1 1-8 Cc1</p>	<p>The first four bars form an instrumental introduction with a mostly syncopated piano LH (which nevertheless plays the downbeat) playing D and E-flat, and decorative material above tracing out G-minor with ‘extension notes’ (in Jazz terminology). Bars 5-8 continue this instrumental function and tonality, adding a drum groove vocal melody in the mezzo. All eight bars are in 4/4 and form a pop-song-like enunciation.</p>	<p>After the rhythmless Pop-Up, the first eight bars of Cc1 create a clear rhythmic groove and basic tonality as found in almost the entire amount of pop music and its plethora of subgenres (including Soul and R&B). This change should put the listener clearly in the sphere of pop music, narrowing down on the more sexually-based genres through memory of the Pop-Up, through the text and also the incessantness of the groove. The latter point is something I derived through listening to artists like James Brown, Donna Summers and Ariana Grande, who built their careers based on sexually-promiscuous music.</p> <p>Additionally, the m2 interval of D and E-flat, contextualised by the surrounding G-minor, serves as dominant and flattened sub-mediants - a sort of unresolved energy that may have a sexual feel. In any case, through listening to 50+ songs of pop artists that base their work on sex culture, I found the m2 interval to be ubiquitously embedded in the</p>	<p>In comparison to Juli’s language, which is insecure, bipolar and uneasy, Circe’s first enunciation creates feelings of confidence and security with its driving rhythm and steady harmony. The alternate, conflicting aesthetic can be seen as an alternate way of life - grooves instead of outbursts, enjoying momentary carnal pleasures instead of fighting a long game for ideological purposes.</p> <p>The third space conflict arising through this enunciation and the appearance of Circe is one of conflicting feelings, rather than levels of complexity, as with Cyclops. Where the feelings of Juli’s languages are very sincere and reflective, Circe’s are easy-going and extroverted - this can be understood as a metaphor for contrasting experiences of CCM/classical music and many pop genres.</p> <p>The drum samples are, like with Cyclops, samples that could easily be used in original Soul and R&B music. Its material is also strictly notated, not improvised or looped. The sound of a piano is also not necessarily foreign to the genres, although the usage of the</p>
--	---	---	---

			<p>strings is non-typical. Were strings to be used in the original genres, they would likely sustain long notes or play simple melodic lines, whereas I have used them for more experimental decorative textures. Most importantly, the vocalist sings with an operatic tone, very far from the sultry parlando style of Donna Summers, the horse belting style of James Brown or belting pop diva style of Ariana Grande. As such, the resulting musical material is a hybrid collection, articulating much musical material and some sound qualities of the external genres with primary elements of CCM (string textures) and the classical tradition (vocal style). One further hybridity is the use of the m2, which is both Juli's interval and the key tonal element of the groove.</p>
--	--	--	--

Driving, grooving $\text{♩} = 115$

Electric Guitar

Violin

Violoncello

Piano

Drum Set

5 B

Circe

Weil von der Welt doch je - der

Vln.

Vc.

Pno.

Dr.

Circe

ein - mal ge - hen muss, will er vor - her

E. Gtr.

Vln.

Pno.

Dr.

<p>S3.1 9 Cc2</p>	<p>A 9/8 bar is divided into three even pulses, with a chromatically ascending piano and cello line (harmonised with the violin using the ‘I.th.Ak.A. chord’ of J7) asserting each pulse and the major third three octaves higher in the guitar on the offbeat. The vocalist sings ‘kommen, kommen, kommen’ on the off beats, one syllable per note, with the notes of the violin harmony.</p>	<p>This enunciation contains almost none of the groove of Cc2, apart from perhaps the drum ‘fill’ in the final beat. Compositionally, I intended this enunciation to break the straight 4/4 groove of the previous one, to make it clear that the song does not employ a standard pop song structure. Associations established by Cc1 should therefore be challenged by the presence of Cc2.</p>	<p>Cc2, in challenging the groove element of Cc1, should show a level of internal conflict in Circe that gives the character another level. Compositionally, the 9/8 bar serves to change the pulse and therefore create tension for release when the bar returns to a straight 4/4. In terms of Circe’s cultural identity, however, it serves to push the groove out of normal usage, by breaking it after only one 8-bar phrase. In doing so, the Scene 3.1 moves closer to the border zone between Soul and R&B and CCM through demonstrating metric flexibility and using groove as one element of multiple ones, instead of as an omnipresence.</p>
--	--	--	--

9 *p*

kom-men, kom-men, kom-men,

p

fp *fp* *fmp*

arco

fp *fp* *fmp*

(8)

S3.1
26-27
Cc3

In the first bar, the piano plays a long arpeggio based on an inverted D-minor chord (2nd position) with a tripled flattened sub-mediante. The string instruments perform upward glissandi. This bar climaxes in the next bar on a more chromatically coloured version of D-minor, where the drum beat kicks in, the guitar slides between

Cc3, as with Cc2, also breaks the groove, composed above all in a gestural manner to represent an explosion or sexual climax. The complex textural layering will certainly remind most opera audience members more of CCM music than of the genres in question. Yet the dramatic scenario and text setting may make it clear that it is a gesture representing a sexual climax, at the latest, in bar 39-42 when Cc3 is developed into a similar and somewhat larger gesture to support the text 'gemeinsam explodiert'.

Further to Cc2, Cc3 largely breaks the steady groove in order to create a gesture that serves the dramaturgy and text in a theatric way: e.g. the text suggests sexual climax (or in the case of 39-42, explicitly mentions it) and the music creates a musical gesture that has qualities of explosion and climax. This break with genre conventions reinforces the operatic intent of Circe's character, which ultimately sings to narrate a dramatic plot (through music and scene) rather than purely out of genre-based musical stimulation (which still includes non-musical hermeneutic information, but not in a scenic form), as with Soul and R&B. Breaks such as Cc2 and Cc3 (as well as its

thirds tracing D-minor and B-flat-minor, the piano plays quick arpeggios, the violin performs a trill texture (also in thirds) and the cello a downwards glissando.

development in bars 39-42) show the hybridity of Circe's identity, to the extent that the character primarily orients itself on key operatic conventions, yet enriches this approach musically and hermeneutically through other key elements of external genres.

The musical score is divided into two systems, each with four staves. The first system (bars 39-40) features a piano part with a 'psyche-delay' annotation and a melodic line with triplets and dynamics *mf* and *pp*. The violin part includes a trill texture with a 'gliss' instruction and dynamics *f* and *pp*. The cello part has a downwards glissando with dynamics *ff* and *pp*. The double bass part has a melodic line with dynamics *f* and *pp*. The second system (bars 41-42) continues the piano part with triplets and dynamics *mf* and *pp*. The violin part has a melodic line with dynamics *f* and *pp*. The cello part has a melodic line with dynamics *ff* and *pp*. The double bass part has a melodic line with dynamics *f* and *pp*. The score includes various performance instructions such as 'LH non decresc.', 'Red.', and 'mp'.

<p>S3.1 44-47 Cc4</p>	<p>The groove continues as with Cc1, yet with more harmonic movement in the bass. However, the newest element is a motif in the vocal line built on the octatonic scale and multiple grace-note inflections.</p>	<p>Associations and hermeneutic information regarding the groove remain the same as Cc1. Regarding the vocal line, I intended an exotic flavour, somewhat Carmen-esque or as in Buttons by The Pussycat Dolls (one of the inspirations for this song). This is attempted through the octatonic scale, the m2 and augmented thirds (A3) of which share similarities with many scales of the middle eastern area.</p>	<p>Sexualising the Other, through the employment of the octatonic scale and grace-note inflections common in middle eastern music, is in line with the highly sexually objectified role that she plays, that of a deliberately alluring and certainly dangerous caricature of sexual desire.</p> <p>Bhabha labels the combination of simultaneously stereotyping and lusting after the Other as ‘fetish’, and this is exactly the intention of Circe: she presents ‘offerings’ (<i>Angebote</i> in the libretto) of diverse sorts for sexual pleasure. This brief enunciation of exotic style does exactly this, by presenting a simplified form of exoticism (i.e. without displaying the internal differences of the original ‘exotic’ culture of the Other) for purposes of arousing lust. Moreover, the addition of an ‘Other’ language into the already foreign (i.e. foreign for an opera) language of Soul and R&B should add another level of otherness, foreignness and fetish-like sexuality to the non-classical and non-CCM enrichment of Circe’s ‘introductory song’.</p>
--	--	---	--

<p>3.2 126-1 29 Cc5</p>	<p>The first two bars are centred on A-major with M7 and M2 extensions. The e-drums play a slow and simple triple time swing groove. The violin and e-guitar alternate in small soloistic figures on top of the ensemble texture.</p>	<p>Genre associations for Cc5 should recall a relaxed sort of Soft Jazz rather than a virulently energetic and driving Soul and R&B, as in Cc1-4. My intention was that associations would stay within the pop meta-genre, but switch sub-genres. These four bars present a sort of ballad-like groove which could be used for a down-tempo song. The extension notes should give it a smooth feeling with some tension to the chords. This enunciation should create a second style of sexual pop genre-reference and narrate the change in dramatic mood from a sort of 'show dance' (the introductory song) to that of calm, relaxed and inviting atmosphere conducive to professional conversation about sexual desire.</p>	<p>The character identity for Circe shows another layer with the change of genre elements from those from Soul and R&B to those from Soft Jazz. The hermeneutic, sex-focussed genre associations remain but the character's stylistic breadth expands. This causes Circe to become a stronger character, showing internal difference. Rhythms, chords, chord colourations and sounds are imported from the original genre (the e-guitar, synthesiser sound and e-drums could be used in an original Soft Jazz piece), with cello textures that are more common in CCM and violin lines that would be unorthodox but not especially dissonant in the original style. The third space border zone between external genres and the inside tradition is shown by Circe as a multifaceted one through the variety of styles employed by the enunciations.</p>
-------------------------------------	---	---	--

<p>3.2 163-1 70 Cc6</p>	<p>Circe's vocal line focusses on m2, P4 and TT, rather than the G-minor of Cc1 or octatonic scale of Cc4. The accompaniment is fractured and gestural without any groove or much noticeable harmony.</p>	<p>In stark contrast to the previous enunciations, Cc6 orients itself strongly toward Juli's intervallic material (i.e. J3). Dramatically, this is the point in the text where Circe breaks her role as a sex-merchant and begins to help Juli on a collegial level. As such, associations should switch quickly from those of sexually-oriented pop sub-genres and Soft Jazz ballads to the free post-tonal CCM language Juli uses, as constructed from dissonant intervals and non-rhythmic and non-harmonic accompanying instrumental textures. The hermeneutic information changes from sexual</p>	<p>Where Circe's music in Cc1-5 confronted Juli's language with a contrasting one, Cc6 shows an adoption of key elements of Juli's language. This is an example of mimicry in the third space for the narrative purpose of showing collegiality between the characters. As with mimicry per Bhabha, the mimic contains 'slippages': unlike Juli, Circe sings in a relaxed free time, where Juli is almost always 'constrained' by rhythmic elements in the instruments (even in her first Arietta, which is quite slow, there is a constant rhythm in the 'bell' sounds in the e-drums), the register is tightly contained instead of extreme and the</p>
---	---	--	---

lust and desire to the freedom-seeking ideology of the avant-garde, which, in addition, should highlight a change in dramatic orientation of Circe's character toward Juli: instead of selling sex, she's helping Juli on her self-made mission (as shown by adopting many elements of her language).

accompaniment is purely gestural rather than providing a harmonic bed out of Juli's intervals. These slippages show that the language is not authentically Circe's but rather a mimic of Juli's.

The conflict between Juli and Circe in the third space has now two fundamentally different facets: in the first of which, Circe seeks to offer Juli an alternate path (the 'external' genres) for her journey - sensual momentary pleasure instead of taxing ideological struggle - and in the second, Circe switches sides across the border zone via mimicry to use Juli's CCM language (that of the 'inside') to communicate with her on her own terms. This shows further that Circe is a servant to her customers, bending to their desires.

<p>S3.2 191-2 13 Hybrid</p>	<p>The vocal line continues as per Cc6 with a cello line adopting the groove-bassline from Cc1. The guitar plays intermittent M7 intervals, and around the word ‘Abartiges’, an instrumental fantasy built on m2 intervals in different octaves develops.</p> <p>In the recapitulation of</p>	<p>The purpose of this enunciation is to bring together the two previous categories of languages Circe has used: the genre-infused sexual language and that which mimic’s Juli’s. Therefore, audience members should have associations of both categories, that Circe is both helping Juli and selling sex. This fits in with the dramaturgy of the plot, since Circe is helping Juli by making her a digital sex worker, in order to find a customer that can help her reach the Dark Net.</p> <p>In the recapitulation, the octatonic scale, which contains many m2 intervals, adds potentially associations of Cc4.</p>	<p>The two previous tactics of Circe in the third space are brought together in this enunciation and show Circe as a flexible character with her own multifaceted genre-enriched language (as in Cc1-5), one also capable of mimic (as in Cc6) and also in bringing these two categories together for narrative purposes, as described in the previous column. This last point is something Juli struggles with throughout the opera - aligning the unsettled CCM language (J1) with the childishly romantic classical language (J4). Circe is presented, therefore, as a character not only comfortable and free with her sexuality, but also flexible in using the language of others (i.e. being social or ‘fitting in’),</p>
---	---	--	--

this enunciation,
bars 237-242,
Circe sings on the
octatonic scale.

and even bringing these two things
together. The pervasive concept, that
all characters are projections of
unfulfilled parts of Juli's persona, is
particularly fitting with these aspects
of Circe's social qualities and abilities
in the third space.

The image displays a musical score for a vocal line and instrumental accompaniment, spanning five systems of music. The systems are numbered 191, 196, 201, 206, and 211. The vocal line is written in a single staff, and the instrumental parts include Electric Guitar (E. Gtr.), Violin (Vln.), Violoncello (Vc.), and Piano (Pno.).

System 191: Starts with a double bar line and a first ending bracket labeled 'F1'. The tempo is marked 'Double Tempo' with a metronome marking of 100. The dynamic is *mp*. The lyrics are: 'Wer-de An-bie - ter... Lass dich kau - fen. Und nut - ze - den Käu - fer'. The dynamic changes to *mf* at the end of the system.

System 196: The dynamic is *p*. The lyrics are: 'Wenn du Glück hast, ist es ein Tarn - kapp - en Trä - ger... Such' je - man - den, der'. The dynamic changes to *pp* at the end of the system.

System 201: Starts with a double bar line and a first ending bracket labeled 'G1'. The dynamic is *p*. The lyrics are: 'Ab - art - i - ges be - gehrt...'. The dynamic changes to *pp* at the end of the system.

System 206: The dynamic is *p*. The lyrics are: 'Der will nicht da - bei be - o - bach - tet wer - den. Der bringt dich wo hin, wo es kei - ne Ü - ber...'. The dynamic changes to *f* at the end of the system.

System 211: The dynamic is *f*. The lyrics are: 'wach - ung gibt...'. The system ends with a double bar line.

<p>S3.2 245-2 50 Cc7</p>	<p>A ‘four to the floor’ drum beat (with hat samples evenly on the offbeats) and piano LH from Cc1 (not octavated and in the deepest piano register) form the accompaniment. The vocal line is a simple <i>Sprechstimme</i> line with ‘prank caller’ vocal effects in the low register of the Mezzo, tracing a simple D-minor scale. The piano LH plays the dominant and flattened sub-mediante, as in Cc1. Although Circe sings, she pretends to be a ‘customer’ (<i>Der Kunde</i>).</p>	<p>The drum part is a classic Straight Techno beat, with the piano bassline also fitting into the genre. The tempo 130 solidifies this genre reference and should therefore bring forward associations of drug-infused partying in the underground, since the techno culture emerged intimately within an underground drug culture (including events in unlicensed abandoned buildings), which goes to explain the extreme lack of variation over long periods of time that this genre features. When combined with the ‘prank caller’ vocal effect, which masks the true identity of the voice by re-pitching it two octaves deeper and adding basic distortion, listeners could develop associations of a person, perhaps under the influence, seeking thrills in the (digital) underground, one of which is particularly unusual form of sex.</p>	<p>Although Juli (and perhaps the audience) believes the voice to be that of a customer (<i>Der Kunde</i>), it is in fact another facet of Circe’s character identity. The other primary female character in the story, it is important to note that she is the most sophisticated of all external characters. This can be seen most clearly due to the many different genre elements that she displays - this point is particularly relevant to a cross-genre analysis. That Circe has used elements from Soul and R&B, Soft Jazz, Juli’s CCM language and now Straight Techno encodes her character with a multiplicity of internal difference that makes her flexible moving through the third space in order to reach Juli and help her. No other character is as successful in communicating with Juli - Circe is the only one that can at least somewhat control her behaviour, by convincing her to become an ‘offer’ (<i>Angebot</i>) in Circe’s collection. That the customer is also Circe, as shown in Cc7, demonstrates a further flexibility in communicating and operating with Juli.</p>
--	---	--	---

mf with 'Kunde' Vocal FX

245

Circe

Setzt du dich auf mein Ge- sicht? Pisst du mir ins Maul?

Pno.

Dr.

Elec.

(Prank Caller Vocal-FX on Circe)

5.2.3.1. Step 2: Discussion of Circe' Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

The Syuzhet for Circe contains a wide range of genre references, all focused on different aspects of sex culture. Cc1 and Cc4 are composed using elements of Soul and R&B genres, the latter of which contains elements of exoticism. Cc5 employs a passage of Soft Jazz to communicate the intimate nature of the drama in that moment. Cc6 switches approaches to mimicking Juli's CCM language (i.e. intervallic content of J3) in order to communicate more directly with her. Cc7 uses a Straight Techno beat to refer to thrill seeking in the underground. For many listeners, these genre references will result in the transportation of hermeneutic information regarding Circe's character identity: her sexual promiscuity, intimate seductiveness, flexibility in communication, adventurousness (respectively)³¹².

Since Circe's character identity contrasts with Juli's so strongly, an inherent conflict of styles is created, between Juli's frigidness and social incompetence and Circe's promiscuity and communicative flexibility - or in cross-genre terms, between the inaccessible and difficult CCM language Juli uses and the attractive and easy-going set of genre elements of Circe's musical world.

Juli approaches the conflict the way she does every time, by remaining adamantly with her

³¹² As stated in the introduction, I do not claim general validity of such hermeneutic information according to a scientific method. Rather, I claim this as my personal understanding as the composer and point toward the intention for such information to be used in a cross-genre approach.

language (on her side of the borderzone) and demanding that her objectives be realised without compromise. This is the tenor for the scene, apart from a moment when Juli becomes one of Circe's 'offers' (*Angebot*), and thereby hybridises Circe's language with her own - a moment that will be analysed in the mid layer analysis. Generally, however, Juli remains by her CCM-based enunciations and conflicts directly with Circe, stylistically and dramatically. Circe changes the genre-references in her language throughout the narrative, in order to show different sides of herself, to communicate more directly with Juli and progress her language with the progression of the narrative. Where Juli is typically stubborn, Circe is professional in her catering to her customer, and later, to the person she wishes to help out of ideological reasons. It can be said that the qualities of Circe's character, as shown by the genre references, articulate a part of Juli she never had the chance to, was able to or allowed herself to live out - sexually free, socially able, adventurous and uninhibited. A part of Juli wants to party and experiment with drugs, as shown by Cc7, be sexualised, as shown by Cc1-5 and the Pop-Up, and be able to use the language of others to communicate more directly with them, as in Cc6. The conflict, therefore, is one of Circe presenting an alternative, and using hybrid enunciations (i.e. Cc6) to communicate across third space borderline, where Juli cannot benefit from Circe's 'offerings' of pop genres and more enjoyable way of life. In simple cross-genre terms, Juli cannot shake off the ideology of her CCM and classical language and adopt the enjoyable pop-enriched aesthetic Circe presents. Juli, is simply unable to facilitate this functional dialog, and instead remains adamantly entrenched on her CCM/classical side of the conflict. As will be shown in the high layer analysis, Juli's inability to be flexible in her communication and flexible in her way of life (e.g. by taking on positive elements of the language of the other characters) leads to a tragic narrative archetype.

Compositionally, some of the instrumentation allowed for an easy transportation of genre elements into the operatic ensemble - the electric guitar, e-drums, synthesiser and often the piano are standard

elements of the genres to which Cc1-5 refer. The strings also pose no significant obstacle to the reproduction of the original genres, but are rather decorative. As such, the bulk of genre material in Cc1-5, the drum rhythms and sounds, the synthesiser notes and sounds, some electric-guitar riffs (mostly from enunciations not analysed in this character identity analysis³¹³) and some piano lines would be appropriate in the original genre contexts. The main differences between this sort of material in an original genre context and in *I.th.Ak.A.* is that the material is notated and reproduced by classically-trained musicians, instead of improvised or semi-improvised by session musicians in a recording or stage situation. The differences here are obvious, in terms of feel and the details of the notes themselves. Perhaps the largest difference is that of the vocalist, who sings in a classically-trained style instead of any one of a range of pop styles. This results in a necessarily hybrid style, nevertheless essentially routed in the operatic context, as seen by the score, performance context, and chosen performing musicians, all of which are operatic rather than pop-based: it articulates many materials from the original genres (rhythms, riff-like patterns, 4/4 structures etc.) whilst articulating the performance idiosyncrasies of the classical/CCM tradition.

5.2.4. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Dark

The music for Dark contains three Recitativo passages, two with Juli and one with Juli and Borgo, and one aria. In order to analyse his character identity, I will analyse a sufficient amount of enunciations in order to establish the core of musical and hermeneutic material that constitutes his character and the cross-genre narrative conflict in the third space.

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Dark

³¹³ As stated in the introduction, I did not analyse every enunciation for any given character, but rather chose a sufficient amount in order to provide a complete picture of each character in isolation. A comprehensive analysis of every enunciation would lie beyond the scope of this already large chapter.

<u>Enun- ciatio n</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>
S4.2 64-68 D1	<p>Bars 64-66 contain a repetitive piano line of two half-note chords (in the 4/4 bars), which are actually four polytonal chords spaced far apart in the first accent and closely in the second. The two chords per accent are minor chords spaced a TT apart. The e-drums play strong accents on the downbeat of the first bar with tam-tam, crotales and timpani sounds. The cello drones octave Cs, with microtonal glissandi on the higher of the two. The violin and guitar play decorative notes and textures that colour the harmony with chromatic tones. For the remaining bars, Dark sings ‘chant-style, like a Monk’ in the lowest register of his voice.</p>	<p>The materials for D1 have a steadiness, repetitiveness and modernity of harmony and texture. His vocal line is a modern version of Gregorian chant, free and mostly flat in its line, yet not bound to a tight system as Gregorian chant usually is. These two aspects are a result of my inspiration from the music of Carl Orff, who likewise created a sort of German minimalism in the repetitiveness of his patterns, and developed a quasi-Gregorian, monk-like way of setting text in his Greek dramas such as <i>Antigone</i>. Although very few if any listeners could make the direct connection to Carl Orff from hearing the music for the first time, I believe that the repetitiveness of the accompaniment and flat-lined, free-time style of singing may be reminiscent of chant. For me, chant singing brings associations of timelessness,</p>	<p>The references to chant-style singing (be it Gregorian chant, as inspired Carl Orff, or otherwise) is hybridised with significant aspects of CCM, in the dissonant, textural and harmonically free material in the strings and e-guitar, and the modernity of the soundworld, including e-drums and e-guitar. As such, Dark has a strong identity in reference to chant, nevertheless free of stereotype in the internal difference displayed by the elements of CCM. The contradictions of an ancient music style (Gregorian chant) and contemporary elements (instrumentation, e-drum samples, extended technique textures, polytonality) make Dark a mysterious and intriguing character that cannot be understood easily through stereotype.</p>

peacefulness, a celestial higher power and solemnity or at least sincerity. These associations would fit well with my conception of the character identity for Dark, and were my compositional intentions.

Dark is, therefore, a sort of monk or even demi-God of the Dark Net, singing in a style somewhere between sacred chant and CCM. He is calm, powerful (as shown by the loud, deep and full e-drum sounds of timpani, tam-tams and crotales) and solemn, as chant usually is.

L Slow, mysteriously
♩ = 55
f distortion

64 E. Gtr. *mf* *p*
Vln. *f* *pp* *s.p.m.* *s.t.m.* *s.p.m.* *s.t.m.*
Vc. *f* *p*
Pno. *f* *p*
Dr. 7 x) 7 x) 7 x)

67 **Recit. (chant-style, like a Monk)**
mp
Dark Man macht a - ber auch auf sich auf-merk-sam, jung - e Frau.
E. Gtr. any dissonant harmonic trill
Vc.
Pno.
Elec. FX: Dark Vox (always on: therefore not too obvious)
extremely deep, physical, subwoofer FX,
real-time with the voice (not delay-based)

<p>S4.2 71-74 D2</p>	<p>The e-guitar and violin continue the decorative role from D1, colouring the harmony with freely-composed chromatic tones. The piano plays a two bar figure first in C, over which the Bass sings a melody oscillating between C-minor and C-major, and the two repeat the material a minor third lower. The rhythm has a steady quarter note pulse in the piano, with flowing 8th and triplet durations in the Bass.</p>	<p>In contrast to D1, D2 has a steady rhythm and clear harmony of C and then A (major and minor) - this creates more of a song-like feel than D1, which was more atmospheric and free in its aesthetic. Concrete associations may not arise from this sections, rather, the timelessness of D1 may be challenged by the more rhythmic and perhaps therefore profane pulsating quarter notes of the piano. As will be shown in following enunciations, D2 will develop into the ‘song’ for the character identity of Dark.</p>	<p>D2 enriches the language for Dark through a rhythmic and mono-tonal harmonic approach that stands in contrast to D1. The richness of difference within his language leads to an important ambivalence, where Dark could develop in a variety of directions - either to a more freely atmospheric language (as will be seen in D**) or a more rhythmic form of expression (as will be seen in D3). For a mysterious figure, which Dark strives to be - representing the Dark Net as he does - ambivalence is a commodity that shrouds an easy understanding of his identity.</p>
---	---	---	--

71 **N** ♩ = 45

Dark
wel - ches von zau - ber - haft - em Ge -

E. Gtr.
mp

Vln.
mf

Pno.
ricc.

Dr.

73

Dark
sang gleich-sam mag isch an - ge - zo

E. Gtr.
p

Vln.
pp

Vc.
pp

Pno.
pp

no distortion: psychedelic FX

<p>S4.2 103-1 08 D1'</p>	<p>The e-drums play the loud samples from D1, the piano plays a rhythmic pattern in (slow) 16th notes outlining an incomplete polytonal mode built on fragments of F#-minor and D-minor. The vocal line sings highly syncopated in an unclear harmony that features two M7 intervals.</p>	<p>The e-drum samples and polytonal modal fragments in the piano, as well as the textural decoration in the cello, should continue some of the mysteriously style built in D1-2, taking it even further into an even more indefinite aesthetic. The vocal line is the opposite of the previous enunciations - angular instead of flat, and unclear in its harmony. Indeed, it seems closest to Juli's intervallic language, if anything. The main associations here should be those of uncertainty of style - Dark's language should show here its ability to free itself of concrete associations.</p>	<p>As with the progression from D1 to D2, this enunciation increases the mystery and uncertainty surrounding Dark's identity. As an actor in the conflict, Dark's main operating function is that of obscuring and seeking anonymity. He will later, in a text passage, praise the 'darkness' (<i>Finsternis</i>) as a form camouflage, like a 'warm blanket'. As Bhabha has noted, an effective cultural camouflage - where one does not want to be easily stereotyped or categorised, culturally - is that of a 'mottled background' (Bhabha 1996: 85). The hybridity of expression in this enunciation is certainly a case of mottled identity, leading to camouflage as a technique of conflict in the cross-genre third space: with this and other enunciations like it, one cannot easily identify Dark's genre-references nor links to tradition.</p>
--	---	---	--

With flow
103 **S** ♩ = 50

Dark: Ich weiß viel - es, da ich in

Vc.: consonant harmonic trills (multiple, different, less dissonant than before)

Pno.: legato

Dr.: 3

107

Dark: viel - en Ka - nä - len un - ter - wegs bin.

Vc.: col legno battuto ricc. mp

Pno.: 3, 2, 3

<p>S4.3 127-1 29 D3</p>	<p>The piano plays a steady bassline in the lowest register, in straight 8th notes with one triplet on the final backbeat, turning what would otherwise be a 4/4 pattern into 7/8. The e-drums play samples of military drums on principal beats, and the e-guitar (with distortion) and cello F and G-flat power chords in syncopation. The</p>	<p>D3 develops the rhythmic approach from D2 into a strong, driving pattern supported by the instrumental apparatus, above all, by the piano and drums. In combination with the power chords, the music forms a Heavy Metal-inspired song that should bring forward associations of brute strength, aggression and physical masculinity. Throughout Dark's solo song, of which D3 is the first enunciation, he sings of</p>	<p>D3 displays some strong elements of Heavy Metal music - the power chords, a driving riff-like bassline and militaristic drum samples - that are nevertheless all significantly altered from the original context: the power are highly syncopated, the drum samples play on the principle beats but not in a clear groove, and the piano bassline contains a triplet where a usual Heavy Metal bassline would have three 8th notes, making the bar 7/8 instead of the typical 4/4. These alterations make the original genre</p>
---	--	---	---

<p>vocalist first outlines a B-minor arpeggio with flattened sub-mediante, then a stepwise melody.</p>	<p>being a warrior. This dramatic information is therefore coupled with the hermeneutic information of Heavy Metal music to reinforce the strength he claims to be capable of. What's more, Heavy Metal is the principle genre of music that US soldiers listen to before and during combat (Ricks 2010).</p> <p>On the base of the previous enunciations, the background to Dark's character identity has been one of mysticism and camouflage. D3 and the song, however, narrow down on a the concrete hermeneutic information of Heavy Metal music. As such, we learn through the musical associations, that the true core of Dark is one seeking power, aggression and consequential confrontations - the chant-like music that creates mystery and celestial qualities is purely a guise for a physical, humanistic warrior.</p>	<p>less stereotypical and articulate rhythmic conventions of CCM (high syncopation, non-quadratic bar lengths).</p> <p>Dark's identity as a warrior, as shown by the text and enhanced through the genre elements from Heavy Metal and their hermeneutic associations with war, aggression and power, presents Juli with an opportunity to take on these warrior-like qualities, by taking on elements of this language. Juli expresses aggression in her dialog and her musical language (i.e. J5), and Dark offers her a musical language enriched by elements of external genres that takes her aggression into a mature language of real combat.</p>
--	---	--

127 *f* (2,2,3)

Dark *f* 3 3 3 3

Für ein-en Krie - ger ist die Fin - ster - nis; ein Par - a - dies:

E. Gtr. *distorted* *f* *wild*

Vc. (arco) *whip!* *pp* *ff* *f* *pp* *f* *p*

Pno. *mf* *8^{va}*

Dr. *f*

<p>S4.3 142 D4</p>	<p>The e-drums play the samples and pattern from D1 whilst the ensemble in unison plays three notes of an octatonic scale, with the guitar playing a fourth, and the violin and e-guitar start a soloistic fantasia-like line on the scale, although the violin is much more present. Every instrument plays forte.</p>	<p>After the long passage built on D3, D4 recapitulates the ‘mysterious’ e-drum sounds of D3 and features a tutti fragment of an octatonic scale, a scale with oriental associations (as in Cc5) and an obscure harmonic orientation. My intention, regarding the fragment but also the soloistic fantasia in the violin and e-guitar, was that this enunciation would evoke associations with middle eastern music, be it Turkish, Arabic or Persian, since many scales from this region share similarities with the octatonic scale.</p>	<p>In terms of Dark’s warrior identity, I sought with D4 to add a reference to modern warriors from the opposite side of Heavy Metal (which represents the US forces), by including a middle-eastern scale often used in <i>Nasheeds</i> - jihadi war songs. This will be developed and become significantly clearer in D4’, which play samples that concretely reference jihad. As such, the warrior identity of Dark should be encoded with internal difference and internal cultural conflict, so as to avoid stereotype and create a richer character. Even if this association does not occur for many listeners, the</p>
----------------------------	---	--	--

breaking with the steady rhythms and patterns of D3 create a sort of ‘smoke and mirrors’ moment, where Dark briefly masks his warrior self.

S4.3
159-1
62
D4'

In the electronics, samples of large cats, horses, swords, knives, burning and an Islamic song (originally sampled from a call to prayer, although this cannot be clearly heard in the chosen excerpt) are played with electronic

The electronic samples reference sounds used in ISIS propoganda videos - large cat growls are used in the ISIS *Nasheed* (Islamic war song), as well as sounds of horses, which refer to Mohammeds time in exile in the desert, and swords, which have obvious connotations of fighting. The

As with D4, D4' develops the alternative reference to modern war and warrior culture, the primary reference being to US troops (through elements of Heavy Metal music) and the alternative reference to *Nasheeds* and other jihadist war songs. Rather than referring to a melodic scale, which may be too obscure to many listeners, the

effects that slightly obscure them, but not significantly. The electric guitar strums chords based freely on Juli's intervals and the I.th.Ak.A. leitmotif, and the violin plays fantasia melodies approximately on the octatonic scale, with free embellishments and deviations.

addition of burning sounds and the fragment from a call to prayer were my own, that do not feature in the ISIS *Nasheed*. These samples should evoke clear associations of the war in the middle east, even for listeners not aware of how ISIS embellishes their *Nasheed*.

samples should make the associations clear. The aesthetic of this enunciation - in free time, with electronic (4CH with speakers distributed in the room) and acoustic sound sources, and an unclear harmony (based on both Juli's intervals and references to middle-eastern scales) - should provide a bridge from the self-confident Heavy Metal to the mysterious, smoke-and-mirrors aesthetic of D1, to which the enunciation leads. As such, this enunciation portrays both the internal conflict of Dark's warrior identity and the ease with which he can 'mottle' his style away from concrete references to war cultures back to an undefined genre identity in the third space.

Sensa misura, extremely freely and strangely

159 **A1** pluck with thumb, use lowest strings possible

p liberale: sul pont./sul tasto

Tam-tam *p*

Sample: Large Cat(s) *mp* Sample: Horses, Swords, Knives

161

mf Sample: Explosions, Burning *mp* Sample: Call to Prayer *p*

Dru Sam

<p>S4.3 185-1 86 D5</p>	<p>The strings make 'seagull' harmonic sounds freely and softly. The piano scrapes the lowest string with a guitar pick and the electronics fades in the Night Forest sound effects. The Bass sings an angular set of pitches that are selected from the octatonic scale to set the text 'what do you believe in?' [Woran glaubst du?].</p>	<p>In D5, the freely textural and aleatoric instrumental music - devoid of harmony or pitch - delves deeply into the world of CCM, which is not combatted by the octatonic-based and still quite obscure vocal line. The audience should be reminded of the qualities of CCM - a tradition of music which is experimental with sound-design and tests of the limits of the term 'music' as opposed to 'noise' - leading to associations of difficulty of comprehension, mysteriousness and curiosity.</p>	<p>The mysterious and indiscernible elements of Dark's character identity are taken to their extreme with this completely aleatoric enunciation, fitting with the existential question he poses in the lyrics. As such, with this enunciation, he extends his flexible character into the CCM tradition that Juli's language represents, in order to gather information about her deepest thoughts and feelings (indeed, the response he gets, that Juli believes in freedom, is the main concept that drives her). It is a form of mimicry, just as Circe does with Cc6. However, it does not use Juli's intervals (J1 etc.) as with Cc6, but rather the free string textures of J2 and J8. It shows, nevertheless, the power of Dark's mysterious character in its ability to change cross-genre function for narrative purposes (from hermeneutic genre references on one side of the conflict to concurrence with tradition on the other side).</p>
---	---	---	---

E1 (sensa misura) (Recit.)
5s *mp*

Wo-ranglaubst du?

'seagulls': slowly, atmospheric,
in the high register of the G-string

pp

'seagulls': slowly, atmospheric,
in the high register of the A-string

pp

scrape string once,
slowly, with a guitar pick

SD: Night Forest (Fade in) (until B152)

5.2.4.1. Step 2: Discussion of Dark's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

Dark's character identity displays a variety of material, from rhythmic and forceful elements from Heavy Metal to free textural music, fragments of octatonic and middle-eastern scales in either thematic or fantasia forms, to a mixture of polytonality, extended technique and chant-based vocal delivery that is deliberately hard to identify. The character Dark, as with all other characters, is constructed on a bed of associations, even if the point of some parts of his identity is to mask associations. These conflicting, contradicting associations, from sacred chant to profane Heavy Metal, free his character of stereotype through the conflicts they produce within the character identity (i.e. 'inner conflict'). In the dramatic narrative, Dark is a demigod-like presence that uses the anonymity of the Dark Net as a camouflage for his true intentions, those of waging war,

although the type is not specified. These narrative elements are recounted in the music through: a mystic style referring to chant (Gregorian or otherwise) and the sacred-minimalism of Carl Orff yet shrouded in CCM textures and poly-/quadro-tonality (D1); rhythmic and melodic enunciations that have a profane quality in their straightness (D2), eventually developing into a brutally-strong Heavy Metal-inspired warrior aesthetic (D3); fragments of octatonic and middle eastern scales (D4) that develop into concrete samples of jihadi propaganda songs (D4'), adding a conflict within the warrior aesthetic; and aleatoric textures that straddle the more extreme side of CCM (D5). Together, these enunciations articulate a complex and obscure culture of anonymity and war in the Dark Net, for which Dark is the spiritual leader and battle commander.

In regards to the narrative cross-genre conflict in the third space, Dark and the various styles and genre-references of his language present Juli's consistent and conspicuous CCM/classical language with a broad range of elements and general flexibility that could help her achieve her goals of freedom (through anonymity) and resistance (through combat). In comparison to Juli's language, Dark's can be more brutal (as with D3), more clearly defined (as with D4'), more ambiguous (D1) and more experimental (D5). Through Juli's constant rejection of Dark's language, by refusing to take on any elements thereof, one learns that Juli is too stubborn to accept that other characters may have a more advantageous approach to achieving her goals than that which she developed - she refuses to learn from or adapt elements from the other characters. This could be down to her stubbornness, learning disabilities or a narcissistic personality disorder. In any case, the conflict here is one where Dark offers Juli useful methodologies and techniques for achieving her stated goals, and she rejects the help. At the end of the scene, Juli's language does not articulate any of the elements of Dark's language, and we see, therefore, that no hybridity has taken place. The passage, therefore, foreshadows the tragic helplessness of Juli's character identity. This was depicted musically through the cross-genre references in Dark's identity, which could have been

advantageous to Juli, and the complete rejection of hybridity on Juli's part. On another note, all the enunciations, although some contain clear elements of genres, articulate simultaneously significant elements of CCM - as with Circe and Cyclops before him, this expresses the narrative situation that the characters are projections of Juli's persona, Juli representing CCM as she does. It shows in a cross-genre way that the common thread running through all characters is that they ultimately belong Juli's psyche (and its representation through CCM), even if they attempt to offer Juli another way of behaving, living and dealing with her narrative struggle.

Associations of mysticism and spirituality are created in D1 primarily through the chant-like style of singing: majority stepwise movement with long passages on a single pitch, together with free-time rhythm, create a flat melodic line typical of chanting. Noteworthy differences to original (Gregorian) chant include: employment of the octatonic scale or a freely-composed mode instead of the church modes; the variation of the melodic line, which sometimes extends to arpeggios and broken chords for dramatic effect; the presence of a modern arsenal of acoustic and electronic instruments, that play a complex, multi-layered textural and polyphonic music. The genre elements from Heavy Metal in D3 are in their nature relatively close to the original but in their deployment much more in line with CCM. For example, the power-chords of the e-guitar are identical to those from the genre, power-chords in the cello in their simple 5ths are a mere instrumentation of the musical material of the original, where the sound of the cello in the lowest register is noticeably different but not too far from that of a distorted e-guitar. Even the oscillation between F and G-flat power-chords could easily form a riff in Heavy Metal. The essential difference here is the highly-syncopated rhythm, which is fragmentary and through-composed rather than repetitive - this feature avoids the solidity of a steady riff that would be necessary for the original genre and articulates instead the high level of compositional freedom and complex (unpredictable) rhythmic conventions of much CCM. Additionally, where a Heavy Metal track would feature a drum pattern based on

Rock, Blues or Thrashing rhythms, the drum pattern for D3 is composed based on military drum patterns (here, not a specific pattern, but rather a newly-composed one). This has the benefit of enhancing militaristic associations and moves the enunciation further into a hybridised form. The bassline in the piano could well be a functional e-bass line in a Heavy Metal track, were it a 4/4 bar where the final triplet would extend to three 8th notes. The 7/8 time signature, although a seemingly small detail, make the line unlikely to be functional in the aesthetic of most Heavy Metal bands. As with the cello, the instrumentation leads the bassline to sound similar but different - an e-bass has less high frequencies than the low register of a grand piano and a more powerful resonance due to its electronic nature. D4 employs original samples and is therefore a reliable reproduction of the soundworld, although the samples are manipulated with electronic effects in a way that would be too obscure for ISIS propaganda videos but valuable for electro-acoustic CCM contexts. What's more, the guitar chords are based on Juli's CCM language and the fragments of middle-eastern scales in the violin fantasias are too freely composed to be in the league of an authentic reproduction of middle eastern instrumental music - instead, they articulate the CCM context of the opera.

5.2.5. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Borgo

The music and drama for Borgo begins with a substantial a cappella solo passage that displays his identity clearly. Following from this, there is a dialog passage with Dark and Juli that continues the language whilst adding instrumental music and some electronics. The scenes with Borgo end with a duet with Juli that introduces a contrary side to his character. Regarding bar numbers in the solo passage, the bar numbering in the score can be confusing - to this end, I will refer to sections in their relation to rehearsal figures (rehearsal letters).

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Borgo

<u>Enunciation</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>
<p>5.1</p> <p>Until</p> <p>Fig. A</p> <p>B1</p>	<p>The Tenor does not sing specific pitches, but freely in a range of low, middle and high. The word ‘Dark’ is set through a loud breath, vocalisation on the ‘Da’ vowel with vibrato and an accent on the ‘K’ consonant, which is held for effect. This is repeated, with the held consonant developed into different sounds and eventually whistling. In the next line, these consonants become a passage of choking sounds. It ends with a ‘hyperventilating’</p>	<p>Borgo’s mode of delivery is highly obscure, in that he does not sing any pitches in a typically musical relation, but rather makes the consonants and secondary sounds (<i>Nebengeräusche</i>) the primary focus for structured development. Such a backwards way of approaching operatic singing may bring forward associations of comedy routines, as some comics speak and/or sing in absurd ways for comic effect, where they exaggerate the elements of singing that make a performance characteristic, such as when doing an impression. In the performance of the opera <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i>, this section was always received as comedic.</p> <p>The intended associations were those of the most extreme CCM opera works that obscure text delivery so highly through stuttering, fragmentation or focus on secondary elements (extended vocal technique) so as to be almost completely unrecognisable as opera in any</p>	<p>Borgo’s language, as effectively represented by B1, has the third space meaning of showing what Juli could become if she lets her CCM side completely inherit her identity, unchecked and untempered. Juli displays an internal conflict of two sides of CCM/classical tradition - a contemporary quasi-serialist CCM side and a Romantic, quasi-tonal side - which results in the mutual control of each side. Borgo, however, articulates a language that operates on the extreme of the CCM tradition. As such, his role in the third space of the opera can be seen as one tempting Juli to surrender her identity to the most extreme elements of one side (CCM) of her character identity.</p> <p>In this enunciation, Borgo gives the first impression of his character, where he takes a large</p>

passage on the breath sound, which began the enunciation.

traditional sense. Such composers include Helmut Lachenmann and Beat Furrer. Hermeneutic information associated with this sort of music include: elitism to the point of almost complete inaccessibility for almost every potential audience member, extremism in an ideology against concepts of traditional opera, and extreme self-interest, since highly inaccessible music must have its base in self-interest rather than communication or an existing market.

amount of time to set one word: 'Dark'. This elongated approach shows his fondness in himself and his own language - two qualities Juli could use to enrich her language, should she be open to his influence. Of course, as with all characters (as stated previously), Borgo is a projection of a part of Juli's identity that she is unable to or does not let herself live out.

High Energy
loud breath no pitch, only through teeth the air of the consonant **c. 10-15s**

Borgo high middle low
f *sim.* *whistling*
 Dar(k)! K Dar(k)! K - R - sh ss - hh - üü

c. 10-15s

Bg. *3* *(loud breath on 'oo')* tongue roll lip roll back glottal roll frontal glottal roll (back gl. roll) improvise with glottal rolls and noises, almost like choking and snoring - wild and perverse etc. *on 'oo'*

D - R - B - L - K - B - R - L - K - L - K - L

c. 6-8s **c. 4**

Bg. *accel.* *f* *mf* like blowing out a candle crazily breathing as if hyperventilating, ad lib. *f* *oo'*

OO oo

<p>S5.1</p> <p>Line 1</p> <p>of Fig</p> <p>A</p> <p>B2</p>	<p>Compared to B1, this enunciation has a relatively dense amount of text, and can be considered a quasi-Recitativo style, where B1 is more Arioso. The indication ‘Sprechgesang’ is given, as are the heights of approximate pitches in the melodic curve. Nevertheless, consonants ‘rrr’, ‘b’ and ‘n’, as well as the syllable ‘fall’ are exaggerated for effect.</p>	<p>As with B1, associations should go in directions of absurd (perhaps comedic) voice-acting and the extreme end of CCM. What’s more, the indication ‘Sprechstimme’ is given - a direct reference to Schoenberg and his avant-garde vocal delivery, which was an innovation part of a body of work that was deliberately elitist (as demonstrated by his famous Society for Private Performances). The speaking quality of this enunciation should push it further away from traditional opera and music-theatre, traditions that create their identity through opposition to speaking. B2, on the contrary, moves toward straight theatre (<i>Sprechtheater</i>) with an absurdist approach to text delivery, which still keeps it in the musical realm. The move towards undersandbiilty of text delivery moves it also slightly away from extreme extended vocal techniques of CCM (e.g. as championed by Lachenmann), which usually deconstructs the necessity of understandability in favour of elevating secondary sounds to the primary function.</p>	<p>Although the focus of B2 shifts from the practise in B1 of treating consonants and secondary sounds (i.e. the breath) as primary musical material to one on text and the delivery thereof, no substantial internal difference is shown through B2. Borgo is then a stereotype of extreme CCM extended vocal technique, which is what I intended as a composer: he is to represent a mockery of composers that work with the extremity of inaccessibility in their music. This is supported by text occurring later in the solo passage, where Borgo talks of creating ‘art and massacre’ which is more grandiose than the art of Magritte. Musically (through references to extreme CCM) and dramatically (through the text), Borgo represents a perverted and self-satisfied artist, elements of Juli’s unrealised personality.</p>
---	---	--	---

A c. 10s

sprechgesang

Wir-rrr wer-den ein-en Tour-ist-en clu(b) B ü-ber fal-al-al-al-en-n

<p>S5.2 37-40 B3</p>	<p>In a steady 4/8, the Tenor communicates a passage of dialog in a <i>Sprechstimme</i> style with approximate pitches, exact rhythms and given dynamics. The instrumental ensemble accentuates the rests in the vocal line.</p>	<p>Associations of experimental CCM are reinforced through the instrumental accompaniment, which is based on extended performance techniques and noise-like textures that arise from them. Where B2 may have related to absurdist and/or comedic vocal delivery in straight theatre for some listeners, B3 is clearly in the style of experimental CCM for anybody aware of the category due to the instrumental writing based primarily on extended technique.</p>	<p>The addition of the instrumental ensemble to Borgo's language reinforces the stereotype of his character, since it merely continues the extended-technique-based CCM language of his vocal enunciations (above all, of B1).</p>
------------------------------	--	---	--

Freely, gesturally, with movement

37 **G** c. $\text{♩} = 60$
mp

Bg. *mp* Wel-ches Frä-u-lein? Ach! Du bist nicht all-ein-e, ach- so!

E. Gtr. *f* *ricochet col legno* *mp* *palm mute*

Vln. *f* *ricochet col legno* *pp* *whip*

Vc. *f* *pp* *f*

Pno. *f* *(m)p* *f*

<p>S5.2 111-11 4 B4</p>	<p>An improvisatory ‘cadenza’ from the Tenor is followed by an instrumental passage including a large range of extended techniques in a free form, with rippled piano chords in a progression strongly outlining G major. The electronics play ‘childish sounds’ including toy pianos and baby laughter.</p>	<p>The usual connotations of extended-technique-based CCM produce particularly perverse associations in this context due to the improvisatory Tenor line (where he mimics ‘enjoying something very much’), the ‘childish sounds’ of the sampler, which make Borgo seem childish himself and perhaps hint at him ‘enjoying himself’ in the context of children or being stimulated sexually and/or violently by children (since we know him to be a violent character), and the simple tonal chords in the piano, which reinforce the childish elements and show a simplicity that makes him less human and less intricate.</p>	<p>The instrumental language of B4 relates most closely to that of J8, which represented the trauma that Juli experienced immediately before being committed or forced into the sanitarium. Developing the concept that Borgo is a projection of Juli, one can learn from this instrumental passage that Borgo’s perverse character identity is the potential result of Juli not combating her trauma and letting it inherit her identity: if she would give in to her trauma, she could become a perverted, sadistic and dangerous person like Borgo is. As such, B4 contains elements of mimicry of the J8 enunciation, with the intention to tempt Juli into Borgo’s hedonistic and uncontrolled way of life.</p>
---	--	--	--

Short Cadenza, 5-10s

111

improvisation, very perverse, as if about to enjoy something very much.

Bg.



E. Gtr.



(w. sponge) improvise, incl. with:
bending, diff. FX, dynamics etc.
Use the lower strings.

p Lyrical

O ♩ = 50

112

cont.

Bg.



E. Gtr.



Vln.



Vc.



Pno.



Dr.



Sampler



Childish sounds: toy pianos, baby laughter etc: very perverse, including with FX (pitch shifting etc.)

114

E. Gtr.



Vln.



Vc.



Pno.



Dr.



rice: (col legno batt.)

<p>S5.3 129-131 B5</p>	<p>The Tenor sings in a lyric style with the vocal indication of ‘very lyrically’, firstly on an octatonic scale and then on an unclear mode. The guitar accompanies with I.th.Ak.A. chords (J7) and A3 intervals. The rhythm is steady.</p>	<p>B5 has a strong melodic character, due to the steady rhythm in the e-guitar, vocal indication and steady up-and-down melodic curve that lends itself to easy singing. It should give connotations of Romantic operatic singing, and due to the ambiguous harmonies, of late-Romantic and early 20th century styles, such as those by Wagner, Strauss, Bartok and Janacek. Opera of this sort has a high conception of art as a transcendental force, and these are the associations I intended with this reference in B5.</p>	<p>B5 is the first musical and cross-genre element to add internal conflict to Borgo’s otherwise stereotyped character identity. It comes at the end of the scenes with him, as he realises he cannot tempt her into his perversity and gives her a warning about a future stage of her journey. This demonstrates another side of his character and shows that the stereotyping of the previous enunciations was a tactic, one which he can change, as he does in B5. Yet the references to high opera are also part of Juli’s character identity, and therefore another example of mimicry. Borgo is, therefore, a character that communicates to Juli from within extreme versions of her own language, rather than enriching it with an external genre, as with the others.</p>
---	--	--	---

Lyricaly

129 **R** = 45
mp very lyrically

Borgo

Be - geg-nest du Ge-schöpf - en son- der - bar -er Art T

♫ 'hawaiian sounds'

E. Gtr.

<p>B5.3 159-16 7 B6</p>	<p>The Tenor and Soprano sing a tonal sequence in duet in B-flat major setting the word 'Adieu'. They are accompanied by the e-guitar, playing a simple accompanying gesture, also in B-flat major.</p>	<p>B6 is composed as a pastiche inspired from the 'Addio' sequence in Rigoletto and will trigger associations to Romantic opera, especially Italianate opera such as those of Verdi.</p>	<p>B6 displays a reference different to the previous enunciations. In terms of Borgo's character identity, this is a confusing occurrence which undermines the previous language, even though it can be seen as related to B5. It is a simple reference with little to no hybridisation away from the original style, only in the instrumentation (e-guitar) and one unusual cadence, the E-major chord in bar 165. It shows internal difference in his cultural identity but one that is largely stereotyped, as shown by the lack of hybridisation. As such, the enunciation has a highly inauthentic quality and serves a purely comic purpose in the cross-genre conflict.</p>
---	---	--	--

159 **X** **Flowing** (♩ = 90)

Juli
T.
E. Gtr.

163

Juli
T.
E. Gtr.

5.2.5.1. Step 2: Discussion of Borgo's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

Borgo's Syuzhet is built on two stretches of material, both of which have two internal sections. The first stretch (Scene 5.1) contains enunciations which contain extended-vocal-technique CCM language that construes the more musical moments and an absurd sprechstimme vocal delivery bordering on straight theatre for the more text-focussed enunciations. It is notated in semi-graphic notation without exact rhythms or pitches, albeit based on a skeletal traditional clef, resembling a percussion clef more than a vocal one. In the second part of this stretch of material (Scene 5.2) the instrumental ensemble joins in with extended-instrumental-technique CCM language that reinforce the references to extreme CCM and, towards the end, electronics that play 'childish sounds' along with simple tonal chords in the piano that both portray his character as perversely childish and hint at a broader depth of stylistic possibility. This is then realised in the second stretch of material (Scene 5.3), containing a change of vocal tone in the Tenor to a lyrical modus with specific pitches

and rhythms in traditional notation - the melodic line is based on the octatonic scale and the accompaniment on sequential I.th.Ak.A. chords (J7). At the end of this stretch, the tonality shifts to an almost pure B-flat major, with the exception of one substitution of the dominant chord for the tritone chord (E-major), as a weird and skewed cadence before the final tonal chord, to portray Borgo's perverse nature, even when he attempts 'normality' (of musical and social behaviour, since this is the moment he bids Juli farewell, albeit saying the linguistically skewed 'Adieu' instead of a German phrase).

The perverted fixation on extreme extended-technique language of B1-B3 represent the first impressions and majority of material for the Borgo character, representing the musical culture of extreme CCM which is, as a culture (in my experience), self-interested (incestuous), extreme in its ideology, almost completely unrelatable, even to many elite listeners, and produced by practitioners (composers) not held to account by any force other than the own self-righteousness of their ideological convictions. Borgo's character is therefore encoded with this hermeneutic information by way of association in some listeners, or at the very least, according to my intention as the composer. One could read the aforementioned 'extreme CCM' attributes from Borgo's character identity purely from reading the text. As such, the cross-genre encoding in B1-B3 is one of enhancing the attributes of the text (through hermeneutic information from associations) rather than multi-layering or contradicting them. The Borgo character is, up to this point, a perverse stereotype of the extremities of CCM language. In the following enunciations, B4 and B5, he shows a sharply contrasting side of his characterL musically, that of an increasingly traditional operatic Tenor and dramatically, he becomes helpful and even polite. This shows a depth to his character that places the stereotype of the previous enunciations under question - if Borgo is capable of more than the language in B1-B3, it begs the question: what more is he hiding? The clash between extended-technique CCM and the Italianate B5, which borders on Operetta, is ideologically opposite - in fact,

many of the musical innovations of the most avant-garde CCM music (especially in the context of CCM opera) was made in a deliberate attempt to deconstruct the Italianate opera tradition. Borgo's character identity is, therefore, one of extremes - of extreme styles, extreme pastiches and, most important to the cross-genre approach, extreme opposites.

Borgo's explicit mission in textual terms is to collect Juli's toes, in case she dies. In subtextual terms, it is to be appreciated as a perverse genius artist. His musical mission, as given by the cross-genre coding of his character, is to tempt Juli to develop her languages to the extreme of the CCM language that represents her trauma (J8). When this is unsuccessful, he changes tack and decides to help her, as Circe did before him, employing then a language an ideological opposite of extreme CCM - Italianate early-Romantic opera. When Circe helped Juli by adopting her language, it showed compassion, understanding and empathy. When Borgo ceases attempting to tempt Juli, he introduces a new style, demonstrating a detachment and distance from Juli, one where he mocks early-Romantic opera through a stereotyped mimicry or pastiche thereof. This sort of conflict, one of detachment, shows the cold and brutal Dark Net context that Borgo operates in, and the extreme point at which Juli has reached in her inner journey. The extreme shifts of style also show the extremity of Juli's hallucinations at point, which nears the end.

The enunciations B1-B3 do not need any hybridity, since they are built from elements from CCM and are presented in a CCM context - a contemporary opera. They also need, therefore, no comment regarding how the cross-genre approach worked regarding compositional technique. B4 articulates elements of late-Romantic and early-20th Century opera in the smooth curvature of the melody (a calling card of Romantic opera), indication for 'very lyrical' singing and quasi-tonal harmony that stretches any sense of a tonic (as with some moments of Strauss, and the work of Bartok and Janacek). The freely quasi-tonal nature of the enunciation, which is based melodically on the

octatonic scale and harmonically on a sequence of I.th.Ak.A. chords (J7) but varied freely, articulates strong elements of freely/intuitively conceived harmony in CCM. B5 is harmonically and melodically almost a complete pastiche of Italianate Romantic opera with the exception of: a harmony, an E-major chord instead of the dominant, which would be F, therefore a so-called ‘tritone substitution’ (as it’s known in Jazz theory), and an instrumentation, that of an e-guitar, which has a soundworld completely foreign to the original. These two ‘slippages’ in the pastiche show an hybridity which indicated to Borgo’s weird, unhealthy and obscure (*schräg*) character identity, seen here most clearly, because he attempts to create a stereotyped element for the aforementioned purpose of distant mocking of Juli.

5.2.6. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Der Kapitän

Der Kapitän has two stretches of material, a dialog-based scenic passage that contains some enunciations that can be considered as displaying his character in isolation (such as D1, which occurs in the scene before Juli articulates) and a soloistic aria-like passage, where he reflects on his situation and experience. Enunciations from both stretches will be analysed to establish Der Kapitän’s character identity.

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Der Kapitän			
<u>Enunc</u>	<u>Autonomous musical</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts</u>
<u>iation</u>	<u>elements / Syuzhet</u>		<u>conflict in the third space</u>

<p>S6.2</p> <p>65-72</p> <p>K1</p>	<p>The e-drums play a steady and very simple rock rhythm with accentuated snares on the 3rd beat - it is otherwise only kick drums, accentuated on the first and third beat. The samples are of the Grunge rock genre and have a large delays: the snare delay is huge. For harmony, the e-guitar plays a drone low E and the descending semitones G-F#, F, then E, D#, C and B in a melodic fragment. It therefore traces out a very chromatic E-minor. For a textural layer, the strings play close double-stop chromatic clusters with exaggerated vibrato and glissandi between double stops. The Bass groans and moans below his deepest traditional singing register (i.e. sub-tones)</p>	<p>The combination of e-drums and e-guitar should remind listeners of Grunge Rock, for those familiar with it I was inspired by Nine Inch Nails, Nirvana and Joy Division, although the music for Der Kapitän takes the depressive, dirty, broken and sick music of these bands further with the experimental vocal effects, high chromaticism and experimental string textures. Aside from the aforementioned qualities ('dirty' etc.), Grunge Rock as a genre in the scene-based stage of its trajectory (Lena/Petersen 2008) deals with themes such as self harm (especially Nine Inch Nails, i.e. 'Hurt' and 'Into the Void') and the sentimentalising of death and dying - these are two key associations for Der Kapitän, who I conceived of as a sort of Charon with I.th.Ak.A. on the 'death' side of the river styx.</p> <p>As such, listeners could have bleak associations of nihilism, anguish and social alienation due to the genre elements. This is exacerbated by the additional elements - the vocal effects, which make his voice sound monstrous, inhuman and</p>	<p>K1 presents Der Kapitän as a character with an identity linked to danger and issues with mental health. Considering Juli's background with trauma and her situation in a sanatorium, contact with Der Kapitän threatens to trigger Juli's insecurities, and this is exactly his role in the conflict. Der Kapitän's cross-genre character identity is one of brokenness, sickness and closeness to death (physical or sentimental) - these are qualities within Juli that he attempts to trigger.</p> <p>The elements of Grunge Rock are the dominant force in K1, since the polyphonic musical force of the e-drums and e-guitar is acoustically more powerful than the homophonic string texture (which articulates CCM and is an element of hybridity) or the simple chords in the piano. The vocal effect could be related to either Grunge Rock or experimental electronic CCM music. As</p>
---	---	---	--

with vocal effects that amplify and pitch-shift (down) the voice, creating a monstrous sound.

even satanic (which is occasionally a feature of extreme Grunge music that borders on Thrash Metal, such as Meshuggah), and the effect-driven CCM string writing, inspired by *Anahit* by Giacinto Scelsi, which give the harmony a 'sick' feeling through the constant glissandi and large vibrato.

such, Der Kapitän's cross-genre identity is hybridised between Grunge Rock and CCM, and one could say that his language tempts Juli toward the Grunge Rock elements and sinister consequences of that path.

groan (gradual vowel change)

65 *p* *mf* *p* *p* *f*

Kap. oh ah ii

E. Gtr. *mp*

Vln.

Vc.

Dr. *f p f p f p f p f p f p f p*

groan (gradual vowel change)

69 *p* *f* *mp*

Kap. oh ah eh

E. Gtr. *3*

Vln.

Vc.

Pno. *p* *6* *p*

Dr. *f p f p f p f p f p f p f p*

<p>S6.2 73 K2</p>	<p>Only the vocal line is the focus of the analysis of this enunciation: a descending chord built on Juli's intervals (P4, TT) which is almost an I.th.Ak.A. chord (J7) apart from the B (instead of C) pitch in the middle. In fact, in bar 99, the C is chosen, and there are multiple instances where variations on K2 do trace out an I.th.Ak.A. chord.</p>	<p>In K1, Der Kapitän groaned and moaned. In K2, Der Kapitän sings, albeit, still with vocal effects. The act of singing makes the character somewhat more relatable in the operatic context, where singing is the normal mode of delivery. Associations of CCM opera should be strengthened by K2.</p>	<p>Der Kapitän's first textual vocal enunciation traces what almost is an I.th.Ak.A. chord. For some listeners, this may result in Der Kapitän's association with I.th.Ak.A.. Der Kapitän represents the inner core of Juli's sinister desires.</p> <p>Although not significantly large in its hermeneutic, associative or cross-genre material, K2 is compositionally very important and constitutes a large part of Der Kapitän's sung vocal material.</p>
--	---	---	--

2 73 **J**

J.

Kap. *f* *p* *f* *p*

Wer ist da?

E. Gtr.

Vln.

Vc.

Pno.

Dr.

<p>S6.2 142-14 5 K3</p>	<p>The cello, synthesizer and e-guitar play homophonic embellished tonal chords in C-sharp minor. The vocal line provides further elaborations of the harmony but does not contradict it so strongly as to undermine it. Textually, Der Kapitän declares to be the captain of the ship Esperanza.</p>	<p>K3 is a stark change of aesthetic and hermeneutic information in comparison to K1: Der Kapitän sings a lyrical melody without vocal effects in a pianissimo dynamic. The intervallic content is different to K2, focussed on smooth, stepwise motion of seconds and third, as opposed to the J3-based intervals of K2. The most important intended associations of this aesthetic are those that are opposite to the Grunge Rock of K1 - I didn't have a concrete genre in mind, instead, a contrast to a concrete genre. The humble, mysterious and understated mode of delivery of K3 should create a bipolar or split character identity for KD and therefore be unnerving.</p>	<p>In this enunciation, there is no reason to believe that Der Kapitän is trying to lure Juli into behaving in a certain way, or that he wants anything from here - this is in contrast to the role of conflict that the previous characters have played at almost all moments. Instead, Der Kapitän wishes to present his identity (captain of the ship, and, later in the solo stretch, the experience of riding in his ship), in a reflective, introverted way - all other characters were markedly extrovert.</p> <p>In terms of cross-genre conflict in the third space, K3 has no obvious function, other than contrasting K1 and therefore deflecting stereotype through inner cultural difference. It does not refer to a genre, but is free composed in contrast to the Grunge Rock of K1.</p>
---	---	---	---

<p>S6.3 164, 178-17 9 K4</p>	<p>K4 as an enunciation has two sections of contrasting autonomous material, which both represent the narrative function of dissolving Der Kapitän's character identity. It can be called a 'concept-enunciation'. The first quotes D4 in the e-guitar, violin (both play the octatonic fragment from D4) and synth (the piano bass from D3) and the second introduces a whole-tone scale into the vocal line.</p>	<p>The quotation fragment of D4 in bar 164 should provide uncertainty for listeners that have Dark's identity still in mind, as if Der Kapitän's character identity becomes confused with that of Dark. The whole tone scale unstabilises the melodic and harmonic material of the enunciations which came before. As such, K4 is an enunciation (split over two separated parts) that is about unstabilised the hermeneutic identity (through quoting the foreign associations of D4) and harmonic material of Der Kapitän.</p>	<p>Destabilisation of Der Kapitän's character identity in K4 represents a destabilisation of Juli's mental ability to conceive the fantastical journey with consistency. That Der Kapitän's identity fractures harmonically and 'mixes' with Dark's is a result of Juli's inability to maintain his material and hermeneutic information. The cross-genre conflict cannot be maintained, since Juli cannot faithfully reproduce the genres, as encoded into the characters, that conflict with Juli's tradition-based language.</p>
---	--	--	---

K4 (part 1)

Musical score for K4 (part 1) in 4/4 time. The score consists of six staves. The first staff is the vocal line with lyrics: "- in. Die Fahrt wird". It features a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The second staff is a piano accompaniment with a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The third staff is another piano accompaniment with a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The fourth staff is a piano accompaniment with a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The fifth staff is a piano accompaniment with a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The sixth staff is a piano accompaniment with a piano (*p*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes.

K4 (part 2)

Musical score for K4 (part 2) in 4/4 time. The score consists of six staves. The first staff is the vocal line with lyrics: "Es gibt kein-en Raum nur Rich-tung-en.". It features a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The second staff is a piano accompaniment with a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The third staff is a piano accompaniment with a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The fourth staff is a piano accompaniment with a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The fifth staff is a piano accompaniment with a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes. The sixth staff is a piano accompaniment with a mezzo-forte (*mf*) dynamic and a triplet of eighth notes.

5.2.6.1. Step 2: Discussion of Der Kapitän's Character Identity, as arising from the analysis

Of the four enunciations that comprise Der Kapitän's character identity, the first three constitute his character in isolation the fourth represents the decomposition of this identity as a parallel to the decomposition of Juli's mental fitness. The Grunge Rock elements of K1, an enunciation which form the majority of the scene, are anchored in the e-guitar and drums - the E-guitar plays a simple

chromatic lick based on a minor chord, loosely inspired by *Come As You Are* by Nirvana, although K1 is made darker through the extended chromaticism of the guitar lick and the hallowing e-drums, with a snare drum (on the 3rd beat, as with slow Grunge Rock) that has a 15-second reverb (like a large gothic cathedral), reminiscent of Joy Division (i.e. *She's Lost Control*), and a heart-beat-like kick drum, similarly with unusually long reverb. The CCM elements that enhance this enunciation, dissonant double-stop strings that glissandi in short distances, as if sea-sick or groaning from pain, and dissonant sostenuto piano chords, push the Grunge Rock elements into an expressionistic aesthetic. The vocal line of K1, groaning with c. 50/50 double-octave pitch shifting and 4CH amplification, adds a monstrous element that was inspired by extreme vocal effects in early Heavy Metal bands (i.e. *Paranoid* [Album] by Black Sabbath) or Nine Inch Nails (*Broken*), yet they would be closer to monster sound design in the Horror film genre. As such, the syuzhet of Der Kapitän's character identity is enriched by substantial elements from Grunge Rock, that are driven to extremes and combined with CCM elements to create a hybrid expression that should trigger associations of inhumanity, depression, sickness, self-harm and alienation, as in the original genre and as representing Juli's penultimate character projection.

Der Kapitän represents the sickness and depression inside Juli, hinting at her death wish - the hermeneutic information of Grunge Rock is perfectly suited to these themes, as is the dark, hallowing aesthetic. In K1-K3, the role Der Kapitän plays in the conflict is that which the characters before her had played: tempting her to live out a side of her that they represents. In Der Kapitän's case, this is the mentally unfit, depressed and sick side of her. In his fully-fledged sickness and depression, he attempts to trigger hers. In cross-genre terms, his language shows how CCM can be hybridised with Grunge Rock, and therefore offers Juli a pathway for enriching her language with these Grunge Rock elements. Hermeneutically, however, she would then be importing further elements of depression, sickness etc., which could tip the balance of her psyche toward self-harm or

mental degradation. This is exactly what happens, as hinted at in the first instance by K4, which shows a ‘confusion’ in Juli’s imagining of Der Kapitän’s character identity, since Dark’s D4 enunciation is featured, and the harmonic language is dissolved through a whole-tone scale that dovetails into the next scene without circling back to K1-K3 with any sort of resolution.

The elements of Grunge Rock could be faithfully transported into the instrumentation, since e-guitar and e-drums are instruments fitting to the original genre conventions. In K1, the element of reverb was taken to a further extreme than the Grunge Rock repertoire I know, and in my mind, this extended to CCM territory. Rhythmically, the guitar lick fit broadly into the original genre, is, however, rhythmically not consistent (as for example, the aforementioned *Come As You Are*), which destabilises the element as a true reproduction of genre conventions. Harmonically, the high level of chromaticism adds to the instability. As such, even without the clear CCM elements in the strings and piano, K1 articulates both elements of the original genre and their hybridised application in the context of a CCM opera. K2 is a vocal line based on J7 and K3 is a concept-enunciation, both of which do not need any cross-genre transposition.

5.2.7. Step 1: Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: Die Sirenen

Cross-Genre Character Identity Analysis: The Sirens			
<u>Enunciation</u>	<u>Autonomous musical elements / Syuzhet</u>	<u>Hermeneutic information / Fabula</u>	<u>Articulates and/or boosts conflict in the third space</u>

<p>S7 1-24 S1</p>	<p>The Mezzo hums a two-bar phrase (tempo 1/8th note = 90), in even 8th notes, which is then looped. This occurs 3 times and builds a freely-modal B-minor harmony with a flattened 5th and sharpened 7th. Over this texture, and staying mostly in the mode, the Soprano and then the Mezzo sing dialog phrases.</p>	<p>Looping is a popular modern electronic technique functioning with a concept that is immediately and easily understood - something is recorded, then played back verbatim ad infinitum. Such techniques are the basis of much Electronic (House, Techno) music, and essential to early Rap and Hiphop, which is based on looping samples from Vinyl records. Although, in those genres, the material is pre-recorded, where Live-Looping as a genre records material in the moment. The genre is still in the avant-garde stage of its trajectory, and as such, does not have significant concrete hermeneutic information (which is constituted in the scene-based stage) with which the cross-genre approach can be faithfully executed.</p> <p>Nevertheless, looping as a technique is so fundamental to much commercial production, that a general sense of a technical approach from the Pop industry can be assumed as an association: repeating the same material verbatim is simply very foreign to the ideals of 20th and 21st century CCM in the German-speaking</p>	<p>Juli's language is constantly changing in detail - no two phrases are the same. This depicts her nervous, restless and aggressive character identity and is the trigger for the journey, where she always wants to move on, forwards, toward I.th.Ak.A., a goal she cannot properly describe when asked. The Live-Looping of Die Sirenen is the exact opposite - the mechanical exact repetitions of the inputted loops give a timeless, immortal, inhuman and otherworldly quality and, importantly, a predictability and security to the listener, qualities that are very much lacking in Juli's constant nervous variations.</p> <p>As such, Die Sirenen present Juli with a musical pathway that is beyond those of her human struggles - they suggest that she could enter their world of loops (i.e. perhaps by becoming one of their loops). As with many previous characters, it is a conflict tactic of enticement - Die Sirenen give Juli an alternative pathway forward than her stubborn</p>
---------------------------	---	--	--

world, which has had no prominent minimalist or post-minimalist composers. Regarding minimalism, the 'loops' are executed by an instrumentalist, with natural slight variations, rather than a machine. As such, Live-Looping should be considered separate to minimalism. Instead, the Live-Looping of S1 should trigger general associations of commercial genre music production, without any concrete scene-based hermeneutic information - that is a special quality of Live-Looping that I sought with Die Sirenen.

The image shows a musical score for a piece titled 'Juli'. It consists of two staves. The top staff is for the voice, labeled 'Juli', and the bottom staff is for the piano, labeled 'Spur 4'. The tempo is marked as ♩ = 90. The piano part features a steady, rhythmic accompaniment with a dynamic marking of *p* (piano). The vocal line starts with a rest, then enters with the lyrics 'Das, Das ist nicht I-tha- ka.' The melody includes triplets and a dynamic marking of *p*. The piano accompaniment consists of a series of eighth notes in a simple, repetitive pattern.

S7
33-36
S2

The piano plays three tonal chords softly and with regular rhythm in chorale-like spacing: C-major, A-minor and E-minor, all within C-ionian/A-aeolian. These repeat throughout the enunciation.

The simplicity of the chords, rhythms and modal melody is, from the standpoint of musical material, reminiscent of the most simple Pop, Pop-Rock and Musical genres, especially in the form of a Ballad. The instrumentation of a piano and voice should suggest artists like Elton John, Billy Joel and Nick Cave, who wrote many simple ballads and sang at the piano, without additional accompaniment.

S2 gets to the core of the cross-genre conflict between Juli's highly complex tradition-based language and the alternative path that Die Sirenen offer. Where in S1, through the mechanism of looping, Die Sirenen tempted Juli with a sense of eternity, S2 presents the most simple music I could conceive of as a composer as a relief from the complex musical cross-genre journey that

The Mezzo sings, in her lowest register, a stepwise melody in the same mode. The text offers Juli a pathway to death.

Associations with Pop-Rock Ballads should include the potential beauty of simplicity (i.e. a philosophy of appreciating simplicity and the beauty of simple things). The main hermeneutic information that I wished to encode into Die Sirenen through the elements of Pop-Rock Ballads this enunciation was that effectivity of art and artistic beauty can be achieved through highly simple means, and don't always need to involve compositional virtuosity.

occurred up to this point. The temptation for Juli should be clear: a pathway to clarity, simplicity, beauty - it should be an easy choice. A Pop-Rock Ballad was the appropriate genre for representing this simplicity and ease of communicating artistic beauty, as compared with the CCM tradition, that for many decades has stood in complete opposition to the simplicity of three-chord tonal Ballads. The basic simple beauty of the genre elements should call severely into question Juli's ideological fight for freedom, and the ideologically complex music of the avant-garde CCM tradition that her language is based on.

Lento
 33 ♩ = 65

The musical score is for a section of 'Die Sirenen'. It features a vocal line for the mezzo-soprano (Sir.) and accompaniment for violin (Vln.), viola (Vc.), piano (Pno.), and timpani (T.-t.). The tempo is marked 'Lento' with a metronome marking of 65. The key signature has one flat (B-flat) and the time signature is 4/4. The vocal line begins at measure 33 and includes the lyrics: 'Wir schau-feln dir ein sanf-tes Grab in den Well - en... Wir'. The piano accompaniment consists of a simple harmonic progression in the left hand, with a dynamic marking of *mp*. The timpani part has a dynamic marking of *p con pedale*.

5.2.7.1. Step 2: Discussion of The Sirens' Character Identity, as Arising from the Analysis

The syuzhet for Die Sirenen is built in two halves: the stretch of Live-Looping of S1, a bridge stretch, and the Ballad of S2. The Live-Looping is based on a mode that alters B-minor - the loops from Die Sirenen stay completely in this mode, and the dialog material (i.e. quasi dramatic Recitativo) ventures slightly from the mode but orients itself overwhelmingly to it. A steady 8th rhythm in the first two loops pervades the enunciation and gives it a steady feeling. As such, it is steady in both harmony and rhythm, with free alterations of the harmony and rhythm through the alterations to the mode and the dialog passages that occur on top of the loops. S2 takes the 'steadiness' to an extreme, where it displays an extremely high level of simplicity: the harmony is built on three simple chords that fit into a C-ianian/A-aeolian, the rhythm of the chords outlines a clear 4/4 bar and the vocal melody, stepwise and within the mode, is based on 8th notes that support the underlying rhythm with some slight natural variations. The bridge stretch is freely composed using the principles of repetitive patterns from S1 and the approach using simple tonal chords and melodies from S2. These enunciations together point toward aspects of Pop music culture that aim for simplicity of expression and ease of understandability: the mechanism of Live-Looping defines predictability and security of the listening experience, and the three-chord Pop-Rock Ballad of S2 is perhaps the most essential and familiar form of Pop music available, similarly predictable and extremely familiar.

The cross-genre conflict between Die Sirenen and Juli is the same as many characters, in that Die Sirenen try to tempt Juli into converting to their way of life and their way of music. Where Juli's music is highly complex and inaccessible in its CCM form, the music of Die Sirenen is extremely simple. Die Sirenen coming where they do in the work - in the penultimate scene - their simplicity is meant to offer a relief or even 'cure' for Juli's constant restlessness and unsettled nature. Just as Die Sirenen offer Juli this highly reduced, simple and steady musical language (as it is encoded

with elements of Pop-Rock Ballads and Live-Looping), they offer her in the scene death and suicide as the solution to her problems. As such, the simplicity of the genre is meant to represent the simplicity of believing that suicide is an answer to life's greatest problems.

Both the Live-Looping and Pop-Rock Ballad genre elements could be faithfully reproduced in the score, since a Live-Looping device was implemented (S1), and the instrumentation of piano and vocalist was on hand (S2). The main difference is the vocalist - not a Pop-Rock singer but an opera singer. S2 articulates the materialistic and instrumentalistic elements from Pop-Rock Ballads quite faithfully with the voice of opera, and is a hybrid enunciation accordingly. Regarding the Live-Looping of S1, there is no standard practice regarding the type of voice, although Jazz singers have been the most enthusiastic avant-garde proponents in the early stages of the genre. Nevertheless, the flexibility with the dialog-based material is something characteristic to CCM that would be highly uncommon in the Live-Looping performances and recordings I have experienced thus far. The altered mode is common in CCM, occurs in Jazz and is irregular in Pop. These are elements of hybridity.

5.3. Mid Layer Analysis

The purpose of the mid layer analysis is to establish sequential teleology on the basis of the enunciations (including their variations, as appropriate) analysed in the bottom layer analysis. As such, the symbol of the bottom layer progresses to a syntax in the mid layer, and on the top layer, the focus will be on paradigm³¹⁴. In other words, the individual enunciations of the bottom layer form a sequential teleology in the mid layer, where they demonstrate mutual influence, and, over

³¹⁴ Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia: 6.

the course of the entire operatic experience, eventually converge in a cumulative, global effect, to communicate a super-textual meaning³¹⁵.

Analysing the sequential teleology between the characters, as demonstrated by the enunciations, involves examining how they ‘mutually influence musical behaviour’ - how the enunciations mutually influence the teleology of association-driven conflict - and how they function together to create a ‘system ... of musical actions’³¹⁶. Concretely, this involves identifying the character roles, as given by the libretto and any elements of the cross-genre approach and the dynamic development of the character roles in the first step. The second step then involves considering plot functions of the characters as they relate to one another, through identifying and analysing functions that ‘motivate the actions’ of the characters to create the aforementioned ‘system [of] musical [cross-genre] actions’³¹⁷.

5.3.1. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Libretto

(C.I.# stands for ‘Character Identity Number’ and R.T.A. for ‘Role Type and Attributes’)

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
Juli	Antiheroine	Antiheroine: - Juli elicits our sympathies as the character who: - is on stage for the entire production; - has (by far) the strongest teleological drive,	Juli does not undergo much of a fundamental development until the very end of the narrative, when she dies and ends the narrative. From the first scene

³¹⁵ See Fig. 1 in the previous chapter on narrative semiology.

³¹⁶ Karl, G. (1997). *Structuralism and musical plot*. Music Theory Spectrum, 19, 1, 13-34.

³¹⁷ Ibid.

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
		<p>who wants to reach an ideological goal, unto which the narrative is docked;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - reflects the most intensively and for the longest amount of time about her human desires, ambitions, problems, thoughts and feelings (in the three solo arias, above all) - antiheroic quality 1: since Juli devises the journey in her mind, her ultimate failure must be considered her ‘fault’; - antiheroic quality 2: Juli is incapable of adopting qualities from the other characters which may help her be more social and reach a greater understanding of what I.th.Ak.A. is (what sort of place, what it represents, how an alternative could be constructed or found), instead of stubbornly rejecting each character. 	<p>until the last, she presents the two antiheroic qualities listed in the previous column: Juli is just as socially inflexible in Scene 1 as she is with Die Sirenen, and ultimately fails at her chosen teleological task of finding I.th.Ak.A., a failure exacerbated by the understanding that she created the journey herself in her mind. She is, therefore, a Major-Flat character.</p>

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
Cyclops	Villain	<p>Villain:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cyclops attempts to block her freedom of passage by not leaving at Juli's request and not granting her direct passageway to the Dark Net. Ultimately, he allows Juli passage to the 'grey area' with a warning, which she ignores. From this area, Juli can reach the Dark Net, and as such, Cyclops is a failed villain. 	<p>Cyclops is essentially a flat character, one who attempts to be helpful to Juli, but ends up attempting to block her most important goals. This is true at the outset and at the end. The only developmental process is that where Cyclops becomes more differentiated in his task of simultaneously helping Juli and blocking her passage to the Dark net through allowing her access to the 'grey area' (differentiated between black and white). Nevertheless, the essential actions of cyclops remain consistent: helping Juli only when it fits his pre-programming, which is ultimately against Juli's interests.</p>
Circe	Tempter, Skeptic, Mentor	<p>Tempter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Circe is primarily concerned with boasting to Juli about her catalog of pornography and digital sex products. Towards the end of her aria, she turns to Juli and asks her directly, what sort of product or service she's looking for. This presents the first instance of tempting, where Juli would entertain herself in Circe's domain instead of pursuing her goals of getting to <u>I.th.Ak.A.</u> - After discovering that Juli is a woman, Circe 	<p>Circe develops significantly as a character throughout her stretch. At the beginning, she is a somewhat stereotyped character (who still exhibits hybridity and internal conflict, see 2.3.1. and 2.3.2.) firmly in the Tempter role. The addition of the Skeptic role humanises the character through demonstrating independent thought (from that of the</p>

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
		<p>tempts Juli into working for her and becoming ‘rich’. Similarly, this would result in a disruption of Juli’s protagonistic (antiheroine) goals.</p> <p>Skeptic:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Subtextually, Circe is a skeptic of Juli’s ambition to reach I.th.Ak.A.: when Juli attempts to describe to Circe the nature of <u>I.th.Ak.A.</u>, Circe replies simply with ‘what do you want, little girl? Sex, drugs, cheese cake?’. Ignoring the personal, introspective moment of Juli confiding in Circe with a cynical and somewhat mocking rhetorical question is a skeptical subtext regarding the benefits of Juli’s stated mission. <p>Mentor:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In the final phase of the dialog between Juli and Circe, Circe becomes a Mentor to Juli, helping her become a ‘product’ (<i>Angebot</i>), and telling her how to gain access to a camouflaged area and customers with an ‘invisibility cloak’. This is directly helpful to Juli's ambitions to reach the Dark Net. - Later, she gives Juli advice and a warning about what lies ahead (‘anders als hier, in dieser gemütlichen Schwärze, erwartet dich dort eine andere Schwärze, kalt und gefährlich.’). 	<p>customer) and personal opinion.</p> <p>Introducing the substantial Mentor role shows a sentimental side, further humanising her and providing a dynamic impact on the development of the story regarding the antiheroine. The large stretch of material (c. 30 minutes) is the second biggest behind Juli, nevertheless, I would consider her a minor character in relation to the c. 95 minutes that Juli spends on stage. As such, Circe is a Minor-Dynamic character.</p>

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
Dark	Tempter, Sidekick	<p>Tempter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dark's primary objective is to recruit Juli as either a fighter or lover. It's unclear who he fights, but one can assume that it's against Juli's objectives, since Juli primarily wants to get to I.th.Ak.A., and performance any potential resistance there. <p>Sidekick:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dark offers Juli his help, and when rejected, he faithfully accepts her rejection. This demonstrates a serving nature which ultimately wants the best for Juli. - He apologises for Borgo, having seen that Borgo has disturbed Juli ('mach dem Fräuline keine Angst'). - Ultimately, Dark grants Juli passage through to Borgo as the highest act of helpfulness he can offer her. 	<p>Dark's development shows a logical sequence of goals: at first, he wishes to recruit Juli as a fighter to his cause or lover, and when this fails, he helps her out of fondness. He is a Minor-Dynamic character.</p>

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
Borgo	Clown, Sidekick, Mentor	<p>Clown:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Borgo's exaggerated, absurd and ridiculous solo aria serves as comic relief. His style progressing forward, including the stereotype of Italianate Romantic opera, further serves his clown role. <p>Sidekick:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Borgo does not wish Juli harm, but in the eventuality that she dies he wants to gather her toes. This shows a morbid sort of faithfulness to the protagonist, that is the precondition for the Sidekick role. - Ultimately, Borgo helps Juli achieve passage to Der Kapitän. He does not know that Der Kapitän will trick her, just that if there is anybody that knows about I.th.Ak.A., it would be him. - As with Circe, he gives Juli a warning about accroaching danger - in this case, Die Sirenen. 	<p>Borgo's role as a Clown first occurs at the outset and recurs at the end with the quote of Italianate opera. His Sidekick role emerges gradually throughout the scene and the Mentor role comes suddenly in the final scene, when he gives Juli a warning. These emerging and suddenly occurring new roles can be considered a dynamic development in his character: Minor-Dynamic.</p>
Der Kapitän	Villain	<p>Villain:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Der Kapitän performs only one significant action: that of accepting Juli as a passenger, but dumping her at a sandbank instead of I.th.Ak.A., as promised. This is, of course, directly in opposition to Juli's stated interests, and makes him a Villain. 	<p>Dark's singular action makes him a Minor-Flat character.</p>

C.I. #	R.T.A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of character
Die Sirenen	Tempter, Villain	Tempter, Villain: - Die Sirenen perform, similarly to Der Kapitän, only one action: Tempting Juli to take her life. Moreover, since this is contradictory to Juli's goal of reaching I.th.Ak.A., they are Villains.	Die Sirenen's singular action makes them a Minor-Flat character.

5.3.2. Role types, Attributes and Developments as Given by the Musical Material and Cross-Genre Associations

As mentioned in 2.2.1. of the previous chapter, identifying cross-genre musical role types is more difficult than reading dramatic roles from the libretto, as I have just performed (i.e. 3.1.1. of this chapter). I will focus on discussing how the enunciations form primary (protagonistic) or secondary (other roles) materials, how these stand in contrast to one another and how this mutual relationship articulates, boosts or otherwise controls the musical cross-genre conflict in the third protagonistic goal-setting and analysing the relationship of the musical language of the characters in relation to this goal-setting.

(M.R.T.A. stands for 'Musical Role Type and Attributes')

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Juli	(Musical) Protagonist	<p>Protagonist:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As with literary roles, the musical protagonist elicits our sympathies and strives for certain goals (see 2.2.1. in the chapter on narrative semiology). - Juli elicits our sympathies as the musical protagonist via two principle features. <p>Firstly, we have, by far, the longest exposure to her material throughout the opera (she is on stage the entire time and singing in every scene, aside from solo songs/arias of the other characters). Secondly, her CCM (i.e. J8) and quasi-Romantic languages (i.e. J4) fit perfectly into the context of an opera as ‘native’ languages, where the genre-based languages of the other characters may seem ‘foreign’. Here, I was aware as a composer that the opera would be performed as such in an opera house, not as a musical, broadcast or in another performance context. These CCM- (i.e. J8) and quasi-late-Romantic-based (J4) languages represent the tradition against which the other characters will contrast, and which the others will enrich with genre references and ‘external’ hermeneutic information and associations. They are the main canvas on which the series of associations occurs - in other words. they perform the</p>	<p>Juli’s musical development mirrors largely that of the Major-Flat development in the libretto: stubbornly, she sticks to her languages despite becoming acquainted with many other musical characters and alternate genres that could enrich her experience. In the final Arietta, there is no instrumental ensemble, and the intervallic/harmonic language treads a line between the two sides of her language (CCM/quasi-late-Romantic), before ending in a dissonant, extended-technique enriched (through breathing sounds) passage which is weighted toward the ‘traumatised’ (see J8) side of her personality.</p> <p>The external characters attempt to give her keys to achieving this through enriching these two halves with additional components - the external genres - in the hope that an external element could act as a glue or mediator between Juli's internal conflict.</p> <p>However, Juli ultimately rejects all ‘external’ help and attempts to resolve her tension from within the two languages, by bringing them together in the final arietta.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
		<p>protagonistic (musical) role in the cross-genre narrative.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Juli's musical goal-setting is a sibling of her textual goal-setting (of reaching I.th.Ak.A. and everything it represents: freedom and peacefulness). Musically, Juli's musical language seeks to resolve the tension between its two traditional halves (CCM like J8 and quasi-late-Romantic like J4). - The textual goal setting, of reaching I.th.Ak.A., is doubled musically with the I.th.Ak.A. leitmotiv. This provides a teleology to her musical character, as the audience can remember instances of the leitmotiv and track them through time. 	<p>In the final <i>Arietta</i>, Juli does articulate some hybrid enunciations (12-24, 39-51) that indicate she has come close to unifying the inner conflict of her musical language (see 2.1.1.), yet has ultimately failed: the quasi-late-Romantic and CCM elements come in sequence but are not articulated simultaneously for a significant amount of time or for any chain of enunciations, as would be required, to achieve convincing unification of her languages, which is her protagonistic musical goal.</p> <p>In general, Juli is a similarly Major-Flat musical character, as with the libretto. Nevertheless, the ending poses a question regarding what state her language is ends in, since the harmony is an obscure mix of the two, not clarified by an accompaniment (since it is a cappella).</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Cycl ops	Villain	<p>The video-game-design ('Gameboy') musical language and associations of Cyclops' character identity (i.e. Cy1) present, in their brutal simplicity and aesthetic primitivity, a sort of polar opposite to the complex, multilayered (i.e. the polystylism of J3, J4 and J8) language of Juli. Accordind to Gregory Karl, musical 'villainy' is musical material that is 'at odds with the principle material' (Karl 1997), and Cyclops is the strongest example of this in I.th.Ak.A. from the cross-genre standpoint - a standpoint that assesses the relationship between tradition and genres. In other words, the genre elements of the other characters may too be at odds with the CCM and quasi-late-Romantic traditions that Juli embodies, but not to the extent that Cyclops' Gameboy music is.</p> <p>Moreover, Cyclops demonstrates an inflexibility that makes the contrasts of his language to Juli's particularly sharp. This will be explained in the next column, but is relavant to his role in showing the level of his musical disagreement with Juli.</p>	<p>Where Circe and Borgo (for example) develop their languages relating to the way Juli behaves in the scenes, Cyclops ends his scene (bar 179) with a Cy1 enunciation just as clear those from the first bars, as if his character has not at all been affected. There is a fake sense of development is brought about through the increasing presence of C4/C4' enunciations - those that represents error messages and warnings - throughout the scene. This is fake, in that it does not show a true development of Cyclops but rather his reorientation toward considering Juli a threat to security instead of being a helpful cyber guide. Musically and dramatically, Cyclops does not essentially change, as shown by the unchanged clarity of the Cy1 enunciation in the final bar, but focuses more on the 'error-message' material.</p> <p>Nevertheless, the musical language becomes more differentiated between bars 31 and 35, where a polytonality of C-pentatonic and D-flat-pentatonic Cy1 enunciations are over-layered (or</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
			<p>at least played in very quick succession without modulation) in the piano and vocal lines to create a dissonance in relation to one another, but consonance in their pentatonic fragments. These black harmonies (D-flat-pentatonic) and white harmonies (C-pentatonic) merge to become grey harmonies - elements of dissonance meet elements of consonance just as Juli tests the limits of what Cyclops will allow, the 'Grauzone', as Cyclops puts it himself in the libretto.</p> <p>All in all, cyclops is musically, as well as dramatically, a Minor-Flat character, since he ends the scene exactly how he started it, albeit with a 'fake' development of the 'error-message' side of his language.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Circe	Tempter, Skeptic, Mentor	<p>Tempter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Circe’s musical role as a tempter is demonstrated firstly through the extent to which her Soul and R&B genre elements are mediated with elements of CCM (i.e. ‘Pop-up/Interlude’, Cc2 and Cc3 and the quasi-fugue from bar 86 to 91, which is a hybrid of Cc1, Cc2 and fugue elements), making them more accessible to Juli, who interacts using a CCM language. - Secondly, it is shown, musically, that the tempting ‘works’, in that Juli mimics Circe’s language with fidelity in Der Kunde sequence, for example in bars 287-290, where Juli uses Cc4 in the vocal line, whilst the instruments accompany her with Cc7. <p>Mentor:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Circe is a mentor to Juli in the exchange of musical styles. After the sections where Circe uses her own default language (Cc1-Cc5), she takes on Juli’s language, showing understanding and facilitating communication on Juli’s musical home turf, so to speak. Then, She changes her musical language to adapt to the dramatic ways she is helping Juli - the Techno language of Cc7 represents entry into the Dark Room, from which Juli can gain entry to the Dark 	<p>Circe’s musical language develops significantly throughout her enunciations. The first two stretches of material, the PopUp/Interlude and her ‘Introductory Song’ (S 3.1.), are delivered without any dialog or interaction with Juli. They appear to be the standard musical sequences that arise when anybody visits Circe. The enunciations on Cc5 (S 3.2 until bar 155) operate in dialog with Juli - slightly altering their stock material to react to Juli’s responses. Afterwards, Circe takes on Juli’s language, merging it with her own. Mirroring the change in dramatic scenery, the accompaniment moves to Techno (Cc7). The scenes with Circe end in a musical place far removed from the first enunciations, and along the way, Circe controls the tenor of the debate (by changing her materials and adopting those of Juli) and the scenery (i.e. Cc7). Moreover, none of these materials are revisited, once Circe has progressed the narrative, as was the case with Cyclops. Simply put, Circe’s musical material develops by changing</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
		<p>Net. As previously mentioned, that Juli then takes on Circe's Cc4 enunciation as her vocal line shows her trust of Circe, and shows a Mentoring relationship. The only case of Juli adopting the language of another.</p> <p>Skeptic:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - When Circe asks 'Was ist I.th.Ak.A.' in bars 223-224, the intervallic I.th.Ak.A. motiv (J7) is highly reduced down to a simple m2 interval. That Circe does not reproduce J7 with any level of fidelity demonstrates a certain disrespect for its mysticism and importance, and is a musical skepticism. 	<p>permanently at crucial developments of the narrative. This makes her a Minor-Dynamic character.</p> <p>The genre elements - Soul, R&B and Techno - demonstrate Circe's ability to be flexible in her musical language according to the situation at hand. This is a key floor in Juli's antiheroine identity. Were Juli to adopt Circe's flexibility, she would be a more successful actor in the third space, through being able to enrich her language with the positive elements of others. Dramatically, this may mean she can see the benefits of staying alive, albeit it within the 'system', and find a way to enjoy her live here - according to Circe, this enjoyment could come through sex. Musically, Juli enriching her language in the third space through elements of Circe's genre references would be a gain of material and hermeneutic information through genre associations that make her language more secure.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Dark	Tempter, Sidekick	<p>Sidekick</p> <p>- Dark's mysterious language, not far from Juli's CCM and quasi-late-Romantic styles (were one to separate the keys in the polytonality of Dark's harmonies, they would be late-Romantic), is a complement rather than a contrast to Juli's language. As such, he is harmonically faithful to Juli - the key criteria for a Sidekick role (see 2.2.1. in the previous chapter).</p> <p>Tempter (and Sidekick)</p> <p>- in the solo stretch of Dark's material (S 4.3.), he introduces a language with strong elements of Heavy Metal music, to bring in associations of strength, masculinity and warrior culture (D3). These qualities are therefore offered as enrichments to Juli, were she to wish for them. Juli's language is unstable (CCM) and sometimes childishly sentimental (quasi-late-Romantic) - both of these qualities make her an inefficient resistance fighter, which she claims to be. As such, Dark wishes to tempt her into being a fighter - the role of a Tempter - although it would be for her own good, therefore demonstrating another element of his Sidekick role.</p>	<p>Dark ends the scenes with him in a similar language to the one in which he began it. The change in material comes in Scene 4.3., where he 'open up' about his true core musical material - that of the Heavy Metal-inspired warrior music. As mentioned, the 'mysterious' material surrounding S 4.3. is a sort of 'camouflage', not unveiling his true musical character.</p> <p>This is a specific tactic of cultural exchange in the third space: to create a 'mottled background' (as Bhabha put it) upon which one can provide hybrid cultural references - in this case, Heavy Metal - and seem relatively authentic to the culture, since the background creates a chaos in relation to which hybrids seem comparatively complete in both cultures they simultaneously articulate. As such, there is a two-fold development of Dark's musical character in S 4.3.: we see his 'true musical core' but also his tactical cunning, that he masks it so efficiently either side of the scene with the his 'camouflage' language.</p> <p>Nevertheless, since Dark's music remains the same as the end of the</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
			<p>scenes as that which started them, he is essentially a Minor-Flat musical character, albeit one about which we learn a lot throughout the course of the narrative teleology.</p>
<p>Borgo</p> <p>o</p>	<p>Clown, Tempter, Mentor</p>	<p>Clown:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Borgo's approach to vocal extended techniques (B1) in 5.1. and 5.2. is drastically stereotyped to the extent that it has a comic effect, especially when combined with the text. His music ridicules extended-technique music in its extremity and lack of internal difference from this style (i.e. the approach is not enriched by other materials, but is composed entirely with extended techniques). Like a clown, this exaggeration of an otherwise serious art form (<i>E-Musik</i>) depicts a caricature that undermines composers who write in that style with sincerity. - A similar clown-like action is performed at the end of 5.3. (B6) parodying Italianate Romantic opera. It is similarly stereotyped, albeit it harmonically skewed (<i>schräg</i>) with the E-Major chord in the penultimate harmony, instead of the 'normal' F-major. 	<p>Borgo's role as a Clown remains in tact throughout the dramatic change of musical style from extended-technique to Italianate Romantic music.</p> <p>Nevertheless, the strong contrast of styles, which Borgo does not reverse (i.e. he does not revert back to extended-vocal-technique after changing to lyrical singing, as Dark reverted back to his mystic style after the Heavy Metal song), depicts a development of the Clown role, which is, however, essentially consistent.</p> <p>The Tempter role, of trying to 'bring out' Juli's J8 traumatised music through articulated it in his B1-B4 enunciations, is abandoned in scene 5.3. and not renewed. In its place emerges the Mentor role emerges - this presents a significant development in his musical character. Borgo is a</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
		<p>Mentor/Tempter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Borgo's role as a Mentor is shown by the duet moments in 5.3. Firstly, they sing in duet during his 'warning' that the sirens will sing and lull her to death ('sie singen hell') - here, one sees musically that Juli is attending to Borgo's Mentor role, through joining in with the musical material he presents (Juli almost always sings <i>against</i> other characters, by disrupting them or answering them, but very rarely <i>with</i> them). - This is developed though the homophonic duet of B6, which demonstrates Borgo's Mentor role, but also shows his function as a Tempter, since Juli has been drawn into his behaviour of mocking serious art music traditions genres (firstly extended-technique-based CCM, now Italianate Romantic opera). - Borgo's B1 extended vocal (B1) and instrumental (B4) technique-based music is related to the 'traumatic' music of Juli (J8). As such, the many B1-B4 enunciations could be seen as attempts to lure Juli into extending her traumatised self. Juli resists this, responding to Borgo in her usual J1/J3 vocal language, rather than developing an extended-vocal-technique language like Borgo. 	<p>Minor-Dynamic musical character, highlighted through the changing ways he mocks and stereotypes genres of serious art music.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Der Kapitän	Villain	<p>Villain:</p> <p>- Der Kapitän's musical language has an audible impact on Juli: she no longer sings aggressive CCM music (J3) as a response, but rather seems to be entranced by Der Kapitän. This can be clearly seen by the J4 response to Der Kapitän when she is asked what her name is (bars 75-78) - J4 stood previously for introverted memories of her pre-traumatised state, and is now used to present herself to Der Kapitän. In a sense, she has given up a part of her musical language because she has been enchanted by Der Kapitän. This can be considered a Villainous act, since Juli's language is not improved, but diminished - i.e. she does not use Der Kapitän's Grunge Rock-inspired language to enrich her own, but is rather frightened by it and therefore does not employ her otherwise confident and aggressive side (the J4-like enunciations that occur in dialog with every other character up to this point).</p>	<p>Der Kapitän's musical language has a bi-polar shift from the K1-K2 Grunge Rock hybrid language to the 'opposite' material of K3. The effect on Juli remains the same - Juli is not emboldened by Der Kapitän's polar shift of style, but rather brought into his K4-induced trance of repetitive whole tone scales that have no preparation or resolution but rather drift harmonically, as if in space. The stylistic development of Der Kapitän - the polar shift and introduction of the concept-enunciation K4 - presents a strong intensification of his role as a Villain, even though this role stays the same. The intensification is demonstrated through the establishment then dissolution of Grunge Rock genre elements and, for me, great enough to warrant a significant development in his musical character. He is then a Minor-Dynamic musical character.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
Die Sire nen	Tempter, Villain	<p>Tempter/Villain:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The two stretches of musical language that Die Sirenen articulate are fundamentally different from Juli's. The S1 looping is a technology that transports the material beyond the limitations of the human voice. This is in direct contrast to the traditions Juli represents: the intervallic CCM language (J1-J3) is built on variation for the phrase in question - J1-J3 enunciations are always adapted to the moment in question, where Looping would remain consistent ad infinitum. Were Juli to enter the looping world, she would lose control of the varying nature of her language. This would not be an enrichment, since it would destroy variation rather than add to or enhance elements of her language. - The Ballad music of S2 forms a simplicity and popular form of beauty that Juli struggles to display up to this point in the opera. After this scene, in the final <i>Arietta</i>, Juli incorporates simple tonality (the hybrid enunciation in bars 39-51) that has been triggered by the S2 enunciation. My compositional intention was for the opera to, after S2, end with a downwards curve of 	<p>Die Sirenen develop harmonically from a clouded tonality (S1) to a crystal clear tonality (S2), the latter of which dissolves in the final bars into complete dissonance. This is one of prolonged intensification (42 bars) of the simplicity of the tonality and quick relaxation into complete dissonance (3 bars), where the ending represents the musical evaporation of the character and the Pop-Rock Ballad associations that go with them, like a theatric departure (Abgang),</p> <p>This straightforward curve, presents an intensification but no real change in purpose or role, and no dramatic introduction of new roles, as was the case with Der Kapitän. The change of technology, from Live-Looping to acoustic piano, is also subtle, and not disrupting the curve of intensification of both the Tempter and Villain roles. As such, musically, Die Sirenen are together a Minor-Flat character.</p>

C.I. #	M.R.T. A.	Reasons for type and attributes	Development of (musical) character
		<p>complexity - i.e. to end with simplicity. As such, the S2 Tempter role of Die Sirenen is effective in this regard, even if it's ineffective relating to S1.</p> <p>- The dialog with Die Sirenen and Juli displays no J4 enunciation, as with Der Kapitän, reinforcing the Villain role Der Kapitän played and showing the Villain role Die Sirenen plays through not retriggering J4 enunciations but rather distracting Juli through the two genre-based languages of S1 and S2, that contrast Juli's inner CCM and quasi-late-Romantic languages and tempt her away from them.</p>	

5.3.3. Analysing Musical Plot Functions with Commentary on the Libretto

Analysing plot functions will occur when characters are in dialog with one another. There are significant stretches of solo material showing the nature of each character identity, which have been covered in the bottom-level analysis. Additionally, there are musical interludes, which have musical and dramatic qualities, but do not relate to the characterisation, and it is characterisation which is the focus of this thesis. Indeed, another set of research could go into narrative for the entire opera, but I have focussed my analysis on characterisation through cross-genre. The following step of the mid layer analysis will focus on how the characters relate to one another through plot functions, as

described in the previous chapter on (musical) narrative semiology. In addition to the plot functions as described by Gregory Karl³¹⁸, I will indicate moments of mimicry, as received from Bhabha.

Plot functions in Scene 2			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-17	INSTRUMENTAL INTERLUDE		
18-22	Cy1	Enclosure A (+Meta-enclosure B)	
23	J1	The Enclosed	
24	Mimic/ Subversion	The Enclosed	Juli mimics the P4 language of Cyclops, including his high G, which starts the scene, but with a Juli ‘slippage’ - turning it to a TT. This chromatic souring of Cyclops’ crystal-clear pentatonic language can be seen to subvert his artificial self-presentation as a perfectly good and well wishing character, which he is not, as seen in the libretto (i.e. since he does not wish to help Juli achieve her stated goals).
25-29	Cy1’	Enclosure B	The C-major pentatonic is transposed up a semitone to D-flat, then modulated again downwards. It shows some ‘processing’ of Juli’s TT ‘slippage’ (by introducing the D-flat, which she sang instead of a D-natural) and encloses her first enunciation of the scene. This is the ‘grey’ harmony that combines white- and black-note pentatonic scales.
30	JX	Counteraction	JX contrasts the Cy1 enclosure extremely in its dissonant harmony, rhythmic syncopation and panicked singing style.
31-38	Cy1+Cy2	Enclosure C	For a third time, Cyclops encloses Juli with his Cy1 enunciation, ending with the Cy2 enunciation.
38-41	J4	Withdrawl	Juli changes languages to the quasi-Romantic, reflective J4, to express her desire of wanting ‘Intimsphäre’.

³¹⁸ Karl, G. (1997). Structuralism and musical plot. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

Plot functions in Scene 2			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
42-45	Cy3	The Interrupted	
46-47	JX	Interruption	
48	Cy4	Counteraction	As a response to Juli's interruption, Cyclops changes his tone from the (artificially) 'helpful' Cy1-Cy3 to the 'error message' style of Cy4. This is a sort of muscle-flexing or warning to her that he retains power and can behave disruptively to her, not just helpfully.
49-50	Cy3	The Interrupted	
51-52	JX	Interruption	
53	Cy4	Counteraction	
54-57	Cy1	Counteraction : Enclosure A	As a counteraction, Cyclops 'restarts' with his language from the beginning of the scene.
58-60	J1	The Enclosed	
61-68	Cy1'''+Cy2'	Enclosure B	The Cy1 enunciation is highly varied here through the pointalistic and highly poly-tonal, also somewhat quasi- and post-serialistic language. It is reminiscent of the not-analysed 2.1. musical interlude, which is exactly that in its language. Nevertheless, the vocal line (and especially piano accompaniment) in bars 53-56, shows that it is a Cy1 enunciation.
69-75	Cy1''' (Circ e-variation)	Realisation	As a result of the counteractions and second enclosure, Cyclops reveals (textually and musically) the presence of Circe as a potential next stage for Juli. This is a function of Realisation - the dialog has brought about new information. The harmonic material is of the 'decorative' material of Cc1, until bar 71. The piano and drums in bars 72-75 are a self-explanatory variation on Cy1.
76-79	Cy1'	Enclosure A	After the Realisation of Circe, Cyclops tries to establish his Cy1 language in a more original form (which still somewhat 'grey' through the included black notes) through an Enclosure.

Plot functions in Scene 2			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
81-83	JX	The Enclosed	
84-88	Cy1	Enclosure B	
89-90	JX'	Counteraction	JX' has the vocal line of JX but a highly reduced accompaniment.
91	Cy4	Counteraction	
92-94	Cy2	Enclosure A	
95-96	JX	The Enclosed	
97-101	Cy1'+mimi c	Enclosure B	The vocal line in bar 100 contains a mimic of J1 on the word 'verloren', indicating that Cyclops is aware of Juli's intentions to enter territory he sees as undesirable.
102-103	JX	Counteraction	
104-107	Cy4	Counteraction	
107-113	Cy1'+J1/J3/ JX Hybrid	Realisation	Cyclops is forced into a language that hybridises the 'warning'/'error message' harmonies with the drum and piano patterns of Cy1, vocal lines of J1 and J3, and complexity in the RH of the piano like JX. This Realisation shows how disturbed Cyclops is by Juli's counteractions, and that his software is having trouble calculating a clear response to them. The Gameboy (i.e. video-game and computer sound-design) elements are becoming highly obscured with Juli's CCM elements, showing Juli's influence through a cross-genre technique.
114-115	JX	Counteraction	
116-118	Cy1'+J1/J3 Hybrid	Realisation	Cyclops stays with the hybridised language of the previous enunciation, forced into it ('realised') through Juli's behaviour.
119	Cy4	Counteraction	Cyclops attempts to warn Juli as to the danger of the 'Grauzone'.
120-121	JX	Enclosure A	Juli asks a question, to put Cyclops on the defensive.

Plot functions in Scene 2

Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
122	Cy4	The Enclosed	
123	JX	Enclosure B	
124-1 27	J5	Realisation	Juli's J5 is triggered through the realisation that Cyclops is protecting information regarding Circe. J5 is a particularly dramatic enunciation (see the bottom layer analysis).
128	Cy4	Counteraction	Cyclops rejects Juli's Realisation, musically (through the Cy4 'error message' enunciation) and in the libretto.
129-1 32	Cy1'+J1/J3 Hybrid	Realisation	Juli's Realisation from bars 124-127 triggers a question from Cyclops, if she has been part of a 'defätistischen Gruppe'.
133-1 34	Cy3	Counteraction	Returning to Cy3 is a sort of counter-offer - instead of the aggressive musical language and textual conflict of the previous enunciation, Cyclops reminds Juli that he professes to be helpful.
135	Mimic of Cy4	Mimic (Counteraction)	
136-1 42	Cy1+Cy4'	Withdrawal	Cyclops withdraws to his power and his system, textually weighing up possible 'consequences' for Juli's behaviour, and musically transitioning from his confident Cy1 to a very sustained and soft version of Cy4.
143-1 47	JX'	Withdrawal	
148-1 49	Mimic of JX' + Cy4	Mimic + Subversion	Cyclops mimics the vulnerable 'withdrawal' of Juli in order to undercut her sincerity (subversion) - this is shown through attaching a Cy4 'error message' to the mimic of Juli's sincere emotional withdrawal.

Plot functions in Scene 2			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
150-1 51	Cy1'''' (minimalist variation)	Enclosure A	Cyclops presents a minimalistic enunciation based loosely on Cy1, demonstrating the extent to which his pre-programmed language is being stretched in both directions by Juli's demands (the Cy1'+J1/J3 etc. hybrids stretch his language in the other direction - towards complexity).
152-1 54	Mimic of Cy1''''	The Enclosed A	Juli mimics Cy1'''' in order to communicate with him more directly at this essential juncture in the scene.
155-1 61	J4	The Enclosed B (+Withdrawl)	This J4 is completely instrumental, and, as with the first J4 in the first <i>Arietta</i> , is a dreamy (<i>verträumt</i>) memory of her time before the trauma and the sanatorium.
163-1 66	Cy1+Cy1''''	Enclosure B (Realisation)	Cyclops allows Juli passage to Circe after observing (textually and also musically through the dreamy withdrawl) a level of obedience and cooperation.
167-1 74	Cy4'	Counteraction	Cyclops threatens Juli with registering her rebellious activity.
175	Cy1''''+Cy4 Hybrid	Counteraction	
176-1 77	J3+JX Hybrid	Counteraction	
178-1 79	Cy1	Realisation (Meta-enclosure B)	Cyclops reverts to the clear C-pentatonic and melody from stacked P4 intervals, just as clear as the first enunciation, showing no core development of character. This forms a meta-enclosure: that Cyclops has enclosed the entire dialog.

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-124	SOLO SONG (analysed in isolated character analysis, not here in the dialog character analysis)		

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
125-1 30	Cc5	Enclosure A	A long string of enclosures starts the dialog scenes between Circe and Juli. Circe wishes, musically and textually, to include (enclose) Juli in her process of selling digital sex.
131	JX	The Enclosed	
132-1 34	Cc5	Enclosure B	
135	JX	The Enclosed	
136-1 47	Cc5	Enclosure C	
148-1 51	JX	The Enclosed	
152-1 55	Cc5'	Enclosure D	The Cc5' variation involves a quasi-octatonic and quasi-exotic/oriental melisma reminiscent of Cc4.
156-1 60	JX	Realisation	Juli forces her way out of the endless string of enclosures, to force Circe to change her language from Cc5 to Cc6 - that which mimics Juli's own language.
161-1 70	Cc6	Enclosure A	A new string of enclosures are started in an attempt to convince Juli to work for Circe. Musically, this is shown through the enclosures and through Cc6, which mimics Juli's language, in order for Circe to appear more musically familiar.
171-1 72	JX	The Enclosed	
173-1 78	Cc6	Enclosure B	

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
179	JX	The Enclosed	Juli is, by this point, in a largely reactionary modus. The JX aesthetic shows outbursts (<i>Ausbrüche</i>) of counteractive behaviour, that are nevertheless easily contained by Circe's confident and calm domination of the scene through the second large string of enclosures, which she is able to assert even through a significant change of style from Cc5 to Cc6.
180-1 85	Cc6	Enclosure C	
186	JX	The Enclosed	
187	Cc6	Enclosure D	The final enclosure of this chain is chillingly cynical: 'Aber die Wahrheit' (here referring to Circe's cynical gender stereotypes). Musically, it is highly reduced - one held flageolet tone in the cello and a simple TT+m2 combination in the vocal line.
188-1 90	J4'+J1-J3 Hybrid	Withdrawl	Juli Withdraws to introspection counteract Circe's seemingly endless chains of Enclosures - Withdrawl was defined in the previous chapter as 'introversive counteraction' (see 2.2.1. in the <u>previous</u> chapter). This enunciation is harmonically a variation on J4 with melodic elements of J1-J3. The J4 elements dominate, however, reinforcing the Withdrawl musically through the cross-genre associations thereof (see 2.1.1. of <u>this</u> chapter).
191-2 13	Cc1+Cc6 Hybrid	Counteraction	This hybrid uses the accompaniment, rhythmic and tempo material from Cc1 with the vocal intervallic quality of Cc6. As a counteraction, Circe presents her final offer of helping Juli find a client that will help her gain access to the Dark Net.
214-2 018	Cc6+Cc5' Hybrid	Counteraction (cont.)	(cont.)
219	JX	Counteraction	An initial rejection of Circe's final offer.
220-2 22	J7	Realisation+E nclosure A	Juli states her true goal to Circe - to reach I.th.Ak.A.. This is doubled musically with the I.th.Ak.A. Leitmotiv (J7).

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
223-2 24	Cc6	The Enclosed	
225-2 26	J1	Enclosure B	
227-2 31	J5	Realisation	Juli describes I.th.Ak.A. - a further development of stating her true intentions (i.e. a Realisation).
232-2 35	Cc2'	Counteraction	
236	JX	Realisation	Juli accepts Circe's final offer (i.e. Realises the offer). Musically, however, she stays with her JX 'aggressive' language, for now, hinting at a grudge and inauthenticity to her acceptance.
237-2 50	Cc7	Enclosure A	Circe shifts style again to Cc7, showing the progression in the narrative and bringing fresh associative power and hermeneutic information according to the cross-genre method (see 2.3.1. and 2.3.2. of this chapter for further detail and discussion). The melodic material - that of the <i>Der Kunde</i> (an impersonation of a customer that Circe performs) - is primitively straight in rhythm (mostly 1/4 notes on the beat) and simple in melodic intervals (P4, unison), showing the basic nature of <i>Der Kunde's</i> sexual drive.
251-2 52	J3+Cc7 Hybrid	The Enclosed	Juli's melodic material retains her character qualities, whilst the accompaniment is of Cc7.
253-2 56	Cc7	Enclosure B	
257-2 62	J3'+Cc5'+C c7 Hybrid	The Enclosed	Juli merges her melodic material with Cc5, showing musically the development of Circe's effect on and power over Juli in this moment.

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
263-2 83	C1''''	Counteraction +Enclosure X	Cyclops bursts onto the scene with an extreme variaoin of C1'''', showing his exasperation at Juli's progress in leaving his system. With this, he starts his own Counteractive Enclosure chain, attempting to combat Circe's control over Juli (note for the jurors: this is shown musically through the musical narrative plot function hybrid of Counteraction and Enclosure, and is therefore a sophisticated key example of both the cross-genre technique and narrative musicality of the work). Cyclops Cyl'''' is at its most extreme point of development, coming as it does at end of material for Cyclops' character and a regional high-point of the work (i.e high-point of his character development).
284-2 94	J3'+Cc5'+C c7 Hybrid	The Enclosed	Sim. as 257-262
295-2 97	Cc7	Enclosure C	
298-2 06	C1''''	Counteraction +Enclosure Y	
307-3 08	Circe's Mimic of the J3+JX Hybrid of the previous dialog with Cyclops	Counteraction	
309-3 21	C1''''	Counteraction ++Enclosure Z	

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
322	Cy4	Realisation	Cyclops' Enclosure chain (X-Y-Z) culminates in the Realisation of his threat - an anticlimax, since he states he will 'wait' and see what 'consequences' Juli's actions will have.
323-3 25	Cc5'	Counteraction	
326-3 28	Cc1	Subversion	Circe - having essentially defeated Cyclops in their battle of Enclosure chains - Subverts Cyclops by addressing him with Cc1, musically and textually asking if he wants sex from her. This is mockingly sarcastic, since she calls him 'Robot' at the end. His response, 'keine Information', closes the subversive mockery.
329-3 33	Cy1	Realisation	Here, Cyclops has been undercut (Subverted) to the extent that his accompaniment has disappeared and only the Cy1 melodic line remains.
334-3 37	(freely composed gesture)	Realisation	The instrumental ensemble plays a 'shut down' gesture, and Cyclops' defeat is fully realised.
338-3 41	Cc7''	Enclosure A	The techno beat of Cc7 is slowed down dramatically, and enhanced with 'Dark Room' sound-design and a bassline that oscillates between two notes.
342-3 46	J1/J3+Cc7''	The Enclosed	
246-3 50	Cc7''	Enclosure B	The melodic language for <i>Der Kunde</i> is extended by a few m2 intervals, but remains essentially the same as in the previous scene. The accompaniment is, of course, developed from Cc7 to Cc7'' as explained.
351-3 53	JX+Cc7''	The Enclosed	The melodic material is of JX, the accompaniment of Cc7''.
355-3 58	Cc7''	Enclosure C	

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
359-3 63	JX (pure)	Counteraction	Juli breaks the Enclosure chain through a pure (i.e. non-hybridised) and long JX enunciation.
364-3 68	Cc7'''	Enclosure A	Circe begins a new Enclosure chain with a variation on Cc7, where the bassline has a sort of 'walking bass' quality through the persistent triplets and adventurous harmony. It becomes a sort of theme and variations, with instruments adding themselves one-by-one to the texture. This makes the Enclosure chain particularly strong, as it increases in dynamic and complexity with every new instrumental line.
368-3 71	JX+Ccy7''	The Enclosed	
372-3 73	Cy7'''	Enclosure B	
374	J5+Ccy7''	The Enclosed	Juli tries out different approaches to break the Enclosure, now J5 instead of JX.
374-3 77	Cy7'''	Enclosure C	
377-3 81	J1'+JX	The Enclosed	
381-3 95	Cy7'''	Enclosure D	
395-3 96	JX	The Enclosed	
396-4 03	Cy7'''	Enclosure E	

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
404-4 05	JX	Realisation (Counteraction)+Enclosure	Juli breaks the Enclosure chain with sheer will ('Schluss mit dem Gesäusel!'), Realising her potential to reject Circe through Counteractions that are strong enough. This enunciation, at another region high-point (which breaks such a long chain), demonstrates that, ultimately, the whole process is in Juli's mind, she must simply be strong enough to Realise her own potential.
406-4 07	Cy7'''	The Enclosed	
408	JX	Enclosure B	Juli's two-fold strong rejection of Circe forms an Enclosure.
409-4 16	Cc6+Cy1'''	Counteraction - Enclosure X	Circe sings in Juli-like intervals with the Cc6 enunciation, adding one element of Cc1 from bar 413 (the piano LH) to retain some of her isolated identity.
417-4 18	J4	Withdrawal	In the text, Juli is surprised that Circe knows 'where she comes from'. Musically, this is mirrored with a Withdrawal to her 'reflective/dreamy' and 'post-trauma' J4 enunciation - the quasi-late-Romantic side of her personality, which has been triggered by Circe's previous Counteraction.
419-4 24	Cc6	Enclosure Y	This enunciation reveals that Circe's previous Counteraction was the start of a new Enclosure.
425-4 28	Cc7'''	Counteraction	On the back of the Enclosure, Circe rehashes the Cy7''' enunciation that Juli had Counteracted in 404-405, matching the text 'Lass mich dich zum Abschied noch einmal flüchtig berühren'.
429	JX	Counteraction	
430-4 33	Cc6	Counteraction	

Plot functions in Scene 3			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
434-441	CX	Realisation	For Circe to Realise her aim to help Juli progress to the Dark Net, she introduces a new enunciation, CX (which was not included in the bottom layer analysis, since it essentially belongs to the non-character-based instrumental etude <i>Verwandlungsmusik</i> and not to Circe's isolated identity, therefore lying outside of the scope of a characterisation analysis, which this is).

Plot functions in Scene 4			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-49	<i>ARIETTA</i> (analysed in isolated character analysis, not here in the dialog character analysis)		
50-63	J4	Withdrawl	Before Dark enters, Juli goes into a dreamy trance with J4 (as always, with this enunciation).
64-70	D1	Interruption+ Enclosure A	Dark interrupts Juli's moment of Withdrawn solemnity.
71-75	D2	Enclosure A (cont.)	
76	JX'	The Enclosed	Juli's vocal line is typical of JX but the accompaniment is bare, showing her uncertainty in the Dark Net. In the Surface Net, the accompaniment would typically be aggressive, full and complex.
77-79	D1''	Enclosure B	The D1'' contains essentially the same material, yet is soft and intimate in its feeling, rather than loud and epic.
80-82	JX	Counteraction	In this Counteraction, the accompaniment returns.
83-87	JX'	Withdrawl	Juli is unsure about the full JX enunciation, and Withdraws to a JX' without accompaniment, and significantly less strong in dynamic and expression. This demonstrates her changing attitude within the Dark Net.

Plot functions in Scene 4			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
88-89	D1''	Counteraction	
90-94	D2	Counteraction (cont.)	
95	JX	Counteraction	Sim. as above.
96-98	JX'	Withdrawl	Sim. as above.
99-100	J7	Realisation+E nclosure A	Through the Withdrawl, Juli opens up enough to reveal her goal: I.th.Ak.A.
101	Mimic of J7	The Enclosed+Mi mic	Dark's vocal line mimics the M7 I.th.Ak.A. Leitmotiv of J7, and the accompaniment continues as with the previous enunciation.
102	J3	Enclosure B	
103-108	D1'	Counteraction	
109-111	Mimic of Cc1+Cc5	Counteraction	Juli mimics Circe in an attempt to highlight the aspect of the text where Juli offers Dark a bribe (<i>Trinkgeld</i>) - here, the music offers another level to that offered in the text, that being, that Circe sold sex, and now Juli is offering 'a bribe', one can assume she means a sexual bribe, due to the musical cross-genre reference.
112-116	D1	Enclosure A	
117	JX	The Enclosed	
118	D1''	Enclosure B	The D1'' here is purely instrumental.
119	JX'	Withdrawl	The reduced, soft and introspective nature of JX' (as opposed to the extroverted, dynamic nature of JX) shows an insecurity when she poses to Dark the question: 'Wer sind Sie?'.
120-121	D3	Enclosure A	
122	JX	The Enclosed	

Plot functions in Scene 4			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
122-1 24	D3	Enclosure B	
124-1 25	JX	The Enclosed	
126-1 63	D3	Enclosure C	As a massive Enclosure on their first dialog passage comes Scene 4.3., Dark's solo song, which encloses this enunciation. It will not be analysed because it contains no dialog, only a solo individual exposition of Dark's warrior-side, as explored previously.
126-1 63	SOLO SONG (analysed in isolated character analysis, not here in the dialog character analysis, beyond commenting on its nature as Enclosure C)		
164-1 66	D1	Enclosure A	
167	JX	The Enclosed	
168-1 69	D1''	Enclosure B	
170-1 72	D4	Realisation+E nclosure A	With the change in musical enunciation comes a textual Realisation of Dark's offer to Juli - to be a warrior with him.
173-1 75	JX	The Enclosed	Juli's rejection is enhanced with the instrumental ensemble (JX as opposed to JX').
176-1 79	D4	Enclosure B	The second part of the musical enclosure mirrors a textual enclosure, where Dark offers her now to be a lover.
180-1 81	JX	Counteraction	Juli forcefully rejects Dark for the second time, breaking the Enclosure.
182-1 84	D1	Counteraction	
185-1 86	D5	Realisation	Dark reveals a new element of his (musical) character with D5 (see previous section for details as to the dynamics and role of Dark's character identity as demonstrated by this moment), a sort of Realisation of the depth of his character.

Plot functions in Scene 4			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
187-1 93	J4	Realisation	Juli reveals her deepest desire - for freedom.
194-1 97	J2	Realisation	These desires are developed into discussing I.th.Ak.A., which is, however, not musically encoded by the usual J7 Leitmotiv (although this is secretly found in the string double-stops) but rather the unsatisfied and reflective J2. This should show a level of diminishing hope about and/or frustration with reaching I.th.Ak.A..
198-2 00	D1''	Counteraction	
201-2 02	D5	Counteraction	
203-2 09	JX'+J4 Hybrid	Realisation	Juli drifts off in a dreamy state (J4), based harmonically although on JX', forming a hybrid enunciation.

Plot functions in Scene 5			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-33	SOLO SONG (analysed in isolated character analysis, not here in the dialog character analysis)		
34-36	D1	Enclosure A	
37-40	B3	The Enclosed	
41-45	D1	Enclosure B	
46-47	JX	Counteraction	Juli breaks the Enclosure-based musical and textual dialog between Dark and Borgo with a JX.
48-59	D1'	Realisation	Dark leaves by giving Juli the Link to Borgo, as a way of helping her, Realising his role in Juli's journey.

Plot functions in Scene 5			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
60-63	B3	Enclosure A	Borgo begins his dialog passages alone with Juli by offering her to go with him. Instrumentally, the accompaniment becomes more intense.
64-66	J7	The Enclosed	The accompaniment is of J7, as if Juli is hoping that he means that they will travel to I.th.Ak.A. (and asking the question ‘Wohin?’).
66-72	B3	Enclosure B	
73-74	JX	The Enclosed	
75-83	B3	Enclosure C	
84	JX	Counteraction	Juli breaks the Enclosure chain.
85-94	B3+Cc7 Hybrid	Counteraction	Strangely, Borgo uses the accompaniment from Cc7, which should indicate that he is also a ‘Kunde’, in that he wants to collect Juli’s toes, should she die in her journey.
95	JX	Counteraction	
96-100	B3	Enclosure A	
101-103	JX	The Enclosed	
104-110	B3	Enclosure B	Borgo’s language is very consistent, up to this point, focussing heavily on B3
111-114	B4	Withdrawl+Realisation	Borgo Withdraws to a fantasy about eating Juli’s toes, which is also a Realisation of his pervertedness, which has been let to develop unchecked through the many B3 enunciations.
115-116	B3	Enclosure A	
117	JX	The Enclosed	
118-126	B3+J2/J8 Hybrid	Enclosure+Realisation	Borgo firstly Encloses Juli’s impatient attitude, before the instrumental accompaniment begins to develop elements of textures and instrumental materials in J2 and J8.
127	JX	Counteraction	

Plot functions in Scene 5			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
128-1 32	B5	Realisation	The extreme change in style between B3 and B5 is a stylistic Realisation of the hidden depth of Borgo's character identity (see 2.5.1.).
133-1 36	B5'	Realisation	Borgo and Juli sing B5 in duet - Realising the influence that Borgo is beginning to exert on Juli.
137	B3	Counteraction	
128-1 42	B5'	Realisation	(See bars 133-136.)
143-1 47	B5+B3	Counteraction	
148-1 55	B3	Counteraction	
156-1 57	B5+B3	Counteraction	
158-1 66	B6	Realisation	Borgo's final trick is Realised - the pastiche of Italianate Romantic opera.

Plot functions in Scene 6			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-63	INSTRUMENTAL INTERLUDE		
64-72	K1	Realisation+E nclosure A	DK's character identity is presented - a Realisation thereof.
73-74	K2	Realisation+E nclosure A (cont.)	
74-81	J4	The Enclosed	Juli is entranced by DK's presence, sending her to a J4 response rather than the usual JX.
82-84	K2	Enclosure B	

Plot functions in Scene 6			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
85-88	J7	The Enclosed	
89-90	K1	Enclosure C	The short in-between enunciation (without text) shows DK's pervasiveness and strengthens the Enclosure chain.
91	J1	The Enclosed	
92-93	K2	Enclosure D	
94-95	J2	The Enclosed	
96-98	K1	Enclosure D	
99-100	K2	Enclosure D	
		(cont.)	
101	Cc1	Counteraction	A tiny quote from Cc1 should demonstrate that Juli has paid with her body, just as Circe pays with the bodies of those she sells in a sexual way. This enunciation is almost unnoticeable without analysing the score - the conductor was the only one to notice. Nevertheless, compositionally, I found that it provided a (very) short moment of non-random variation that helped with the aesthetic for the scene.
102-103	JX	Counteraction	The previous enunciation, together with this one, breaks the Enclosure chain.
104-108	K1+K2	Enclosure A	Der Kapitän starts another Enclosure chain without any other plot functions. This should demonstrate him as a relentless power, inhuman and uncompromising. Aesthetically, it gives the scene an 'installation'-like quality, since K1 and K2 pervade relentlessly throughout.
109-110	K3'	The Enclosed	DK Encloses himself with a foreshadowing of the full K3 enunciation, here, in a highly reduced form.
111-115	K2	Enclosure B	
116-117	K1	Enclosure B (cont.)	

Plot functions in Scene 6			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
118	J1	The Enclosed	This enunciation is truly Enclosed, since the accompaniment from DK is unbroken.
119-1 25	K2	Enclosure C	
126-1 29	K2'	Realisation+E nclosure C (cont.)	The accompaniment develops into a busier, more intense and dynamic variation on K2, creating a musical acceleration in the groove, without accelerating the tempo itself.
130-1 38	K2'+J1/J3	Subversion+T he Enclosed	DK Subverts Juli's character by developing K2 to such an extremity that Juli's interjections are mere details in the engulfing texture of a K2 accelerating out of control.
139-1 41	J3+JX Hybrid	Counteraction	Juli breaks the K2' development acceleration and the Enclosure that results from this engulfing texture.
142-1 66	K3	Withdrawl+E nclosure A	DK Withdraws to articulate his fragile inner character (see the discussion of DK as a bipolar character from 2.6.1. and 2.6.2.).
167	J3	The Enclosed	
168-1 73	K2	Enclosure B	
174-1 76	K2'	Enclosure B (cont.)	
177-1 85	K4	Enclosure C	DK Encloses Juli in his final K4 enunciation.
186-2 48	INSTRUMENTAL INTERLUDE (with text-free vocalises from the singers - which still within my conception of an instrumental interlude)		

Plot functions in Scene 7			
Bar #	Enunciatio n	Musical function type	Comments (Libretto/Music)
1-16	S1	Subversion	DS Subvert Juli through the electronic process of looping, which is omnipresent throughout Juli's interjections in this enunciation.
17-26	S1'	Realisation	DS introduce their own text and substantial melodic line, cancelling Juli's interjections and overtaking (Realising) the texture.
27-32	S1''	Realisation	The electronic looping is faded out and the ensemble plays that which the electronic previously played, Realising DS' presence in the 'real world' as opposed to the 'sublime' and 'eternal' world of live looping (see 2.7.1 and 2.7.2.).
33-42	S2	Realisation	DS have reached the climax of their character identity with the S2 enunciation, that presents the simplest and most accessible form of music in the entire opera, as a type of high-point.
43	S2'	Realisation	The simple and accessible quasi-perfection of S2 becomes increasingly soured through dissonance, ending in complete ('perfect') dissonance. It is a further, final Realisation that DS can also be perfectly nihilistic (S2'), as well as perfectly sublime/eternal (S1) and perfectly simple and accessible (S1).

5.4. Top Layer Analysis

5.4.1. Identification of Elements of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict

<p>Musical elements representing ‘order’ in relation to the Cross-Genre theory:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Juli’s language as based on the CCM ‘inside’ tradition: i.e. J1-J3/J8 - Juli’s language as based on a quasi-late-Romantic classical music tradition. 	<p>Literary/textual elements representing ‘order’:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Juli’s journey to <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i>
<p>Musical elements representing ‘transgression’ in relation to the Cross-Genre theory:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cyclops’ musical references to video-game and computer sound-design (Cy1, Cy3, Cy4); - Circe’s musical references to Soul and R&B (Cc1-4), Soft Jazz (Cc5) and Techno (Cc7); - Dark’s musical references to Mystic Primitivism (D1), Heavy Metal (D3) and Orientalism (D4); - Borgo’s corruption of extended-technique CCM (B1-B3) and (similar corruption) of Italianate Romantic opera (B5); - Der Kapitän’s musical references to Grunge Rock (K1) and material composed as the ‘opposite’ to it (K3); - Die Sirenen’s deployment of Live-Looping and musical references to Pop Rock Ballads. 	<p>Literary/textual elements representing ‘transgression’:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cyclops’ will to detain Juli within the bounds he offers or, at the very least, within the ‘grey zone’; - Circe’s desire to have Juli work for her as a digital sex-worker or be her lover; - Dark’s desire to have Juli work for her as a fighter or be her lover; - Borgo’s games of mockery and fantasy distract Juli and waste her time; - Der Kapitän lies to Juli about taking her to <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i> and dumps her instead at a sand bank; - Die Sirenen tempt Juli into taking her life instead of fighting (albeit in vain) to reach <i>I.th.Ak.A.</i>

Musical elements eliciting the listeners sympathies in relation to the Cross-Genre theory:

- Since *I.th.Ak.A.* is conceived as a CCM opera, and was first performed in an opera house, Juli's two languages are the native languages of such an occasion and 'fit in' to the expectations and conventions of the listeners. This is one reason why Juli's languages may elicit our sympathies.
- A second reason is the huge inequality to which listeners hear Juli's languages above those of the other characters: Juli is on stage for the entire opera and listeners are exposed to it more than the others by a huge margin.
- As such, a cross-genre scenario is constructed, where Juli's languages represent 'tradition' and those of the other characters (where they display elements of genres) represent enrichments to or challenges thereof. Exceptions to this rule include: Circe's hybrid mimic of Juli's language (Cc6), Dark's Mystic Primitivism (D1, which is undefined in its nature but

Literary/textual elements eliciting the listeners sympathies:

- Juli's character identity as an antiheroine creates a tragically sympathetic relationship to the listeners, since she is obviously the protagonist - having indeed imagined the entire scenario in her mind - but seems essentially flawed at working within the system or 'playing the game'.
- Nevertheless, Juli clearly elicits our sympathies, since the teleology of the narrative follows her actions, goals and desires. Similarly to the musical narrative, Juli's textual narrative is overwhelmingly dominant regarding proportions of exposure: listeners are overwhelmingly exposed to her dialog and her individual reflections (three *Ariettas*) and are therefore naturally attracted to her character, since listeners are most familiar with it by a large margin.
- Some elements of the external characters have, however, attractive qualities that are Minor in their role. These may differ from listener to listener but include, for me, as the

<p>most closely inspired by Carl Orff, a 20C classical composer) and Borgo's clown-like mockery of CCM in B1-B3 and late-Romantic opera in B5, which are two styles belonging to the tradition side of the third space cross-genre conflict).</p>	<p>composer: Cc1, Cc5 and Cc7, D3 and D4, K1 and K3, and S1 and S2. These are superficial apparitions of style in comparison to the huge exposure to Juli, but that makes listeners perhaps even more sympathetic to their qualities. Therefore, there are external genre elements that could serve not as true alternative powers to Juli's languages, but could enrich them to make the inner conflict between Juli's languages less bipolar and more myriad.</p>
---	---

5.4.2. Discussion of the Elements and Identification of an Archetypical Cross-Genre Conflict

In the opera *I.th.Ak.A.*, two strands of the classical music tradition are presented as the musical and cross-genre 'order': CCM and quasi-late-Romantic classical music. Transgressive elements are almost entirely based on elements of external genres, apart from the few exceptions mentioned above. Therefore, the questions to be asked in order to assess the musical narrative cross-genre archetype of the opera *I.th.Ak.A.* are: Do Juli's languages form a desirable or undesirable order? Is the (musico-)traditional order ultimately conserved or transgressed by the external genres, or, is it enriched, and if so, are the results thereof positive or negative? (I refer in the following freely to 2.3.1. of the previous chapter to develop the discussion beyond these two key questions.)

Juli's two languages, the first of which is J1-J3 and J5-J8 and the second of which is J4, form an internal conflict that is based largely on Fixity of the CCM and late-Romantic classical music traditions (respectively). Through analysing Juli's first and last Ariettas, it is clear that there is no essential development of these two strands: on one hand, no significant hybridity takes place, and on the other, no significant additional ('new') elements enrich the polar Fixity-based conflict. As such, from a perspective of musical narrative, the traditions serve as an oppressive force (undesirable) that rejects all external information and regenerative newness. Aesthetically, the CCM tradition has stood (at least since WW2, if not since mid-Schoenberg) for inaccessibility of expression and elitism, two markedly anti-social ideologies. This has been largely achieved through a high level of harmonic dissonance, rhythmic syncopation, melodic angularity and textural unclarity - all elements that I built into the 'aggressive' and 'traumatised' parts of Juli's language. From the point of view of the libretto, which is an especially factor relevant here, Juli meets a tragic demise - suicide - and similarly, she remains adamant in her rejection of all external help or pathways to an alternative way of life than her stated goal to reach I.th.Ak.A. (as discussed, this is what makes her an antiheroine). The order that her languages present is an antagonistic one.

In contrast, the additional characters often display elements of external genres that contrast the aforementioned CCM qualities strongly. These elements could be integrated by Juli into her own language for strategic gain: though such a process, she would gain qualities that would make her a more effective actor in her (imagined) third space world, where health of identity is generated through newness arising from conflict at the boarder zones in the third space. Were she to achieve a process of regenerative newness, she would cure the wounds in her musical and textual psyche - since she images the characters and their languages as fantasies, unfulfilled desires and/or parts of her she can't live out (see 2.1.1. and 2.1.2. of this chapter) - leading to a mental space where internal cultural difference (as represented by the external genre-enriched characters and two

strands of her traditional language) is not combatted through Fixity (i.e. Juli's rejection of including newness in her personal language) but rather hybridised through inclusion of cultural difference into the dominant order, that of Juli's personal language.

Cyclops' references to what I've sometimes referred to as Gameboy music (i.e. video-game and computer sound design) present a return to simplistic musical elements such as pentatonic scales, minimalist sets of melodic intervals (i.e. stacked fourths) and rhythms built from straight 1/8 or 1/4 notes. These simplistic and emotionally-neutral elements could provide a stark relief to the complexity of Juli's CCM and sentimental quasi-late-Romantic languages. Circe quotes Soul and R&B, displaying steady grooves³¹⁹ that have a level of syncopation to keep the texture interesting (as opposed to Cyclops' uninteresting 'straightness') without losing a sense of pulse (as with Juli), additionally aiming at the sexual associations from these genres. This would be a pathway between Cyclops' over-simplicity and Juli's CCM over-complexity. Dark creates both an attractively obscure soundworld (D1 - Mystic Primitivism and D4 - Orientalism) and a confident, physical language (D3) that could easily be integrated with Juli's aggression (D3) and desire for freedom (D1). Borgo mocks both strands of Juli's language, which could expose to her through satire the unappealing self-victimisation of her identity. In other words, were Juli to attempt self-mockery, she could enrich her (textual and musical) identity with self-irony. Der Kapitän presents her with a pathway to creating an aesthetic out of her wounds, as Grunge Rock does (K1), rather than either trying to heal or ignoring them by reaching I.th.Ak.A., which she believes will solve her problems. Die Sirenen offer her the most extreme way to solve her problems with the most simple solution - musically, either by becoming 'digital' and basing ones language on mere verbatim repetitions or through

³¹⁹ In relation to commercial music genres, when I refer to genres based on musical elements that lie outside notation (i.e. vocal colour and groove, as with R&B), that the element is not available to a CCM composer and therefore virtual in the head of the composer.

three-chord music, both of which are the simplest forms of music to understand, and textually, by committing suicide.

However, Juli does not integrate any elements of these characters into her language: it is not enriched or brought into any process of regenerative sustainability of newness. It simply remains in a stalemate, she doesn't even convincingly reconcile the two strands of her language from the first stretch of material (the first *Arietta*) into a hybrid in the last stretch (the third *Arietta*). Therefore, the efforts to transgress the oppressive order - by enriching it with attractive external elements or hybridising the inner conflict thereof - fail. Not only does it fail, but it does so tragically, since our sympathies lie with Juli and her (antiheroine) language, which we hope will develop regenerative newness in order to reconcile the sick nature of Juli's textual and musical character identity³²⁰. It is a tragedy that Juli's inner conflict could not be developed in its essence along the narrative starting with the first *Arietta* to the last (third) *Arietta*. Therefore, *I.th.Ak.A.* the opera presents a tragic archetype where Juli fails musically to enrich her traditional languages with elements of external genres, in order to transform this inner conflict of two stagnant traditions (i.e. conflicting Fixities in a stalemate) into a myriad of cultural difference, which would be more sustainable in the third space, and a process that creates regenerative 'newness' for her character identity through the teleology of the operatic narrative. This failure is tragic. As the prototypical analysis based on the newly-developed analytical technique shows, the three layers of hermeneutic information and associations, autonomous musical material and third-space-style narrative musical conflict between

³²⁰ The language is familiar and native to the operatic context, which I argued above may elicit our sympathies in its familiarity and therefore be something that some listener wishes is not transgressed. I am arguing that the listener wishes at least for it to be transgressed in the sense that it develops 'newness', reaches some form of essential Realisation or regenerates itself with new power. Were this to happen, the archetype could be considered Romantic. That this does not happen, but rather that the language stagnates in a stalemate, and that this is coupled with the textual narrative of suicide, points clearly to a tragic musical, textual and cross-genre archetype.

the classical musical tradition and external commercial music genres demonstrate that *I.th.Ak.A.* is a quintessential cross-genre opera³²¹.

³²¹ To be more specific, it is a quintessential realisation of the 'Cross-genre tragic archetype model 1' from 2.3.1. of the previous chapter.

6. A Summary of Key Developments and Discoveries

6.1. A Key Development: the Changing Form of the Guidelines Throughout the Dissertation Project

6.2. Discovery of Methods for Artistic Research in Composition

6.3. Discoveries as to the Nature of my Creative Process as a Composer

6.4. A Recapitulation of the Original Research Contained in the Dissertation Project and Answers to the Research Questions

In this concluding chapter, I wish to outline some research insights that have not been articulated in the text thus far and provide a recapitulation of the research contained in the dissertation project.

6.1. The Changing Form of the Guidelines Throughout the Dissertation Project

The production of this thesis in its two components has been a process of extreme personal and professional development for me, the currency of which has been insights, critical results, discoveries and other illuminating knowledge products that could be described by the German term *Erkenntnis*. Before illuminating some key *Erkenntnisse*, I'd like to reflect shortly on perhaps the substantial development in the form of the cross-genre theory. Originally, I had envisioned a manual-like set of easily reproducible techniques that would be a formula-like skill-set for writing cross-genre music. Such a handbook or manual may function like Samuel Adler's treatise on orchestration, *The Study of Orchestration*. In the thesis artefact as I originally envisioned it, a student could learn concrete techniques for cross-genre composition and replicate them in their own work to achieve an objective measure of cross-genre compositional virtuosity. I would provide a few formulas for hybridising elements of genres with traditional conventions to arrive at an objectively cross-genre compositional outcome. These formulas could be exemplified in the score

for *I.th.Ak.A.*. Such a process and research artefact appealed to me due to its scientific appearance: I would create ‘rules’ that could be used as compositional tools to create music on the basis of the ideology I wished to explore. It seemed similar to mathematical formulas or engineering blueprints, which I saw as obviously scientific.

However, through exploring artistic research as a topic, I discovered a spectrum of research, from pure mathematics, undisturbed by the chaos of reality, to field anthropology, where the researcher interacts with their subjects and influences their behaviour without concern. Artistic research would be a field with zero distance between subject and observer - a paradigm shift opening up a range of subjective propositions still underneath the umbrella term of research. Additionally, although not included in the final text for the thesis, I explored post-modernism and drafted an essay taking a standpoint in regards to the intellectual debate surrounding it. Here, I found convincing arguments against perceiving positivistic statements as the only pathway to academic research. The work of Joseph Kerman brought such ideas into the realm of musical analysis, debating the academic benefit of positivistic analyses to the point of demonising them. The final and essential ‘nail in the coffin’ for a ‘blueprint’ or ‘manual-like’ form for the cross-genre guidelines was the work of Homi K. Bhabha, which, instead of performing literary criticism through positivistic-like analysis of text, basing his thoughts on objective measurements of literary narratives, struck a philosophical discursive tone based on a set of vocabulary that was ‘alive’ - Bhabha never strictly defines his coinages (hybridity, mimicry, stereotype, cultural difference, articulation, enunciation etc.), but rather lets them develop and change like living things. Although I ended up providing my understanding of his coinages and how they could apply to the musical sphere in a definition-like manner in chapter 4, they were employed in chapter 6 in a method similar to how Bhabha used

them - through free, naturally-evolving discourse (which was, nevertheless, structured by me in a consistent tabular methodology)³²².

In summary, I moved away from providing a prescriptive method for cross-genre composition towards creating a perspective for appreciating cross-genre music. More than an instruction manual, cross-genre is a way of thinking. The resulting analysis may be more esoteric than a positivistic analysis (such as a Schenkerian analysis of tonal works by Mozart or Brahms), and as such, it may lose some gloss of quasi-scientific perfection. This is, however in line with what I discovered through personal research on theories of artistic research, modern perspectives of musical analysis, cultural crossing in postcolonial literature, and, ultimately, the composition and analysis of *I.th.Ak.A.*. Discussing and analysing *I.th.Ak.A.* as a cross-genre opera in a more open, philosophical tone (that is nevertheless structured in layers of meaning and considers objective autonomous musical materials to the extent that they are self-evident) is a more true representation of my compositional process.

Instead of an instruction manual, this thesis provides an invitation to my future self and any interest other composers to reverse-engineer the analytic method into a creative compositional one. Just as discussing three layers of encoding musical characters with a cross-genre narrative can analyse a work, it can serve as an inspiration for new cross-genre music. Philosophical and even practical tips for creating musico-cultural hybridity, stereotype or regenerative newness can be reverse-engineered through the attributes that I extracted from the experimental compositional canvas of my submitted composition. The methods for analysis of cross-genre characterisation can be ‘reversed’

³²² On a side note, a minor *Erkenntnis* was the usage of the modal verb ‘should’ to claim as the composer (first source) which associations were intended to accompany which enunciations and why. I could have simply claimed that the autonomous materials definitely create hermeneutic information, e.g. ‘the lack of an *Arietta* for *Cyclops* creates the hermeneutic information that he lacks a true soul’, yet the modal verb ‘should’ shows that encoding hermeneutic information is an uncertain process that is based on the professional and personal biases of the composer and no definite process. Furthermore, ‘should’ implies a strong artistic intention on my part without having to establish any positivistic scientific evidence of a universality to the claim.

to provide structural and hermeneutic methods for encoding characters in new works of contemporary opera. For example, the analytical method for establishing a ‘tragic archetype’ in *I.th.Ak.A.* can be ‘reversed’ to work as a compositional technique. Two models for this archetype are provided in chapter 5 that can be turned into a creative stimulus for a new composition with a normal amount of inspiration and artistic effort. On a smaller level, hybridity was explored as the articulation of two musico-cultural elements within an enunciation. This could be reverse-engineered, for example in the simple way that one can compose a genre reference, compose a convention of a tradition and bring them together creatively in one enunciation. This is the sort of instruction-manual-like technique I had envisioned as a standard form for the thesis, yet I have come to believe that the cross-genre approach is strongest as an artistic aesthetic philosophy when these details are left to the personal convictions of the individual artist.

6.2. Discovery of Methods for Artistic Research in Composition

The literature review on artistic research provided at least one key revolution to the development of the thesis: that I would not analyse the work of my peers with the cross-genre technique in an attempt to show a compositional tendency or modern paradigm, but rather focus on analysing my own creative process as a method of reflection. Originally, I had planned to analyse works of Michael van der Aa, Moritz Eggert, Alexander Schubert, Bernard Gander, David T. Little and more. In fact, in the cases of Eggert and A. Schubert, I had already done sketches of these analysis, and in the case of Eggert, performed a complete analysis which I then discussed with the composer, leading to interesting insights into his creative process. Nevertheless, the methodology and scope³²³

³²³ It proved impossible to provide another scope: where would I start to claim aspects of cross-genre in the music of others, and why? Along the course of the discussion on scope, I suggested starting anywhere from with Rameau’s *Les Indes Galantes* to, arbitrarily, the start of the 21st century. But after research artistic research and learning of the key methodology of reflection on the creative process by the artist themselves - being both the observer and the subject - I had a clear answer to the problems of scope that arose.

for the dissertation project was only sound when it was focused on one large filter: the opera *I.th.Ak.A.* and my personal reflections on this regarding what I state as the key generator for inspiring the compositional process thereof, cross-genre composition³²⁴. It also provided a key to an academic writing style that suits my principle training as a composer, or author *through* music, and only secondary training as an author *about* (musicologist) or *for* (music theorist) music. This key was that artistic research can have an artistic quality to it, itself. It must not resemble how a non-artistic research would write about a topic: namely, the discursive academic discussion on cross-genre composition can itself be ‘cross-genre’ in its academic method, as discussed in the introduction.

6.3. Discoveries as to the Nature of my Creative Process as a Composer

Regarding how this dissertation revolutionised my approach to composition going forward, it provided the ‘Aha! moment’ that the currency for inspiration in my creative process is that of working with socially-constructed musical associations and hermeneutic information. Honestly, I was not aware of this before I started researching. And, even if these associations aren’t heard by the listener, and the references are so obscure as have become something else through mutative hybridity with my own musical intuitions (becoming ‘their own thing’), they were an essential part of inspiring and motivating me to create the music which articulates them. If a musicologist wishes to analyse my work *ex ante*, then, I state for posterity, that this insight is a key driver to my creative process as it stands. One could say that as the fundament to Brahms’ music was counterpoint, to Schoenberg’s mid and late music was serialisation, or to Stockhausen’s the concept of *avant-garde*, mine is the interplay of musical associations.

³²⁴ Indeed, I had also considered analysing other works of mine composed in the time period of the dissertation project and/or before it. This was similarly excluded.

Another key motivating factor in my creative process as discovered through the research into Bhabha's perspective on cultural (symbolic) exchange is that of conflict in a 'third space'. That this exchange fit with Boris Groys' model of regenerative artistic newness in artistic spaces was an additional significant 'Aha!' moment and gave me the essential insight that: colliding traditional conventions (the 'sacred inside') with profane challenges from external genres (the 'profane outside') feeds my creative process with a sense of exciting, rebellious creative taboo. Breaking a taboo by examining what music is considered inside a space and what outside, then finding a conflict-rich border-zone between them, is another method for creative stimulation that a future me (and any third party composers) could well use to create more music.

It could be, however, that the largest development is on a deeper intuitive level that has been made discursive only between the lines in the supplementary text. To venture a guess, I would say that exposing myself to literature on postmodernism, cultural exchange, reflective critical thought in artistic processes, narrative musical analysis and the nature of genres and traditions has had a developmental impact that may only be able to be articulated after an appropriate period of intellectual digestion - perhaps even a decade or more. I can be relatively certain (on the grounds of common sense) that the intense intellectual exercise of writing the supplementary text, composing the submitted opera and undergoing a process of supervision and examination on a doctoral level will have a constructive impact on my development as an artistic researcher for years to come.

6.4. A Recapitulation of the Original Research Contained in the Dissertation Project and Answers to the Research Questions

The dissertation has the ontology of a three-in-one research object (i.e. research about+for+through art), and followed a *Nachdenkliche Methodologie* of making intuitive artistic decisions, as made in *I.th.Ak.A.*, discursive and cognitive through a written supplement. This process was, however, cyclical, since throughout the free (intuitive) composition of *I.th.Ak.A.* was accompanied through free research in the form of wide-ranging reading and conversations with my doctoral supervisors. These intellectual stimuli fed into the artistic stimuli to create a compositional experiment which then could be analysed for insights into the creative process as informed and motivated by the overarching topic of the dissertation process: cross-genre composition, and the questions: what do I mean by cross-genre composition (chapter 4), and how is this concept encapsulated in my creative process, as shown by *I.th.Ak.A.* (chapter 6)? In order to effectively answer these two questions, I came to original standpoints regarding artistic research (chapter 2) and musical analysis (chapter 5).

As a concluding answer to the research question, *I.th.Ak.A.* is an opera in which the characters are encoded with references to ('inside') tradition(s) and ('external') genres and thereby mark a musical cross-genre narrative of conflict in a third space border-zone between tradition and genre, built on enunciations which form a teleology of mutual influence between the characters and narrate a tragic archetype. This cross-genre narrative combines with the textual narrative in the libretto to create a music-theatre experience congruent with the term 'opera'. On the small scale, I came to the key realisations that the building blocks of my creative process are cells containing autonomous musical material, associations and hybridity, which I call 'enunciations' after Homi K. Bhabha. These can give a musical structure through creating a semiotic conflict between forces of hybridity and cultural exchange and forces of stereotype and fixity, where forces of hybridity and cultural exchange are the de facto protagonists. In opera, this conflict can be equated to a (bipolar) textual conflict in the given libretto to achieve functional synthesis of musical and textual narrative.

Research insights contained in this project may be useful primarily to composers through either a process of free stimulation of inspiration resulting from the discussion of aesthetic philosophies, or through personalised, creative reverse-engineering of the analytic method to one of a free compositional method. Musicologists may find insights into my creative process, should they be interested in this topic, by assessing the score and reflections thereof as an *ex ante* document. Music theorists may find new approaches to appreciating music with cross-genre elements through the original analytic method or an adaption thereof. Performers may inform recitals of works with cross-genre elements through considering the perspective I have outlined. Finally, artistic researchers may benefit from the literature review on the currently-forming hot-topic of the nature, methodology, ontology and epistemology of artistic research, to which I have taken a standpoint and derived a method for myself as a composer-researcher reflecting on his own creative process and submitting a dissertation in the two practically equal of a substantial written supplement and related substantial new composition.

Complete Bibliography

Abbate, C. (1996). *Unsung voices: Opera and musical narrative in the nineteenth century*. Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press: xi.

Adorno, T. (1941). *Studies in Philosophy and Social Science*, New York: Institute of Social Research, 1941, IX, 17-48.

Agawu, K. (1997) *Analyzing Music under the New Musicological Regime*, *Journal of References* 147 15/3, 297–307.

Agawu, V. K. (2004). How we got out of analysis, and how to get back in again. *Music Analysis*, 23, 2-3.

Agawu, V. K. (2016). *Playing with signs*. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press.

Almén, B. (2003). Narrative archetypes: A critique, theory, and method of narrative analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 47, 1, 1-39.

Art and Humanities Research Council (2017). *Arts and Humanities Research and Innovation*. https://www.nesta.org.uk/sites/default/files/arts_and_humanities_research_and_innovation.pdf.

Accessed on 21.11.17

Association Européenne des Conservatoires, Académies de Musiques et Musikhochschulen (AEC) (2015). *Key Concepts for AEC Members Artistic Research An AEC Council 'White Paper'*, 2015.

<https://www.aec-music.eu/userfiles/File/Key%20Concepts/White%20Paper%20AR%20-%20Key%20Concepts%20for%20AEC%20Members%20-%20EN.pdf>. Accessed 16:12, 21.11.17.

Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. 1. Auflage. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes.

Badura, J. (2009). *Erkenntnis (Sinnliche)*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes

Bauck, A. (1997). Review. *Popular Music* 16(2): 231-34.

Ballantine, C. (1977). Towards an Aesthetic of Experimental Music. *The Musical Quarterly*, 63(2), 224-246. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/741368>

Bakhtin, M. M. (2000). *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Trans. Emerson, C. and Holquist, M., ed. Holquist, M., Austin, University of Texas Press.

Becker, J., & Becker, A. (1983). A grammar of the musical genre "srepegan.". In *Asian Music* 14/2 (1983).

Bellaviti, S. (2015). Standing out while fitting in: Genre, style, and critical differentiation among Panamanian conjunto musicians. *Ethnomusicology*, 59, 3, 450-474.

Bhabha, H. K. (2012). *The Location of Culture*. Routledge.

Binder, A. (1993). Constructing Racial Rhetoric: Media Depictions of Harm in Heavy Metal and Rap Music. *American Sociological Review* 58: 753-67.

Brown, H. M. et al (2018). Opera(i) (It., from Lat. opera, plural of opus: 'work'; Fr. opéra; Ger. Oper). *Grove Dictionary Online*: <https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40726>. Accessed 17:55 on 24.04.2018.

Barthes, R. (1977) *Image—Music—Text*, trans. S.Heath, London, Fontana: 142-8.

Barthes. R (1982). *The Imagination of the Sign*. In *A Barthes Reader*, ed. Susan Sontag. New York: Hill and Wang.

Beard, D., & Gloag, K. (2016). *Musicology: The key concepts - second edition*. New York: Routledge.

Bent, Ian (1987). *Analysis*. London: McMillan Press.

Bent, I., & Pople, A. (2001). *Analysis*. *Grove Music Online*. Retrieved 27 Jan. 2018, from <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000041862>.

Bordwell, D. (1985). *Narration in the fiction film*. University of Wisconsin Press.

Biggs, M. & Karlsson, H. (2010). *Foundations*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge.

Borgdorff, H. (2006). *The Debate on Research in the Arts*. Focus on Artistic Research and Development, no. 02. Bergen: Bergen National Academy of the Arts.

Borgdorff, H. (2009), *Onderzoek in kunsten bloeit*, Science Guide 2009. online. <http://www.scienceguide.nl/200903/onderzoek-in-kunsten-bloeit.aspx>. Accessed on 1 march 2010, link now defunct. — as quoted by Kälvemark in the Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts.

Borgdorff, H. (2010). *The Production of Knowledge in Artistic Research*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge.

Bowie, A. (1993). *Aesthetics and Subjectivity: From Kant to Nietzsche*, Manchester, Manchester University Press.

Bujić, B. (ed.) (1988). *Music in European Thought: 1851–1912*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press: 276.

Chua, D. K. L. (2004). *Rethinking Unity*. *Music Analysis*, 23(2/3), 353-359. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3700451>

- Clarke, E.F. (1999). Subject-Position and the Specification of Invariants in Music by Frank Zappa and P.J.Harvey. *Music Analysis* 18/3, 347–74.
- Cook, Nicholas (1987). *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. New York: George Braziller.
- Cone, E.T. (1977). Three Ways to Read a Detective Story or a Brahms Intermezzo. *Georgia Review* 31: 554-74.
- Crispin, D. (2015). *Forschen in den Künsten: Musik*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. 1. Auflage. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes.
- Culler, J. (1975). *Structuralist Poetics*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- DeBellis, M. (January 01, 1999). The paradox of musical analysis. *Journal of Music Theory*, 43, 1, 83-99.
- DiMaggio, P. (1987). Classification in Art. *American Sociological Review*. 52 (4): 440-55.
- Dombois, F. (2006). *Kunst Als Forschung*. Hochschule der Künste Bern HKB
- Eakin, E (2001). Harvard's Prize Catch, a Delphic Postcolonialist, *The New York Times*.
- Eliot, T. S., and Washington, P. (1998). *Eliot: poems and prose*. New York: A.A. Knopf.

Ellis, J. (1995). Book Review: The Location of Culture. *Philosophy and Literature*, 19, 1, 196-197

EILA (2016), *The 'Florentine Principles' on the Doctorate in the Arts* as presented in the 14th ELIA Biennial Conference *Turn Mirrors Into Windows*, 30 November - 3 December 2016 Florence, Italy. Available u.a.: http://www.elia-artschools.org/userfiles/File/customfiles/elia-florenceprinciples2017-digital_20170406105153.pdf accessed 17:31, 20.11.17.

Eisner, E. W. (2003). *On the Differences between Scientific and Artistic Approaches to Qualitative Research*. *Visual Arts Research*, 29, 57, 5.

EUA (2005), *General Rapporteur's Report*. http://www.eua.be/eua/jsp/en/upload/Salzburg_Report_final.1129817011146.pdf, accessed 13:24, 21.11.18. but here quoting a summary provided by: EILA (2016), *The 'Florentine Principles' on the Doctorate in the Arts* as presented in the 14th ELIA Biennial Conference *Turn Mirrors Into Windows*, 30 November - 3 December 2016 Florence, Italy.

Everist, M. (1996). Meyerbeer's *Il crociato in Egitto*: mélodrame, Opera, Orientalism, *Cambridge Opera Journal* 8/3.

Fabbri, F., and Iain C. (1982). "What kind of Music?" *Popular Music*. 2: 131-143.

Feyerabend, P. (1984). *Wissenschaft als Kunst*. Frankfurt/M.

Flender, R. (2013). *Die Entdeckung des Raumes in der Musik*. in ZWÖLF, Hamburg: Hochschule für Musik und Theater.

Flender, Reinhard (2017). *Der Doktor der musikalischen Wissenschaften Dr. scientiae musicae an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater*. In *13. Jahre Masterstudiengang Multimediale Komposition an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

Forte, A. and Gilbert, S. E. (1982). *Introduction to Schenkerian Analysis*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company.

Forte, A. (1988). *New Approaches to the Linear Analysis of Music*. *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 41(2), 315-348. doi:10.2307/831436

Frayling, C. (1994). *Research in Art and Design*. Royal College of Art Research Papers, Vol 1, No 1, 1993/4.

Frith, S. (1996). *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

Frith, S. (2000). *The Discourse of World Music*, in Born G. and Hesmondhalgh D. (eds), *Western Music and Its Others: Differences, Representation and Appropriation in Music*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press.

Frye, N. (1957). *Anatomy of criticism: Four essays*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Genette, G., Lewin, J. E., Culler, J. (1983). *Narrative discourse: An essay in method*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Gilsén, Y. (2006), 'Research: notions and complications', in L. Elkjaer (ed.), *Re.Searching — Om Praksisbaseret Forskning i Scenekunst*, NordScen: Nordisk center for Scenekunst, pp. 125-40

Groys, B. (2014). *On the new*. London: Verso

Haenfler, R. (2006). *Straight Edge: Clean-Living Youth, Hardcore Punk, and Social Change*. Piscataway, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Haarman, A. (2010). *Methodologie*. In Badura, J., Dubach, S., Haarmann, A., Mersch, D., Rey, A., Schenker, C., & Toro, G. (2015). *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes: 85-88.

Hannula, M., Suoranta, J., & Vadén, T. (2005). *Artistic Research: Theories, methods and practices*. Helsinki: Academy of Fine Arts.

Hanslick, E. (1986). *On the Musically Beautiful*, trans. G. Payzant, Indianapolis, Hackett.

Harris, T. (1995). Genre. *The Journal of American Folk-Lore*. 108 (430).

Hatten, R. (1994) *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press. 1994: 29-30, 44-455.

Harper, G. (2011). *Practice-led research and the future of the creative industries*. Creative Industries Journal, 4:1, 5-17.

Held, D. (1980) *Introduction to Critical Theory: Horkheimer to Habermas*, Cambridge, Polity Press.

Hochschule für Musik und Theater, Hamburg (2013/2015). *Ordnung für die Promotion zum Doktor der Musikwissenschaften der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. https://www.hfmt-hamburg.de/fileadmin/u/ordnungen/SO_DrScMus.pdf. Accessed 16:06, 21.11.17.

Hornuff, D. (2015). *Praxis Dr. Kunst geschlossen*. Faz Feuilleton. Can be found under: <http://www.faz.net/-gsn-864ks> accessed 14:50, 21.11.17.

Hsu, Greta, and Michael T. Hannan. 2005. "Identities, Genres, and Organizational Forms". *Organization Science*. 16 (5): 474-490.

<http://the.echonest.com/> - accessed 19:14 on 24.08.2018.

Hutnyk, J. (1997). Adorno at WOMAD: South Asian Crossovers and the Limits of Hybridity Talk, in Werbner P. and Modood T. (eds) *Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism*, London and Atlantic Highlands, NJ, Zed Books: 112.

Jeffress, I. M. (2013). *An Essay on Musical Narrative Theory and Its Role in Interpretation, with Analyses of Works for Saxophone by Alfred Desenclos and John Harbison*. Doctoral dissertation: University of South Carolina - Columbia.

Joel K. and Jopi N. (Eds. 2007). *Reconstructing Hybridity: Postcolonial Studies in Transition*. New York: Rodopi B. V.

Karl, G. (1997). *Structuralism and musical plot*. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 19, 1, 13-34.

Kalra, V. et al. (2005). *Diaspora and Hybridity*. London: SAGE publication Inc

Kerman, J. (1985). *Contemplating music: Challenges to musicology*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Kerman, J. (1994). *How We Got into Analysis, and How to Get Out: 15*, in *Write all These Down*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press [originally published in *Critical Inquiry* (1980), 7, 311–31].

Kälvevemark, Torsten (2010). *University politics and practice-based research*. in *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge (2010): 3-23.

Keller, H., Wintle, C., Northcott, B., & Samuel, I. (2005). *Essays on music*. Cambridge [England: Cambridge University Press: 143.

Kerman, J. (1985). *Contemplating music: Challenges to musicology*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press: 12.

Kerman, J. (1994). *How We Got into Analysis, and How to Get Out*. 15, in *Write all These Down*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press [originally published in *Critical Inquiry* (1980), 7, 311–31].

Kershaw, B. (2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T. (2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*.

Kjørup, S. (2010). *Pleading for Plurality: artistic and Other Kinds of research*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge (2010).

Klein, J. (2015). *Peer Review*. In *Künstlerische Forschung: Ein Handbuch*. Zürich Berlin: Diaphanes

Klein, J. (2017). *What is Artistic Research?* Journal for Artistic Research Online. Originally published in German in: *Gegenworte 23*, Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften 2010.

Kivy, P. (1980). *The Corded Shell*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Kramer, L. (1992). *Musical Narratology: A Theoretical Outline*. *Indiana Theory Review* 12.

Kramer, L., & California Digital Library. (2003). *Music as cultural practice, 1800-1900*. Berkeley: EScholarship, the California Digital Library.

Krims, A. (2000). Introduction: Postmodern Musical Poetics and the Problem of 'Close Reading', in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, Canada, G & B International.

Korsyn, K. (2004). *The Death of Musical Analysis? The Concept of Unity Revisited*. *Music Analysis*, 23(2/3), 337-351. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3700450>

Kramer, J. D. (January 01, 1995). *Beyond unity: Toward an understanding of musical postmodernism*. *Concert Music, Rock, and Jazz Since 1945*, 11-33.

Kuhn, T. S. (2012). *The structure of scientific revolutions*. Chicago, Ill: The University of Chicago Press: 4th edition.

Lazarevic (2017). *(Artistic) Research - current state of affairs in our little neck of the woods*. In *13. Jahre Masterstudiengang Multimediale Komposition an der Hochschule für Musik und Theater Hamburg*. ZM4, Hamburg University of Music and Theatre.

Leavy, P. (2015). *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice*. New York: Guilford.

Lesage, Dieter (2009). *Who's Afraid of Artistic Research? On measuring artistic research output*. *Art and Research* Spring 2/2 2009.

Levi-Strauss, C. (1981). *The Naked Man*. trans. Doreen and John Weightman. New York: Harper and Row.

le Huray, P. and Day, J. (1981). *Music and Aesthetics in the Eighteenth and Early-Nineteenth Centuries*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press: 221.

Littlefield, R., & Neumeier, D. (1992). *Rewriting Schenker: Narrative--History--Ideology*. *Music Theory Spectrum*, 14(1), 38-65. doi:10.2307/746080

Liszka, J. J. (1989). *The semiotic of myth: A critical study of the symbol*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Lyotard, J.-F. (1992). *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*, trans. G. Bennington and B. Massumi, Manchester, Manchester University Press.

Laing, D. (1985). *One Chord Wonders: Power and Meaning in Punk Rock*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Lee, S. (2007). *Musical Stratification: Explaining the Aesthetic Mobility among Music Genres*. PhD of Dissertation, Department Sociology, Nashville, TN, Vanderbilt University.

Lena, J. C., & Peterson, R. A. (October 01, 2008). *Classification as Culture: Types and Trajectories of Music Genres*. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 5, 697-718.

Lipsitz, G. (1997). *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place*, London and New York, Verso.

Loomba, A. (2001). *Colonialism/Postcolonialism*. London and New York: Routledge.

Mcdonald, G (2018). Every noise at once. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/engenremap.html>.

Mcdonald, G. (2013). How We Understand Music Genres. Online, accessed 08.03.18. <http://everynoise.com/EverynoiseIntro.pdf>

Middleton, R. (1990). *Studying Popular Music*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.

Middleton, R. (2000). Work-in-(g) Practice: Configuration of the Popular Music Intertext, in Talbot M. (ed.), *The Musical Work: Reality or Invention?*. Liverpool, Liverpool University Press.

Mishra, V. and Hodge, B. (1994). What is Post(-)colonialism?, in Williams, P. and Chrisman, L. (eds) (1994). *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, New York, Columbia University Press.

Moore, A. (2001). Categorizing Conventions in Music Discourse: Style and Genre, *Music and Letters* 82/3, 432–42.

Moore, R. (2005). Alternative to What? Subcultural Capital and the Commercialization of a Music Scene. *Deviant Behavior* 26: 229-52.

Malterud, N. (2012). *Artistic research – necessary and challenging*. InFormation 1/2012 trans. Bergen Academy of Art and Design.

Middleton, R. (1990). *Studying Popular Music*, Milton Keynes, Open University Press: 7.

Maus, F. (1988). Music as Narrative. *Music Theory Spectrum* 10: 56-73

McDonald, M. (2004). Silent narration?: Elements of narrative in Ives's "The unanswered question". *19th Century Music*, 27, 3, 263-286.

Nattiez, J.-J., (1994). Can one speak of narrativity in music?. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 115, 240-257.

Newcomb, A. (1987). Schumann and Late Eighteenth-Century Narrative Strategies. *19th-Century Music* 11: 164-74.

Norwegian National Artistic Research Fellowship Programme (2010). *Regulations for the Research Fellowship Programme*. Available at <http://www.kunststipendiat.no/index.php/en/regulations>.

OECD Frascati Manual, Sixth edition, 2002, para. 64, page 30. Also available online through their website <https://stats.oecd.org/>.

OELD (2018). Semiotics | Definition of Classical Music in English by Oxford Dictionaries. Oxford Dictionaries Online | English. <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/semiotics>, Accessed 19:11, 23.04.18.

OELD (2018). Classical Music | Definition of Classical Music in English by Oxford Dictionaries. Oxford Dictionaries Online | English. Accessed April 09, 2018. https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/classical_music.

Oxford English Living Dictionaries Online, <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/ontology>, accessed 11:37, 24.11.17.

Oxford English Living Dictionaries Online, <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/methodology>, accessed 17:39, 24.11.17.

Penderbayne, S. (2011). Operatic Elements in Leonard Bernstein's score for West Side Story. BMus Honours Thesis (Sydney Conservatorium)

Peterson, R. and Simkus A. (1992). How musical tastes mark occupation status groups: 152-186 in Lamont, M. and Fournier, M. (ed. 1995). *Cultivating differences. Symbolic boundaries and the making of inequality*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Parker, R. and Abbate, C. (eds) (1989). *Analyzing Opera: Verdi and Wagner*, Berkeley and London, University of California Press: 1-2.

Perrine, L. (1985). *Story and structure*. Calgary: Alberta Education.

Piccini, A. and B. Kershaw (2003). *Practice as research in performance: from epistemology to evaluation*. *Journal of Media Practice*, 4 (2): 113-23.

Polanyi, M. (1967): *The Tacit Dimension*. New York

RAE (2008). *RAE 2008: the outcome*. <http://www.rae.ac.uk/pubs/2008/01/>, accessed 14:15, 21.11.17.

Raes, G.W (2014). *Experimental Art as Research*. In Crispin D., Gilmore B (ed) (2014). *Artistic Experimentation in Music: An Anthology*. Leuven University Press.

Ratner, L. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York: Schirmer Books

Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) (2006). *Dance, Drama and the Performing Arts* (cited 15 June 2008), available from <http://www.rae.ac.uk/pubs/2006/01/docs/065.pdf> as quoted in Kershaw, B.

(2014). *Practice as Research Through Performance*. In Smith, H., & In Dean, R. T.

(2014). *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts*.

Réti, R. (1961) *The Thematic Process in Music*, London, Faber and Faber.

Ratner, L.G. (1980). *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York, Schirmer Books.

Regev, M. (1994). Producing Artistic Value: The Case of Rock Music. *The Sociological Quarterly* 35:85-102.

Rosenberg, N. (1985). *Bluegrass: A History*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.

Said, E. (1994). *Culture and Imperialism*. London, Vintage Books.

Schoenberg, A. (1975). *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*. Edited by Leonard Stein, translated by Leo Black. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Schorch, Philipp. (2013). *Contact zones, third spaces, and the act of interpretation*. University of Leicester : Department of Museum Studies and Clifford

Shuker, R. (1998). *Popular Music: The Key Concepts*, London and New York, Routledge.

Sparling, H. (2008). Categorically speaking: towards a theory of (musical) genre in Cape Breton gaelic culture. *Ethnomusicology : Journal of the Society for Ethnomusicology*. 2008/52/401

Strinati, D. (1995) *An Introduction to Theories of Popular Culture* , London and New York, Routledge.

Schenker, H. (1979) *Free Composition* , trans. E. Oster, New York and London, Longman.

Seel, M. (1997). *Die Kunst der Entzweiung: Zum Begriff der ästhetischen Rationalität*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.

Schiesser G. (2015). *What Is at Stake: qu'est-ce que l'enjeu? Paradoxes: Problematics: Perspectives in Artistic Research Today*. In: Bast G., Carayannis E., Campbell D. (eds) (2015). *Arts, Research, Innovation and Society*. Springer, Cham.

Schwarz, H.P. (2010). *Forward to the Routledge Companion on Research in the Arts*.

Slager, H. (2009). *Art and method*, in Elkins, J., (ed.) *Artists with PhDs*, Washington, d.C.: new academia publishing

Smith, Hazel, and R T. Dean (2014). *Practice-led Research, Research-Led Practice in the Creative Arts*. Edinburgh University Press.

Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy Online, <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/epistemology/>, accessed 16:01, 24.11.17.

Sullivan, G. (2010). *Artistic Cognition and Creativity*. In *The Routledge Companion to Research in the Arts*, Reino Unido: Routledge

Tarasti, E. (1994). *A Theory of Musical Semiotics*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

The Guardian (1998). *Bad Writing Contest*. The Guardian: <https://www.theguardian.com/books/1999/dec/24/news>, Accessed 26.08.18. at 19:12.

Thornton, S. (1996). *Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital*. Hanover, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

Treitler, L. (1982). To Worship that Celestial Sound: Motives for Analysis. *Journal of Musicology* 1.

Unsold, M. (2008). *Der Komponist als Erzähler: Narrativität in Dmitri Schostakowitschs Instrumentalmusik*. Hildesheim: Olms.

Urquia, N. (2004). 'Doin' It Right': Contested Authenticity in London's Salsa Scene. in *Music Scenes*, edited by A. Bennett and R. A. Peterson. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press: 96-114.

Walser, R. (1993) *Running with the Devil: Power, Gender, and Madness in Heavy Metal Music*. Hanover, NH, University Press of New England: 109.

Wilkie, A., Gaver, W., Hemment, D., & Giannachi, G. (January 01, 2010). Creative Assemblages: Organisation and Outputs of Practice-Led Research. *Leonardo*, 43, 1, 98-99.

Williams, P. (2004) 'Peripheral Visions?' *The Musical Times* 145, 51–67.

Wilson, M., & Ruiten, S. (2013). *SHARE handbook of artistic research education*. Amsterdam: ELIA

Winters, B. (2010). The Non-diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music, and Narrative Space. *Music and Letters*, 91, 2, 224-244.